NATIONAL INSTITUTE FOR HEALTH AND CARE EXCELLENCE

Centre for Health Technology Evaluation

# Medical Technologies Advisory Committee (MTAC) meeting minutes

**Minutes:** Confirmed

**Date and time: 130th MTAC meeting - Friday 17th November 2023**

**Location:** Virtual meeting via Zoom

## Attendees

Committee members present

1. Kiran Bali Present for all items
2. Katherine Boylan Present for all items
3. Donna Cowan Present for all items
4. Stacey Chang-Douglass Present for all items
5. Teik Goh Present for all items
6. Neil Hawkins Present for all items
7. Emily Lam Present for all items
8. Avril McCarthy Present for all items
9. Karen McCutcheon Present for all items
10. Naomi McVey Present for all items
11. Abdullah Pandor Present for all items
12. Jai Patel Present for all items
13. Kazem Rahimi Present for all items
14. Roger Whittaker Present for all items
15. Alun Williams Present for all items

NICE staff present

Anastasia Chalkidou, Associate Director Present for all items

Catherine Pank, Project Manager Present for all items

Elizabeth Islam, Project Manager Present for items 5-6

Izabela Syrek, Administrator Present for all items

Evan Campbell, Health Technology Assessment Analyst Present for all items

Kimberley Carter, Health Technology Assessment Advisor Present for items 1-4.2

Dionne Bowie, Health Technology Assessment Analyst Present for items 1-4.2

Amy Crossley, Health Technology Assessment Advisor Present for items 5-6

Alice Pritchard, Associate Health Technology Assessment Analyst Present for items 5-6

Samantha Baskerville, Health Technology Assessment Analyst Present for items 1-4.2

Haider Shamsi, Associate Health Technology Assessment Analyst Present for items 1-4.2

Oyewumi Afolabi, Health Technology Assessment Analyst Present for all items

Lizzy Latimer, Health Technology Assessment Advisor Present for all items

Bernice Dillon, Health Technology Assessment Advisor Present for all items

Sana Issa, Coordinator, Corporate Office team Present for items 1-4.1 & 5-5.1

Martin Njoroge, Senior Analyst, Data & Analytics team Present for all items

Olivia Waring, Content Designer – Guidance, Publishing team Present for items 5-6

Matthew Brown, Digital Media Manager, Media Relations

(External Comms) team Present for items 1-4.2

Helen Barnett, Senior Guidance Content Designer, Editorial

and Publishing Present for items 1-4.2

Edgar Masanga, Business Analyst, Resource Impact

Assessment team Present for items 1-4.2

Tom Lawrence, Data scientist, Managed Access team Present for items 5-6

Xia Li, Health Technology Assessment Analyst, Interventional

Procedures and Observational Data Unit team Present for items 5-6

Farhan Ismail, Associate Director, Office for Digital Health Present for items 5-6

Omar Moreea, Technical Advisor, Evidence Services Present for items 5-6

Helen Crosbie, Public Involvement Adviser, Public Involvement Present for all items

Programme Present for all items

Michael Bell, Associate Health Technology Assessment Analyst,

Technology Appraisals Present for items 5-6

EAC representatives present

Susan O'Connell, Cardiff and Vale UHB, Cedar Present for items 1-4.1

Huey Yi Chong, Cardiff and Vale UHB, Cedar Present for items 1-4.1

Madhusubramanian Muthukumar, PenTAG Present for items 5-5.2

Max Barnish, PenTAG Present for items 5-5.2

Professional experts present

Emma Brown, Head of Innovation / Physiotherapist, NHS Present for items 1-4.1

Bedfordshire, Luton and Milton Keynes ICB

Birthe Dahl Andersen, Falls Prevention Service Lead, Your Present for items 1-4.1

Healthcare CIC

Helen Grimes, Health Coach, AgeUk Norwich Present for items 1-4.1

Fiona McLeod, Specialist Falls Practitioner (Physiotherapist), Present for items 1-4.1

Specialist Community Falls Service, Cornwall Partnership

NHS Foundation Trust

Specialist committee members present

Dr Enya Daynes, Clinical Academic Physiotherapist, NIHR

Leicester Biomedical Research Centre (LEAD) Present for items 5-6

Dr Claire Nolan, Senior Research Physiotherapist, Brunel

University London Present for items 5-6

Dr Nicola Roberts, Associate Professor, School of Health and

Social Care. Edinburgh Napier University Present for items 5-6

Prof William Man, Consultant Chest Physician, Royal Brompton &

Harefield Hospitals Present for items 5-6

Lay Specialist Committee members present

Mr Alan Thomas Present for items 5-6

Ms Tessa Jelen Present for items 5-6

## 1. Introduction to the meeting

* 1. The chair welcomed members of the committee and other attendees present to the meeting.
  2. The chair noted apologies from committee members: Jacob Brown (Chair), Michael Kolovetsios, Carl Roobottom and Huseyin Naci.

## 2. News and announcements

* 1. n/a

## 3. Minutes from the last meeting

* 1. The committee approved the minutes of the committee meeting held on 6th October

## 4. Evaluation of GID-MT575 GaitSmart rehabilitation exercise programme for gait and mobility issues

* 1. Part 1 – Open session
     1. The chair welcomed the invited professional experts, external assessment group representatives, members of the public and company representatives from Dynamic Metrics Ltd.
     2. The chair asked all committee members, experts, external group representatives and NICE staff present to declare any relevant interests in relation to the item being considered.
* **Prof Neil Hawkins** has declared a non-financial Professional & personal interests as he is a director of a consultancy company providing HTA consultancy services to biomedical and pharmaceutical companies. No services have been provided to any stakeholders associated with these appraisals.

It was agreed that his declaration would not prevent Prof Hawkins from providing advice to the committee.

* **Ms Emma Brown** has declared an indirect financial interest as she started a new role on the 05/09/2022- Innovation lead for Bedfordshire Luton and Milton Keynes ICB. This is a joint role with Oxford and Eastern Academic Health Science Network (AHSN). She supported the used of GaitSmart and introduced it to a Care Hotel in her pervious role in NHS England as a Regional Clinical Fellow where she had no declarations of interest.

GaitSmart has a commercial agreement with Eastern AHSN. Eastern AHSN see innovators that offer something that seems really promising to the system but are early stage and require more support than they are commissioned to provide. In these instances, often the innovators do not have the capital to pay for AHSN additional support or resources for example Health Economic Budget Evaluations, Infographics, Development of Value Propositions, Grant Funding/Bid Writing support, Surveys etc, and so they set up revenue share agreements with them ( usually a small percentage of their gross sales ).

Any income generated to EAHSN is reinvested back into other innovations to meet the needs of the NHS and the population in the East of England.

It was agreed that her declaration would not prevent Ms Brown providing advice to the committee.

* **Ms Birthe Dahl Andersen** has declared a non-financial professional interest as she is a user of product.

It was agreed that her declaration would not prevent Ms Andersen from providing advice to the committee.

No other conflicts of interests were declared for this item.

* + 1. The Chair led a discussion of the evidence presented to the committee. This information was presented to the committee by Ms Naomi McVey and Prof Neil Hawkins.
  1. Part 2b – Closed session (professional experts, external assessment group representative, company representatives and public observers were asked to leave the meeting)
     1. The committee then agreed on the content of the Medical Technology Guidance (MTG). The committee decision was reached by consensus.
     2. The committee asked the NICE technical team to prepare the Medical Technology Guidance (MTG) in line with their decisions.

## 5. Evaluation of Early Value Assessment (EVA) of GID-HTE10019 Digital pulmonary rehabilitation technologies for adults with chronic obstructive pulmonary disease

* 1. Part 1 – Open session
     1. The chair welcomed the invited specialist committee members, lay specialist committee members, external assessment group representatives, members of the public and company representatives from My mhealth, Aseptika, Rehab Guru, Spirit Health, Kaia Health Software GmbH and University Hospitals of Leicester NHS Trust/Space for COPD.
     2. The chair asked all committee members, specialist committee members, lay specialist committee members, external group representatives and NICE staff present to declare any relevant interests in relation to the item being considered.
* **Prof Neil Hawkins** has declared a non-financial Professional & personal interests as he is a director of a consultancy company providing HTA consultancy services to biomedical and pharmaceutical companies. No services have been provided to any stakeholders associated with these appraisals.

It was agreed that his declaration would not prevent Prof Hawkins from providing advice to the committee.

* **Ms Claire Nolan** has declared a non-financial professional and personal interest due to:
* Manuscript publication: Polgar, O., Patel, S., Walsh, J. A., Barker, R. E., Ingram, K. A., Kon, S. S., ... & Nolan, C. M. (2022). Digital habits of pulmonary rehabilitation service-users following the COVID-19 pandemic. Chronic Respiratory Disease, 19, 14799731221075647.
* British Thoracic Society Summer meeting invited presentation: Digital habits of pulmonary rehabilitation service-users: Opportunities and challenges
* Manuscript pending publication: British Thoracic Society Clinical Statement on Pulmonary Rehabilitation

It was agreed that her declaration would not prevent Ms Nolan from providing expert advice to the committee.

* **Ms Enya Daynes** has declared an indirect interest as she is a Chair of the British Thoracic Society Pulmonary Rehabilitation Specialist Advisory Group and an American Thoracic Society Website committee member.

It was agreed that her declaration would not prevent Ms Daynes from providing expert advice to the committee.

* **Ms Nicola Roberts** has declared a non-financial professional and personal interest due to:
* Co-design of educational resources for children and young adults with asthma to manage their condition independently Funded Napier studentship (DOS Nicola Roberts, Janette Pow Alison Porter Armstrong)
* Take Ten Scoping Study The Scottish Inward Investment Catalyst Fund Application Form Scottish Government (funded £10K) Alison Porter-Armstrong, Fintan Connolly, Nicola Roberts, Fiona Maclean, Cathal Breen
* European Respiratory Society Clinical Research Collaborations (CRC) proposal: CRC-2022-02 - Moving multiple digital innovations towards connected respiratory care: addressing the over-arching challenges of whole systems implementation (CONNECT) – collaborator (health literacy)
* Co-chair of the pulmonary rehabilitation specialist advisor group at the British Thoracic Society
* Member of the Pulmonary rehabilitation pulmonary rehabilitation guidelines group, British Thoracic society
* Member of the Healthcare Technologies Research Group, School of Social and Health Care (Sighthill Campus), Edinburgh Napier University, Edinburgh

It was agreed that her declaration would not prevent Ms Roberts from providing expert advice to the committee.

* **Prof William Man** has declared a financial interest due to:
* Private practice – Alongside my NHS consultant role, I deliver private outpatient respiratory services. As part of these services, I might recommend referral to pulmonary rehabilitation as part of an overall management plan. However I do not directly deliver pulmonary rehabilitation nor have any financial interest in any organization that delivers private pulmonary rehabilitation.

Prof Manhas also declared a non-financial

professional and personal interest due to:

* Honorary President for the Association for Respiratory Technology and Physiology (ARTP) – this is a 2 year term which will terminate in March 2024. The ARTP’s interests are principally in the field of lung function and sleep services including the use of technology. The ARTP does not have pulmonary rehabilitation This post is not renumerated.
* Co-Chair, British Thoracic Society Clinical Statement on Pulmonary Rehabilitation. I am the co-chair of a committee that will be publishing the BTS Clinical Statement on Pulmonary Rehabilitation. This is expected in Q3 of 2023-2024. The statement will include a section on alternative methods of delivering pulmonary rehabilitation including digital pulmonary rehabilitation technologies. This post is not renumerated.
* Research interests – I am widely published in pulmonary rehabilitation, although not specifically on digital pulmonary rehabilitation delivery. I have co-authored two publications which documents the digital literacy of people referred for pulmonary rehabilitation.
* I am a co-applicant on a SBRI grant awarded to a commercial company, Aseptika, that produces an app that supports digital delivery of pulmonary rehabilitation. I have no financial interests in Aseptika and received no payments from this company. My organisation has received research funding through this grant in order to employ research staff to manage the independent evaluation of the app.
* I will be taking up the post of Secretary, Group 1.02 Chronic care and rehabilitation of the European Respiratory Society. This group organises sessions at the European Respiratory Society congress, some of which may include pulmonary rehabilitation.

It was agreed that his declaration would not prevent Prof Man from providing expert advice to the committee.

* **Ms Tessa Jelen** has declared a non-financial professional and personal interest as she is a Volunteer Lead for Breathe Easy Westminster support group. Interest in improving self management facilities for those with respiratory conditions.

It was agreed that her declaration would not prevent Ms Jelen from providing expert advice to the committee.

No other interests were declared at the meeting.

* + 1. The Chair led a discussion of the evidence presented to the committee. This information was presented to the committee by lead committee member Avril McCarthy and lead specialist committee member Dr Enya Daynes.
  1. Part 2a – Closed session (company representatives and members of the public were asked to leave the meeting).
  2. Part 2b – Closed session (external assessment group representatives were asked to leave the meeting).
     1. The committee then agreed on the content of the draft Early Value Assessment. The committee decision was reached by consensus.
     2. The committee asked the NICE technical team to prepare the draft Early Value Assessment in line with their decisions.

## 5. Date of the next meeting

The next virtual meeting of the Medical Technologies Advisory Committee (MTAC) will be held on 8th December 2023 and will start promptly at 09:00am.