

## Technology Appraisal Committee Meeting (Committee B)

**Minutes:** Confirmed

**Date and Time:** Wednesday 2 November 2016, 10am to 5pm

**Venue:** Prospero House  
241 Borough High Street  
London  
SE1 1GA

<b>Present:</b>	1. Dr Amanda Adler	Present for all notes
	2. Dr Sanjeev Patel	Present for all notes
	3. Dr Ray Armstrong	Present for all notes
	4. Dr Jeff Aronson	Present for all notes
	5. Professor John Cairns	Present for all notes
	6. Mr Mark Chapman	Present for all notes
	7. Dr Sumeet Gupta	Present for all notes
	8. Dr Neil Iosson	Present for all notes
	9. Dr Sanjay Kinra	Present for all notes
	10. Dr Miriam McCarthy	Present for all notes
	11. Professor Ruairidh Milne	Present for all notes
	12. Mr Christopher O'Regan	Present for all notes
	13. Professor Stephen Palmer	Present for all notes
	14. Dr Dani Preedy	Present for all notes
	15. Dr Nicky Welton	Present for all notes
	16. Mr Nigel Westwood	Present for all notes

### In attendance:

Meindert Boysen	Programme Director, National Institute for Health and Care Excellence	Present for all notes
Dr Melinda Goodall	Associate Director, National Institute for Health and Care Excellence	Present for notes 15 to 30
Jeremy Powell	Project Manager, National Institute for Health and Care Excellence	Present for all notes
Glenys Russell	Administrator, National Institute for Health and Care Excellence	Present for all notes
Rosie Lovett	Technical Adviser, National Institute for Health and Clinical Excellence	Present for notes 1 to 17
Jasdeep Hayre	Technical Adviser, National Institute for Health and Clinical Excellence	Present for notes 1 to 17
Thomas Palmer	Technical Lead, National Institute for Health and Clinical Excellence	Present for notes 1 to 17

Ross Dent	Technical Lead, National Institute for Health and Clinical Excellence	Present for notes 18 to 30
Ahmed Elsada	Technical Adviser, National Institute for Health and Clinical Excellence	Present for notes 18 to 30
Professor Aileen Clarke	Director of Warwick Evidence	Present for notes 1 to 15 and 18 to 28
Dr G.J. Melendez-Torres	Assistant Professor of HTA, Epidemiology and Evidence	Present for notes 1 to 15 and 18 to 28
Peter Auguste	Research Fellow in Medical Statistics and Epidemiology / Health Economist	Present for notes 1 to 15
Dr Ewen Cummins Dr Martin Duddy	Health Economist Consultant Neurologist, Royal Victoria Infirmary, Newcastle upon Tyne, nominated by the Association of British Neurologists	Present for notes 18 to 28 Present for notes 1 to 13
Professor Gavin Giovannoni	Professor of Neurology, Queen Mary University London, nominated by Merck	Present for notes 1 to 13
Dr Jacqueline Palace	Consultant Neurologist, Oxford University Hospitals Trust, nominated by the MS Trust	Present for notes 1 to 13
Sarah Bittlestone	Patient Expert, Nominated by the MS Society	Present for notes 1 to 13
Denise Murray	Patient Expert, Nominated by the MS Society	Present for notes 1 to 13
<b>Non-public observers:</b>		
Helen Barnett	Medical Editor, NICE	Present for all notes
Heidi Livingstone	PIP, NICE	Present for notes 1 to 17
Isceelyn Richards	Corporate Office, NICE	Present for notes 1 to 17
Emily Richards	Assistant Project Manager, NICE	Present for all notes

## Notes

### Welcome

1. The Chair welcomed all members of the Committee and other attendees present to the meeting. The Chair reviewed the agenda and timescales for the meeting, which included the appraisals of beta interferon and glatiramer acetate for treating multiple sclerosis (review of TA32) [ID809] and daclizumab for treating relapsing-remitting multiple sclerosis [ID827].
2. The Chair informed the Committee that it was Jeff Aronson's last meeting as a Committee member and thanked him for his contributions to the Committee.
3. Apologies were received from Dr Mark Glover, Anne Joshua, Alun Roebuck, Dr Nigel De-Kare Silver, Marta Soares and Professor Ken Stein,

### Any other Business

4. The Committee were given an update on timelines for other appraisals.

### Appraisal of beta interferon and glatiramer acetate for treating multiple sclerosis (review of TA32) [ID809]

#### Part 1 – Open session

5. The Chair welcomed the invited experts: Dr Martin Duddy, Professor Gavin Giovannoni, Dr Jacqueline Palace, Sarah Bittlestone and Denise Murray to the meeting and they introduced themselves to the Committee.
6. The Chair welcomed company representatives from Biogen, Merck, Novartis and Teva to the meeting.
7. The Chair asked all Committee members to declare any relevant interests
  - 7.1. Dr Amanda Adler, Dr Sanjeev Patel, Dr Ray Armstrong, Dr Jeff Aronson, Professor John Cairns, Mr Mark Chapman, Dr Sumeet Gupta, Dr Neil Iosson, Dr Sanjay Kinra, Dr Miriam McCarthy, Professor Ruairidh Milne, Mr Christopher O'Regan, Professor Stephen Palmer, Dr Dani Preedy, Dr Nicky Welton and Mr Nigel Westwood all declared that they knew of no personal specific financial interest, personal non-specific financial interest, non-personal specific financial interest, non-personal non-specific financial interest, personal specific family interest or personal non-specific family interest for any of the technologies to be considered as part of the appraisal of beta interferon and glatiramer acetate for treating multiple sclerosis (review of TA32) [ID809].
8. The Chair asked all NICE Staff to declare any relevant interests.
  - 8.1. All declared that they knew of no personal specific financial interest, personal non-specific financial interest, non-personal specific financial interest, non-personal non-specific financial interest, personal specific family interest or personal non-specific family interest for any of the technologies to be considered as part of the appraisal of beta interferon and glatiramer acetate for treating multiple sclerosis (review of TA32) [ID809].
9. The Chair asked all other invited guests (assessment group/ERG and invited experts, not including observers) to declare their relevant interests.
  - 9.1. Professor Aileen Clarke, Dr G.J. Melendez-Torres, Peter Auguste, Sarah Bittlestone and Denise Murray declared that they knew of no personal specific financial interest, personal non-specific financial interest, non-personal specific

financial interest, non-personal non-specific financial interest, personal specific family interest or personal non-specific family interest for any of the technologies to be considered as part of the appraisal of beta interferon and glatiramer acetate for treating multiple sclerosis (review of TA32) [ID809].

- 9.2. Dr Martin Duddy declared a personal specific financial interest as he has received honoraria and travel fees from Biogen, Merck, Teva, Novartis (and Genzyme).
  - 9.2.1. It was agreed that this declaration would not prevent Dr Duddy from participating in this section of the meeting.
- 9.3. Professor Gavin Giovannoni declared a personal specific financial interest as he is a consultant or speaker for, or has received research support from: Bayer, Biogen, Merck-Serono, Novartis and Teva.
  - 9.3.1. It was agreed that this declaration would not prevent Professor Giovannoni from participating in this section of the meeting.
- 9.4. Dr Jacqueline Palace declared a personal specific financial interest as she has received honoraria from Biogen, Merck and Teva and has received speaking fees and attended advisory boards for Novartis.
  - 9.4.1. It was agreed that this declaration would not prevent Dr Palace from participating in this section of the meeting.
10. The Chair introduced the lead team, Dr Miriam McCarthy, Professor Stephen Palmer and Dr Dani Preedy, who gave presentations on the clinical effectiveness and cost effectiveness of beta interferon and glatiramer acetate for treating multiple sclerosis (review of TA32) [ID809].
11. The Chair asked the company representatives whether they wished to comment on any matters of factual accuracy.
12. The Chair explained that “representatives of the press and other members of the public be excluded from the remainder of this meeting having regard to the confidential nature of the business to be transacted, publicity on which would be prejudicial to the public interest” (Section 1(2) Public Bodies (Admission to Meetings) Act 1960)” and all public attendees left the meeting.
13. The Chair then thanked the experts and company representatives for their attendance, participation and contribution to the appraisal and they left the meeting.

## **Part 2 – Closed session**

14. Discussion on confidential information continued.
15. The Assessment Group representatives left the meeting.
16. The Committee continued to discuss the clinical and cost effectiveness of beta interferon and glatiramer acetate for treating multiple sclerosis.
  - 16.1. The committee decision was based on consensus.
17. The Committee instructed the technical team ask the Assessment Group to prepare additional analyses.
18. The Committee approved the minutes of the meetings held on 7 September and 5 October.

## **Appraisal of Daclizumab for treating relapsing-remitting multiple sclerosis [ID827]**

### **Part 1 – Open session**

19. The Chair welcomed company representatives from Biogen to the meeting.
20. The Chair asked all Committee members to declare any relevant interests
  - 20.1. Dr Amanda Adler, Dr Sanjeev Patel, Dr Ray Armstrong, Dr Jeff Aronson, Professor John Cairns, Mr Mark Chapman, Dr Sumeet Gupta, Dr Neil Iosson, Dr Sanjay Kinra, Dr Miriam McCarthy, Professor Ruairidh Milne, Mr Christopher O'Regan, Professor Stephen Palmer, Dr Dani Preedy, Dr Nicky Welton and Mr Nigel Westwood, all declared that they knew of no personal specific financial interest, personal non-specific financial interest, non-personal specific financial interest, non-personal non-specific financial interest, personal specific family interest or personal non-specific family interest for any of the technologies to be considered as part of the appraisal of daclizumab for treating relapsing-remitting multiple sclerosis [ID827].
21. The Chair asked all NICE Staff to declare any relevant interests.
  - 21.1. All declared that they knew of no personal specific financial interest, personal non-specific financial interest, non-personal specific financial interest, non-personal non-specific financial interest, personal specific family interest or personal non-specific family interest for any of the technologies to be considered as part of the appraisal of daclizumab for treating relapsing-remitting multiple sclerosis.
22. The Chair asked all other invited guests (assessment group/ERG and invited experts, not including observers) to declare their relevant interests.
  - 22.1. Professor Aileen Clarke, Dr G.J. Melendez-Torres and Ewen Cummins declared that they knew of no personal specific financial interest, personal non-specific financial interest, non-personal specific financial interest, non-personal non-specific financial interest, personal specific family interest or personal non-specific family interest for any of the technologies to be considered as part of the appraisal of daclizumab for treating relapsing-remitting multiple sclerosis.
23. The Chair introduced the key themes arising from the consultation responses to the Appraisal Consultation Document (ACD) received from consultees, commentators and through the NICE website.
24. The Chair asked the company representatives whether they wished to comment on any matters of factual accuracy.
25. The Chair explained that “representatives of the press and other members of the public be excluded from the remainder of this meeting having regard to the confidential nature of the business to be transacted, publicity on which would be prejudicial to the public interest” (Section 1(2) Public Bodies (Admission to Meetings) Act 1960)” and all public attendees left the meeting.
26. The Chair then thanked the Evidence Review Group and company representatives for their attendance, participation and contribution to the appraisal and they left the meeting.

### **Part 2 – Closed session**

27. Discussion on confidential information continued.

28. The Chair then thanked the Evidence Review Group representatives for their attendance, participation and contribution to the appraisal and they left the meeting.
29. The Committee continued to discuss the clinical and cost effectiveness of daclizumab for treating relapsing-remitting multiple sclerosis.
  - 29.1. The committee decision was based on consensus.
30. The Committee instructed the technical team to prepare the Appraisal Consultation Document or Final Appraisal Determination (FAD) in line with their decisions.

**Date, time and venue of the next meeting:** Wednesday 25 January 2017, 10am at Prospero House, 241 Borough High Street, London SE1 1GA