

Technology Appraisal Committee Meeting (Committee B)

Minutes: Confirmed

Date and Time: Wednesday 20 September 2017, 10am to 5pm

Venue: National Institute for Health and Care Excellence
10 Spring Gardens
London
SW1A 2BU

Present:	1. Dr Amanda Adler	Present for all notes
	2. Dr Sanjeev Patel	Present for all notes
	3. Dr Ray Armstrong	Present for all notes
	4. Professor John Cairns	Present for all notes
	5. Mr Diar Fattah	Present for all notes
	6. Ms Susan Faulds	Present for all notes
	7. Dr Mark Glover	Present for all notes
	8. Mr Richard James Hoddes	Present for all notes
	9. Dr Sanjay Kinra	Present for all notes
	10. Dr Miriam McCarthy	Present for all notes
	11. Dr Stephen Smith	Present for all notes
	12. Professor Ken Stein	Present for all notes
	13. Mr Nigel Westwood	Present for all notes
	14. Dr Stuart Williams	Present for all notes

In attendance:

Elisabeth George	Associate Director, National Institute for Health and Care Excellence	Present for all notes
Jeremy Powell	Project Manager, National Institute for Health and Care Excellence	Present for all notes
Bashama Anjum	Administrator, National Institute for Health and Care Excellence	Present for all notes
Ahmed Elsada	Technical Advisor, Technology Appraisals, National Institute for Health and Care Excellence	Present for notes 18 to 43
Jasdeep Hayre	Technical Advisor, Technology Appraisals, National Institute for Health and Care Excellence	Present for notes 1 to 17
Thomas Palmer	Technical Analyst, National Institute for Health and Care	Present for notes 1 to 17

Ross Dent	Excellence Technical Analyst, National Institute for Health and Care Excellence	Present for notes 18 to 30
Orsolya Balogh	Technical Analyst, National Institute for Health and Care Excellence	Present for notes 31 to 43
Mr Malcolm Qualie	Pharmacy Lead - NHS England – NHS commissioning expert, nominated by NHS England	Present for notes 5 to 13
Dr Richard Nicholas	Consultant Neurologist, Imperial Healthcare NHS Trust – clinical expert, nominated by the MS Trust	Present for notes 5 to 13
Dr Waqar Rashid	Consultant Neurologist, Hurstwood Park Neurological Centre – clinical expert, nominated by the Association of British Neurologists	Present for notes 5 to 13
Ms Christine Chapman	Patient expert, nominated by the MS Society	Present for notes 5 to 13
Ms Amy Mackelden	Patient expert, nominated by the MS Trust	Present for notes 5 to 13
Rui Duarte	Liverpool Reviews and Implementation Group	Present for notes 1 to 15
James Mahon	Liverpool Reviews and Implementation Group	Present for notes 1 to 15
Steve Edwards	Head of HTA -Evidence Review Group – BMJ Group	Present for notes 18 to 28 and notes 31 to 41
Tracey Jhita	Health Economics Manager - Evidence Review Group – BMJ Group	Present for notes 18 to 28
Kayleigh Kew	HTA Analyst - Evidence Review Group – BMJ Group	Present for notes 18 to 28
Charlotta Karner	HTA Analysis Manager - Evidence Review Group – BMJ Group	Present for notes 31 to 41
Peter Cain	Health Economist - Evidence Review Group – BMJ Group	Present for notes 31 to 41

Non-public observers:

Helen Barnett	Senior Medical Editor,	Present for all notes
---------------	------------------------	-----------------------

Heidi Livingstone	NICE Senior Public Involvement Advisor, NICE	Present for all notes
Edgar Masanga	Business Analyst, Resource Impact Assessment, Implementation, NICE	Present for all notes

Notes

Welcome

1. The Chair welcomed all members of the Committee and other attendees present to the meeting. The Chair reviewed the agenda and timescales for the meeting, which included the appraisals of cladribine tablets for treating relapsing-remitting multiple sclerosis [ID64], tivozanib for treating renal cell carcinoma [ID591] and lenvatinib with everolimus for previously treated advanced renal cell carcinoma [ID1029].
2. The Chair welcomed Dr Stephen Smith to his first meeting as a member of the Appraisal Committee
3. Apologies were received from Mr Mark Chapman, Dr Sumeet Gupta, Dr Nigel de Kare Silver, Mr Christopher O'Regan, Professor Stephen Palmer, Dr Danielle Preedy, Ms Marta Soares, and Professor Nicky Welton.

Any other Business

4. The Committee were given an update on the progress of appraisals that had been discussed at previous meetings and the papers being presented at this month's NICE Board meeting.

Appraisal of cladribine tablets for treating relapsing-remitting multiple sclerosis [ID64]

Part 1 – Open session

5. The Chair welcomed the invited experts: Mr Malcolm Qualie, Dr Richard Nicholas, Dr Waqar Rashid, Ms Christine Chapman, Ms Amy Mackelden, James Mahon and Rui Duarte to the meeting and they introduced themselves to the Committee.
6. The Chair welcomed company representatives from Merck to the meeting.
7. The Chair asked all Committee members to declare any relevant interests
 - 7.1. Dr Amanda Adler, Dr Sanjeev Patel, Dr Ray Armstrong, Professor John Cairns, Mr Diar Fattah, Ms Susan Faulds, Dr Mark Glover, Mr Richard James Hoddes, Dr Sanjay Kinra, Dr Miriam McCarthy, Dr Stephen Smith, Professor Ken Stein, Mr Nigel Westwood, Dr Stuart Williams all declared that they knew of no personal specific financial interest, personal non-specific financial interest, non-personal specific financial interest, non-personal non-specific financial interest, personal specific family interest or personal non-specific family interest for any of the technologies to be

considered as part of the appraisal of cladribine tablets for treating relapsing-remitting multiple sclerosis [ID64].

8. The Chair asked all NICE Staff to declare any relevant interests.
 - 8.1. All declared that they knew of no personal specific financial interest, personal non-specific financial interest, non-personal specific financial interest, non-personal non-specific financial interest, personal specific family interest or personal non-specific family interest for any of the technologies to be considered as part of the appraisal of cladribine tablets for treating relapsing-remitting multiple sclerosis [ID64]
9. The Chair asked all other invited guests (assessment group/ERG and invited experts, not including observers) to declare their relevant interests.
 - 9.1. Mr Malcolm Qualie, Ms Christine Chapman, Ms Amy Mackelden, James Mahon and Rui Duarte declared that they knew of no personal specific financial interest, personal non-specific financial interest, non-personal specific financial interest, non-personal non-specific financial interest, personal specific family interest or personal non-specific family interest for any of the technologies to be considered as part of the appraisal of cladribine tablets for treating relapsing-remitting multiple sclerosis [ID64].
 - 9.2. Dr Richard Nicholas declared a personal specific financial interest as he has received payments from a number of pharmaceutical companies, including Biogen and Roche.
 - 9.2.1. It was agreed that this declaration would not prevent Dr Nicholas from participating in this section of the meeting
 - 9.3. Dr Waqar Rashid declared a personal specific financial interest as he has received payments from a number of pharmaceutical companies, including Novartis, Roche and Teva.
 - 9.3.1. It was agreed that this declaration would not prevent Dr Rashid from participating in this section of the meeting
10. The Chair introduced the lead team, Dr Mark Glover, Miriam McCarthy and Nigel Westwood who gave presentations on the clinical effectiveness and cost effectiveness of cladribine tablets for treating relapsing-remitting multiple sclerosis [ID64].
11. The Chair asked the company representatives whether they wished to comment on any matters of factual accuracy.
12. The Chair explained that “representatives of the press and other members of the public be excluded from the remainder of this meeting having regard to the confidential nature of the business to be transacted, publicity on which would be prejudicial to the public interest” (Section 1(2) Public Bodies (Admission to Meetings) Act 1960)” and all public attendees left the meeting.
13. The Chair then thanked the experts and company representatives for their attendance, participation and contribution to the appraisal and they left the meeting.

Part 2 – Closed session

14. Discussion on confidential information continued. This information was supplied by the company.
15. The Chair then thanked the Evidence Review Group representatives for their attendance, participation and contribution to the appraisal and they left the meeting.
16. The Committee continued to discuss the clinical and cost effectiveness of cladribine tablets for treating relapsing-remitting multiple sclerosis [ID64].
 - 16.1. The committee decision was based on consensus.
17. The Committee instructed the technical team to prepare the Final Appraisal Determination (FAD) in line with their decisions.

Appraisal of tivozanib for treating renal cell carcinoma [ID591]

Part 1 – Open session

18. The Chair welcomed the invited experts: Professor Peter Clark, Steve Edwards, Kayleigh Kew, Tracey Jhita to the meeting and they introduced themselves to the Committee.
19. The Chair welcomed company representatives from Eusapharma to the meeting.
20. The Chair asked all Committee members to declare any relevant interests
 - 20.1. Dr Amanda Adler, Dr Sanjeev Patel, Dr Ray Armstrong, Professor John Cairns, Mr Diar Fattah, Ms Susan Faulds, Dr Mark Glover, Mr Richard James Hoddes, Dr Sanjay Kinra, Dr Miriam McCarthy, Dr Stephen Smith, Professor Ken Stein, Mr Nigel Westwood, Dr Stuart Williams all declared that they knew of no personal specific financial interest, personal non-specific financial interest, non-personal specific financial interest, non-personal non-specific financial interest, personal specific family interest or personal non-specific family interest for any of the technologies to be considered as part of the appraisal of tivozanib for treating renal cell carcinoma [ID591].
21. The Chair asked all NICE Staff to declare any relevant interests.
 - 21.1. All declared that they knew of no personal specific financial interest, personal non-specific financial interest, non-personal specific financial interest, non-personal non-specific financial interest, personal specific family interest or personal non-specific family interest for any of the technologies to be considered as part of the appraisal of tivozanib for treating renal cell carcinoma [ID591].
22. The Chair asked all other invited guests (assessment group/ERG and invited experts, not including observers) to declare their relevant interests.
 - 22.1. All declared that they knew of no personal specific financial interest, personal non-specific financial interest, non-personal specific financial interest, non-personal non-specific financial interest, personal specific family interest or personal non-specific family interest for any of the

technologies to be considered as part of the appraisal of tivozanib for treating renal cell carcinoma [ID591].

23. The Chair introduced the key themes arising from the consultation responses to the Appraisal Consultation Document (ACD) received from consultees, commentators and through the NICE website.
24. The Chair asked the company representatives whether they wished to comment on any matters of factual accuracy.
25. The Chair explained that “representatives of the press and other members of the public be excluded from the remainder of this meeting having regard to the confidential nature of the business to be transacted, publicity on which would be prejudicial to the public interest” (Section 1(2) Public Bodies (Admission to Meetings) Act 1960)” and all public attendees left the meeting.
26. The Chair then thanked the experts and company representatives for their attendance, participation and contribution to the appraisal and they left the meeting.

Part 2 – Closed session

27. Discussion on confidential information continued. This information was supplied by the company.
28. The Chair then thanked the Evidence Review Group representatives for their attendance, participation and contribution to the appraisal and they left the meeting.
29. The Committee continued to discuss the clinical and cost effectiveness of tivozanib for treating renal cell carcinoma [ID591].
 - 29.1. The committee decision was based on consensus.
30. The Committee instructed the technical team to prepare the Final Appraisal Determination (FAD) in line with their decisions.

Appraisal of lenvatinib with everolimus for previously treated advanced renal cell carcinoma [ID1029]

Part 1 – Open session

31. The Chair welcomed the invited experts: Professor Peter Clark, Steve Edwards, Peter Cain, Charlotta Karner to the meeting and they introduced themselves to the Committee.
32. The Chair welcomed company representatives from Eisai to the meeting.
33. The Chair asked all Committee members to declare any relevant interests
 - 33.1. 2Dr Amanda Adler, Dr Sanjeev Patel, Dr Ray Armstrong, Professor John Cairns, Mr Diar Fattah, Ms Susan Faulds, Dr Mark Glover, Mr Richard James Hoddes, Dr Sanjay Kinra, Dr Miriam McCarthy, Dr Stephen Smith, Professor Ken Stein, Mr Nigel Westwood, Dr Stuart Williams all declared that they knew of no personal specific financial interest, personal non-

specific financial interest, non-personal specific financial interest, non-personal non-specific financial interest, personal specific family interest or personal non-specific family interest for any of the technologies to be considered as part of the appraisal of lenvatinib with everolimus for previously treated advanced renal cell carcinoma [ID1029].

34. The Chair asked all NICE Staff to declare any relevant interests.

34.1. All declared that they knew of no personal specific financial interest, personal non-specific financial interest, non-personal specific financial interest, non-personal non-specific financial interest, personal specific family interest or personal non-specific family interest for any of the technologies to be considered as part of the appraisal of lenvatinib with everolimus for previously treated advanced renal cell carcinoma [ID1029].

35. The Chair asked all other invited guests (assessment group/ERG and invited experts, not including observers) to declare their relevant interests.

35.1. All declared that they knew of no personal specific financial interest, personal non-specific financial interest, non-personal specific financial interest, non-personal non-specific financial interest, personal specific family interest or personal non-specific family interest for any of the technologies to be considered as part of the appraisal of lenvatinib with everolimus for previously treated advanced renal cell carcinoma [ID1029].

36. The Chair introduced the key themes arising from the consultation responses to the Appraisal Consultation Document (ACD) received from consultees, commentators and through the NICE website.

37. The Chair asked the company representatives whether they wished to comment on any matters of factual accuracy.

38. The Chair explained that “representatives of the press and other members of the public be excluded from the remainder of this meeting having regard to the confidential nature of the business to be transacted, publicity on which would be prejudicial to the public interest” (Section 1(2) Public Bodies (Admission to Meetings) Act 1960)” and all public attendees left the meeting.

39. The Chair then thanked the experts and company representatives for their attendance, participation and contribution to the appraisal and they left the meeting.

Part 2 – Closed session

40. Discussion on confidential information continued. This information was supplied by the company.

41. The Chair then thanked the Evidence Review Group representatives for their attendance, participation and contribution to the appraisal and they left the meeting.

42. The Committee continued to discuss the clinical and cost effectiveness of lenvatinib with everolimus for previously treated advanced renal cell carcinoma [ID1029].

- 42.1. The committee decision was based on consensus.
43. The Committee instructed the technical team to prepare the Final Appraisal Determination (FAD) in line with their decisions.

Date, time and venue of the next meeting

Wednesday, 16 October 2017 at 10am to 5pm National Institute for Health and Care Excellence, 10 Spring Gardens London , SW1A 2BU