Technology Appraisal Committee Meeting (Committee B)

**Avonmouth House**

**Avonmouth Street**

**London**

**SE1 6NX**

# Minutes: Confirmed

## Date and Time: Wednesday 15 January 2020, from 10am to 4pm

### Present:

1. Dr Amanda Adler (Chair) Present for all notes
2. Dr Sanjeev Patel (Vice Chair) Present for all notes
3. Dr Laura Bojke Present for all notes
4. Professor John Cairns Present for all notes
5. Dr Susan Faulds Present for all notes
6. Dr Mark Glover Present for all notes
7. Mr Gareth Hooper Present for all notes
8. Dr Megan John Present for all notes
9. Dr Sanjay Kinra Present for all notes
10. Dr Nicholas Latimer Present for all notes
11. Dr Veline L'Esperance Present for all notes
12. Prof Allyson Pollock Present for all notes
13. Dr Stephen Smith Present for all notes
14. Mr Nigel Westwood Present for all notes
15. Mr Peter Wheatley Price Present for notes 1 to 17
16. Dr Sarah Wild Present for all notes
17. Dr Stuart Williams Present for all notes
18. Mr Tony Wootton Present for all notes

### In attendance:

* Helen Knight, Programme Director, NICE, Present for all notes
* Dr Melinda Goodall, Associate Director, NICE, Present for all notes
* Jeremy Powell, Project Manager, NICE, Present for all notes
* Bashama Anjum, Administrator, NICE, Present for all notes
* Iordanis Sidiropoulos, Technical Analyst, NICE, Present for notes 1 to 17
* Carl Prescott, Technical Adviser, NICE, Present for notes 1 to 17
* Dr Mary Hughes, Technical Analyst, NICE, Present for notes 18 to 31
* Ross Dent, Technical Adviser, NICE, Present for notes 18 to 31
* Thomas Strong, Technical Adviser, NICE, Present for notes 14 to 17 and 18 to 31
* Mr Tosin Lambe, Liverpool Reviews and Implementation Group, Evidence Review Group, Present for notes 1 to 15
* Mrs Sarah Nevitt, Liverpool Reviews and Implementation Group, Evidence Review Group, Present for notes 1 to 15
* Dr Graham Scotland, Aberdeen HTA Group, Evidence Review Group, Present for Notes 18 to 24
* Dr Richard Griffiths, Clinical Expert, Consultant in Medical Oncology, Clatterbridge Cancer Centre, Present for notes 5 to 13
* Dr Paul Nathan, Clinical Expert, Consultant Medical Oncologist, Mount Vernon Cancer Centre, Present for notes 5 to 13
* Mr Colin Timney, Patient Expert, Patient expert, Present for notes 5 to 13
* Professor Peter Clark, Chair of NHS England Chemotherapy Clinical Reference Group and National Clinical Lead for CDF, Present for notes 1 to 24

### Non-public attendees:

* Helen Barnett, Medical Editor, NICE, Present for all notes
* Emma Douch, Technical Analyst, NICE, Present for all notes
* Heidi Livingstone, PIP, NICE, Present for notes 1 to 17
* Edgar Masanga, Business Analyst, NICE, Present for all notes
* Hannah Nicholas, Technical Analyst, NICE, Present for notes 1 to 26

### Notes

### Welcome

1. The Chair welcomed all members of the Committee and other attendees present to the meeting. The Chair reviewed the agenda and timescales for the meeting, which included the appraisals of avelumab with axitinib for untreated advanced or metastatic renal cell carcinoma [ID1547] and abiraterone for treating newly diagnosed metastatic hormone-naive prostate cancer [ID945].
2. The Chair informed the Committee of the non-public observers at this meeting: Helen Barnett, Emma Douch, Heidi Livingstone, Edgar Masanga and Hannah Nicholas.
3. Apologies were received from Dr Carlo Berti and Mr Mark Chapman.

### Any other Business

1. The Committee were given an update on the progress of other appraisals discussed at previous meetings.

## Appraisal of avelumab with axitinib for untreated advanced or metastatic renal cell carcinoma [ID1547]

### Part 1 – Open session

1. The Chair welcomed the invited experts: Professor Peter Clark, Dr Richard Griffiths, Mr Tosin Lambe, Dr Paul Nathan, Mrs Sarah Nevitt and Mr Colin Timney to the meeting and they introduced themselves to the Committee.
2. The Chair welcomed company representatives from Merck and from Pfizer to the meeting.
3. The Chair asked all Committee members to declare any relevant interests.
   1. Dr Amanda Adler, Dr Sanjeev Patel, Dr Laura Bojke, Professor John Cairns, Dr Susan Faulds, Dr Mark Glover, Mr Gareth Hooper, Dr Megan John, Dr Sanjay Kinra, Dr Nicholas Latimer, Dr Veline L'Esperance, Prof Allyson Pollock, Dr Stephen Smith, Mr Nigel Westwood, Mr Peter Wheatley Price, Dr Sarah Wild, Dr Stuart Williams and Mr Tony Wootton all declared that they knew of no personal specific financial interest, personal non-specific financial interest, non-personal specific financial interest, non-personal non-specific financial interest, personal specific family interest or personal non-specific family interest for any of the technologies to be considered as part of the appraisal of avelumab with axitinib for untreated advanced or metastatic renal cell carcinoma [ID1547].
4. The Chair asked all NICE Staff to declare any relevant interests.  
   1. All declared that they knew of no personal specific financial interest, personal non-specific financial interest, non-personal specific financial interest, non-personal non-specific financial interest, personal specific family interest or personal non-specific family interest for any of the technologies to be considered as part of the appraisal of avelumab with axitinib for untreated advanced or metastatic renal cell carcinoma [ID1547].
5. The Chair asked all other invited guests (assessment group/ERG and invited experts, not including observers) to declare their relevant interests.
   1. Professor Peter Clark, Mr Tosin Lambe, Mrs Sarah Nevitt and Mr Colin Timney declared that they knew of no personal specific financial interest, personal non-specific financial interest, non-personal specific financial interest, non-personal non-specific financial interest, personal specific family interest or personal non-specific family interest for any of the technologies to be considered as part of the appraisal of avelumab with axitinib for untreated advanced or metastatic renal cell carcinoma [ID1547].
   2. Dr Richard Griffiths declared a personal non-specific financial interest as he has received honoraria for advisory work from pharmaceutical companies including Bristol Myers-Squibb, Novartis and Pfizer.
      * 1. It was agreed that this declaration would not prevent Dr Griffiths from participating in this section of the meeting.
   3. Dr Paul Nathan declared a personal non-specific financial interest as he has received payments for participating in advisory boards and/or receiving speaker fees from pharmaceutical companies including Ipsen and Pfizer.
      * 1. It was agreed that this declaration would not prevent Dr Nathan from participating in this section of the meeting.
6. The Chair introduced the lead team, Dr Stuart Williams, Mr Nigel Westwood and Mr Peter Wheatley Price who gave presentations on the clinical effectiveness and cost effectiveness of avelumab with axitinib for untreated advanced or metastatic renal cell carcinoma [ID1547].
7. The Chair asked the company representatives whether they wished to comment on any matters of factual accuracy.
8. The Chair explained that “representatives of the press and other members of the public be excluded from the remainder of this meeting having regard to the confidential nature of the business to be transacted, publicity on which would be prejudicial to the public interest" (Section 1(2) Public Bodies (Admission to Meetings) Act 1960)” and all public attendees left the meeting.
9. The Chair then thanked the experts and company representatives for their attendance, participation and contribution to the appraisal and they left the meeting.

**Part 2 – Closed session**

1. Discussion on confidential information continued. This information was supplied by the company.
2. The Chair then thanked the Evidence Review Group representatives for their attendance, participation and contribution to the appraisal and they left the meeting.
3. The Committee continued to discuss the clinical and cost effectiveness of avelumab with axitinib for untreated advanced or metastatic renal cell carcinoma [ID1547].
   1. The committee decision was based on consensus.
4. The Committee instructed the technical team to prepare the Appraisal Consultation Document (ACD) in line with their decisions.

## Appraisal of abiraterone for treating newly diagnosed metastatic hormone-naive prostate cancer [ID945]

**Part 1 – Open session**

1. The Chair welcomed the invited experts: Professor Peter Clark and Dr Graham Scotland to the meeting and they introduced themselves to the Committee.
2. The Chair welcomed company representatives from Janssen to the meeting.
3. The Chair asked all Committee members to declare any relevant interests.
   1. Dr Sanjeev Patel, Dr Laura Bojke, Professor John Cairns, Dr Susan Faulds, Dr Mark Glover, Mr Gareth Hooper, Dr Megan John, Dr Sanjay Kinra, Dr Nicholas Latimer, Dr Veline L'Esperance, Prof Allyson Pollock, Dr Stephen Smith, Mr Nigel Westwood, Dr Sarah Wild, Dr Stuart Williams and Mr Tony Wootton all declared that they knew of no personal specific financial interest, personal non-specific financial interest, non-personal specific financial interest, non-personal non-specific financial interest, personal specific family interest or personal non-specific family interest for any of the technologies to be considered as part of the appraisal of abiraterone for treating newly diagnosed metastatic hormone-naive prostate cancer [ID945].
   2. Dr Amanda Adler declared a non-personal specific non-financial interest as she has provided advice to the STAMPEDE trial.
      1. It was agreed that this declaration would not prevent Dr Adler from participating in this section of the meeting.
   3. Mr Peter Wheatley Price declared a personal financial interest before the meeting as he works for Takeda who are a comparator in this appraisal. 20.3.1. It was agreed that this declaration would prevent Mr Wheatley Price from participating in this section of the meeting.
4. The Chair asked all NICE Staff to declare any relevant interests.
   1. All declared that they knew of no personal specific financial interest, personal non-specific financial interest, non-personal specific financial interest, non-personal non-specific financial interest, personal specific family interest or personal non-specific family interest for any of the technologies to be considered as part of the appraisal of abiraterone for treating newly diagnosed metastatic hormone-naive prostate cancer [ID945].
5. The Chair asked all other invited guests (assessment group/ERG and invited experts, not including observers) to declare their relevant interests.
   1. All declared that they knew of no personal specific financial interest, personal non-specific financial interest, non-personal specific financial interest, non-personal non-specific financial interest, personal specific family interest or personal non-specific family interest for any of the technologies to be considered as part of the appraisal of abiraterone for treating newly diagnosed metastatic hormone-naive prostate cancer [ID945].
6. The Chair introduced the additional evidence submitted by the company and the Evidence Review Group’s critique of this.
7. The Chair asked the company representatives whether they wished to comment on any matters of factual accuracy.
8. The Chair explained that “representatives of the press and other members of the public be excluded from the remainder of this meeting having regard to the confidential nature of the business to be transacted, publicity on which would be prejudicial to the public interest" (Section 1(2) Public Bodies (Admission to Meetings) Act 1960)” and all public attendees left the meeting.
9. The Chair then thanked the company representatives for their attendance, participation and contribution to the appraisal and they left the meeting.

**Part 2 – Closed session**

1. Discussion on confidential information continued. This information was supplied by the company.
2. The Chair then thanked the Evidence Review Group representative for his attendance, participation and contribution to the appraisal and he left the meeting.
3. The Committee continued to discuss the clinical and cost effectiveness of abiraterone for treating newly diagnosed metastatic hormone-naive prostate cancer [ID945].
   1. The committee decision was based on consensus.
4. The Committee instructed the technical team to prepare the Final Appraisal Document (FAD) in line with their decisions.

## Date, time and venue of the next meeting

1. Tuesday 11 February 2020 from 10am to 4pm at 10 Spring Gardens, London SW1A 2BU