# NATIONAL INSTITUTE FOR HEALTH AND CARE EXCELLENCE

Centre for Health Technology Evaluation

# Diagnostics Advisory Committee (DAC) meeting minutes

**Minutes:** Confirmed

**Date and time:** Thursday 23 March 2023

**Location:** Via Zoom

## Attendees

Committee members present

1. Brian Shine (Chair) Present for all items
2. Rebecca Allcock Present for all items
3. Sam Creavin Present for all items
4. Diane Davies Present for all items
5. Neil Hawkins Present for all items
6. Rashmi Kumar Present for all items
7. Patrick McGinley Present for all items
8. Michael Messenger Present for all items
9. Radha Ramachandran Present for all items
10. Anne Scott Present for all items
11. Karen Sennett Present for all items
12. Matt Stevenson Present for all items
13. Jonathan Weir-McCall Present for all items

NICE staff present

Rebecca Albrow, Associate Director, Diagnostics Assessment Present for all items

Programme (DAP)

Frances Nixon, Health Technology Assessment Adviser, DAP Present for all items

Suvi Harmala, Health Technology Assessment Analyst, DAP Present for all items

Alice Bell, Associate Health Technology Assessment Analyst

Toni Gasse, Project Manager, DAP Present for all items

Harriet Wilson, Project Manager, DAP Present for all items

Alex Sexton, Administrator, DAP Present for all items

Emma Gordon, Meetings in Public Present for items 1 to 1.1.5

External assessment group representatives present

Peter Auguste, Health Economist, Warwick Evidence Present for items 1 to 1.1.5

Yen-Fu Chen, Associate Professor, Warwick Evidence Present for items 1 to 1.1.5

Julia Geppert, Research Fellow, Warwick Evidence Present for items 1 to 1.1.5

**Specialist Committee Members present**

Phil Crosbie, Senior Lecturer in Respiratory Medicine, Present for all items  
University of Manchester

Sujal Desai, Consultant Radiologist, Royal Brompton Hospital Present for all items   
Emma O'Dowd, Consultant Respiratory Physician, Nottingham Present for all items   
University Hospitals NHS Trust

Nagmi Qureshi, Consultant Radiologist, Royal Papworth Present for all items  
Hospital NHS Foundation Trust

John Reynolds, Consultant Radiologist, University Hospitals Present for all items  
Birmingham NHS FT

James Shambrook, Consultant Cardiothoracic Radiologist, Present for all items  
University Hospital Southampton

Alan Thomas, Lay specialist committee member Present for all items

Observers present

Ben Gregory, Finance/Business Analyst Present for all items

Korn Knight, Senior Medical Editor Present for all items

## Lyn Woodward Present for items 1 to 1.1.5

## Minutes

### Assessment of ‘Software with artificial intelligence derived algorithms for automated detection and analysis of lung nodules from CT scan images’

### The Chair welcomed members of the committee and other attendees present to the meeting.

The Chair noted apologies from standing committee members Keith Abrams, Ghada Ahmed, John Cairns, and Brendan Meyer, and from specialist committee member Seamus Grundy. In addition he noted that Joy Allen would not attend due to conflicts of interests.

* 1. Part 1 – Open session

The Chair welcomed external assessment group representatives, members of the public, and company representatives from Aidence BV, ContextFlow, Fujifilm Medical, Infervision UK Ltd, SynApps Solutions Limited/Mevis, and Varien/Siemens.

* + 1. The Chair asked all committee members to declare any new relevant interests in relation to the topic being considered in addition to those declared in advance of the meeting. The following standing committee members had notified these interests in advance of the meeting:

Joy Allen had declared a financial interest as she is an employee of Roche Diagnostics. Roche Diagnostics UK and Ireland are partners in the following research studies which are ongoing: (1) DART: The Integration and Analysis of Data using Artificial Intelligence to Improve Patient Outcomes with Thoracic Diseases. (2) iDx Lung: Lung Health Checks in Wessex and Yorkshire: Integrated Biomarker Studies. She is not actively involved in either of these projects but members of her team (Access and Innovation) are. She also declared an indirect interest in that Roche is in partnership with Medial EarlySign who have developed an AI based clinical support tool, LungFlag for early flagging of potential patients for Lung Cancer Screening. It was agreed that these interests meant that Joy Allen could not participate in the meeting, and she did not attend.

Neil Hawkins declared that alongside his academic role he has provided advice and undertaken analysis for a number of pharmaceutical and biotech companies related to HTA activities and is listed as a director of a company providing HTA services. He has not provided consultancy to any of the stakeholders listed for this assessment. He also declared non-financial professional and personal interests: as part of his university employment (University of Glasgow) he was a member of the TSET (Technology Specific Evaluation Team) that was assigned to perform an evaluation of the Behold.ai Red Dot technology as part of its Evaluation for Artificial Intelligence (AI) in Health and Care Award. However contracting was not completed and the University of Glasgow is no longer involved in this evaluation. In addition, as part of his university employment he is involved in a proposal for funding to evaluate an AI technology developed by Qure.ai. The University is partnering with Qure.ai to obtain funding. If funded the project will be financed by the Scottish Government. The money is received by the University of Glasgow. It was agreed that these interests would not prevent Neil Hawkins from participating in the assessment.

Patrick McGinley declared a financial interest as he is a Faculty Member of MTech Access, providing advice on NHS finance structure, pricing and tariff developments. He also declared non-financial professional and personal interests as he is a Strategic Council member of the All-Party Parliamentary Group (APPG) on Obesity, Honorary Treasurer for the Association for Study of Obesity (ASO) and a Member of Obesity Policy Engagement Network UK (OPEN UK). It was agreed that these interests would not prevent Patrick McGinley from participating in the meeting.

Michael Messenger declared financial interests as he is a Director at Insightful Health Ltd, a UK based public health and regulatory consultancy firm. He is or has recently been a paid consultant for: The European Union IMI programme (since 2018), the World Health Organisation (since 2022) and is currently consulting for WHO on AI / TB; the Bill and Melinda Gates Foundation (since 2022); FIND – the global alliance for diagnostics (since 2022); ACT-IVD (since 2022); as well as PinPoint Data Science Ltd (interest ceased 2020) and Cepheid (interest ceased 2020). He is a co-inventor of the PinPoint Cancer Test (Pinpoint Data Science Ltd) and as such may be eligible for a share of royalties from any sales. He was previously a CI on the YCR funded Yorkshire Lung Screening trial from March 2018 to October 2020 and the iDX-LUNG trial from August 2019 to October 2020. It was agreed that these interests would not prevent Michael Messenger from participating in the meeting.

Jonathan Weir-McCall declared financial interests due to private practice (Private Radiology Practice Group, Royal Papworth Radiology Group). He also declared non-financial professional and personal interests as he is Treasurer of British Society of Cardiovascular Imaging – Specialist Interest Group to the Royal College of Radiologists. He further declared indirect interests as he is on the Executive Committee of the British Society of Cardiovascular Magnetic Resonance, and he is on the Guideline Committee of the Society of Cardiovascular Computed Tomography. It was agreed that these interests would not prevent Jonathan Weir-McCall from participating in the meeting.

The following specialist committee members had notified these interests in advance of the meeting:

Phil Crosbie declared financial interests due to consultancy fees and share options for lung cancer early detection and screening from Everest Detection, a biotechnology startup company (Everest Detection do not currently have a product); honoraria from Novartis for a lung cancer survey design (interest ceased 2020); and honoraria from AstraZeneca for a lung cancer screening talk and round table discussion (interest ceased 2020). He also declared non-financial professional and personal interests as he was the co-applicant on a grant submitted to NIHR involving commercial partner Infervision and AI approaches to chest CT interpretation (interest arose and ceased 2021), and he was co-applicant on a grant submitted to NIHR involving commercial partner Mindshare and AI approaches to chest CT interpretation (interest arose and ceased 2021), It was agreed that these interests would not prevent Phil Crosbie from participating in the meeting.

Sujal Desai declared financial interests as he is the Founder/Co-Director, DMC-Radiology Reporting Ltd (out-sourced radiology reporting service); tutor, Boehringer-Ingelheim interstitial lung disease educational courses (paid honoraria & expenses); and external expert/steering committee member for Astra Zeneca Phase III trial (paid consultancy fee). He also declared that he undertakes private practice (Cromwell Hospital, Royal Brompton Hospital, OneWelbeck Lung Health Group) (variable payments depending on workload). He also declared non-financial professional and personal interests as he is a Technical Adviser, Qure.AI, evaluating their nodule detection software and only advising on issues/deficiencies, as any potential user might. He has no financial relationship with Qure.AI and has never been paid by Qure.AI. He further declared that he is a Specialist Training Committee Member, Royal College of Radiologists, and an FRCR 2B examiner, Royal College of Radiologists. It was agreed that these interests would not prevent Sujal Desai from participating in the meeting.

James Shambrook declared non-financial professional and personal interests as he is President of the British Society of Cardiovascular Imaging/ British Society of Cardiovascular CT (this society does not advise on the management of pulmonary nodules). He also declared an indirect interest as he gave a presentation to the BIR conference in November 2020 about “The role of AI in developing the targeted lung health check programme”, he was invited to give this talk because of his institution’s use of Veye Chest from Aidence. No money was received for this talk. It was agreed that these interests would not prevent James Shambrook from participating in the meeting.

Emma O’Dowd declared non-financial professional and personal interests as she is the co-author on research looking at the role of artificial intelligence in pulmonary nodule risk stratification and co-author on editorials relating to nodules in lung cancer screening but these are not specifically related to the matter under review, there is no ongoing research related to this, and she does not have any affiliations related to this research. It was agreed that these interests would not prevent Emma O’Dowd from participating in the meeting.

* + 1. The Committee proceeded to discuss the comments made during the public consultation for the ‘Software with artificial intelligence derived algorithms for automated detection and analysis of lung nodules from CT scan images’. The Committee was asked if there were any specific equality issues to consider in relation to this assessment.
    2. The Chair asked the representatives of the manufacturers whether they wished to comment on any matters of factual accuracy.
    3. The Chair thanked the manufacturer representatives, the EAG and public observers for their attendance at the meeting.
    4. The Chair explained that “representatives of the press and other members of the public be excluded from the remainder of this meeting having regard to the confidential nature of the business to be transacted, publicity on which would be prejudicial to the public interest (Section 1(2) Public Bodies (Admission to Meetings) Act 1960)” and all public attendees left the meeting.
  1. Part 2 - Closed session
     1. The committee discussed confidential information submitted for this item.
     2. The committee then agreed on the content of the Diagnostics Guidance Document (DGD). The committee decision was reached by consensus.
     3. The committee asked the NICE technical team to prepare the DGD in line with their decisions.

### Date of the next meeting

The next meeting of the Diagnostics Advisory Committee (next topic) will be held on 18 April 2023.