

Technology Appraisal Committee Meeting (Committee B)

Minutes: Confirmed

Date and Time: Thursday 11 June 2015

Venue: Prospero House
241 Borough High Street
London
SE1 1GA

Present:	1. Chair, Dr Amanda Adler	Present for all notes
	2. Vice Chair, Professor Ken Stein	Present for all notes
	3. Dr Jeff Aronson	Present for all notes
	4. Professor John Cairns	Present for all notes
	5. Mr Matthew Campbell-Hill	Present for all notes
	6. Mark Chapman	Present for all notes
	7. Dr Neil Iosson	Present for all notes
	8. Mrs Anne Joshua	Present for all notes
	9. Dr Sanjay Kinra	Present for all notes
	10. Dr Miriam McCarthy	Present for all notes
	11. Professor Ruairidh Milne	Present for all notes
	12. Mr Christopher O'Regan	Present for all notes
	13. Professor Stephen Palmer	Present for all notes
	14. Dr Sanjeev Patel	Present for all notes
	15. Dr John Pounsford	Present for all notes
	16. Dr Danielle Preedy	Present for all notes
	17. Mr Alun Roebuck	Present for all notes
	18. Dr Nicky Welton	Present for all notes
	19. Mr David Thomson	Present for all notes

In attendance:

Meindert Boysen	Programme Director, National Institute for Health and Care Excellence	Present for all notes
Dr Elisabeth George	Associate Director, National Institute for Health and Care Excellence	Present for all notes
Jeremy Powell	Project Manager, National Institute for Health and Care Excellence	Present for all notes
Stuart Wood	Administrator, National Institute for Health and Care Excellence	Present for all notes
Richard Diaz	Technical Analyst, National Institute for	Present for notes 1 to 17

Health and Care Excellence

Dr Melinda Goodall	Technical Adviser, National Institute for Health and Clinical Excellence	Present for notes 1 to 17
Sarah Davis	Senior Lecturer in Health Economics, School of Health and Related Research (SchARR) - Sheffield	Present for notes 1 to 16
Marissa Martyn St- James	Research Fellow, School of Health and Related Research (SchARR) - Sheffield	Present for notes 1 to 16
Jean Sanderson	Research Associate, School of Health and Related Research (SchARR) - Sheffield	Present for notes 1 to 16
Mr David Brookfield	Patient expert nominated by the National Osteoporosis Society	Present for notes 1 to 16
Dr Graham Davenport	Clinical expert nominated by the Primary Care Rheumatology Society	Present for notes 1 to 16
Dr Nicholas Harvey	Clinical experts nominated by the British Society for Rheumatology	Present for notes 1 to 16
Dr Nicola Peel	Clinical expert nominated by the National Osteoporosis Society	Present for notes 1 to 16

Non-public observers:

Helen Barnett	NICE Editing Staff	Present for all notes
Rebecca Dittrich	NICE International Staff	Present for all notes
Heidi Livingstone	NICE PIP Staff	Present for all notes

Notes

Welcome

1. The Chair welcomed all members of the Committee and other attendees present to the meeting. The Chair reviewed the agenda and timescales for the meeting, which included the appraisals of bisphosphonates for preventing osteoporotic fragility fractures (including a partial update of NICE technology appraisal guidance 160 and 161).
2. The Chair informed the Committee of the non-public observers at this meeting: Barnett, Dittrich, Livingstone

3. Apologies were received from Dr Ray Armstrong, Professor Imran Chaudhry, Professor Daniel Hochhauser and Dr Marta Soares

Any other Business

4. None

Appraisal of bisphosphonates for preventing osteoporotic fragility fractures (including a partial update of NICE technology appraisal guidance 160 and 161)

Part 1 – Open session

5. The Chair welcomed the invited experts: Mr David Brookfield, Dr Graham Davenport, Dr Nicholas Harvey, Dr Nicola Peel, Sarah Davis, Marissa Martyn St-James and Jean Sanderson to the meeting and they introduced themselves to the Committee.
6. The Chair welcomed company representatives from Actavis and Rosemont to the meeting.
7. The Chair asked all Committee members to declare any relevant interests
 - 7.1. Dr Amanda Adler, Professor Ken Stein, Dr Jeff Aronson, Professor John Cairns, Mark Chapman, Dr Neil Iosson, Anne Joshua, Dr Sanjay Kinra, Dr Miriam McCarthy, Professor Ruairidh Milne, Professor Stephen Palmer, Dr Sanjeev Patel, Professor John Pounsford, Alun Roebuck, Dr Nicky Welton and David Thomson all declared that they knew of no personal specific pecuniary interest, personal non-specific pecuniary interest, non-personal specific pecuniary interest, non-personal non-specific pecuniary interest, personal specific family interest or personal non-specific family interest for any of the technologies to be considered as part of the appraisal of bisphosphonates for preventing osteoporotic fragility fractures (including a partial update of NICE technology appraisal guidance 160 and 161).
 - 7.2. Matthew Campbell-Hill stated that he is set to take up a position as a non-executive director at the MHRA.
 - 9.2.1 It was agreed that this was not a conflict of interest
 - 7.3. Chris O'Regan stated that his employer, Merck Sharp and Dohme were listed as a comparator manufacturer as they manufactured alendronate.
 - 7.3.1. It was agreed that since alendronate was a generic drug this should not be regarded as a conflict of interest.
 - 7.4. Dr Danielle Preedy stated that she is currently leading some consultancy work for the National Osteoporosis Society. Her institution will receive payment for this work
 - 9.3.1 It was agreed that this was not a conflict of interest
8. The Chair asked all other invited guests assessment group and invited experts, not including observers) to declare their relevant interests.
 - 8.1. Dr Nicola Peel declared that she knew of no personal specific pecuniary interest, personal non-specific pecuniary interest, non-personal specific

pecuniary interest, non-personal non-specific pecuniary interest, personal specific family interest or personal non-specific family interest for any of the technologies to be considered as part of the appraisal of bisphosphonates for preventing osteoporotic fragility fractures (including a partial update of NICE technology appraisal guidance 160 and 161).

- 8.2. David Brookfield declared a non-personal non specific pecuniary interest as he sits on a National Osteoporosis Society. The National Osteoporosis Society receives a small proportion of its funding from pharmaceutical companies.
 - 8.2.1. It was agreed that this conflict would not prevent Mr Brookfield from participating in this part of the meeting.
- 8.3. Dr Nicholas Harvey declared a non specific personal pecuniary interest. Dr Harvey has received honoraria for giving talks at a number of pharmaceutical companies involved with this appraisal. Dr Harvey has also worked with the FRAX group.
 - 8.3.1. It was agreed that this conflict would not prevent Dr Harvey from participating in this part of the meeting
- 8.4. Dr Graham Davenport declared a non specific personal pecuniary interest. Dr Davenport has attended advisory boards and given presentations at meetings and conferences for a number of pharmaceutical companies.
 - 8.4.1. It was agreed that this conflict would not prevent Dr Davenport from participating in this part of the meeting.
9. The Chair introduced the lead team, Mr Matthew Campbell-Hill, Dr Sanjay Patel and Professor Stephen Palmer who gave presentations on the clinical effectiveness and cost effectiveness of bisphosphonates for preventing osteoporotic fragility fractures (including a partial update of NICE technology appraisal guidance 160 and 161)
10. The Committee then discussed the clinical effectiveness, patient perspective and cost effectiveness of bisphosphonates for preventing osteoporotic fragility fractures (including a partial update of NICE technology appraisal guidance 160 and 161) on the basis of the evidence before them, and potential equality issues raised in this appraisal. They sought clarification and advice from the experts present. The discussions included:
 - 10.1. the remit for this appraisal review, that is: to align the treatment recommendations with the NICE clinical guideline for risk assessment (CG146)
 - 10.2. the differences between the 2 risk assessment tools recommended in CG146 (FRAX and QFracture) to estimate absolute fracture risk
 - 10.3. the clinical effectiveness of the bisphosphonates included in the appraisal, for different fracture types
 - 10.4. treatment duration and adherence to treatment with bisphosphonates
 - 10.5. equality issues raised in the previous appraisals
 - 10.6. the discrete simulation model, assumptions in, and inputs to, the model, and net benefit approach developed by the Assessment Group
 - 10.7. the incremental net benefits for the bisphosphonates at different levels of absolute fracture risk obtained in the model
 - 10.8. the fact that with QFracture an increase in the cost effectiveness with increasing risk was seen, whereas with FRAX there was no relationship between risk and cost effectiveness

10.9. that DEXA is used in clinical practice to make treatment decisions

11. The Chair asked the company representatives whether they wished to comment on any matters of factual accuracy.
12. The Chair explained that “representatives of the press and other members of the public be excluded from the remainder of this meeting having regard to the confidential nature of the business to be transacted, publicity on which would be prejudicial to the public interest” (Section 1(2) Public Bodies (Admission to Meetings) Act 1960)” and all public attendees left the meeting.
13. The Chair then thanked the experts, company representatives and academic group for their attendance, participation and contribution to the appraisal and they left the meeting.

Part 2 – Closed session

14. Discussion on confidential information continued. This information was supplied by the company.
15. The Committee continued to discuss the clinical and cost effectiveness of bisphosphonates for preventing osteoporotic fragility fractures (including a partial update of NICE technology appraisal guidance 160 and 161)
16. The Committee agreed to defer a decision on the content of the guidance section of the Appraisal Consultation Document (ACD) until more information and evidence necessary to make clinically meaningful recommendations is made available.

Date, time and venue of the next meeting

17. Thursday 9 July 2015 at Prospero House, 241 Borough High Street, London, SE1 1GA.