Technology Appraisal Committee Meeting (Committee B)

Minutes: Confirmed

Date and Time: Wednesday 21 June 2017, 10am to 5pm

Venue: Prospero House, 241 Borough High Street, London, SE1 1GA

Present:
1. Dr Amanda Adler (Chair) Present for all notes
2. Dr Sanjeev Patel (Vice-Chair) Present for all notes
3. Dr Ray Armstrong Present for all notes
4. Professor John Cairns Present for all notes
5. Mr Mark Chapman Present for all notes
6. Dr Mark Glover Present for all notes
7. Dr Sumeet Gupta Present for all notes
8. Dr Sanjay Kinra Present for all notes
9. Dr Miriam McCarthy Present for all notes
10. Mr Christopher O'Regan Present for all notes
11. Professor Stephen Palmer Present for all notes
12. Ms Marta Soares Present for all notes
13. Dr Nicky Welton Present for notes 7 to 42
14. Mr Nigel Westwood Present for all notes
15. Dr Stuart Williams Present for all notes

In attendance:

Meindert Boysen Programme Director, National Institute for Health and Care Excellence Present for all notes

Dr Elisabeth George Associate Director, National Institute for Health and Care Excellence Present for all notes

Dr Melinda Goodall Associate Director, National Institute for Health and Care Excellence Present for notes 18 to 29

Jeremy Powell Project Manager, National Institute for Health and Care Excellence Present for all notes

Mandy Tonkinson Administrator, National Institute for Health and Care Excellence Present for notes 1 to 35

Jasdeep Hayre Technical Adviser, National Institute for Health and Clinical Present for notes 1 to 29
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Name</th>
<th>Position</th>
<th>Present for notes</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Ahmed Elsada</td>
<td>Technical Adviser, National Institute for Health and Clinical Excellence</td>
<td>30 to 42</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sharlene Ting</td>
<td>Technical Analyst, National Institute for Health and Care Excellence</td>
<td>1 to 17</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Henry Edwards</td>
<td>Technical Analyst, National Institute for Health and Care Excellence</td>
<td>18 to 29</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Dr Mary Hughes</td>
<td>Technical Analyst, National Institute for Health and Care Excellence</td>
<td>30 to 42</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Dr John Foerster</td>
<td>Senior clinical lecturer, University of Dundee, clinical expert – nominated by Almirall</td>
<td>5 to 13</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mr David Chandler</td>
<td>Chief Executive, Psoriasis &amp; Psoriatic Arthritis Alliance, patient expert - nominated by the Psoriasis &amp; Psoriatic Arthritis Alliance</td>
<td>5 to 13</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ms Helen McAteer</td>
<td>Chief Executive, Psoriasis Association, patient expert - nominated by the Psoriasis Association</td>
<td>5 to 13</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Professor James Mason</td>
<td>Professor of Health Economics, Warwick Evidence</td>
<td>5 to 15</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mr Ewen Cummins</td>
<td>Independent Health Economist, Warwick Evidence</td>
<td>5 to 15</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ms Emma Loveman</td>
<td>Warwick Evidence</td>
<td>5 to 15</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Dr Graham Scotland</td>
<td>Senior Research Fellow, Aberdeen HTA Group</td>
<td>18 to 26</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Professor Norman Waugh</td>
<td>Professor of Public Health, Warwick Evidence</td>
<td>30 to 40</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Dr Hema Mistry</td>
<td>Assistant Professor of Health Economics, Warwick Evidence</td>
<td>30 to 40</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Mr Andy Metcalfe</td>
<td>Associate Clinical Professor, WMS Clinical Trials, Warwick Evidence</td>
<td>30 to 40</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Non-public observers:

Helen Barnett  Medical Editor, National Institute for Health and Care Excellence  Present for all notes
Edgar Masanga  Business Analyst - Resource Impact Assessment, National Institute for Health and Care Excellence  Present for all notes
Chidozie Nduka  Research Fellow, Clinical Effectiveness Reviewer, ERG observer  Present for notes 1 to 17
Susanne de Vaal  Dutch Hospital pharmacists study program  Present for notes 1 to 17
Christian Vader  Dutch Hospital pharmacists study program  Present for notes 1 to 17
Yu Han Kho  Dutch Hospital pharmacists study program  Present for notes 1 to 17
Ellen Frankfort  Dutch Hospital pharmacists study program  Present for notes 1 to 17
Audrey Blenke  Dutch Hospital pharmacists study program  Present for notes 1 to 17
Allison Webster-Kell  Dutch Hospital pharmacists study program  Present for notes 1 to 17
Carlyn Noll  Dutch Hospital pharmacists study program  Present for notes 1 to 17
Dick Bloemhof  Dutch Hospital pharmacists study program  Present for notes 1 to 17
Jordi Butterhoff  Dutch Hospital pharmacists study program  Present for notes 1 to 17
Emilie Gieling  Dutch Hospital pharmacists study program  Present for notes 1 to 17
Liesbeth Bosma  Dutch Hospital pharmacists study program  Present for notes 1 to 17

Notes

Welcome

1. The Chair welcomed all members of the Committee and other attendees present to the meeting. The Chair reviewed the agenda and timescales for the meeting, which included the appraisals of dimethyl fumarate for treating moderate to severe
plaque psoriasis [ID776], eluxadoline for treating irritable bowel syndrome with diarrhoea [ID870] and autologous chondrocyte implantation for repairing symptomatic articular cartilage defects of the knee (including a review of TA89) [ID686].


3. Apologies were received from Dr Neil Iosson, Dr Danielle Preedy and Professor Ken Stein.

Any other Business

4. The Committee were given an update on the progress of appraisals that had been discussed at previous meetings.

Appraisal of dimethyl fumarate for treating moderate to severe plaque psoriasis [ID776]

Part 1 – Open session

5. The Chair welcomed the invited experts: Mr David Chandler, Mr Ewen Cummins, Dr John Foerster, Ms Emma Loveman, Professor James Mason, Ms Helen McAteer to the meeting and they introduced themselves to the Committee.

6. The Chair welcomed company representatives from Almirall to the meeting.

7. The Chair asked all Committee members to declare any relevant interests

7.1. Dr Amanda Adler, Dr Sanjeev Patel, Dr Ray Armstrong, Mr Mark Chapman, Dr Mark Glover, Dr Sumeet Gupta, Dr Sanjay Kinra, Dr Miriam McCarthy, Mr Christopher O'Regan, Professor Stephen Palmer, Ms Marta Soares, Dr Nicky Welton, Mr Nigel Westwood and Dr Stuart Williams all declared that they knew of no personal specific financial interest, personal non-specific financial interest, non-personal specific financial interest, non-personal non-specific financial interest, personal specific family interest or personal non-specific family interest for any of the technologies to be considered as part of the appraisal of dimethyl fumarate for treating moderate to severe plaque psoriasis [ID776].

7.2. Professor John Cairns declared a non-personal specific financial interest as he has given a presentation to Boehringer.

9.2.1 It was agreed that this declaration would not prevent Professor Cairns from participating in this section of the meeting.

8. The Chair asked all NICE Staff to declare any relevant interests.

8.1. All declared that they knew of no personal specific financial interest, personal non-specific financial interest, non-personal specific financial interest, non-personal non-specific financial interest, personal specific family interest or personal non-specific family interest for any of the technologies to be considered as part of the appraisal of dimethyl fumarate for treating moderate to severe plaque psoriasis [ID776].
9. The Chair asked all other invited guests (assessment group/ERG and invited experts, not including observers) to declare their relevant interests.

9.1. Mr David Chandler, Mr Ewen Cummins, Ms Emma Loveman and Professor James Mason declared that they knew of no personal specific financial interest, personal non-specific financial interest, non-personal specific financial interest, non-personal non-specific financial interest, personal specific family interest or personal non-specific family interest for any of the technologies to be considered as part of the appraisal of dimethyl fumarate for treating moderate to severe plaque psoriasis [ID776].

9.2. Dr John Foerster declared a personal specific financial interest as he has received honoraria for participating in an advisory board for Almirall.

9.2.1. It was agreed that this declaration would not prevent Dr Foerster from participating in this section of the meeting

9.3. Ms Helen McAteer declared a non-personal specific financial interest as the Psoriasis Association has received corporate membership fees from the companies involved in this appraisal.

9.3.1. It was agreed that this declaration would not prevent Ms McAteer from participating in this section of the meeting

10. The Chair introduced the lead team, Dr Miriam McCarthy, Mr Nigel Westwood and Dr Stuart Williams who gave presentations on the clinical effectiveness and cost effectiveness of dimethyl fumarate for treating moderate to severe plaque psoriasis [ID776].

11. The Chair asked the company representatives whether they wished to comment on any matters of factual accuracy.

12. The Chair explained that "representatives of the press and other members of the public be excluded from the remainder of this meeting having regard to the confidential nature of the business to be transacted, publicity on which would be prejudicial to the public interest" (Section 1(2) Public Bodies (Admission to Meetings) Act 1960)" and all public attendees left the meeting.

13. The Chair then thanked the clinical and patient experts and company representatives for their attendance, participation and contribution to the appraisal and they left the meeting.

Part 2 – Closed session

14. Discussion on confidential information continued. This information was supplied by the company.

15. The Chair then thanked the Evidence Review Group representatives for their attendance, participation and contribution to the appraisal and they left the meeting.

16. The Committee continued to discuss the clinical and cost effectiveness of dimethyl fumarate for treating moderate to severe plaque psoriasis [ID776].

16.1. The committee decision was based on consensus.
17. The Committee instructed the technical team to prepare the Final Appraisal Determination (FAD) in line with their decisions.

**Appraisal of eluxadoline for treating irritable bowel syndrome with diarrhoea [ID870]**

**Part 1 – Open session**

18. The Chair welcomed the invited expert: Dr Graham Scotland to the meeting and he introduced himself to the Committee.

19. The Chair welcomed company representatives from Allergan to the meeting.

20. The Chair asked all Committee members to declare any relevant interests

20.1. Dr Amanda Adler, Dr Sanjeev Patel, Dr Ray Armstrong, Professor John Cairns, Mr Mark Chapman, Dr Mark Glover, Dr Sumeet Gupta, Dr Sanjay Kinra, Dr Miriam McCarthy, Mr Christopher O'Regan, Professor Stephen Palmer, Ms Marta Soares, Dr Nicky Welton, Mr Nigel Westwood and Dr Stuart Williams all declared that they knew of no personal specific financial interest, personal non-specific financial interest, non-personal specific financial interest, non-personal non-specific financial interest, personal specific family interest or personal non-specific family interest for any of the technologies to be considered as part of the appraisal of eluxadoline for treating irritable bowel syndrome with diarrhoea [ID870].

21. The Chair asked all NICE Staff to declare any relevant interests.

21.1. All declared that they knew of no personal specific financial interest, personal non-specific financial interest, non-personal specific financial interest, non-personal non-specific financial interest, personal specific family interest or personal non-specific family interest for any of the technologies to be considered as part of the appraisal of eluxadoline for treating irritable bowel syndrome with diarrhoea [ID870].

22. The Chair asked all other invited guests (assessment group/ERG and invited experts, not including observers) to declare their relevant interests.

22.1. Dr Graham Scotland declared that he knew of no personal specific financial interest, personal non-specific financial interest, non-personal specific financial interest, non-personal non-specific financial interest, personal specific family interest or personal non-specific family interest for any of the technologies to be considered as part of the appraisal of eluxadoline for treating irritable bowel syndrome with diarrhoea [ID870].

23. The Chair introduced the key themes arising from the consultation responses to the Appraisal Consultation Document (ACD) received from consultees, commentators and through the NICE website.

24. The Chair asked the company representatives whether they wished to comment on any matters of factual accuracy.

25. The Chair explained that “representatives of the press and other members of the public be excluded from the remainder of this meeting having regard to the confidential nature of the business to be transacted, publicity on which would be
prejudicial to the public interest” (Section 1(2) Public Bodies (Admission to Meetings) Act 1960) and all public attendees left the meeting.

26. The Chair then thanked the experts and company representatives for their attendance, participation and contribution to the appraisal and they left the meeting.

Part 2 – Closed session

27. Discussion on confidential information continued. This information was supplied by the company.

28. The Committee continued to discuss the clinical and cost effectiveness of eluxadoline for treating irritable bowel syndrome with diarrhoea [ID870].

28.1. The committee decision was based on consensus.

29. The Committee instructed the technical team to prepare the Final Appraisal Determination (FAD) in line with their decisions.

Appraisal of autologous chondrocyte implantation for repairing symptomatic articular cartilage defects of the knee (including a review of TA89) [ID686]

Part 1 – Open session

30. The Chair welcomed the invited experts: Mr Andy Metcalfe, Dr Hema Mistry and Professor Norman Waugh to the meeting and they introduced themselves to the Committee.

31. The Chair welcomed company representatives from the Robert Jones and Agnes Hunt hospital and from Vericel to the meeting.

32. The Chair asked all Committee members to declare any relevant interests

32.1. Dr Amanda Adler, Dr Sanjeev Patel, Dr Ray Armstrong, Professor John Cairns, Mr Mark Chapman, Dr Mark Glover, Dr Sumeet Gupta, Dr Sanjay Kinra, Dr Miriam McCarthy, Mr Christopher O'Regan, Professor Stephen Palmer, Ms Marta Soares, Dr Nicky Welton, Mr Nigel Westwood and Dr Stuart Williams all declared that they knew of no personal specific financial interest, personal non-specific financial interest, non-personal specific financial interest, non-personal non-specific financial interest, personal specific family interest or personal non-specific family interest for any of the technologies to be considered as part of the appraisal of autologous chondrocyte implantation for repairing symptomatic articular cartilage defects of the knee (including a review of TA89) [ID686].

33. The Chair asked all NICE Staff to declare any relevant interests.

33.1. All declared that they knew of no personal specific financial interest, personal non-specific financial interest, non-personal specific financial interest, non-personal non-specific financial interest, personal specific family interest or personal non-specific family interest for any of the technologies to be considered as part of the appraisal of autologous
chondrocyte implantation for repairing symptomatic articular cartilage defects of the knee (including a review of TA89) [ID686].

34. The Chair asked all other invited guests (assessment group/ERG and invited experts, not including observers) to declare their relevant interests.

34.1. All declared that they knew of no personal specific financial interest, personal non-specific financial interest, non-personal specific financial interest, non-personal non-specific financial interest, personal specific family interest or personal non-specific family interest for any of the technologies to be considered as part of the appraisal of autologous chondrocyte implantation for repairing symptomatic articular cartilage defects of the knee (including a review of TA89) [ID686].

35. The Chair introduced the Assessment Group’s addendum and the key themes arising from the consultation responses on this addendum received from consultees and commentators.

36. The Chair asked the company representatives whether they wished to comment on any matters of factual accuracy.

37. The Chair explained that “representatives of the press and other members of the public be excluded from the remainder of this meeting having regard to the confidential nature of the business to be transacted, publicity on which would be prejudicial to the public interest” (Section 1(2) Public Bodies (Admission to Meetings) Act 1960)” and all public attendees left the meeting.

38. The Chair then thanked the company representatives for their attendance, participation and contribution to the appraisal and they left the meeting.

**Part 2 – Closed session**

39. Discussion on confidential information continued. This information was supplied by the company.

40. The Chair then thanked the Assessment Group representatives for their attendance, participation and contribution to the appraisal and they left the meeting.

41. The Committee continued to discuss the clinical and cost effectiveness of autologous chondrocyte implantation for repairing symptomatic articular cartilage defects of the knee (including a review of TA89) [ID686].

41.1. The committee decision was based on consensus.

42. The Committee instructed the technical team to prepare the Final Appraisal Determination (FAD) in line with their decisions.

**Date, time and venue of the next meeting**

Wednesday 19 July, 10am to 5pm at ETC venues, Prospero House, 241 Borough High Street, London SE1 1GA.