From:	
Sent:	03 June 2009 15:53
To:	
Cc:	
Subject:	RE: Appeal - Initial scrutiny letter: renal cell carcinoma -

bevacizumab, sorafenib, sunitinib and temsirolimus

Dear .

Thank you very much foryou letter of 19th May regarding our appeal points for the above appeal.

In relation to point 3 (the basis for the committee's conclusions with regard to tolerability of bevacizumab plus IFNa is unclear) Roche would expand on this point by noting that theissue seems to be that the Committee has not explained in the FAD, adequately or at all, what evidence was relied upon for the conclusions drawn with respect to the incidence of adverse events associated with bevacizumab. Paragraph 4.3.8 of the FAD states that this was based on the evidence of "clinical specialists and patient experts"; however the written statements we can find in the Evaluation Report from such persons and published on NICE's website, do not support the conclusion drawn. The reasoning is unclear and, possibly, the evidence relied upon has not been disclosed (we cannot of course know that until we know what the evidence was).

In relation to point 4 (the conclusions reached on the side effect profile of bevacizumab plus IFNa are perverse) Roche would expand on this point by noting that we have made a "best guess" as to the basis for NICE's conclusions at paragraph 4.3.8 of the FAD and believe that reliance upon such evidence for the purposes of the conclusions drawn is perverse. Our interpretation of the adverse event data which is described by the Committee and that which was made available to the Committee suggests that the conclusion drawn is inappropriate. Roche submitted as part of the appraisal a side-by-side analysis of the adverse event profile of both bevacizumab and sutent and our point here is further reinforced by the contrasting conclusions drawn by the Committee about the adverse event profile for sutent.

We would therefore like to respectfully request that we are permitted tokeep both appeal points 3 and 4 for further discussion at the oral hearing.

Best wishes.

Healthcare Management Director Roche 6 Falcon Way Shire Park Welwyn Garden City AL7 1TW

Registration in England No: 100674



http://careers.roche.com/wms/roche_uk/

The information transmitted in this message is intended only for the person or entity to which it is addressed and may contain confidential and/or privileged material. Any review, retransmission, dissemination or other use of, or taking of any action in reliance upon, this information by person or persons or entities other than the intended recipient is prohibited. If you receive this message in error, please contact the sender and delete the material from any computer.

Please consider the environment before printing this email.