A review of the effectiveness and cost-effectiveness of personal, social and health education in secondary schools focusing on sex and relationships and alcohol education for young people aged 11 to 19 years

ALCOHOL EDUCATION FOREST PLOTS

Lisa Jones, Geoff Bates, Jennifer Downing, Harry Sumnall, Mark A Bellis Centre for Public Health, Liverpool John Moores University



PSHE Secondary school and FE review

Table of figures

Figure 1. Classroom-based programmes (alcohol specific): Alcohol consumption [1]	3
Figure 2. Classroom-based (alcohol-specific): Alcohol consumption [2]	
Figure 3. Classroom-based (alcohol-specific): Heavy alcohol use	
Figure 4. Classroom-based (substance use): Alcohol consumption	
Figure 5. Classroom-based (substance use): Heavy alcohol use	7
Figure 6. Brief behavioural/single session: 30-day alcohol consumption	8
Figure 7. Brief behavioural/single session: Alcohol use frequency	9
Figure 8. Brief behavioural/single session: Heavy alcohol use	10

Figure 1. Classroom-based programmes (alcohol specific): Alcohol consumption [1]

Study	Programme	Odds Ratio 95% CI	Odds Ratio 95% CI
1) Weekly alcohol use			
Short-term programme effect	ts (<6 months)		
McBride 2004 (end of Yr 1)	SHAHRP	0.81 [0.63, 1.04]	
McBride 2004	SHAHRP	0.71 [0.58, 0.86]	
Long-term programme effect	ts (>12 months)		
McBride 2004	SHAHRP	0.80 [0.66, 0.97]	
2) Monthly alcohol use			
Short-term programme effect	ts (<6 months)		
McBride 2004 (end of Yr 1)	SHAHRP	0.78 [0.63, 0.97]	
McBride 2004	SHAHRP	0.94 [0.77, 1.14]	- 1
Long-term programme effect	ts (>12 months)		
McBride 2004	SHAHRP	0.91 [0.75, 1.10]	
3) Lifetime alcohol use			
Short-term programme effec	ts (<6 months)		
Morgenstern 2009	Unnamed	0.81 [0.57, 1.16]	
Medium-term programme ef	fects (up to 12 mo	onths)	
Morgenstern 2009	Unnamed	0.90 [0.67, 1.21]	
			0.2 0.5 1 2 5 Favours intervention Favours control

Figure 2. Classroom-based (alcohol-specific): Alcohol consumption [2]

Study		Std. Mean Difference 95% CI	Std. Mean Differenc 95% CI	е	
Short-term programme effect	cts (<6 months)				
Shope 1994 abstainer	Enhanced AMPS	0.03 [-0.09, 0.15]			
Shope 1994 supervised	Enhanced AMPS	0.03 [-0.21, 0.27]	-		
Shope 1994 unsupervised	Enhanced AMPS	-0.03 [-0.40, 0.35]	•	-	
	Subtotal (95% CI)	0.02 [-0.08, 0.13]	•		
McBride 2004 (end of Yr 1)	SHAHRP	-0.09 [-0.18, 0.01]			
McBride 2004	SHAHRP	-0.07 [-0.16, 0.02]	-		
Long-term programme effect	ts (<6 months)				
McBride 2004	SHAHRP	-0.08 [-0.18, 0.01]	-		
Shope 1996a	AMPS	-0.08 [-0.20, -0.05]			
		-1 Favour	-0.5 0	0.5 avours control	1

Figure 3. Classroom-based (alcohol-specific): Heavy alcohol use

Study	Programme	Odds Ratio 95% CI	Odds Ratio 95% CI	
1) Risky drinking: hazardous/	/harmful ≥1 per month			
Short-term programme effect	cts (<6 months)			
McBride 2004 (end of Yr 1)	SHAHRP	0.72 [0.54, 0.95]		
McBride 2004	SHAHRP	0.57 [0.47, 0.70]		
Long-term programme effect	ts (>12 months)			
McBride 2004	SHAHRP	0.93 [0.76, 1.13]		
2) Lifetime drunkenness				
Short-term programme effec	cts (<6 months)			
Morgenstern 2009	Unnamed	0.70 [0.48, 1.02]		
Medium-term programme ef	fects (up to 12 months)			
Morgenstern 2009	Unnamed	0.77 [0.52, 1.13]		
3) Lifetime binge drinking				
Short-term programme effec	ts (<6 months)			
Morgenstern 2009	Unnamed	0.56 [0.41, 0.77]		
Medium-term programme ef	fects (up to 12 months)			
Morgenstern 2009	Unnamed	0.74 [0.57, 0.97]		
		⊢		
		0.2	2 0.5 1 Favours intervention	2 5 Favours control
			i avours intervention	1 avours control

Figure 4. Classroom-based (substance use): Alcohol consumption

Study	Programme	Std. Mean Difference 95% CI	Std. Mean Difference 95% CI
1) Regular alcohol use			
Long-term programme effect	ts (>12 months)		
Spoth 2005	LST + SPF	-0.08 [-0.22, 0.06]	-
Spoth 2005	LST	-0.02 [-0.16, 0.12]	-
2) Recent alcohol use			
Long-term programme effect	ts (>12 months)		
Hecht 2003	Keepin it REAL	-0.17 [-0.29, -0.04]	
Hecht 2003	Keepin it REAL	-0.16 [-0.26, -0.06]	
Hecht 2003	Keepin it REAL	-0.15 [-0.27, -0.03]	
3) Drinks/occasion			
Short-term programme effect	cts (<6 months)		
Cuijpers 2001 (end of Yr 1)	HSDP	-0.06 [-0.15, 0.03]	
Cuijpers 2001 (end of Yr 2)	HSDP	-0.09 [-0.19, 0.01]	
Cuijpers 2001 (end of Yr 3)	HSDP	-0.21 [-0.31, -0.11]	
4) Drinks/week			
Short-term programme effect	cts (<6 months)		
Cuijpers 2001 (end of Yr 1)	HSDP	0.04 [-0.05, 0.13]	+-
Cuijpers 2001 (end of Yr 2)	HSDP	-0.11 [-0.20, -0.02]	
Cuijpers 2001 (end of Yr 3)	HSDP	-0.16 [-0.26, -0.06]	
Medium-term programme ef	ffects (up to 12 mon	ths)	
Shope 1996b	Based on AMPS	-0.58 [-0.79, -0.37]	
		-1	-0.5 0 0.5 1 urs intervention Favours control

Figure 5. Classroom-based (substance use): Heavy alcohol use

	Odds Ratio		Odds	s Ratio	
Study or Subgroup	IV, Fixed, 95% CI		IV, Fixe	d, 95% CI	
1) Binge drinking					
Botvin 2001b LT	0.41 [0.22, 0.75]				
Botvin 2001b MT	0.41 [0.18, 0.93]	—			
2) Drunkenness					
Faggiano 2008	0.72 [0.58, 0.90]				
Faggiano 2008	0.62 [0.43, 0.89]				
		0.2	0.5	1 2	5
			Favours intervention	Favours control	

Figure 6. Brief behavioural/single session: 30-day alcohol consumption

		Odds Ratio		Odd	s Ratio		
Study	Programme	95% CI	95% CI		95% CI		
Short-term programme effects (<6	months)						
Werch 1996b	STARS for Families	0.51 [0.12, 2.13]					
Werch 2000a (end of 7 th grade)	STARS for Families	0.57 [0.31, 1.07]			+		
Werch 2001 (end of 6 th grade)	STARS for Families	0.66 [0.39, 1.11]					
Werch 1998	STARS for Families	0.79 [0.24, 2.59]	-			_	
Medium-term programme effects	(up to 12 months)				_		
Werch 1998	STARS for Families	1.64 [0.38, 7.15]					
			 	-		-	
			0.1 0.2	0.5	1 2	5	10
			Favours interve	ention	Favours	control	

Figure 7. Brief behavioural/single session: Alcohol use frequency

Study	Programme	Std. Mean Difference 95% CI	Std. Mean Difference 95% Cl	
Short-term programme effect	s (<6 months)			
Werch 1996a	STARS for Families	-0.46 [-0.85, -0.06]		
Werch 1998	STARS for Families	-0.09 [-0.38, 0.19]		
Werch 2005a	STARS for Families	-0.21 [-0.44, 0.02]		
Werch 2005a	STARS for Families Plus	0.06 [-0.18, 0.29]	- 	
Werch 2005b	Project SPORT	-0.32 [-0.49, -0.16]	-	
Werch 2005c (beer)	Alcohol beverage tailored	-0.21 [-0.48, 0.07]		
Werch 2005c (wine)	Alcohol beverage tailored	0.07 [-0.21, 0.34]		
Werch 2005c (cooler)	Alcohol beverage tailored	-0.05 [-0.33, 0.22]		
Werch 2005c (liquor)	Alcohol beverage tailored	-0.33 [-0.61, -0.05]		
Werch 2005c (spirits)	Alcohol beverage tailored	-0.06 [-0.34, 0.22]		
Werch 2005c (fortified wine)	Alcohol beverage tailored	-0.10 [-0.38, 0.18]	- +-	
Werch 2008b	Brief image based messages	-1.62 [-1.85, -1.39] —		
Medium-term programme eff	ects (up to 12 months)			
Werch 2005b	Project SPORT	-0.04 [-0.21, 0.13]		
Werch 1998	STARS for Families	0.11 [-0.22, 0.44]		
		——		+
		-2 F	-1 0 Favours Intervention Fa	1 2 avours control

Figure 8. Brief behavioural/single session: Heavy alcohol use

Study	Programme	Std. Mean Difference 95% CI		n Difference % Cl
Short-term programme ef	fects (<6 months)			
Werch 1996a	STARS for Families	-0.38 [-0.77, 0.02]	-	
Werch 2005a	STARS for Families Plus	0.25 [0.02, 0.48]		_
Werch 2005a	STARS for Families	0.17 [-0.06, 0.40]		
Werch 2005b	Project SPORT	-0.27 [-0.44, -0.11]	-	
Werch 2005c (beer)	Alcohol beverage tailored	-0.12 [-0.39, 0.16]	-	
Werch 2005c (wine)	Alcohol beverage tailored	-0.07 [-0.35, 0.21]		
Werch 2005c (cooler)	Alcohol beverage tailored	-0.20 [-0.47, 0.08]		
Werch 2005c (liquor)	Alcohol beverage tailored	-0.25 [-0.53, 0.03]		-
Werch 2005c (spirits)	Alcohol beverage tailored	-0.24 [-0.52, 0.04]		-
Werch 2008b	Brief image based messages	-1.63 [-1.87, -1.40]	-	
Medium-term programme	e effects (up to 12 months)			
Werch 2005b	Project SPORT	-0.16 [-0.33, 0.02]	-+	
		 -		
		-2	-1	0 1 2
			Favours intervention	Favours control