

Technology Appraisal Committee Meeting (Committee B)

Minutes: Confirmed

Date and Time: Tuesday 23 May 2017, 10am to 5pm

Venue: Prospero House, 241 Borough High Street, London, SE1 1GA

| | | |
|-----------------|--|--|
| Present: | 1. Dr Amanda Adler (Chair) | Present for all notes |
| | 2. Dr Sanjeev Patel (Vice-Chair, Chaired notes 19 to 29) | Present for all notes |
| | 3. Professor John Cairns | Present for all notes |
| | 4. Mr David Chandler | Present for all notes |
| | 5. Mr Mark Chapman | Present for all notes |
| | 6. Dr Mark Glover | Present for all notes |
| | 7. Dr Sumeet Gupta | Present for all notes |
| | 8. Dr Nigel Langford | Present for all notes |
| | 9. Mr Christopher O'Regan | Present for notes 1 to 29 and notes 43 to 45 |
| | 10. Professor Stephen Palmer | Present for all notes |
| | 11. Dr Danielle Preedy | Present for all notes |
| | 12. Professor Ken Stein | Present for all notes |
| | 13. Dr Nicky Welton | Present for all notes |
| | 14. Dr Stuart Williams | Present for all notes |

In attendance:

| | | |
|---------------------|---|----------------------------|
| Meindert Boysen | Programme Director, National Institute for Health and Care Excellence | Present for all notes |
| Dr Elisabeth George | Associate Director, National Institute for Health and Care Excellence | Present for notes 1 to 18 |
| Dr Melinda Goodall | Associate Director, National Institute for Health and Care Excellence | Present for notes 19 to 45 |
| Jeremy Powell | Project Manager, National Institute for Health and Care Excellence | Present for all notes |
| Bashama Anjum | Administrator, National Institute for Health and Care Excellence | Present for all notes |
| Ahmed Elsada | Technical Adviser, National Institute for | Present for notes 19 to 42 |

| | | |
|----------------------------------|---|---|
| Jasdeep Hayre | Health and Clinical Excellence Technical Adviser, National Institute for Health and Clinical Excellence | Present for notes 1 to 18 and notes 43 to 45 |
| Thomas Palmer | Technical Analyst, National Institute for Health and Care Excellence | Present for notes 1 to 18 |
| Henry Edwards | Technical Analyst, National Institute for Health and Care Excellence | Present for notes 19 to 29 |
| Aminata Thiam | Technical Analyst, National Institute for Health and Care Excellence | Present for notes 30 to 42 |
| Jessica Maloney | Technical Analyst, National Institute for Health and Care Excellence | Present for notes 43 to 45 |
| Dr G.J. Melendez-Torres | Assistant Professor of HTA, Epidemiology and Evidence - Assessment Group – Warwick Evidence | Present for notes 1 to 16 |
| Mr Peter Auguste | Research Fellow in Medical Statistics and Epidemiology / Health Economist - Assessment Group – Warwick Evidence | Present for notes 1 to 16 |
| Dr Hendramoorthy Maheswaran | Clinical Research Fellow - Assessment Group – Warwick Evidence | Present for notes 1 to 16 |
| Mr Charles Dobson Sarah Davis | Department of Health Senior Lecturer in Health Economics - School of Health and Related Research (SchARR) - Sheffield | Present for notes 1 to 16 Present for notes 19 to 27 |
| Steve Edwards | Evidence Review Group – BMJ Technology Assessment Group | Present for notes 30 to 40 |
| Peter Cain | Health Economist - Evidence Review Group – BMJ Technology Assessment Group | Present for notes 30 to 40 |

Non-public observers:

| | | |
|---------------|--|-----------------------------|
| Helen Barnett | Medical Editor, National Institute for Health and Care Excellence | Present for notes all notes |
| Edgar Masanga | Business Analyst - Resource Impact Assessment, National Institute for Health and Care Excellence | Present for notes all notes |

Notes

Welcome

1. The Chair welcomed all members of the Committee and other attendees present to the meeting. The Chair reviewed the agenda and timescales for the meeting, which included the appraisals of beta interferon and glatiramer acetate for treating multiple sclerosis (review of TA32) [ID809], bisphosphonates for preventing osteoporotic fragility fractures (including a partial update of NICE technology appraisal guidance 160 and 161) [ID782], cabozantinib for previously treated advanced renal cell carcinoma [ID931] and daratumumab monotherapy for treating relapsed and refractory multiple myeloma [ID933].
2. The Chair informed the Committee of the non-public observers at this meeting: Helen Barnett and Edgar Masanga
3. Apologies were received from Dr Neil Iosson, Dr Nigel De Kare Silver, Dr Sanjay Kinra, Dr Miriam McCarthy, Marta Soares and Mr Nigel Westwood.

Any other Business

4. The Committee were given an update on the progress of appraisals that had been discussed at previous meetings.

Notes from the last meeting

5. The minutes of the 20 April 2017 Committee meeting were approved.

Appraisal of beta interferon and glatiramer acetate for treating multiple sclerosis (review of TA32) [ID809]

Part 1 – Open session

6. The Chair welcomed the invited experts: Dr G.J. Melendez-Torres, Mr Peter Auguste, Dr Hendramoorthy Maheswaran and Mr Charles Dobson to the meeting and they introduced themselves to the Committee.
7. The Chair welcomed company representatives from Biogen, Merck, Novartis and Teva to the meeting.
8. The Chair asked all Committee members to declare any relevant interests
 - 8.1. Dr Amanda Adler, Dr Sanjeev Patel, Professor John Cairns, Mr David Chandler, Mr Mark Chapman, Dr Mark Glover, Dr Sumeet Gupta, Dr

Nigel Langford, Mr Christopher O'Regan, Professor Stephen Palmer, Dr Danielle Preedy, Professor Ken Stein, Dr Nicky Welton and Dr Stuart Williams all declared that they knew of no personal specific financial interest, personal non-specific financial interest, non-personal specific financial interest, non-personal non-specific financial interest, personal specific family interest or personal non-specific family interest for any of the technologies to be considered as part of the appraisal of beta interferon and glatiramer acetate for treating multiple sclerosis (review of TA32) [ID809].

9. The Chair asked all NICE Staff to declare any relevant interests.

9.1. All declared that they knew of no personal specific financial interest, personal non-specific financial interest, non-personal specific financial interest, non-personal non-specific financial interest, personal specific family interest or personal non-specific family interest for any of the technologies to be considered as part of the appraisal of beta interferon and glatiramer acetate for treating multiple sclerosis (review of TA32) [ID809].

10. The Chair asked all other invited guests (assessment group/ERG and invited experts, not including observers) to declare their relevant interests.

10.1. All declared that they knew of no personal specific financial interest, personal non-specific financial interest, non-personal specific financial interest, non-personal non-specific financial interest, personal specific family interest or personal non-specific family interest for any of the technologies to be considered as part of the appraisal of beta interferon and glatiramer acetate for treating multiple sclerosis (review of TA32) [ID809].

11. The Chair gave a presentation on the addendum prepared by the Assessment Group and introduced the key themes arising from the consultation responses to the addendum received from consultees and commentators.

12. The Chair asked the company representatives whether they wished to comment on any matters of factual accuracy.

13. The Chair explained that "representatives of the press and other members of the public be excluded from the remainder of this meeting having regard to the confidential nature of the business to be transacted, publicity on which would be prejudicial to the public interest" (Section 1(2) Public Bodies (Admission to Meetings) Act 1960)" and all public attendees left the meeting.

14. The Chair then thanked the company representatives for their attendance, participation and contribution to the appraisal and they left the meeting.

Part 2 – Closed session

15. Discussion on confidential information continued. This information was supplied by the company.

16. The Chair then thanked the Assessment Group representatives and Mr Charles Dobson for their attendance, participation and contribution to the appraisal and they left the meeting.

17. The Committee continued to discuss the clinical and cost effectiveness of beta interferon and glatiramer acetate for treating multiple sclerosis (review of TA32) [ID809].
18. The Committee agreed to defer a decision on the content of the guidance section of the Appraisal Consultation Document (ACD).

Appraisal of bisphosphonates for preventing osteoporotic fragility fractures (including a partial update of NICE technology appraisal guidance 160 and 161) [ID782]

Part 1 – Open session

19. The Chair welcomed the invited expert: Ms Sarah Davis to the meeting and she introduced themselves to the Committee.
20. The Chair asked all Committee members to declare any relevant interests
 - 20.1. Dr Amanda Adler, Dr Sanjeev Patel, Professor John Cairns, Mr David Chandler, Mr Mark Chapman, Dr Mark Glover, Dr Sumeet Gupta, Dr Nigel Langford, Mr Christopher O'Regan, Professor Stephen Palmer, Dr Danielle Preedy, Professor Ken Stein, Dr Nicky Welton and Dr Stuart Williams all declared that they knew of no personal specific financial interest, personal non-specific financial interest, non-personal specific financial interest, non-personal non-specific financial interest, personal specific family interest or personal non-specific family interest for any of the technologies to be considered as part of the appraisal of bisphosphonates for preventing osteoporotic fragility fractures (including a partial update of NICE technology appraisal guidance 160 and 161) [ID782].
21. The Chair asked all NICE Staff to declare any relevant interests.
 - 21.1. All declared that they knew of no personal specific financial interest, personal non-specific financial interest, non-personal specific financial interest, non-personal non-specific financial interest, personal specific family interest or personal non-specific family interest for any of the technologies to be considered as part of the appraisal of bisphosphonates for preventing osteoporotic fragility fractures (including a partial update of NICE technology appraisal guidance 160 and 161) [ID782].
22. The Chair asked all other invited guests (assessment group/ERG and invited experts, not including observers) to declare their relevant interests.
 - 22.1. Ms Sarah Davis declared that she knew of no personal specific financial interest, personal non-specific financial interest, non-personal specific financial interest, non-personal non-specific financial interest, personal specific family interest or personal non-specific family interest for any of the technologies to be considered as part of the appraisal of bisphosphonates for preventing osteoporotic fragility fractures (including a partial update of NICE technology appraisal guidance 160 and 161) [ID782].

23. The Vice-Chair gave a presentation on the clinical effectiveness and cost effectiveness of bisphosphonates for preventing osteoporotic fragility fractures (including a partial update of NICE technology appraisal guidance 160 and 161) [ID782].
24. The Vice-Chair explained that “representatives of the press and other members of the public be excluded from the remainder of this meeting having regard to the confidential nature of the business to be transacted, publicity on which would be prejudicial to the public interest” (Section 1(2) Public Bodies (Admission to Meetings) Act 1960)” and all public attendees left the meeting.
25. The Vice-Chair then thanked the expert for their attendance, participation and contribution to the appraisal and she left the meeting.

Part 2 – Closed session

26. Discussion on confidential information continued.
27. The Chair then thanked the Assessment Group representative for her attendance, participation and contribution to the appraisal and she left the meeting.
28. The Committee continued to discuss the clinical and cost effectiveness of bisphosphonates for preventing osteoporotic fragility fractures (including a partial update of NICE technology appraisal guidance 160 and 161) [ID782].
 - 28.1. The committee decision was based on consensus.
29. The Committee instructed the technical team to prepare the Final Appraisal Determination (FAD) in line with their decisions.

Appraisal of cabozantinib for previously treated advanced renal cell carcinoma [ID931]

Part 1 – Open session

30. The Chair welcomed the invited expert: Mr Peter Cain to the meeting and he introduced themselves to the Committee.
31. The Chair welcomed company representatives from Ipsen to the meeting.
32. The Chair asked all Committee members to declare any relevant interests
 - 32.1. Dr Amanda Adler, Dr Sanjeev Patel, Professor John Cairns, Mr David Chandler, Mr Mark Chapman, Dr Mark Glover, Dr Sumeet Gupta, Dr Nigel Langford, Professor Stephen Palmer, Dr Danielle Preedy, Professor Ken Stein, Dr Nicky Welton and Dr Stuart Williams all declared that they knew of no personal specific financial interest, personal non-specific financial interest, non-personal specific financial interest, non-personal non-specific financial interest, personal specific family interest or personal non-specific family interest for any of the technologies to be considered as part of the appraisal of cabozantinib for previously treated advanced renal cell carcinoma [ID931].
33. The Chair asked all NICE Staff to declare any relevant interests.

- 33.1. All declared that they knew of no personal specific financial interest, personal non-specific financial interest, non-personal specific financial interest, non-personal non-specific financial interest, personal specific family interest or personal non-specific family interest for any of the technologies to be considered as part of the appraisal of cabozantinib for previously treated advanced renal cell carcinoma [ID931].
34. The Chair asked the ERG representative to declare any relevant interests.
 - 34.1. Mr Peter Cain declared that he knew of no personal specific financial interest, personal non-specific financial interest, non-personal specific financial interest, non-personal non-specific financial interest, personal specific family interest or personal non-specific family interest for any of the technologies to be considered as part of the appraisal of cabozantinib for previously treated advanced renal cell carcinoma [ID931].
35. The Chair introduced the key themes arising from the consultation responses to the Appraisal Consultation Document (ACD) received from consultees, commentators and through the NICE website.
36. The Chair asked the company representatives whether they wished to comment on any matters of factual accuracy.
37. The Chair explained that “representatives of the press and other members of the public be excluded from the remainder of this meeting having regard to the confidential nature of the business to be transacted, publicity on which would be prejudicial to the public interest” (Section 1(2) Public Bodies (Admission to Meetings) Act 1960)” and all public attendees left the meeting.
38. The Chair then thanked the company representatives for their attendance, participation and contribution to the appraisal and they left the meeting.

Part 2 – Closed session

39. Discussion on confidential information continued. This information was supplied by the company.
40. The Chair then thanked the ERG representative for his attendance, participation and contribution to the appraisal and he left the meeting.
41. The Committee continued to discuss the clinical and cost effectiveness of The Chair then thanked the company representatives for their attendance, participation and contribution to the appraisal and they left the meeting.
 - 41.1. The committee decision was based on consensus.
42. The Committee instructed the technical team to prepare the Final Appraisal Determination (FAD) in line with their decisions.

Appraisal of daratumumab monotherapy for treating relapsed and refractory multiple myeloma [ID933]

Part 2 – Closed session

43. The Chair asked all Committee members to declare any relevant interests

- 43.1. Dr Amanda Adler, Dr Sanjeev Patel, Professor John Cairns, Mr David Chandler, Mr Mark Chapman, Dr Mark Glover, Dr Sumeet Gupta, Dr Nigel Langford, Mr Christopher O'Regan, Professor Stephen Palmer, Dr Danielle Preedy, Professor Ken Stein, Dr Nicky Welton and Dr Stuart Williams all declared that they knew of no personal specific financial interest, personal non-specific financial interest, non-personal specific financial interest, non-personal non-specific financial interest, personal specific family interest or personal non-specific family interest for any of the technologies to be considered as part of the appraisal of daratumumab monotherapy for treating relapsed and refractory multiple myeloma [ID933].
44. The Chair asked all NICE Staff to declare any relevant interests.
- 44.1. All declared that they knew of no personal specific financial interest, personal non-specific financial interest, non-personal specific financial interest, non-personal non-specific financial interest, personal specific family interest or personal non-specific family interest for any of the technologies to be considered as part of the appraisal of daratumumab monotherapy for treating relapsed and refractory multiple myeloma [ID933].
45. The Chair gave an update on the progress of the Cancer Drugs Fund discussions.

Date, time and venue of the next meeting

Wednesday 21 June, 10am to 5pm at ETC venues, Prospero House, 241 Borough High Street, London SE1 1GA.