

Technology Appraisal Committee Meeting (Committee D)

Minutes: Confirmed

Date and Time: Wednesday 27 January 2016, 10:05-17:25

Venue: National Institute for Health and Care Excellence
Level 1A, City Tower
Piccadilly Plaza
Manchester
M1 4BT

Present:	1. Professor Gary McVeigh (Chair)	Present for all notes
	2. Dr Lindsay Smith (Vice Chair)	Present for all notes
	3. Dr Aomesh Bhatt	Present for all notes
	4. Dr Andrew Black	Present for all notes
	5. Dr David Bowden	Present for all notes
	6. Dr Matthew Bradley	Present for notes 19 to 31
	7. Dr Ian Campbell	Present for all notes
	8. Ms Tracey Cole	Present for all notes
	9. Dr Ian Davidson	Present for all notes
	10. Professor Simon Dixon	Present for all notes
	11. Mrs Susan Dutton	Present for all notes
	12. Dr Alexander Dyker	Present for all notes
	13. Mrs Gillian Ells	Present for all notes
	14. Professor Paula Ghaneh	Present for all notes
	15. Dr Susan Griffin	Present for all notes
	16. Professor Carol Haigh	Present for all notes
	17. Professor John Henderson	Present for all notes
	18. Dr Malcolm Oswald	Present for all notes
	19. Dr Paula Parvulescu	Present for all notes
	20. Dr Mohit Sharma	Present for all notes
	21. Dr Murray Smith	Present for all notes

In attendance:

Dr Anthony Bewley	Clinical Expert nominated by AbbVie	Present for notes 07 to 15
Meindert Boysen	Programme Director, National Institute for Health and Care Excellence	Present for all notes
Nicholas Bird	Patient Expert nominated by Solving Kids Cancer	Present for notes 19 to 28
Tara Burton	Patient Expert nominated	Present for notes 07 to 15

by The Hidradenitis
Suppurativa Trust

Chris Carroll	ERG representative, School of Health and Related Research	Present for notes 01 to 15
Danielle Conroy	Administrator, National Institute for Health and Care Excellence	Present for all notes
Richard Diaz	Technical Analyst, National Institute for Health and Care Excellence	Present for notes 19 to 31
Sally Doss	Technical Analyst, National Institute for Health and Care Excellence	Present for notes 01 to 18
Dr Martin Elliott	Clinical Expert nominated by National Cancer Research Institute	Present for notes 19 to 28
Dr Juliet Gray	Clinical Expert nominated by National Cancer Research Institute	Present for notes 07 to 15
Ceri Harris	Patient Expert nominated by The Hidradenitis Suppurativa Trust	Present for notes 07 to 15
Dr John Ingram	Clinical Expert nominated by The British Association of Dermatologists	Present for notes 07 to 15
Eva Kaltenthaler	ERG representative, School of Health and Related Research	Present for notes 01 to 15
Helen Knight	Associate Director, National Institute for Health and Care Excellence	Present for all notes
Sophie Laurenson	Technical Analyst, National Institute for Health and Care Excellence	Present for notes 01 to 18
Kate Moore	Project Manager, National Institute for	Present for all notes

	Health and Care Excellence	
Andrew Rawdin	ERG representative, School of Health and Related Research	Present for notes 01 to 15
Claire Rothery	ERG representative, Centre for Reviews and Dissemination and Centre for Health Economics York	Present for notes 19 to 28
Pedro Saramago	ERG representative, Centre for Reviews and Dissemination and Centre for Health Economics York	Present for notes 19 to 28
Stephen Smith	Patient Expert nominated by Neuroblastoma UK	Present for notes 19 to 28
Paul Tappenden	ERG representative, School of Health and Related Research	Present for notes 01 to 15
Nwamaka Umeweni	Technical Adviser, National Institute for Health and Clinical Excellence	Present for notes 19 to 31
Nerys Woolacott	ERG representative, Centre for Reviews and Dissemination and Centre for Health Economics York	Present for notes 19 to 28

Non-public observers:

Carl Boswell	Programme Manager – PASLU, National Institute for Health and Care Excellence	Present for notes 07 to 18
Wendy Gidman	Technical Analyst, National Institute for Health and Care Excellence	Present for notes 07 to 18
Grace Jennings	Technical Adviser, National Institute for Health and Care Excellence	Present for notes 07 to 18

Gavin Kenny	Administrator, National Institute for Health and Care Excellence	Present for all notes
Liga Kremere	STAR Administrator, National Institute for Health and Care Excellence	Present for all notes
Emily Richards	Scoping Coordinator, National Institute for Health and Care Excellence	Present for all notes
Kate Weir	Medical Editor, National Institute for Health and Care Excellence	Present for notes all notes
Mourella Whiteley	Business Analyst, National Institute for Health and Care Excellence	Present for notes 07 to 18

Welcome

1. The Chair welcomed all members of the Committee and other attendees present to the meeting. The Chair reviewed the agenda and timescales for the meeting, which included the appraisals of adalimumab for treating moderate to severe hidradenitis suppurativa and dinutuximab for treating high-risk neuroblastoma.
2. The Chair introduced Dr Paula Parvulescu as a new member of the Appraisal Committee.
3. The Chair informed the Committee of the non-public observers at this meeting.
4. Apologies were received from Dr Tim Kinnaird and Professor Oluwafemi Oyeboode

Any other Business

5. None.

Notes from the last meeting

6. Agreement of meeting minutes for 4 November 2015.

Appraisal of adalimumab for treating moderate to severe hidradenitis suppurativa

Part 1 – Open session

7. The Chair welcomed the invited experts: Dr Anthony Bewley, Tara Burton, Ceri Harris and Dr John Ingram to the meeting and they introduced themselves to the Committee.
8. The Chair welcomed company representatives from AbbVie to the meeting.

9. The Chair asked all Committee members to declare any relevant interests
- 9.1. Professor Gary McVeigh, Dr Lindsay Smith, Dr Aomesh Bhatt, Dr Andrew Black, Professor David Bowen, Dr Ian Campbell, Dr Ian Davidson, Mrs Susan Dutton, Dr Alexander Dyker, Mrs Gillian Ells, Professor Paula Ghaneh, Professor Carol Haigh, Mr Malcolm Oswald, Dr Paula Parvulescu, Dr Mohit Sharma and Dr Murray Smith all declared that they knew of no personal specific financial interest, personal non-specific financial interest, non-personal specific financial interest, non-personal non-specific financial interest, personal specific family interest or personal non-specific family interest for any of the technologies to be considered as part of the appraisal of adalimumab for treating moderate to severe hidradenitis suppurativa.
- 9.2. Mrs Tracey Cole declared a non-personal specific financial interest as Neurological Commissioning Support (NCS) whom she worked for on secondment between October 2012 and May 2013 received grants from some of the companies involved in this topic. This work was unrelated and Mrs Cole was not paid personally.
- 9.2.1 It was agreed that this declaration would not prevent Mrs Cole from participating in this section of the meeting.
- 9.3. Professor Simon Dixon declared a non-personal specific financial interest as he is the director of a Health Economics Unit that has undertaken unrelated work for Novartis. The University received research funding for this work but Professor Dixon was not paid personally.
- 9.3.1 It was agreed that this declaration would not prevent Professor Dixon from participating in this section of the meeting.
- 9.4. Professor John Henderson declared a non-personal specific financial interest as his institution has received funding from Pfizer for unrelated research. Professor Henderson was not paid personally for this work.
- 9.4.1 It was agreed that this declaration would not prevent Professor Henderson from participating in this section of the meeting.
- 9.5. Mrs Susan Griffin declared a personal non-specific financial interest as she has sat on an advisory board for Novartis in November 2015 for an unrelated topic. Mrs Griffin received personal payment for this work.
- 9.4.1 It was agreed that this declaration would not prevent Mrs Griffin from participating in this section of the meeting.
- 9.6. Dr Matthew Bradley was absent due to a conflict of interest. He is employed by GlaxoSmithKline and owns shares in AstraZeneca whom are both comparator companies in this appraisal. Dr Bradley therefore withdrew from participating in this section of the meeting.
10. The Chair asked all NICE Staff to declare any relevant interests.
- 10.1. All declared that they knew of no personal specific financial interest, personal non-specific financial interest, non-personal specific financial interest, non-personal non-specific financial interest, personal specific family interest or personal non-specific family interest for any of the technologies to be considered as part of the appraisal of adalimumab for treating moderate to severe hidradenitis suppurativa.

11. The Chair asked all other invited guests (ERG and invited experts, not including observers) to declare their relevant interests.
 - 11.1. Tara Burton, Chris Carroll, Ceri Harris, Eva Kaltenhaler, Andrew Rawdin and Paul Tappenden declared that they knew of no personal specific financial interest, personal non-specific financial interest, non-personal specific financial interest, non-personal non-specific financial interest, personal specific family interest or personal non-specific family interest for any of the technologies to be considered as part of the appraisal of adalimumab for treating moderate to severe hidradenitis suppurativa.
 - 11.2. Dr Anthony Bewley declared a non-personal non-specific financial interest as his department has undertaken research for Janssen Pharmaceuticals who is a comparator in this appraisal. Barts Health NHS Trust received research funding for this work but Dr Bewley did not receive payment personally.
 - 11.2.1. It was agreed that this declaration would not prevent Dr Bewley from participating in this section of the meeting.
 - 11.3. Dr Anthony Bewley declared a personal non-specific financial interest as he has completed ad-hoc consultancy work for Janssen Pharmaceuticals who are a comparator in this appraisal. This was for an unrelated topic.
 - 11.3.1. It was agreed that this declaration would not prevent Dr Bewley from participating in this section of the meeting.
 - 11.4. Dr Anthony Bewley declared a personal non-specific non-financial interest as he acts as a medical advisor to the Psoriasis Association who is a consultee in this appraisal.
 - 11.4.1. It was agreed that this declaration would not prevent Dr Bewley from participating in this section of the meeting.
 - 11.5. Dr John Ingram declared a non-personal non-specific financial interest as he is Cardiff Principal Investigator for a hidradenitis suppurativa observational study sponsored by AbbVie. Dr Ingram's department will receive funding for this work but Dr Ingram will not receive payment personally.
12. The Chair introduced the lead team, Tracey Cole, Ian Davidson and Murray Smith who gave presentations on the clinical effectiveness and cost effectiveness of Adalimumab for treating moderate to severe hidradenitis suppurativa.
13. The Chair asked the company representatives whether they wished to comment on any matters of factual accuracy.
14. The Chair explained that "representatives of the press and other members of the public be excluded from the remainder of this meeting having regard to the confidential nature of the business to be transacted, publicity on which would be prejudicial to the public interest" (Section 1(2) Public Bodies (Admission to Meetings) Act 1960)" and all public attendees left the meeting.
15. The Chair then thanked the experts and company representatives for their attendance, participation and contribution to the appraisal and they left the meeting.

16. Discussion on confidential information continued. This information was supplied by the company.
17. The Committee continued to discuss the clinical and cost effectiveness of adalimumab for treating moderate to severe hidradenitis suppurativa.
18. The Committee instructed the technical team to prepare the Appraisal Consultation Document (ACD) in line with their decisions.

Appraisal of Dinutuximab for treating high-risk neuroblastoma

Part 1 – Open session

19. The Chair welcomed the invited experts: Nicholas Bird, Martin Elliott, Juliet Gray and Stephen Smith to the meeting and they introduced themselves to the Committee.
20. The Chair welcomed company representatives from United Therapeutics Corporation to the meeting.
21. The Chair asked all Committee members to declare any relevant interests
22. Professor Gary McVeigh, Dr Lindsay Smith, Dr Aomesh Bhatt, Dr Andrew Black, Professor David Bowen, Dr Matthew Bradley, Dr Ian Campbell, Dr Ian Davidson, Mrs Susan Dutton, Dr Alexander Dyker, Mrs Gillian Ells, Professor Paula Ghaneh, Mrs Susan Griffin, Professor Carol Haigh, Professor John Henderson, Mr Malcolm Oswald, Dr Paula Parvulescu, Dr Mohit Sharma and Dr Murray Smith all declared that they knew of no personal specific financial interest, personal non-specific financial interest, non-personal specific financial interest, non-personal non-specific financial interest, personal specific family interest or personal non-specific family interest for any of the technologies to be considered as part of the appraisal of Dinutuximab for treating high-risk neuroblastoma.
 - 22.1. Ms Tracey Cole declared a non-personal specific financial interest as Neurological Commissioning Support (NCS) whom she worked for on secondment between October 2012 and May 2013 received grants from some of the companies involved in this topic. This work was unrelated and Mrs Cole was not paid personally.
 - 24.1.1 It was agreed that this declaration would not prevent Ms Cole from participating in this section of the meeting.
 - 22.2. Professor Simon Dixon declared a non-personal specific financial interest as he is the director of a Health Economics Unit that has undertaken unrelated work for Roche. The University received research funding for this work but Professor Dixon was not paid personally.
 - 24.2.1 It was agreed that this declaration would not prevent Professor Dixon from participating in this section of the meeting.
23. The Chair asked all NICE Staff to declare any relevant interests.
 - 23.1. All declared that they knew of no personal specific financial interest, personal non-specific financial interest, non-personal specific financial interest, non-personal non-specific financial interest, personal specific family interest or personal non-specific family interest for any of the

technologies to be considered as part of the appraisal of dinutuximab for treating high-risk neuroblastoma.

24. The Chair asked all other invited guests (ERG and invited experts, not including observers) to declare their relevant interests.
 - 24.1. Nicholas Bird, Claire Rothery, Pedro Saramago, Stephen Smith and Nerys Woolacott all declared that they knew of no personal specific financial interest, personal non-specific financial interest, non-personal specific financial interest, non-personal non-specific financial interest, personal specific family interest or personal non-specific family interest for any of the technologies to be considered as part of the appraisal of dinutuximab for treating high-risk neuroblastoma.
 - 24.2. Dr Juliet Gray declared a personal non-specific non-financial interest as she is the UK Chief investigator for the SIOPEX ch14.18/CHO Long Term Infusion study trial in Neuroblastoma which involves a similar, but different antibody to dinutuximab. Neither Dr Gray nor her department received payment for this work.
 - 24.2.1. It was agreed that this declaration would not prevent Dr Gray from participating in this section of the meeting.
 - 24.3. Dr Martin Elliott declared a personal non-specific non-financial interest as he is the UK Chief Investigator of the SOPIEN HR-NB1 trial which involves a similar but different antibody to dinutuximab. Neither Dr Elliott nor his department received payment for this work.
 - 24.3.1. It was agreed that this declaration would not prevent Dr Elliott from participating in this section of the meeting.
25. The Chair introduced the key themes arising from the consultation responses to the Appraisal Consultation Document (ACD) received from consultees, commentators and through the NICE website.
26. The Chair asked the company representatives whether they wished to comment on any matters of factual accuracy.
27. The Chair explained that “representatives of the press and other members of the public be excluded from the remainder of this meeting having regard to the confidential nature of the business to be transacted, publicity on which would be prejudicial to the public interest” (Section 1(2) Public Bodies (Admission to Meetings) Act 1960)” and all public attendees left the meeting.
28. The Chair then thanked the experts and company representatives for their attendance, participation and contribution to the appraisal and they left the meeting.

Part 2 – Closed session

29. Discussion on confidential information continued. This information was supplied by the company.
30. The Committee continued to discuss the clinical and cost effectiveness of Dinutuximab for treating high-risk neuroblastoma.
31. The Committee instructed the technical team to prepare the Appraisal Consultation Document (ACD) in line with their decisions.

Date, time and venue of the next meeting

32. Thursday 25 February 2016, 10:00-17:00 at National Institute for Health and Care Excellence, Level 1A, City Tower, Piccadilly Plaza, Manchester M1 4BT.