

## Technology Appraisal Committee Meeting (Committee B)

**Minutes:** Confirmed

**Date and Time:** Thursday 2 August 2018 from 10am to 2pm

**Venue:** 10 Spring Gardens  
London  
SW1A 2BU

<b>Present:</b>	1. Dr Amanda Adler (Chair)	Present for all notes
	2. Dr Sanjeev Patel (Vice-Chair)	Present for all notes
	3. Dr Carlo Berti	Present for all notes
	4. Professor John Cairns	Present for all notes
	5. Mr Diar Fattah	Present for all notes
	6. Ms Susan Faulds	Present for all notes
	7. Dr Mark Glover	Present for all notes
	8. Mr Richard Hoddes	Present for all notes
	9. Dr Sanjay Kinra	Present for all notes
	10. Mr Christopher O'Regan	Present for notes 1 to 30
	11. Professor Stephen Palmer	Present for all notes
	12. Professor Allyson Pollock	Present for notes 1 to 30
	13. Dr Stephen Smith	Present for all notes
	14. Mr William Turner	Present for all notes
	15. Professor Nicky Welton	Present for all notes
	16. Mr Nigel Westwood	Present for all notes
	17. Professor Sarah Wild	Present for all notes
	18. Dr Stuart Williams	Present for all notes

### In attendance:

Helen Knight	Programme Director, National Institute for Health and Care Excellence	Present for all notes
Dr Melinda Goodall	Associate Director, National Institute for Health and Care Excellence	Present for all notes
Jeremy Powell	Project Manager, National Institute for Health and Care Excellence	Present for all notes
Sandra Aleknave	Administrator, National Institute for Health and Care Excellence	Present for all notes
Thomas Walker	Technical Analyst,	Present for notes 1 to 18

	National Institute for Health and Care Excellence	
Rebecca Albrow	Technical Adviser, National Institute for Health and Clinical Excellence	Present for notes 1 to 18
Sharlene Ting	Technical Analyst, National Institute for Health and Care Excellence	Present for notes 19 to 30
Ahmed Elsada	Technical Adviser, National Institute for Health and Clinical Excellence	Present for notes 19 to 38
Alan Lamb	Technical Analyst, National Institute for Health and Care Excellence	Present for notes 31 to 38
Xavier Armoiry	Senior Research Fellow, Warwick Evidence	Present for notes 1 to 16
Peter Auguste	Research Fellow, Warwick Evidence	Present for notes 1 to 16
Professor Peter Clark	Chair of NHS England Chemotherapy Clinical Reference Group and National Clinical Lead for CDF	Present for notes 19 to 38
Dr Graham Scotland	Health Economist, Aberdeen HTA Group	Present for notes 19 to 28
Maria Dimitrova	Health Economist, Aberdeen HTA Group	Present for notes 19 to 28
Dolapo Ayansina	Research Fellow, Aberdeen HTA Group	Present for notes 19 to 28

**Non-public attendees:**

Lawrence Baker	NICE Science Policy and Research	Present for notes 1 to 30
Helen Barnett	Medical Editor, NICE	Present for all notes
Sonia Garcia Gonzalez	NIHR Innovation Observatory	Present for all notes
Alisa Hodgson	NICE Fellows and Scholars Programme	Present for notes 1 to 30
Dr Mark Kroese	Chair of the NICE Diagnostic Committee	Present for notes 1 to 30
Edgar Masanga	Business Analyst, NICE	Present for all notes
Atefeh Mashayekhi	NIHR Innovation Observatory	Present for all notes

## Notes

### Welcome

1. The Chair welcomed all members of the Committee and other attendees present to the meeting. The Chair reviewed the agenda and timescales for the meeting, which included the appraisals of ocrelizumab for treating primary progressive multiple sclerosis [ID938], padeliporfin for treating localised prostate cancer [ID866] and padeliporfin for treating localised prostate cancer [ID866].
2. The Chair informed the Committee that the discussion of cabozantinib for untreated metastatic renal cell carcinoma [ID1208] would be held in closed session and that there would be no company or Evidence Review Group representatives.
3. The Chair informed the Committee that there would be a training session for the Committee after the close of the meeting.
4. The Chair welcomed Dr Carlo Berti and Professor Alyson Pollock to their first meeting as members of the Appraisal Committee.
5. The Chair informed the Committee of the non-public observers at this meeting: Lawrence Baker, Helen Barnett, Sonia Garcia Gonzalez Moral, Dr Mark Kroese, Edgar Masanga and Atefeh Mashayekhi.
6. Apologies were received from Mr Mark Chapman, Dr Mona Johnson and Dr Nicholas Latimer.

### Any other Business

7. The Committee were given an update on the progress of other appraisals previously seen by the Committee and an update on personnel changes within the NICE Technology Appraisals team.

### Appraisal of ocrelizumab for treating primary progressive multiple sclerosis [ID938]

#### Part 1 – Open session

8. The Chair welcomed the invited experts: Xavier Armoiry and Peter Auguste to the meeting and they introduced themselves to the Committee.
9. The Chair welcomed company representatives from Roche to the meeting.
10. The Chair asked all Committee members to declare any relevant interests
  - 10.1. Dr Amanda Adler, Dr Sanjeev Patel, Dr Carlo Berti, Professor John Cairns, Mr Diar Fattah, Ms Susan Faulds, Dr Mark Glover, Mr Richard Hoddes, Dr Sanjay Kinra, Mr Christopher O'Regan, Professor Stephen Palmer, Professor Allyson Pollock, Dr Stephen Smith, Mr William Turner, Professor Nicky Welton, Mr Nigel Westwood, Professor Sarah Wild and Dr Stuart Williams all declared that they knew of no personal specific financial interest, personal non-specific financial interest, non-personal specific financial interest, non-personal non-specific financial interest, personal specific family interest or personal non-specific family interest for any of the technologies to be considered as part of the appraisal of ocrelizumab for treating primary progressive multiple sclerosis [ID938].

11. The Chair asked all NICE Staff to declare any relevant interests.
  - 11.1. All declared that they knew of no personal specific financial interest, personal non-specific financial interest, non-personal specific financial interest, non-personal non-specific financial interest, personal specific family interest or personal non-specific family interest for any of the technologies to be considered as part of the appraisal of ocrelizumab for treating primary progressive multiple sclerosis [ID938].
12. The Chair asked all other invited guests (assessment group/ERG and invited experts, not including observers) to declare their relevant interests.
  - 12.1. All declared that they knew of no personal specific financial interest, personal non-specific financial interest, non-personal specific financial interest, non-personal non-specific financial interest, personal specific family interest or personal non-specific family interest for any of the technologies to be considered as part of the appraisal of ocrelizumab for treating primary progressive multiple sclerosis [ID938].
13. The Chair introduced the key themes arising from the consultation responses to the Appraisal Consultation Document (ACD) received from consultees, commentators and through the NICE website.
14. The Chair asked the company representatives whether they wished to comment on any matters of factual accuracy.
15. The Chair explained that “representatives of the press and other members of the public be excluded from the remainder of this meeting having regard to the confidential nature of the business to be transacted, publicity on which would be prejudicial to the public interest” (Section 1(2) Public Bodies (Admission to Meetings) Act 1960)” and all public attendees left the meeting.
16. The Chair then thanked the Evidence Review Group and company representatives for their attendance, participation and contribution to the appraisal and they left the meeting.

## **Part 2 – Closed session**

17. The Committee continued to discuss the clinical and cost effectiveness of ocrelizumab for treating primary progressive multiple sclerosis [ID938].
  - 17.1. The committee decision was based on consensus.
18. The Committee instructed the technical team to prepare the Final Appraisal Determination (FAD) in line with their decisions.

## **Notes from the last meeting**

19. The minutes of the Technology Appraisal Committee meeting held on 10 July 2018 were approved.

## **Appraisal of padeliporfin for treating localised prostate cancer [ID866]**

### **Part 1 – Open session**

20. The Chair welcomed the invited experts: Dolapo Ayansina, Professor Peter Clark, Maria Dimitrova and Dr Graham Scotland to the meeting and they introduced themselves to the Committee.
21. The Chair welcomed company representatives from Steba Biotech to the meeting.
22. The Chair asked all Committee members to declare any relevant interests
  - 22.1. Dr Amanda Adler, Dr Sanjeev Patel, Dr Carlo Berti, Professor John Cairns, Mr Diar Fattah, Ms Susan Faulds, Dr Mark Glover, Mr Richard Hoddes, Dr Sanjay Kinra, Mr Christopher O'Regan, Professor Stephen Palmer, Professor Allyson Pollock, Dr Stephen Smith, Mr William Turner, Professor Nicky Welton, Mr Nigel Westwood, Professor Sarah Wild and Dr Stuart Williams all declared that they knew of no personal specific financial interest, personal non-specific financial interest, non-personal specific financial interest, non-personal non-specific financial interest, personal specific family interest or personal non-specific family interest for any of the technologies to be considered as part of the appraisal of padeliporfin for treating localised prostate cancer [ID866].
23. The Chair asked all NICE Staff to declare any relevant interests.
  - 23.1. All declared that they knew of no personal specific financial interest, personal non-specific financial interest, non-personal specific financial interest, non-personal non-specific financial interest, personal specific family interest or personal non-specific family interest for any of the technologies to be considered as part of the appraisal of padeliporfin for treating localised prostate cancer [ID866].
24. The Chair asked all other invited guests (assessment group/ERG and invited experts, not including observers) to declare their relevant interests.
  - 24.1. All declared that they knew of no personal specific financial interest, personal non-specific financial interest, non-personal specific financial interest, non-personal non-specific financial interest, personal specific family interest or personal non-specific family interest for any of the technologies to be considered as part of the appraisal of padeliporfin for treating localised prostate cancer [ID866].
25. The Chair introduced the key themes arising from the consultation responses to the Appraisal Consultation Document (ACD) received from consultees, commentators and through the NICE website.
26. The Chair asked the company representatives whether they wished to comment on any matters of factual accuracy.
27. The Chair explained that “representatives of the press and other members of the public be excluded from the remainder of this meeting having regard to the confidential nature of the business to be transacted, publicity on which would be prejudicial to the public interest” (Section 1(2) Public Bodies (Admission to Meetings) Act 1960)” and all public attendees left the meeting.
28. The Chair then thanked the Evidence Review Group and company representatives for their attendance, participation and contribution to the appraisal and they left the meeting.

## **Part 2 – Closed session**

29. The Committee continued to discuss the clinical and cost effectiveness of padeliporfin for treating localised prostate cancer [ID866].

29.1. The committee decision was based on consensus.

30. The Committee instructed the technical team to prepare the Final Appraisal Determination (FAD) in line with their decisions.

## **Appraisal of cabozantinib for untreated metastatic renal cell carcinoma [ID1208]**

### **Part 2 – closed session**

31. The Chair welcomed the invited expert: Professor Peter Clark to the meeting and he introduced himself to the Committee.

32. The Chair asked all Committee members to declare any relevant interests

32.1. Dr Amanda Adler, Dr Sanjeev Patel, Dr Carlo Berti, Professor John Cairns, Mr Diar Fattah, Ms Susan Faulds, Dr Mark Glover, Mr Richard Hoddes, Dr Sanjay Kinra, Professor Stephen Palmer, Dr Stephen Smith, Mr William Turner, Professor Nicky Welton, Mr Nigel Westwood, Professor Sarah Wild and Dr Stuart Williams all declared that they knew of no personal specific financial interest, personal non-specific financial interest, non-personal specific financial interest, non-personal non-specific financial interest, personal specific family interest or personal non-specific family interest for any of the technologies to be considered as part of the appraisal of cabozantinib for untreated metastatic renal cell carcinoma [ID1208].

33. The Chair asked all NICE Staff to declare any relevant interests.

33.1. All declared that they knew of no personal specific financial interest, personal non-specific financial interest, non-personal specific financial interest, non-personal non-specific financial interest, personal specific family interest or personal non-specific family interest for any of the technologies to be considered as part of the appraisal of cabozantinib for untreated metastatic renal cell carcinoma [ID1208].

34. The Chair asked all other invited guests (assessment group/ERG and invited experts, not including observers) to declare their relevant interests.

34.1. Professor Peter Clark declared that he knew of no personal specific financial interest, personal non-specific financial interest, non-personal specific financial interest, non-personal non-specific financial interest, personal specific family interest or personal non-specific family interest for any of the technologies to be considered as part of the appraisal of cabozantinib for untreated metastatic renal cell carcinoma [ID1208].

35. The Chair presented the additional information submitted by the company since the last Committee meeting.

36. The Committee continued to discuss the clinical and cost effectiveness of cabozantinib for untreated metastatic renal cell carcinoma [ID1208].

- 36.1. The committee decision was based on consensus.
37. The Committee instructed the technical team to prepare the Final Appraisal Determination (FAD) in line with their decisions.

**Date, time and venue of the next meeting**

38. Thursday 6 September 2018 at 10 Spring Gardens, London SW1A 2BU.