NATIONAL INSTITUTE FOR HEALTH AND CLINICAL EXCELLENCE

GUIDANCE EXECUTIVE (GE)

Consideration of consultation responses on review proposal

Review of TA169; Sunitinib for the first-line treatment of advanced and/or metastatic renal cell carcinoma and TA178; Bevacizumab (first-line), sorafenib (first- and second-line), sunitinib (second-line) and temsirolimus (first-line) for the treatment of advanced and/or metastatic renal cell carcinoma

This guidance was issued in March 2009 (TA169) / August 2009 (TA178).

The review date for this guidance is June 2011 (deferred from February 2011 for TA169).

Background

At the GE meeting of 28 February 2012 it was agreed we would consult on the review plans for this guidance. A four week consultation has been conducted with consultees and commentators and the responses are presented below.

Proposal put to consultees:	The guidance should be transferred to the 'static guidance list'.	
Rationale for selecting this proposal	All companies involved state that there is no significant new evidence to warrant a review at this time. Consequently, TA169 and TA178 should be transferred to the static list of technology appraisals. The appraisals can be brought back into the active list of appraisals if NICE are informed at a later date of significant new evidence that could imply re-consideration of a review is needed.	

GE is asked to consider the original proposal in the light of the comments received from consultees and commentators, together with any responses from the appraisal team. It is asked to agree on the final course of action for the review.

Recommendation	The guidance should be transferred to the 'static guidance list'.	
post		
consultation:		

Respondent	Response to proposal	Details	Comment from Technology Appraisals
Roche Products	Agree	Roche is not aware of any new evidence relevant to this guidance, and therefore agree with the Institute's proposal that TA169 and TA178 should be transferred to the static list of technology appraisals.	Comment noted.
GlaxoSmithKline	Agree	We are in agreement with NICE's proposal to move guidance reviews of TA169 and TA178 to a static list.	Comment noted.
Healthcare Improvement	No comment	Healthcare Improvement Scotland has no comment to make on the proposal to transfer this appraisal to the static list and we have noted this in our records.	Comment noted.

Respondent	Response to proposal	Details	Comment from Technology Appraisals
James Whale Fund for Kidney Cancer Disagree The Axis trial has demonstrated clear benefit for Axitinib over Sorafenib in patients who have failed Sunitinib. This is the first time one targeted drug has shown superiority over another targeted agent in kidney cancer. In the absence of and NICE approved 2nd line therapy in renal cancer patients, there is a desperate need for axitinib to help in the treatment of their disease.		Comment noted. A separate single technology appraisal of axitinib for the treatment of advanced renal cell carcinoma after failure of prior systemic treatment has been proposed as part of the NICE work programme in order to produce timely guidance on its use in the NHS.	
Bayer Schering	Agree	We would support NICE's proposal to transfer TA169 and TA178 to the static list	Comment noted.
Medicines and Healthcare Products Regulatory Agency	No comment	We have no comments for this appraisal.	Comment noted.
National Cancer Research Institute / Royal College of Physicians / Royal College of Radiologists / Association of Cancer Physicians	Agree	The NCRI/RCP/RCR/ACP/JCCO agrees with the NICE proposal to move the guidance to the static list. Our experts are aware of no new evidence at present in this area.	Comment noted.

Respondent	Response to proposal	Details	Comment from Technology Appraisals
Royal College of Nursing	No comment	The feedback received from nurses working in this area of health suggest that there are no additional comments to be submitted on behalf of the Royal College of Nursing on the review of the above appraisal.	Comment noted.

No response received from:

Manufacturers/sponsors	General
Pfizer (sunitinib) (temsirolimus)	Board of Community Health Councils in Wales
	British National Formulary
Patient/carer groups	Care Quality Commission
Afiya Trust	Commissioning Support Appraisals Service
Black Health Agency	Department of Health, Social Services and Public Safety for
British Kidney Patient Association	Northern Ireland
Cancer Black Care	 National Association of Primary Care
Cancer Equality	NHS Alliance
Cancer52	NHS Commercial Medicines Unit
Chinese National Healthy Living Centre	NHS Confederation
Counsel and Care	Public Health Wales NHS Trust
Equalities National Council	Scottish Medicines Consortium
Helen Rollason Heal Cancer Charity	Welsh Kidney Patients Association
Kidney Alliance	
Kidney Cancer UK	Comparator manufacturers
Kidney Research UK	Novartis Pharmaceuticals (interleukin-2)
Macmillan Cancer Support	Roche Products (interferon alpha)

Maggie's Centres	Relevant research groups
Marie Curie Cancer Care	 Institute of Cancer Research
Muslim Council of Britain	MRC Clinical Trials Unit
Muslim Health Network	National Cancer Research Network
National Kidney Federation	National Institute for Health Research
Rarer Cancers Foundation	 Research Institute of the Care of Older People
 South Asian Health Foundation 	
Specialised Healthcare Alliance	Assessment Group
Sue Ryder Care	• tbc
Tenovus	 National Institute for Health Research Health Technology Assessment Programme
Professional groups	
Association of Renal Industries	Associated Guideline Groups
British Association for Services to the Elderly	 National Collaborating Centre for Cancer
British Association of Urological Nurses	
British Geriatrics Society	Associated Public Health Groups
British Institute of Radiology	None
British Oncological Association	
British Psychosocial Oncology Society	
British Renal Society	
Cancer Network Pharmacists Forum	
Cancer Research UK	
Renal Association	
Renal Pharmacy Group	
Royal College of General Practitioners	
Royal College of Pathologists	
Royal Pharmaceutical Society	
Royal Society of Medicine	
Society and College of Radiographers	
Society for DGH Nephrologists	

 United Kingdom Clinical Pharmacy Association United Kingdom Oncology Nursing Society 	
<u>Others</u>	
Department of Health	
NHS Wakefield District	
South Staffordshire NHS PCT	
Welsh Government	

GE paper sign-off: Frances Sutcliffe Associate Director – Technology Appraisals Programme 30 April 2012

Contributors to this paper:

- Technical Lead: Matthew Dyer
- Technical Adviser: Zoe Charles
- Project Manager: Andrew Kenyon

30 April 2012