NATIONAL INSTITUTE FOR HEALTH AND CARE EXCELLENCE

Centre for Health Technology Evaluation

# Medical Technologies Advisory Committee (MTAC) meeting minutes

**Minutes:** Confirmed

**Date and time: 124th MTAC meeting - Friday 14th July 2023**

**Location:** Virtual meeting via Zoom

## Attendees

Committee members present

1. Jacob Brown (Chair) Present for all items
2. Kiran Bali Present for all items
3. Katherine Boylan Present for all items
4. Stacey Chang-Douglass Present for all items
5. Donna Cowan Present for all items
6. Neil Hawkins Present for items 1-4.2
7. Michael Kolovetsios Present for all items
8. Emily Lam Present for all items
9. Avril McCarthy Present for all items
10. Huseyin Naci Present for all items
11. Jai Patel Present for all items
12. Kazem Rahimi Present for all items
13. Carl Roobottom Present for items 1-4.2

NICE staff present

Sarah Byron, CHTE Programme Director Present for items 1-4.2

Anastasia Chalkidou, Associate Director Present for all items

Catherine Pank, Project Manager Present for all items

Elizabeth Islam, Project Manager Present for all items

Izabela Syrek, Administrator Present for all items

Bernice Dillon, Health Technology Assessment Adviser Present for all items

Lizzy Latimer, Health Technology Assessment Adviser Present for items 1-4.2

Dionne Bowie, Health Technology Assessment Analyst Present for all items

Oye Afolabi, Health Technology Assessment Analyst Present for items 1-4.2

Evan Campbell, Health Technology Assessment Analyst Present for all items

Aamer Jawed, Health Technology Assessment Analyst Present for all items

Amy Barr, Health Technology Assessment Analyst Present for items 1-4.2

Oye Afolabi, Health Technology Assessment Analyst Present for items 1-4.2

Charlotte Pelekanou, Health Technology Assessment Analyst Present for items 1-4.2

Lirije Hyseni, Health Technology Assessment Analyst Present for items 1-4.2

Farhaan Jamadar, Health Technology Assessment Analyst Present for items 1-4.2

Rosalee Mason, Coordinator, Corporate Office team Present for items 1-4.1

Matthew Brown, Digital Media Manager, Media Relations Present for all items

Helen Crosbie, Public Involvement Adviser, Public Involvement

Programme Present for items 1-4.2

Thomas Lawrence, Data scientist, Managed Access team Present for all items

Vandana Ayyar Gupta, Scientific Adviser in Data & Analytics,

Data and Analytics team Present for items 1-4.2

Ann Greenwood, Market Access Analyst, Life Sciences team Present for items 1-4.2

Anne Murray-Ctoa, Senior Analyst, Data and Analytics team Present for all items

Suzie Panek, Analyst, Resource Impact Assessment team Present for all items

Sarah Bromley, Senior Medical Editor, Publishing team Present for items 5-6

Anna Sparshatt, Content designer - guidance, Publishing team Present for items 1-4.2

Zöe Jones, Administrator, Health Tech (Interventional Procedures)

team Present for items 1-4.2

Helen Gallo, Senior Health Technology Assessment Analyst,

Interventional Procedures Programme Present for all items

Charlie Campion, Project Manager, Interventional procedures team Present for items 5-6

Jessica Wilcock, Health Technology Assessment Analyst,

Diagnostics Assessment Programme Present for items 5-6

Alice Bell, Associate Health Technology Assessment Analyst,

Diagnostics Assessment Programme Present for items 5-6

Shruti Patel, Public Health Registrar, Quality and Leadership team Present for items 1-4.2

Stephen Duffield, Associate Director, RWE Methods, Data and

Analytics team Present for all items

Hugh McGuire, Senior Scientific Adviser, PHIGD Present for items 1-4.2

Humayra Ervin, Clinical Scientist, Newcastle External Assessment

Group Present for all items

Katie McDermott, Project Manager, Health Technology Wales Present for items 5-6

Leona Batten, Health Services Researcher, Health Technology

Wales Present for items 5-6

EAC representatives present

Kim Keltie (Newcastle External Assessment Group) Present for items 1-4.1

Ros Parker (Newcastle External Assessment Group) Present for items 1-4.1

Tomos Robinson (Newcastle External Assessment Group) Present for items 1-4.1

Cristine Fernandez-Garcis (Newcastle External Assessment

Group) Present for items 1-4.1

Madhusubramanian Muthukumar, PenTAG External Assessment

Group Present for items 5-5.1

Alan Lovell, PenTAG External Assessment Group Present for items 5-5.1

Specialist committee members present

Dr Imad Mekhail, General Practitioner, Locum Present for items 1-4.2

Mrs Irena Cruickshank, Weight Management Nurse Specialist,

Somerset Foundation Trust Present for items 1-4.2

Dr Jennifer James, Physiotherapy Lecturer / Researcher, The

University of Liverpool Present for items 1-4.2

Dr Karen Coulman, HEE/NIHR Clinical Lecturer (Research Fellow),

Advanced Specialist Dietitian in Obesity Present for items 1-4.2

Mrs Rebecca Fahey, Advanced Specialist Dietitian in Obesity,

Cambridge University Hospitals NHS Foundation Trust Present for items 1-4.2

Dr Samantha Warren, Consultant Clinical Scientist, Northern

Centre for Cancer Care Present for items 5-5.2

Dr Jacqueline Poxon, Deputy Head of Treatment Planning Physics,

Barts Health NHS Present for items 5-5.2

Dr Angela Pathmanathan, Consultant Clinical Oncologist, Royal

Marsden Hopsital Present for items 5-5.2

Mr Mayur Nilkanthbhai Munshi, Dosimetry Lead, Beatson West of

Scotland Cancer Centre Present for items 5-5.2

Dr David Bernstein, Lead Physicist in Radiotherapy Imaging,

Royal Marsden Hopsital Present for items 5-5.2

Mr Syed Moinuddin, Lead Research and Development

Radiographer, UCLH Trust Present for items 5-5.2

Dr Carl Rowbottom, Director of Physics & Lead Scientist, The

Clatterbridge Cancer Centre NHS Foundation Trust Present for items 5-5.2

Professional Expert present

Dr Vijayaraman Arutchelvam, Consultant in Diabetes and

Endocrinology, South Tees Hospitals Foundation Trust Present for items 1-4.1

Mrs Nicola Carruthers, Specialist Dietician, Newcastle Hospitals

NHS Foundation Trust Present for items 1-4.1

Mr William Smith, Healthy Weight & Treating Obesity Strategic

Manager, North East & North Cumbria ICS Present for items 1-4.1

## 1. Introduction to the meeting

* 1. The chair welcomed members of the committee and other attendees present to the meeting.
  2. The chair noted apologies from committee member: Teik Goh, Karen McCutcheont, Naomi McVey, Abdullah Pandor, Roger Whittaker, Alun Williams, Neil Hawkins (for afternoon session) and Carl Roobottom (for afternoon session).

## 2. News and announcements

* 1. n/a

## 3. Minutes from the last meeting

* 1. The committee approved the minutes of the committee meeting held on 16th June 2023.

## 4. Evaluation of Early Value Assessment (EVA) of GID-HTE10007 Digitally enabled weight management programmes to support treatment with weight management medication

* 1. Part 1 – Open session
     1. The chair welcomed the invited specialist committee members, professional experts, external assessment group representatives, members of the public and company representatives from DDM Health, Liva Uk, Oviva, CheqUp, Reset Health and Second Nature.
     2. The chair asked all committee members, specialist committee members, professional experts, external group representatives and NICE staff present to declare any relevant interests in relation to the item being considered.

* **Dr Imad Mekhail** has declared an indirect interest as he has a voluntary and non-representative role as a Committee Member on the Society of Endocrinology’s National Obesity Database Steering Group.

It was agreed that his declaration would not prevent Dr Mekhail from providing expert advice to the committee.

* **Dr Karen Coulman** has declared an indirect -financial interest as she provided consultancy – provided research and dietetic advice for Oxford Medical Products (https://oxfordmedicalproducts.com/about-us/) for a trial they were developing for a new weight loss technology. This consultancy work was undertaken through my academic role at the University of Bristol. The fee for this work (approx. £500 was charged and paid to her through the University of Bristol).

Dr Coulman has also declared an indirect professional interest as she is International Consortium for Health Outcomes Measurement (ICHOM) Working Group member – patient-centred outcome measures for patients living with obesity. She is part of an international multi-disciplinary working group tasked with developing a a set of patient-centred outcome measures that matter most to adult patients living with obesity. (<https://www.ichom.org/patient-centered-outcome-measures/>).

She is UK National Obesity Database Steering Committee Member, Society for Endocrinology. Part of a committee that is overseeing the set-up of a national Tier 3 weight management database. (<https://www.endocrinology.org/clinical-practice/research-projects/national-obesity-database/>).

She undertakes research funded through a Health Education England/National Institute for Health Research (HEE/NIHR) Clinical Lectureship Award: “Understanding barriers to referral for specialist weight management services and bariatric surgery and identifying ways to improve access”.

Dr Coulman is British Obesity and Metabolic Surgery Society (BOMSS) Research co-lead for Dietetics. Encouraging and undertaking national dietetic research related to bariatric surgery – e.g. a national audit of pre-operative diets for bariatric surgery.

It was agreed that her declaration would not prevent Dr Coulman from providing expert advice to the committee.

* **Mrs Rebecca Fahey** has declared a direct-financial interest as she works part-time for Cambridge University Hospitals NHS Foundation Trust. She is a permanent member of staff and is paid on a monthly basis by the trust. She works in the Obesity Service – this specialty is relevant to the proposed role.

It was agreed that her declaration would not prevent Mrs Fahey from providing expert advice to the committee.

* **Dr Vijayaraman Arutchelvam** has declared an indirect-financial interest as he works for MENC ICS obesity. He works for the NENC ICB and he is a patient chamion. He is a consultant physician with Special interest in obesity.

It was agreed that his declaration would not prevent Dr Arutchelvam from providing expert advice to the committee.

No other conflicts of interests were declared for this item.

* + 1. The Chair led a discussion of the evidence presented to the committee. This information was presented to the committee by Dr Huseyin Naci and Dr Karen Coulman.
  1. Part 2 – Closed session (external assessment group representatives, professional experts, company representatives and members of the public were asked to leave the meeting)
     1. The committee then agreed on the content of the draft Early Value Assessment. The committee decision was reached by consensus.
     2. The committee asked the NICE technical team to prepare the draft Early Value Assessment in line with their decisions.

## 5. Evaluation of Early Value Assessment (EVA) of GID- HTE10015 Artificial intelligence auto-contouring for radiotherapy treatment planning

## Part 1 – Open session

* + 1. The chair welcomed the invited specialist committee members, external assessment group representatives, members of the public and company representatives from Xiel, AMG Medtech Ltd, Mirada, Oncology Systems, RaySearch UK Limited, Siemans Healthcare, Philips and Radformations AutoContour.
    2. The chair asked all committee members, specialist committee members, lay specialist committee members, professional experts, external group representatives and NICE staff present to declare any relevant interests in relation to the item being considered.
* **Kathryn Boylan** has declared a non-financial professional interest as her employer (Manchester University NHS Foundation Trust) has a tripartite Memorandum of Understanding with Siemens Healthineers (the third party is The University of Manchester) aimed at building mutually beneficial R&I collaborations in areas of interest. She has negotiated this MoU and manage the relationship with Siemens Healthineers. No funding has changed hands to date although projects funded by Siemens Healthineers might arise in the future - if this were to happen, she would not benefit financially personally. No work has been done on the technology in question - nor would it be likely too, as MFT does not deliver radiotherapy treatment.

It was agreed that her declaration would not prevent Kathryn from providing expert advice to the committee.

* **Dr Samantha Warren** has declared an indirect financial interest as she was paid for standard class train travel and accommodation to attend 1 day workshop at LEO Cancer Care (Horley, UK) to act as an independent advisor on prototype new cancer treatment technology.

Dr Warren has also declared a direct-financial interest as she was paid for standard class train travel and accommodation to attend 1 day workshop (Sheffield, UK) for UK users of MVision software (paid ny Xiel UK distributor); she was paid for travel and accommodation to attend 1 day workshop (Helsinki, Finland) for MVision users (paid by MVision) and travel and accommodation to attend ESTRO conference (Vienna, Austria) and presentation to users (paid by MVision)

Dr Warren has also declared a non-financial professional interest as she gave an oral presentation at IPEM meeting (Glasgow, UK) and round table discussion in AI in radiotherapy session. She attended preliminary discussion and attended at online meeting for KiTEC HTA assessment of AI contouring in RT as external advisor, to give feedback on protocol for data collection to be sent to NHS users for feedback and information.

* **Dr Angela Pathmanathan** has declared a non-financial professional interest as she is a member of the Elekta AI assisted contouring focus group. This included an article for FOCUS magazine ‘AI technology to simplify Unity prostate workflow’. There were no payments received for this role or article.

Elekta MR-Linac consortium- research, travel costs funded by Elekta for MD(research). Honoraria for talks given on MR-guided radiotherapy during this time period.

It was agreed that her declaration would not prevent Kathryn from providing expert advice to the committee.

Dr Pathmanathan has declared an indirect interest - The Royal Marsden Hospital NHS Foundation Trust and Institute of Cancer Research have ongoing partnership with Elekta as part of the MR-Linac research consortium.

It was agreed that her declaration would not prevent Dr Pathmanathan from providing expert advice to the committee.

* **Dr Jacqueline Poxon** has declared an indirect-financial interest as her current employment as a HCPC registered Radiotherapy Physicist at Barts Health NHS Trust.
* She has also declared an indirect conflict as she is Currently working on implementation of Limbus AI auto-contouring software at our NHS Trust. No particular affiliation with Limbus AI other than as a user.

It was agreed that her declaration would not prevent Dr Poxon from providing expert advice to the committee.

* **Dr David Bernstein** has declared a non-financial professional interest as he is part of a research collaboration looking at AI auto contouring in radiotherapy.

It was agreed that his declaration would not prevent Dr Bernstein from providing expert advice to the committee.

* **Mr Syed Moinuddin** has declared a non-financial professional interest as he as part of UCLH radiotherapy department have collaborated with google health deepmind on evaluation of AI delineation in Head and Neck patients and co-authored two papers in 2018 and 2021.

He co-authored a review article on auto-segmentation on head and neck patients.

It was agreed that his declaration would not prevent Mr Moinuddin from providing expert advice to the committee.

* **Dr Carl** **Rowbottom** has declared a non-financial professional interest as he is a Deputy Director, Professional & Standards Council, Institute of Physics & Engineering in Medicine. He is a DClinSCi Research Supervisor (University of Manchester): Research title: An evaluation of AI auto-segmentation for Head & Neck cancer.

Publication (in Press): Patient views on the implementation of artificial intelligence in radiotherapy, Radiography, hiips://doi.org/10.1016/j.radi

He is also is a Patient Safety in Radiotherapy Steering Group member, UK Health Security Agency (formerly Public Health England).

Dr Carl Rowbottomhas also declared a non-financial professional & personal interest as he is a user of Limbus AI and previously Mirada DLC Expert; Deputy Director of Professional & Standards Council - Institute of Physics and Engineering in Medicine (IPEM) and a member of the Artificial Intelligence Group of IPEM

It was agreed that his declaration would not prevent Dr Rowbottom from providing expert advice to the committee.

No other interests were declared at the meeting.

* + 1. The Chair led a discussion of the evidence presented to the committee. This information was presented to the committee by Dr Kathryn Boylan and Dr Samantha Warren.
  1. Part 2 – Closed session (company representatives, external assessment group representatives and members of the public were asked to leave the meeting).
     1. The committee then agreed on the content of the draft Early Value Assessment. The committee decision was reached by consensus.
     2. The committee asked the NICE technical team to prepare the draft Early Value Assessment line with their decisions.

## 6. Date of the next meeting

The next virtual meeting of the Medical Technologies Advisory Committee (MTAC) will be held on 21st July 2023 and will start promptly at 10:00am.