Technology Appraisal Committee Meeting (Committee B)

Minutes: Confirm

Date and Time: Thursday 2 August 2018 from 10am to 2pm

Venue: 10 Spring Gardens
         London
         SW1A 2BU

Present: 1. Dr Amanda Adler (Chair) Present for all notes
         2. Dr Sanjeev Patel (Vice-Chair) Present for all notes
         3. Dr Carlo Berti Present for all notes
         4. Professor John Cairns Present for all notes
         5. Mr Dhar Fattah Present for all notes
         6. Ms Susan Faulds Present for all notes
         7. Dr Mark Glover Present for all notes
         8. Mr Richard Hoddes Present for all notes
         9. Dr Sanjay Kinra Present for all notes
        10. Mr Christopher O'Regan Present for notes 1 to 30
        11. Professor Stephen Palmer Present for all notes
        12. Professor Allyson Pollock Present for notes 1 to 30
        13. Dr Stephen Smith Present for all notes
        14. Mr William Turner Present for all notes
        15. Professor Nicky Welton Present for all notes
        16. Mr Nigel Westwood Present for all notes
        17. Professor Sarah Wild Present for all notes
        18. Dr Stuart Williams Present for all notes

In attendance:

Helen Knight Programme Director, Present for all notes
         National Institute for
         Health and Care
         Excellence

Dr Melinda Goodall Associate Director, Present for all notes
         National Institute for
         Health and Care
         Excellence

Jeremy Powell Project Manager, Present for all notes
         National Institute for
         Health and Care
         Excellence

Sandra Aleknavice Administrator, National Present for all notes
         Institute for Health and
         Care Excellence

Thomas Walker Technical Analyst, Present for notes 1 to 18
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Name</th>
<th>Position and Institution</th>
<th>Notes Present for</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Rebecca Albrow</td>
<td>Technical Adviser, National Institute for Health and Care Excellence</td>
<td>1 to 18</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sharlene Ting</td>
<td>Technical Analyst, National Institute for Health and Care Excellence</td>
<td>19 to 30</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ahmed Elsada</td>
<td>Technical Adviser, National Institute for Health and Clinical Excellence</td>
<td>19 to 38</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Alan Lamb</td>
<td>Technical Analyst, National Institute for Health and Care Excellence</td>
<td>31 to 38</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Xavier Armoiry</td>
<td>Senior Research Fellow, Warwick Evidence</td>
<td>1 to 16</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Peter Auguste</td>
<td>Research Fellow, Warwick Evidence</td>
<td>1 to 16</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Professor Peter Clark</td>
<td>Chair of NHS England Chemotherapy Clinical Reference Group and National Clinical Lead for CDF</td>
<td>19 to 38</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Dr Graham Scotland</td>
<td>Health Economist, Aberdeen HTA Group</td>
<td>19 to 28</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Maria Dimitrova</td>
<td>Health Economist, Aberdeen HTA Group</td>
<td>19 to 28</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Dolapo Ayansina</td>
<td>Research Fellow, Aberdeen HTA Group</td>
<td>19 to 28</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td><strong>Non-public attendees:</strong></td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Lawrence Baker</td>
<td>NICE Science Policy and Research</td>
<td>1 to 30</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Helen Barnett</td>
<td>Medical Editor, NICE</td>
<td>All notes</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sonia Garcia Gonzalez</td>
<td>NIHR Innovation Observatory</td>
<td>All notes</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Moral</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Alisa Hodgson</td>
<td>NICE Fellows and Scholars Programme</td>
<td>1 to 30</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Dr Mark Kroese</td>
<td>Chair of the NICE Diagnostic Committee</td>
<td>1 to 30</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Edgar Masanga</td>
<td>Business Analyst, NICE Innovation Observatory</td>
<td>All notes</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Atefeh Mashayekhi</td>
<td></td>
<td></td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Notes

Welcome

1. The Chair welcomed all members of the Committee and other attendees present to the meeting. The Chair reviewed the agenda and timescales for the meeting, which included the appraisals of ocrelizumab for treating primary progressive multiple sclerosis [ID938], padeliporfin for treating localised prostate cancer [ID866] and padeliporfin for treating localised prostate cancer [ID866].

2. The Chair informed the Committee that the discussion of cabozantinib for untreated metastatic renal cell carcinoma [ID1208] would be held in closed session and that there would be no company or Evidence Review Group representatives.

3. The Chair informed the Committee that there would be a training session for the Committee after the close of the meeting.

4. The Chair welcomed Dr Carlo Berti and Professor Alyson Pollock to their first meeting as members of the Appraisal Committee.

5. The Chair informed the Committee of the non-public observers at this meeting: Lawrence Baker, Helen Barnett, Sonia Garcia Gonzalez Moral, Dr Mark Kroese, Edgar Masanga and Atefeh Mashayekhi.

6. Apologies were received from Mr Mark Chapman, Dr Mona Johnson and Dr Nicholas Latimer.

Any Other Business

7. The Committee were given an update on the progress of other appraisals previously seen by the Committee and an update on personnel changes within the NICE Technology Appraisals team.

Appraisal of ocrelizumab for treating primary progressive multiple sclerosis [ID938]

Part 1 – Open session

8. The Chair welcomed the invited experts: Xavier Armoiry and Peter Auguste to the meeting and they introduced themselves to the Committee.

9. The Chair welcomed company representatives from Roche to the meeting.

10. The Chair asked all Committee members to declare any relevant interests

10.1. Dr Amanda Adler, Dr Sanjeev Patel, Dr Carlo Berti, Professor John Cairns, Mr Diar Fattah, Ms Susan Faulds, Dr Mark Glover, Mr Richard Hoddes, Dr Sanjay Kinra, Mr Christopher O'Regan, Professor Stephen Palmer, Professor Alyson Pollock, Dr Stephen Smith, Mr William Turner, Professor Nicky Welton, Mr Nigel Westwood, Professor Sarah Wild and Dr Stuart Williams all declared that they knew of no personal specific financial interest, personal non-specific financial interest, non-personal specific financial interest, non-personal non-specific financial interest, personal specific family interest or personal non-specific family interest for any of the technologies to be considered as part of the appraisal of ocrelizumab for treating primary progressive multiple sclerosis [ID938].
11. The Chair asked all NICE Staff to declare any relevant interests.

11.1. All declared that they knew of no personal specific financial interest, personal non-specific financial interest, non-personal specific financial interest, non-personal non-specific financial interest, personal specific family interest or personal non-specific family interest for any of the technologies to be considered as part of the appraisal of ocrelizumab for treating primary progressive multiple sclerosis [ID938].

12. The Chair asked all other invited guests (assessment group/ERG and invited experts, not including observers) to declare their relevant interests.

12.1. All declared that they knew of no personal specific financial interest, personal non-specific financial interest, non-personal specific financial interest, non-personal non-specific financial interest, personal specific family interest or personal non-specific family interest for any of the technologies to be considered as part of the appraisal of ocrelizumab for treating primary progressive multiple sclerosis [ID938].

13. The Chair introduced the key themes arising from the consultation responses to the Appraisal Consultation Document (ACD) received from consultees, commentators and through the NICE website.

14. The Chair asked the company representatives whether they wished to comment on any matters of factual accuracy.

15. The Chair explained that “representatives of the press and other members of the public be excluded from the remainder of this meeting having regard to the confidential nature of the business to be transacted, publicity on which would be prejudicial to the public interest" (Section 1(2) Public Bodies (Admission to Meetings) Act 1960)” and all public attendees left the meeting.

16. The Chair then thanked the Evidence Review Group and company representatives for their attendance, participation and contribution to the appraisal and they left the meeting.

**Part 2 – Closed session**

17. The Committee continued to discuss the clinical and cost effectiveness of ocrelizumab for treating primary progressive multiple sclerosis [ID938].

17.1. The committee decision was based on consensus.

18. The Committee instructed the technical team to prepare the Final Appraisal Determination (FAD) in line with their decisions.

**Notes from the last meeting**

19. The minutes of the Technology Appraisal Committee meeting held on 10 July 2018 were approved.

**Appraisal of padeliporfin for treating localised prostate cancer [ID866]**

**Part 1 – Open session**
20. The Chair welcomed the invited experts: Dolapo Ayansina, Professor Peter Clark, Maria Dimitrova and Dr Graham Scotland to the meeting and they introduced themselves to the Committee.

21. The Chair welcomed company representatives from Steba Biotech to the meeting.

22. The Chair asked all Committee members to declare any relevant interests

22.1. Dr Amanda Adler, Dr Sanjeev Patel, Dr Carlo Berti, Professor John Cairns, Mr Diar Fattah, Ms Susan Faulds, Dr Mark Glover, Mr Richard Hoddes, Dr Sanjay Kinra, Mr Christopher O'Regan, Professor Stephen Palmer, Professor Allyson Pollock, Dr Stephen Smith, Mr William Turner, Professor Nicky Welton, Mr Nigel Westwood, Professor Sarah Wild and Dr Stuart Williams all declared that they knew of no personal specific financial interest, personal non-specific financial interest, non-personal specific financial interest, non-personal non-specific financial interest, personal specific family interest or personal non-specific family interest for any of the technologies to be considered as part of the appraisal of padeliporfin for treating localised prostate cancer [ID866].

23. The Chair asked all NICE Staff to declare any relevant interests.

23.1. All declared that they knew of no personal specific financial interest, personal non-specific financial interest, non-personal specific financial interest, non-personal non-specific financial interest, personal specific family interest or personal non-specific family interest for any of the technologies to be considered as part of the appraisal of padeliporfin for treating localised prostate cancer [ID866].

24. The Chair asked all other invited guests (assessment group/ERG and invited experts, not including observers) to declare their relevant interests.

24.1. All declared that they knew of no personal specific financial interest, personal non-specific financial interest, non-personal specific financial interest, non-personal non-specific financial interest, personal specific family interest or personal non-specific family interest for any of the technologies to be considered as part of the appraisal of padeliporfin for treating localised prostate cancer [ID866].

25. The Chair introduced the key themes arising from the consultation responses to the Appraisal Consultation Document (ACD) received from consultees, commentators and through the NICE website.

26. The Chair asked the company representatives whether they wished to comment on any matters of factual accuracy.

27. The Chair explained that “representatives of the press and other members of the public be excluded from the remainder of this meeting having regard to the confidential nature of the business to be transacted, publicity on which would be prejudicial to the public interest” (Section 1(2) Public Bodies (Admission to Meetings) Act 1960)” and all public attendees left the meeting.

28. The Chair then thanked the Evidence Review Group and company representatives for their attendance, participation and contribution to the appraisal and they left the meeting.
Part 2 – Closed session

29. The Committee continued to discuss the clinical and cost effectiveness of padeliporfin for treating localised prostate cancer [ID866].

29.1. The committee decision was based on consensus.

30. The Committee instructed the technical team to prepare the Final Appraisal Determination (FAD) in line with their decisions.

Appraisal of cabozantinib for untreated metastatic renal cell carcinoma [ID1208]

Part 2 – closed session

31. The Chair welcomed the invited expert: Professor Peter Clark to the meeting and he introduced himself to the Committee.

32. The Chair asked all Committee members to declare any relevant interests.

32.1. Dr Amanda Adler, Dr Sanjeev Patel, Dr Carlo Berti, Professor John Cairns, Mr Diar Fattah, Ms Susan Faulds, Dr Mark Glover, Mr Richard Hoddes, Dr Sanjay Kinra, Professor Stephen Palmer, Dr Stephen Smith, Mr William Turner, Professor Nicky Welton, Mr Nigel Westwood, Professor Sarah Wild and Dr Stuart Williams all declared that they knew of no personal specific financial interest, personal non-specific financial interest, non-personal specific financial interest, non-personal non-specific financial interest, personal specific family interest or personal non-specific family interest for any of the technologies to be considered as part of the appraisal of cabozantinib for untreated metastatic renal cell carcinoma [ID1208].

33. The Chair asked all NICE Staff to declare any relevant interests.

33.1. All declared that they knew of no personal specific financial interest, personal non-specific financial interest, non-personal specific financial interest, non-personal non-specific financial interest, personal specific family interest or personal non-specific family interest for any of the technologies to be considered as part of the appraisal of cabozantinib for untreated metastatic renal cell carcinoma [ID1208].

34. The Chair asked all other invited guests (assessment group/ERG and invited experts, not including observers) to declare their relevant interests.

34.1. Professor Peter Clark declared that he knew of no personal specific financial interest, personal non-specific financial interest, non-personal specific financial interest, non-personal non-specific financial interest, personal specific family interest or personal non-specific family interest for any of the technologies to be considered as part of the appraisal of cabozantinib for untreated metastatic renal cell carcinoma [ID1208].

35. The Chair presented the additional information submitted by the company since the last Committee meeting.

36. The Committee continued to discuss the clinical and cost effectiveness of cabozantinib for untreated metastatic renal cell carcinoma [ID1208].
36.1. The committee decision was based on consensus.

37. The Committee instructed the technical team to prepare the Final Appraisal Determination (FAD) in line with their decisions.

**Date, time and venue of the next meeting**

38. Thursday 6 September 2018 at 10 Spring Gardens, London SW1A 2BU.