

Technology Appraisal Committee Meeting (Committee B)

Minutes: Confirmed

Date and Time: Wednesday 19 July 2017, 10am to 5pm

Venue: Prospero House, 241 Borough High Street, London, SE1 1GA

Present:	1. Dr Amanda Adler (Chair)	Present for all notes
	2. Dr Sanjeev Patel (Vice-Chair)	Present for all notes
	3. Dr Ray Armstrong	Present for all notes
	4. Professor John Cairns	Present for all notes
	5. David Chandler	Present for all notes
	6. Mr Mark Chapman	Present for all notes
	7. Dr Miriam McCarthy	Present for all notes
	8. Professor Stephen Palmer	Present for all notes
	9. Dr Danielle Preedy	Present for all notes
	10. Ms Marta Soares	Present for all notes
	11. Professor Ken Stein	Present for all notes
	12. Dr Nicky Welton	Present for notes 7 to 42
	13. Mr Nigel Westwood	Present for all notes
	14. Dr Stuart Williams	Present for all notes

In attendance:

Dr Elisabeth George	Associate Director, National Institute for Health and Care Excellence	Present for all notes
Jeremy Powell	Project Manager, National Institute for Health and Care Excellence	Present for all notes
Bashama Anjum	Administrator, National Institute for Health and Care Excellence	Present for all notes
Jasdeep Hayre	Technical Adviser, National Institute for Health and Clinical Excellence	Present for notes 1 to 17
Ahmed Elsada	Technical Adviser, National Institute for Health and Clinical Excellence	Present for notes 18 to 31
Kirsty Pitt	Technical Analyst, National Institute for Health and Care	Present for notes 1 to 17

Excellence

Orsolya Balogh	Technical Analyst, National Institute for Health and Care Excellence	Present for notes 18 to 31
Professor Peter Clark	Chair of NHS England Chemotherapy Clinical Reference Group and National Clinical Lead for CDF - NHS Commissioning Expert nominated by NHS England	Present for all notes
Professor John Wagstaff	Professor of Medical Oncology & Honorary NHS consultant, Swansea University and Abertawe Bro Morannwg University Health Board - clinical expert nominated by EUSA Pharma	Present for notes 4 to 13 and notes 18 to 26
Dr Paul Nathan	Consultant Medical Oncologist, Mount Vernon Cancer Centre – clinical expert nominated by the NCRI-ACP-RCP- RCR	Present for notes 4 to 13
Mrs Lucy Willingale	Patient Information and Support Leader, Kidney Cancer UK - patient expert nominated by Kidney Cancer UK	Present for notes 4 to 13 and notes 18 to 26
Steve Edwards	Head of Clinical & Economic Evidence- Evidence Review Group – BMJ	Present for notes 1 to 15 and notes 18 to 28
Tracey Jhita	Health Economist and Researcher - Evidence Review Group – BMJ	Present for notes 1 to 15
Kayleigh Kew	Health Technology Assessment Analyst - Evidence Review Group – BMJ	Present for notes 1 to 15
Charlotta Karner	Health Economist - Evidence Review Group – BMJ	Present for notes 18 to 28
Peter Cain	Health Technology	Present for notes 18 to 28

Non-public observers:

Helen Barnett	Senior Medical Editor, NICE	Present for notes all notes
Heidi Livingstone	Senior Public Involvement Advisor, Communications, NICE	Present for notes all notes
Edgar Masanga		Present for notes all notes

1. The Chair welcomed all members of the Committee and other attendees present to the meeting. The Chair reviewed the agenda and timescales for the meeting, which included the appraisals of tivozanib for treating renal cell carcinoma [ID591] and lenvatinib with everolimus for previously treated advanced renal cell carcinoma [ID1029].
2. Apologies were received from Dr Mark Glover, Dr Sumeet Gupta, Dr Neil Iosson, Dr Nigel De Kare Silver, Dr Sanjay Kinra and Mr Christopher O'Regan.

Any other Business

3. The Committee were given an update on the progress of appraisals that had been discussed at previous meetings.
4. The minutes of the Committee meetings held on 23 May and 21 June were approved.

Tivozanib for treating renal cell carcinoma [ID591]

Part 1 – Open session

5. The Chair welcomed the invited experts: Steve Edwards, Tracey Jhita, Kayleigh Kew, Professor Peter Clark, Dr Paul Nathan, Professor John Wagstaff and Lucy Willingale to the meeting and they introduced themselves to the Committee.
6. The Chair welcomed company representatives from Eusapharma to the meeting.
7. The Chair asked all Committee members to declare any relevant interests
 - 7.1. Dr Amanda Adler, Dr Sanjeev Patel, Dr Ray Armstrong, Professor John Cairns, Mr David Chandler, Mr Mark Chapman, Dr Miriam McCarthy, , Professor Stephen Palmer, Dr Danielle Preedy, Ms Marta Soares, Professor Ken Stein, Dr Nicky Welton, Mr Nigel Westwood and Dr Stuart Williams all declared that they knew of no personal specific financial interest, personal non-specific financial interest, non-personal specific financial interest, non-personal non-specific financial interest, personal specific family interest or personal non-specific family interest for any of the technologies to be considered as part of the appraisal of tivozanib for treating renal cell carcinoma [ID591].

8. The Chair asked all NICE Staff to declare any relevant interests.
 - 8.1. All declared that they knew of no personal specific financial interest, personal non-specific financial interest, non-personal specific financial interest, non-personal non-specific financial interest, personal specific family interest or personal non-specific family interest for any of the technologies to be considered as part of the appraisal of tivozanib for treating renal cell carcinoma [ID591].
9. The Chair asked all other invited guests (assessment group/ERG and invited experts, not including observers) to declare their relevant interests.
 - 9.1. Steve Edwards, Tracey Jhita, Kayleigh Kew, Professor Peter Clark and Mrs Lucy Willingale declared that they knew of no personal specific financial interest, personal non-specific financial interest, non-personal specific financial interest, non-personal non-specific financial interest, personal specific family interest or personal non-specific family interest for any of the technologies to be considered as part of the appraisal of tivozanib for treating renal cell carcinoma [ID591].
 - 9.2. Dr Paul Nathan declared a personal specific financial interest as he sits on advisory boards for a number of pharmaceutical companies, including the comparator manufacturers in this appraisal.
 - 9.2.1. It was agreed that this declaration would not prevent Dr Nathan from participating in this section of the meeting
 - 9.3. Professor Jonathan Wagstaff declared a personal specific financial interest as he acts as a consultant to a number of pharmaceutical companies, including those involved in this appraisal.
 - 9.3.1. It was agreed that this declaration would not prevent Professor Wagstaff from participating in this section of the meeting
10. The Chair introduced the lead team, Dr Sanjay Kinra, Professor Stephen Palmer and Mr Nigel Westwood who gave presentations on the clinical effectiveness and cost effectiveness of tivozanib for treating renal cell carcinoma [ID591].
11. The Chair asked the company representatives whether they wished to comment on any matters of factual accuracy.
12. The Chair explained that “representatives of the press and other members of the public be excluded from the remainder of this meeting having regard to the confidential nature of the business to be transacted, publicity on which would be prejudicial to the public interest” (Section 1(2) Public Bodies (Admission to Meetings) Act 1960)” and all public attendees left the meeting.
13. The Chair then thanked the experts and company representatives for their attendance, participation and contribution to the appraisal and they left the meeting.

Part 2 – Closed session

14. Discussion on confidential information continued. This information was supplied by the company.

15. The Chair then thanked the Evidence Review Group representatives for their attendance, participation and contribution to the appraisal and they left the meeting.
16. The Committee continued to discuss the clinical and cost effectiveness of tivozanib for treating renal cell carcinoma [ID591].
 - 16.1. The committee decision was based on consensus.
17. The Committee instructed the technical team to prepare the Appraisal Consultation Document (ACD) in line with their decisions.

Appraisal of lenvatinib with everolimus for previously treated advanced renal cell carcinoma [ID1029]

Part 1 – Open session

18. The Chair welcomed the invited experts: Steve Edwards, Peter Cain and Charlotta Karner, Professor Peter Clark, Professor John Wagstaff and Lucy Willingale to the meeting and they introduced themselves to the Committee.
19. The Chair welcomed company representatives from Eisai to the meeting.
20. The Chair asked all Committee members to declare any relevant interests
 - 20.1. Dr Amanda Adler, Dr Sanjeev Patel, Dr Ray Armstrong, Professor John Cairns, Mr David Chandler, Mr Mark Chapman, Dr Miriam McCarthy, , Professor Stephen Palmer, Dr Danielle Preedy, Ms Marta Soares, Professor Ken Stein, Dr Nicky Welton, Mr Nigel Westwood and Dr Stuart Williams all declared that they knew of no personal specific financial interest, personal non-specific financial interest, non-personal specific financial interest, non-personal non-specific financial interest, personal specific family interest or personal non-specific family interest for any of the technologies to be considered as part of the appraisal of tivozanib for treating renal cell carcinoma [ID591].
21. The Chair asked all NICE Staff to declare any relevant interests.
 - 21.1. All declared that they knew of no personal specific financial interest, personal non-specific financial interest, non-personal specific financial interest, non-personal non-specific financial interest, personal specific family interest or personal non-specific family interest for any of the technologies to be considered as part of the appraisal of tivozanib for treating renal cell carcinoma [ID591].
22. The Chair asked all other invited guests (assessment group/ERG and invited experts, not including observers) to declare their relevant interests.
 - 22.1. Steve Edwards, Peter Cain and Charlotta Karner, Professor Peter Clark and Mrs Lucy Willingale declared that they knew of no personal specific financial interest, personal non-specific financial interest, non-personal specific financial interest, non-personal non-specific financial interest, personal specific family interest or personal non-specific family interest for any of the technologies to be considered as part of the appraisal of tivozanib for treating renal cell carcinoma [ID591].

- 22.2. Professor Jonathan Wagstaff declared a personal specific financial interest as he acts as a consultant to a number of pharmaceutical companies, including those involved in this appraisal.
22.2.1. It was agreed that this declaration would not prevent Professor Wagstaff from participating in this section of the meeting
23. The Chair introduced the lead team, Dr Ray Armstrong, Professor John Cairns and Dr Danielle Preedy who gave presentations on the clinical effectiveness and cost effectiveness of lenvatinib with everolimus for previously treated advanced renal cell carcinoma [ID1029].
24. The Chair asked the company representatives whether they wished to comment on any matters of factual accuracy.
25. The Chair explained that “representatives of the press and other members of the public be excluded from the remainder of this meeting having regard to the confidential nature of the business to be transacted, publicity on which would be prejudicial to the public interest” (Section 1(2) Public Bodies (Admission to Meetings) Act 1960)” and all public attendees left the meeting.
26. The Chair then thanked the experts and company representatives for their attendance, participation and contribution to the appraisal and they left the meeting.

Part 2 – Closed session

27. Discussion on confidential information continued. This information was supplied by the company.
28. The Chair then thanked the Evidence Review Group representatives for their attendance, participation and contribution to the appraisal and they left the meeting.
29. The Committee continued to discuss the clinical and cost effectiveness of lenvatinib with everolimus for previously treated advanced renal cell carcinoma [ID1029].
29.1. The committee decision was based on consensus.
30. The Committee instructed the technical team to prepare the Appraisal Consultation Document (ACD) in line with their decisions.

Date, time and venue of the next meeting

31. Tuesday 22 August at National Institute for Health and Care Excellence, 10 Spring Gardens, London SW1A 2BU