

Technology Appraisal Committee Meeting (Committee B)

Minutes: Confirmed

Date and Time: Wednesday 21 June 2017, 10am to 5pm

Venue: Prospero House, 241 Borough High Street, London, SE1 1GA

Present:	1. Dr Amanda Adler (Chair) 2. Dr Sanjeev Patel (Vice-Chair) 3. Dr Ray Armstrong 4. Professor John Cairns 5. Mr Mark Chapman 6. Dr Mark Glover 7. Dr Sumeet Gupta 8. Dr Sanjay Kinra 9. Dr Miriam McCarthy 10. Mr Christopher O'Regan 11. Professor Stephen Palmer 12. Ms Marta Soares 13. Dr Nicky Welton 14. Mr Nigel Westwood 15. Dr Stuart Williams	Present for all notes Present for notes 7 to 42 Present for all notes Present for all notes
-----------------	--------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------	-------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------------

In attendance:

Meindert Boysen	Programme Director, National Institute for Health and Care Excellence	Present for all notes
Dr Elisabeth George	Associate Director, National Institute for Health and Care Excellence	Present for all notes
Dr Melinda Goodall	Associate Director, National Institute for Health and Care Excellence	Present for notes 18 to 29
Jeremy Powell	Project Manager, National Institute for Health and Care Excellence	Present for all notes
Mandy Tonkinson	Administrator, National Institute for Health and Care Excellence	Present for notes 1 to 35
Jasdeep Hayre	Technical Adviser, National Institute for Health and Clinical	Present for notes 1 to 29

	Excellence	
Ahmed Elsada	Technical Adviser, National Institute for Health and Clinical Excellence	Present for notes 30 to 42
Sharlene Ting	Technical Analyst, National Institute for Health and Care Excellence	Present for notes 1 to 17
Henry Edwards	Technical Analyst, National Institute for Health and Care Excellence	Present for notes 18 to 29
Dr Mary Hughes	Technical Analyst, National Institute for Health and Care Excellence	Present for notes 30 to 42
Dr John Foerster	Senior clinical lecturer, University of Dundee, clinical expert – nominated by Almirall	Present for notes 5 to 13
Mr David Chandler	Chief Executive, Psoriasis & Psoriatic Arthritis Alliance, patient expert - nominated by the Psoriasis & Psoriatic Arthritis Alliance	Present for notes 5 to 13
Ms Helen McAteer	Chief Executive, Psoriasis Association, patient expert - nominated by the Psoriasis Association	Present for notes 5 to 13
Professor James Mason	Professor of Health Economics, Warwick Evidence	Present for notes 5 to 15
Mr Ewen Cummins	Independent Health Economist, Warwick Evidence	Present for notes 5 to 15
Ms Emma Loveman	Warwick Evidence	Present for notes 5 to 15
Dr Graham Scotland	Senior Research Fellow, Aberdeen HTA Group	Present for notes 18 to 26
Professor Norman Waugh	Professor of Public Health, Warwick Evidence	Present for notes 30 to 40
Dr Hema Mistry	Assistant Professor of Health Economics, Warwick Evidence	Present for notes 30 to 40
Mr Andy Metcalfe	Associate Clinical Professor, WMS Clinical Trials, Warwick Evidence	Present for notes 30 to 40

Non-public observers:

Helen Barnett	Medical Editor, National Institute for Health and Care Excellence	Present for all notes
Edgar Masanga	Business Analyst - Resource Impact Assessment, National Institute for Health and Care Excellence	Present for all notes
Chidozie Nduka	Research Fellow, Clinical Effectiveness Reviewer, ERG observer	Present for notes 1 to 17
Susanne de Vaal	Dutch Hospital pharmacists study program	Present for notes 1 to 17
Christian Vader	Dutch Hospital pharmacists study program	Present for notes 1 to 17
Yu Han Kho	Dutch Hospital pharmacists study program	Present for notes 1 to 17
Ellen Frankfort	Dutch Hospital pharmacists study program	Present for notes 1 to 17
Audrey Blenke	Dutch Hospital pharmacists study program	Present for notes 1 to 17
Allison Webster-Kell	Dutch Hospital pharmacists study program	Present for notes 1 to 17
Carlyn Noll	Dutch Hospital pharmacists study program	Present for notes 1 to 17
Dick Bloemhof	Dutch Hospital pharmacists study program	Present for notes 1 to 17
Jordi Butterhoff	Dutch Hospital pharmacists study program	Present for notes 1 to 17
Emilie Gieling	Dutch Hospital pharmacists study program	Present for notes 1 to 17
Liesbeth Bosma	Dutch Hospital pharmacists study program	Present for notes 1 to 17

Notes**Welcome**

1. The Chair welcomed all members of the Committee and other attendees present to the meeting. The Chair reviewed the agenda and timescales for the meeting, which included the appraisals of dimethyl fumarate for treating moderate to severe

plaque psoriasis [ID776], eluxadoline for treating irritable bowel syndrome with diarrhoea [ID870] and autologous chondrocyte implantation for repairing symptomatic articular cartilage defects of the knee (including a review of TA89) [ID686].

2. The Chair informed the Committee of the non-public observers at this meeting: Helen Barnett, Edgar Masanga, Chidozie Nduka, Susanne de Vaal, Christian Vader, Yu Han Kho, Ellen Frankfort, Audrey Blenke, Allison Webster-Kell, Carolyn Noll, Dick Bloemhof, Jordi Butterhoff, Emilie Gieling and Liesbeth Bosma.
3. Apologies were received from Dr Neil Iosson, Dr Danielle Preedy and Professor Ken Stein.

Any other Business

4. The Committee were given an update on the progress of appraisals that had been discussed at previous meetings.

Appraisal of dimethyl fumarate for treating moderate to severe plaque psoriasis [ID776]

Part 1 – Open session

5. The Chair welcomed the invited experts: Mr David Chandler, Mr Ewen Cummins, Dr John Foerster, Ms Emma Loveman, Professor James Mason, Ms Helen McAteer to the meeting and they introduced themselves to the Committee.
6. The Chair welcomed company representatives from Almirall to the meeting.
7. The Chair asked all Committee members to declare any relevant interests
 - 7.1. Dr Amanda Adler, Dr Sanjeev Patel, Dr Ray Armstrong, Mr Mark Chapman, Dr Mark Glover, Dr Sumeet Gupta, Dr Sanjay Kinra, Dr Miriam McCarthy, Mr Christopher O'Regan, Professor Stephen Palmer, Ms Marta Soares, Dr Nicky Welton, Mr Nigel Westwood and Dr Stuart Williams all declared that they knew of no personal specific financial interest, personal non-specific financial interest, non-personal specific financial interest, non-personal non-specific financial interest, personal specific family interest or personal non-specific family interest for any of the technologies to be considered as part of the appraisal of dimethyl fumarate for treating moderate to severe plaque psoriasis [ID776].
 - 7.2. Professor John Cairns declared a non-personal specific financial interest as he has given a presentation to Boehringer.
 - 9.2.1. It was agreed that this declaration would not prevent Professor Cairns from participating in this section of the meeting.
8. The Chair asked all NICE Staff to declare any relevant interests.
 - 8.1. All declared that they knew of no personal specific financial interest, personal non-specific financial interest, non-personal specific financial interest, non-personal non-specific financial interest, personal specific family interest or personal non-specific family interest for any of the technologies to be considered as part of the appraisal of dimethyl fumarate for treating moderate to severe plaque psoriasis [ID776].

9. The Chair asked all other invited guests (assessment group/ERG and invited experts, not including observers) to declare their relevant interests.
 - 9.1. Mr David Chandler, Mr Ewen Cummins, Ms Emma Loveman and Professor James Mason declared that they knew of no personal specific financial interest, personal non-specific financial interest, non-personal specific financial interest, non-personal non-specific financial interest, personal specific family interest or personal non-specific family interest for any of the technologies to be considered as part of the appraisal of dimethyl fumarate for treating moderate to severe plaque psoriasis [ID776].
 - 9.2. Dr John Foerster declared a personal specific financial interest as he has received honoraria for participating in an advisory board for Almirall.
 - 9.2.1. It was agreed that this declaration would not prevent Dr Foerster from participating in this section of the meeting
 - 9.3. Ms Helen McAteer declared a non-personal specific financial interest as the Psoriasis Association has received corporate membership fees from the companies involved in this appraisal.
 - 9.3.1. It was agreed that this declaration would not prevent Ms McAteer from participating in this section of the meeting
10. The Chair introduced the lead team, Dr Miriam McCarthy, Mr Nigel Westwood and Dr Stuart Williams who gave presentations on the clinical effectiveness and cost effectiveness of dimethyl fumarate for treating moderate to severe plaque psoriasis [ID776].
11. The Chair asked the company representatives whether they wished to comment on any matters of factual accuracy.
12. The Chair explained that "representatives of the press and other members of the public be excluded from the remainder of this meeting having regard to the confidential nature of the business to be transacted, publicity on which would be prejudicial to the public interest" (Section 1(2) Public Bodies (Admission to Meetings) Act 1960)" and all public attendees left the meeting.
13. The Chair then thanked the clinical and patient experts and company representatives for their attendance, participation and contribution to the appraisal and they left the meeting.

Part 2 – Closed session

14. Discussion on confidential information continued. This information was supplied by the company.
15. The Chair then thanked the Evidence Review Group representatives for their attendance, participation and contribution to the appraisal and they left the meeting.
16. The Committee continued to discuss the clinical and cost effectiveness of dimethyl fumarate for treating moderate to severe plaque psoriasis [ID776].
 - 16.1. The committee decision was based on consensus.

17. The Committee instructed the technical team to prepare the Final Appraisal Determination (FAD) in line with their decisions.

Appraisal of eluxadoline for treating irritable bowel syndrome with diarrhoea [ID870]

Part 1 – Open session

18. The Chair welcomed the invited expert: Dr Graham Scotland to the meeting and he introduced himself to the Committee.
19. The Chair welcomed company representatives from Allergan to the meeting.
20. The Chair asked all Committee members to declare any relevant interests
 - 20.1. Dr Amanda Adler, Dr Sanjeev Patel, Dr Ray Armstrong, Professor John Cairns, Mr Mark Chapman, Dr Mark Glover, Dr Sumeet Gupta, Dr Sanjay Kinra, Dr Miriam McCarthy, Mr Christopher O'Regan, Professor Stephen Palmer, Ms Marta Soares, Dr Nicky Welton, Mr Nigel Westwood and Dr Stuart Williams all declared that they knew of no personal specific financial interest, personal non-specific financial interest, non-personal specific financial interest, non-personal non-specific financial interest, personal specific family interest or personal non-specific family interest for any of the technologies to be considered as part of the appraisal of eluxadoline for treating irritable bowel syndrome with diarrhoea [ID870].
21. The Chair asked all NICE Staff to declare any relevant interests.
 - 21.1. All declared that they knew of no personal specific financial interest, personal non-specific financial interest, non-personal specific financial interest, non-personal non-specific financial interest, personal specific family interest or personal non-specific family interest for any of the technologies to be considered as part of the appraisal of eluxadoline for treating irritable bowel syndrome with diarrhoea [ID870].
22. The Chair asked all other invited guests (assessment group/ERG and invited experts, not including observers) to declare their relevant interests.
 - 22.1. Dr Graham Scotland declared that he knew of no personal specific financial interest, personal non-specific financial interest, non-personal specific financial interest, non-personal non-specific financial interest, personal specific family interest or personal non-specific family interest for any of the technologies to be considered as part of the appraisal of eluxadoline for treating irritable bowel syndrome with diarrhoea [ID870].
23. The Chair introduced the key themes arising from the consultation responses to the Appraisal Consultation Document (ACD) received from consultees, commentators and through the NICE website.
24. The Chair asked the company representatives whether they wished to comment on any matters of factual accuracy.
25. The Chair explained that “representatives of the press and other members of the public be excluded from the remainder of this meeting having regard to the confidential nature of the business to be transacted, publicity on which would be

prejudicial to the public interest" (Section 1(2) Public Bodies (Admission to Meetings) Act 1960)" and all public attendees left the meeting.

26. The Chair then thanked the experts and company representatives for their attendance, participation and contribution to the appraisal and they left the meeting.

Part 2 – Closed session

27. Discussion on confidential information continued. This information was supplied by the company.
28. The Committee continued to discuss the clinical and cost effectiveness of eluxadoline for treating irritable bowel syndrome with diarrhoea [ID870].
 - 28.1. The committee decision was based on consensus.
29. The Committee instructed the technical team to prepare the Final Appraisal Determination (FAD) in line with their decisions.

Appraisal of autologous chondrocyte implantation for repairing symptomatic articular cartilage defects of the knee (including a review of TA89) [ID686]

Part 1 – Open session

30. The Chair welcomed the invited experts: Mr Andy Metcalfe, Dr Hema Mistry and Professor Norman Waugh to the meeting and they introduced themselves to the Committee.
31. The Chair welcomed company representatives from the Robert Jones and Agnes Hunt hospital and from Vericel to the meeting.
32. The Chair asked all Committee members to declare any relevant interests
 - 32.1. Dr Amanda Adler, Dr Sanjeev Patel, Dr Ray Armstrong, Professor John Cairns, Mr Mark Chapman, Dr Mark Glover, Dr Sumeet Gupta, Dr Sanjay Kinra, Dr Miriam McCarthy, Mr Christopher O'Regan, Professor Stephen Palmer, Ms Marta Soares, Dr Nicky Welton, Mr Nigel Westwood and Dr Stuart Williams all declared that they knew of no personal specific financial interest, personal non-specific financial interest, non-personal specific financial interest, non-personal non-specific financial interest, personal specific family interest or personal non-specific family interest for any of the technologies to be considered as part of the appraisal of autologous chondrocyte implantation for repairing symptomatic articular cartilage defects of the knee (including a review of TA89) [ID686].
33. The Chair asked all NICE Staff to declare any relevant interests.
 - 33.1. All declared that they knew of no personal specific financial interest, personal non-specific financial interest, non-personal specific financial interest, non-personal non-specific financial interest, personal specific family interest or personal non-specific family interest for any of the technologies to be considered as part of the appraisal of autologous

chondrocyte implantation for repairing symptomatic articular cartilage defects of the knee (including a review of TA89) [ID686].

34. The Chair asked all other invited guests (assessment group/ERG and invited experts, not including observers) to declare their relevant interests.
 - 34.1. All declared that they knew of no personal specific financial interest, personal non-specific financial interest, non-personal specific financial interest, non-personal non-specific financial interest, personal specific family interest or personal non-specific family interest for any of the technologies to be considered as part of the appraisal of autologous chondrocyte implantation for repairing symptomatic articular cartilage defects of the knee (including a review of TA89) [ID686].
35. The Chair introduced the Assessment Group's addendum and the key themes arising from the consultation responses on this addendum received from consultees and commentators.
36. The Chair asked the company representatives whether they wished to comment on any matters of factual accuracy.
37. The Chair explained that "representatives of the press and other members of the public be excluded from the remainder of this meeting having regard to the confidential nature of the business to be transacted, publicity on which would be prejudicial to the public interest" (Section 1(2) Public Bodies (Admission to Meetings) Act 1960)" and all public attendees left the meeting.
38. The Chair then thanked the company representatives for their attendance, participation and contribution to the appraisal and they left the meeting.

Part 2 – Closed session

39. Discussion on confidential information continued. This information was supplied by the company.
40. The Chair then thanked the Assessment Group representatives for their attendance, participation and contribution to the appraisal and they left the meeting.
41. The Committee continued to discuss the clinical and cost effectiveness of autologous chondrocyte implantation for repairing symptomatic articular cartilage defects of the knee (including a review of TA89) [ID686].
 - 41.1. The committee decision was based on consensus.
42. The Committee instructed the technical team to prepare the Final Appraisal Determination (FAD) in line with their decisions.

Date, time and venue of the next meeting

Wednesday 19 July, 10am to 5pm at ETC venues, Prospero House, 241 Borough High Street, London SE1 1GA.