

## Technology Appraisal Committee Meeting (Committee C)

**Minutes:** Confirmed

**Date and Time:** Tuesday 15 August 2017 10:00 to 15:30

**Venue:** Holiday Inn Manchester City Centre  
25 Aytoun St  
Manchester  
M1 3AE

<b>Present:</b>	1. Chair Professor Andrew Stevens 2. Professor Kathryn Abel 3. Professor John Cairns (committee B) 4. Mr Michael Chambers 5. Mr David Chandler 6. Dr Prithwiraj Das 7. Ms Sue Faulds (committee B) 8. Mr John P Hampson 9. Dr Nigel Langford 10. Professor Stephen O'Brien 11. Professor Peter Selby 12. Professor Matt Stevenson 13. Dr Paul Tappenden 14. Dr Derek Ward 15. Dr Judith Wardle 16. Mr Nigel Westwood	Present for notes 16 to 52 Present for all notes Present for all notes Present for all notes Present for all notes Present for notes 1 to 27 Present for all notes Present for notes 16 to 52 Present for all notes Present for all notes Present for all notes Present for all notes
-----------------	---	--

### In attendance:

Meindert Boysen	Programme Director, National Institute for Health and Care Excellence	Present for all notes
Frances Sutcliffe	Associate Director, National Institute for Health and Care Excellence	Present for all notes
Stephanie Yates	Project Manager, National Institute for Health and Care Excellence	Present for all notes
Liga Kremere	Administrator, National Institute for Health and Care Excellence	Present for all notes
Victoria Kelly	Technical Analyst, National Institute for	Present for notes 5 to 15

Health and Care Excellence		
Alex Filby	Technical Adviser, National Institute for Health and Care Excellence	Present for notes 5 to 15 and 28 to 51
Ross Dent	Technical Analyst, National Institute for Health and Care Excellence	Present for notes 16 to 27
Sally Doss	Technical Adviser, National Institute for Health and Care Excellence	Present for notes 16 to 27
Boglarka Mikudina	Technical Analyst, National Institute for Health and Care Excellence	Present for notes 28 to 51

### **Non-public attendees:**

Ailsa Bosworth	Patient Expert	Present for notes 5 to 13
Dr Marwan Bukhari	Clinical Expert	Present for notes 5 to 13
Peter Clark	Commissioning Expert	Present for notes 28 to 51
Jennie Jones	Patient Expert	Present for notes 5 to 13
Inigo Bermejo	ERG representative	Present for notes 16 to 24
Emma Simpson	ERG representative	Present for notes 16 to 24
Prof Matt Stevenson	ERG representative	Present for notes 16 to 24
Carl Boswell	NICE Observer	Present for notes 28 to 51
Sally Doss	NICE Observer	Present for notes 28 to 51
Steve Estevao	NICE Observer	Present for all notes
Christopher Eatough	NICE Observer	Present for all notes
Leslie Hayes	NICE Observer	Present for all notes
Linda Landells	NICE Observer	Present for notes 28 to 51
Steve Robinson	NICE Observer	Present for all notes
Amaka Umeweni	NICE Observer	Present for notes 16 to 51
Eleanor Wright	NICE Observer	Present for notes 5 to 24

### **Notes**

### **Welcome**

The Chair welcomed all members of the Committee and other attendees present to the meeting. The Chair reviewed the agenda and timescales for the meeting, which included the appraisals of sarilumab for previously treated moderate to severe active rheumatoid arthritis, afibbercept for treating myopic choroidal neovascularisation, nivolumab for treating metastatic, squamous, non-small-cell lung cancer after chemotherapy and nivolumab for previously treated locally advanced or metastatic non-squamous non-

small-cell lung cancer.

1. The Chair welcomed Dr Derek Ward to his first meeting as a member of the Appraisal Committee
2. The Chair informed the Committee of the non-public observers at this meeting: Carl Boswell, Sally Doss, Steve Estevao, Christopher Eatough, Leslie Hayes, Linda Landells, Steve Robinson, Amaka Umeweni, Eleanor Wright
3. Apologies were received from Mr Kamal Balakrishnan, Gail Coster, Professor Andrea Manca, Dr Iain Miller, Mr Richard Nicholas and Dr Robert Walton.

### **Any other Business**

4. None

### **Appraisal of sarilumab for previously treated moderate to severe active rheumatoid arthritis [ID994]**

#### **Part 1 – Open session**

5. The Chair welcomed the invited experts: Ailsa Bosworth, Dr Marwan Bukhari, Jennie Jones, Inigo Bermejo, Emma Simpson and Professor Matt Stevenson to the meeting and they introduced themselves to the Committee.
6. The Chair welcomed company representatives from Sanofi to the meeting.
7. The Chair asked all Committee members to declare any relevant interests
  - 7.1. Professor Kathryn Abel, Professor John Cairns, Mr David Chandler, Dr Prithviraj Das, Ms Sue Faulds, Mr John P Hampson, Dr Nigel Langford, Professor Stephen O'Brien, Dr Peter Selby (Chair), Dr Derek Ward, Dr Judith Wardle, Mr Nigel Westwood all declared that they knew of no personal specific financial interest, personal non-specific financial interest, non-personal specific financial interest, non-personal non-specific financial interest, personal specific family interest or personal non-specific family interest for any of the technologies to be considered as part of the appraisal of sarilumab for previously treated moderate to severe active rheumatoid arthritis.
  - 7.2. Mr Michael Chambers, declared a personal non-specific financial interest as he has received payment for speaking at advisory boards for Roche (possible comparator company) for a different technology in a different disease area.
    - 7.2.1. It was agreed that this declaration would not prevent Mr Michael Chambers from participating in this section of the meeting.
  - 7.3. Dr Paul Tappenden declared a personal specific financial interest as he had peer reviewed the draft ERG report for this appraisal.
    - 7.3.1. It was agreed that this declaration would prevent Dr Paul Tappenden from participating in this section of the meeting.
  - 7.4. Professor Matt Stevenson is conflicted as his organisation is the Evidence Review Group for the appraisal.

8. The Chair asked all NICE Staff to declare any relevant interests.
  - 8.1. All declared that they knew of no personal specific financial interest, personal non-specific financial interest, non-personal specific financial interest, non-personal non-specific financial interest, personal specific family interest or personal non-specific family interest for any of the technologies to be considered as part of the appraisal of sarilumab for previously treated moderate to severe active rheumatoid arthritis.
9. The Chair asked all other invited guests (assessment group/ERG and invited experts, not including observers) to declare their relevant interests.
  - 9.1. Jennie Jones and the ERG declared that they knew of no personal specific financial interest, personal non-specific financial interest, non-personal specific financial interest, non-personal non-specific financial interest, personal specific family interest or personal non-specific family interest for any of the technologies to be considered as part of the appraisal of sarilumab for previously treated moderate to severe active rheumatoid arthritis.
  - 9.2. Ailsa Bosworth declared a personal non-specific financial interest as her organisation has received funding grants from the pharmaceutical industry
    - 9.2.1. It was agreed that this declaration would not prevent Ailsa Bosworth from participating in this section of the meeting
  - 9.3. Dr Marwan Bukhari declared a personal non-specific financial interest as he regularly provides masterclasses and educational programmes for industry.
    - 9.3.1. It was agreed that this declaration would not prevent Dr Marwan Bukhari from participating in this section of the meeting
10. The Chair introduced the lead team, Prof Andrew Renahan, Dr Nigel Langford and Mr David Chandler who gave presentations on the clinical effectiveness and cost effectiveness of sarilumab for previously treated moderate to severe active rheumatoid arthritis.
11. The Chair asked the company representatives whether they wished to comment on any matters of factual accuracy.
12. The Chair explained that "representatives of the press and other members of the public be excluded from the remainder of this meeting having regard to the confidential nature of the business to be transacted, publicity on which would be prejudicial to the public interest" (Section 1(2) Public Bodies (Admission to Meetings) Act 1960)" and all public attendees left the meeting.
13. The Chair then thanked the experts and company representatives for their attendance, participation and contribution to the appraisal and they left the meeting.

## **Part 2 – Closed session**

14. Discussion on confidential information continued. This information was supplied by the company.
15. The Committee continued to discuss the clinical and cost effectiveness of sarilumab for previously treated moderate to severe active rheumatoid arthritis.
  - 15.1. The committee decision was based on consensus.

The Committee instructed the technical team to prepare the Final Appraisal Determination (FAD) in line with their decisions.

## **Appraisal of aflibercept for treating myopic choroidal neovascularisation [ID952]**

### **Part 1 – Open session**

16. The Chair welcomed the invited experts to the meeting and they introduced themselves to the Committee.
17. The Chair welcomed company representatives from Bayer to the meeting.
18. The Chair asked all Committee members to declare any relevant interests
  - 18.1. Chair Professor Andrew Stevens, Professor Kathryn Abel, Professor John Cairns, Mr Michael Chambers, Mr David Chandler, Dr Prithwiraj Das, Ms Sue Faulds, Mr John P Hampson, Dr Nigel Langford, Professor Stephen O'Brien, Dr Peter Selby, Professor Matt Stevenson, Dr Paul Tappenden, Dr Derek Ward and Dr Judith Wardle, Mr Nigel Westwood all declared that they knew of no personal specific financial interest, personal non-specific financial interest, non-personal specific financial interest, non-personal non-specific financial interest, personal specific family interest or personal non-specific family interest for any of the technologies to be considered as part of the appraisal of aflibercept for treating myopic choroidal neovascularisation.
19. The Chair asked all NICE Staff to declare any relevant interests.
  - 19.1. All declared that they knew of no personal specific financial interest, personal non-specific financial interest, non-personal specific financial interest, non-personal non-specific financial interest, personal specific family interest or personal non-specific family interest for any of the technologies to be considered as part of the appraisal of aflibercept for treating myopic choroidal neovascularisation.
20. The Chair asked all other invited guests (assessment group/ERG and invited experts, not including observers) to declare their relevant interests.
  - 20.1. All declared that they knew of no personal specific financial interest, personal non-specific financial interest, non-personal specific financial interest, non-personal non-specific financial interest, personal specific family interest or personal non-specific family interest for any of the technologies to be considered as part of the appraisal of aflibercept for treating myopic choroidal neovascularisation.
21. The Chair gave presentations on the clinical effectiveness and cost effectiveness of aflibercept for treating myopic choroidal neovascularisation.

22. The Chair asked the company representatives whether they wished to comment on any matters of factual accuracy.
23. The Chair explained that "representatives of the press and other members of the public be excluded from the remainder of this meeting having regard to the confidential nature of the business to be transacted, publicity on which would be prejudicial to the public interest" (Section 1(2) Public Bodies (Admission to Meetings) Act 1960)" and all public attendees left the meeting.
24. The Chair then thanked the experts and company representatives for their attendance, participation and contribution to the appraisal and they left the meeting.

## **Part 2 – Closed session**

25. Discussion on confidential information continued. This information was supplied by the company.
26. The Committee continued to discuss the clinical and cost effectiveness of afibbercept for treating myopic choroidal neovascularisation
  - 26.1. The committee decision was based on consensus.
27. The Committee instructed the technical team to prepare the Final Appraisal Determination (FAD) in line with their decisions.

## **Appraisal of nivolumab for treating metastatic, squamous, non-small-cell lung cancer after chemotherapy [ID811]**

### **Part 1 – Open session**

28. The Chair welcomed the invited experts: Peter Clark and Inigo Bermejo to the meeting and they introduced themselves to the Committee.
29. The Chair welcomed company representatives from Bristol-Myers Squibb Pharmaceuticals Ltd (BMS) to the meeting.
30. The Chair asked all Committee members to declare any relevant interests
  - 30.1. Chair Professor Andrew Stevens, Professor Kathryn Abel, Mr David Chandler, Dr Prithviraj Das, Ms Sue Faulds, Mr John P Hampson, Dr Nigel Langford, Dr Peter Selby, Professor Matt Stevenson, Dr Derek Ward, Dr Judith Wardle and Mr Nigel Westwood all declared that they knew of no personal specific financial interest, personal non-specific financial interest, non-personal specific financial interest, non-personal non-specific financial interest, personal specific family interest or personal non-specific family interest for any of the technologies to be considered as part of the appraisal of nivolumab for treating metastatic, squamous, non-small-cell lung cancer after chemotherapy.
  - 30.2. Professor John Cairns declared a personal non-specific financial interest as he has presented a session on an introduction to health economics to oncologists at Boehringer Ingelheim (a possible comparator company)

30.2.1. It was agreed that this declaration would not prevent Professor John Cairns from participating in this section of the meeting.

30.3. Mr Michael Chambers, declared a personal non-specific financial interest as he has received payment for speaking at advisory boards for Roche (possible comparator company) for a different technology in a different disease area.

30.3.1. It was agreed that this declaration would not prevent Mr Michael Chambers from participating in this section of the meeting.

30.4. Professor Stephen O'Brien declared a non-personal non-specific financial interest as his University and/or NHS Trust has received research funding for clinical trial work from the following companies: Pfizer, Novartis and Bristol-Myers Squibb

30.4.1. It was agreed that this declaration would not prevent Professor Stephen O'Brien from participating in this section of the meeting

30.5. Dr Paul Tappenden declared a non-personal specific financial interest as he provided an internal peer review of the DSU report, although he had not been directly involved.

30.5.1. It was agreed that this declarations would not prevent Dr Paul Tappenden from participating in this section of the meeting

30.6. Dr Prithwiraj Das is conflicted as he is employed by Boehringer Ingelheim Limited, a potential comparator company for this appraisal.

31. The Chair asked all NICE Staff to declare any relevant interests.

31.1. All declared that they knew of no personal specific financial interest, personal non-specific financial interest, non-personal specific financial interest, non-personal non-specific financial interest, personal specific family interest or personal non-specific family interest for any of the technologies to be considered as part of the appraisal of nivolumab for treating metastatic, squamous, non-small-cell lung cancer after chemotherapy.

32. The Chair asked all other invited guests (assessment group/ERG and invited experts, not including observers) to declare their relevant interests.

32.1. All declared that they knew of no personal specific financial interest, personal non-specific financial interest, non-personal specific financial interest, non-personal non-specific financial interest, personal specific family interest or personal non-specific family interest for any of the technologies to be considered as part of the appraisal of nivolumab for treating metastatic, squamous, non-small-cell lung cancer after chemotherapy.

33. The Chair introduced the key themes arising from the consultation responses to the Appraisal Consultation Document (ACD) received from consultees, commentators and through the NICE website.

34. The Chair asked the company representatives whether they wished to comment on any matters of factual accuracy.

35. The Chair explained that "representatives of the press and other members of the public be excluded from the remainder of this meeting having regard to the confidential nature of the business to be transacted, publicity on which would be prejudicial to the public interest" (Section 1(2) Public Bodies (Admission to Meetings) Act 1960" and all public attendees left the meeting.
36. The Chair then thanked the experts and company representatives for their attendance, participation and contribution to the appraisal and they left the meeting.

## **Part 2 – Closed session**

37. Discussion on confidential information continued. This information was supplied by the company.
38. The Committee continued to discuss the clinical and cost effectiveness of nivolumab for treating metastatic, squamous, non-small-cell lung cancer after chemotherapy.
39. The Committee instructed the technical team to prepare the Final Appraisal Determination (FAD) in line with their decisions.

## **Appraisal of nivolumab for previously treated locally advanced or metastatic non-squamous non-small-cell lung cancer [ID900]**

### **Part 1 – Open session**

40. The Chair welcomed the invited experts: Peter Clark and Inigo Bermejo to the meeting and they introduced themselves to the Committee.
41. The Chair welcomed company representatives from Bristol-Myers Squibb Pharmaceuticals Ltd (BMS) to the meeting.
42. The Chair asked all Committee members to declare any relevant interests
  - 42.1. Chair Professor Andrew Stevens, Professor Kathryn Abel, Mr David Chandler, Dr Prithviraj Das, Ms Sue Faulds, Mr John P Hampson, Dr Nigel Langford, Dr Peter Selby, Professor Matt Stevenson, Dr Derek Ward, Dr Judith Wardle and Mr Nigel Westwood all declared that they knew of no personal specific financial interest, personal non-specific financial interest, non-personal specific financial interest, non-personal non-specific financial interest, personal specific family interest or personal non-specific family interest for any of the technologies to be considered as part of the appraisal of nivolumab for previously treated locally advanced or metastatic non-squamous non-small-cell lung cancer.
  - 42.2. Professor John Cairns declared a personal non-specific financial interest as he has presented a session on an introduction to health economics to oncologists at Boehringer Ingelheim (a possible comparator company)
    - 42.2.1. It was agreed that this declaration would not prevent Professor John Cairns from participating in this section of the meeting.

42.3. Mr Michael Chambers, declared a personal non-specific financial interest as he has received payment for speaking at advisory boards for Roche (possible comparator company) for a different technology in a different disease area.

42.3.1. It was agreed that this declaration would not prevent Mr Michael Chambers from participating in this section of the meeting.

42.4. Professor Stephen O'Brien declared a non-personal non-specific financial interest as his University and/or NHS Trust has received research funding for clinical trial work from the following companies: Pfizer, Novartis and Bristol-Myers Squibb

42.4.1. It was agreed that this declaration would not prevent Professor Stephen O'Brien from participating in this section of the meeting

42.5. Dr Paul Tappenden declared a non-personal specific financial interest as he provided an internal peer review of the DSU report, although he had not been directly involved.

42.5.1. It was agreed that this declarations would not prevent Dr Paul Tappenden from participating in this section of the meeting

42.6. Dr Prithwiraj Das was absent due conflicts - a personal specific financial interest. He is employed by Boehringer Ingelheim Limited. Boehringer Ingelheim is listed as a comparator manufacturer for this appraisal

43. The Chair asked all NICE Staff to declare any relevant interests.

43.1. All declared that they knew of no personal specific financial interest, personal non-specific financial interest, non-personal specific financial interest, non-personal non-specific financial interest, personal specific family interest or personal non-specific family interest for any of the technologies to be considered as part of the appraisal of nivolumab for previously treated locally advanced or metastatic non-squamous non-small-cell lung cancer.

44. The Chair asked all other invited guests (assessment group/ERG and invited experts, not including observers) to declare their relevant interests.

44.1. All declared that they knew of no personal specific financial interest, personal non-specific financial interest, non-personal specific financial interest, non-personal non-specific financial interest, personal specific family interest or personal non-specific family interest for any of the technologies to be considered as part of the appraisal of nivolumab for previously treated locally advanced or metastatic non-squamous non-small-cell lung cancer.

45. The Chair introduced the key themes arising from the consultation responses to the Appraisal Consultation Document (ACD) received from consultees, commentators and through the NICE website.

46. The Chair asked the company representatives whether they wished to comment on any matters of factual accuracy.

47. The Chair explained that "representatives of the press and other members of the public be excluded from the remainder of this meeting having regard to the confidential nature of the business to be transacted, publicity on which would be prejudicial to the public interest" (Section 1(2) Public Bodies (Admission to Meetings) Act 1960)" and all public attendees left the meeting.
48. The Chair then thanked the experts and company representatives for their attendance, participation and contribution to the appraisal and they left the meeting.

## **Part 2 – Closed session**

49. Discussion on confidential information continued. This information was supplied by the company.
50. The Committee continued to discuss the clinical and cost effectiveness of nivolumab for previously treated locally advanced or metastatic non-squamous non-small-cell lung cancer.
  - 50.1. The committee decision was based on consensus.
51. The Committee instructed the technical team to prepare the Final Appraisal Determination (FAD) in line with their decisions.

## **Date, time and venue of the next meeting**

52. Wednesday 13 September 2017 at National Institute for Health and Care Excellence, Level 1A, City Tower, Piccadilly Plaza, Manchester M1 4BT.