Technology Appraisal Committee Meeting (Committee D)

Minutes: Confirmed

Date and Time: Wednesday 27 September 2017, 10.00am – 16.00

Venue: National Institute for Health and Care Excellence
Level 1A, City Tower
Piccadilly Plaza
Manchester
M1 4BT

Present:
1. Professor Gary McVeigh (Chair) Present for all notes
2. Dr Lindsay Smith (Vice Chair) Present for all notes
3. Dr Nabeel Alsindi Present for all notes
4. Dr Graham Ash Present for notes 1 to 16
5. Dr Aomesh Bhatt Present for notes 1 to 27
6. Dr Matthew Bradley Present for all notes
7. Dr Ian Davidson Present for all notes
8. Professor Simon Dixon Present for all notes
9. Professor Rachel Elliott Present for all notes
10. Dr Peter Hall Present for all notes
11. Dr Rebecca Harmston Present for all notes
12. Dr David Meads Present for all notes
13. Dr Malcolm Oswald Present for all notes
14. Professor Oluwafemi Oyebodi Present for all notes
15. Dr Paul Tappenden Present for notes 1 to 16 and 28 to 39
16. Mr William Turner Present for all notes

Nigel Armstrong Evidence Review Group representative, Kleijnen Systematic Reviews Ltd Present for notes 28 to 36

Adrian Bagust Academic Group representative, Liverpool Reviews and Implementation Group (LRIG) Present for notes 4 to 12

Anna Brett Technical Analyst, National Institute for Health and Clinical Excellence Present for notes 16 to 27

Meindert Boysen Programme Director, National Institute for Health and Care Excellence Present for all notes

Gareth Bowen Patient expert, nominated by Butterfly Thyroid Cancer Trust Present for notes 16 to 24

Professor Peter Clark CDF Clinical Lead, NHS England Present for all notes

Dr Simon Crabb Clinical expert, Associate Present for notes 28 to 36
Kate Farnell  
Professor in Medical Oncology, nominated by Bristol-Myers Squibb  
Patient expert, nominated by Butterfly Thyroid Cancer Trust  
Present for notes 4 to 12 (attended by telephone)

Nigel Fleeman  
Academic Group representative, Liverpool Reviews and Implementation Group (LRIG)  
Present for notes 4 to 12

Sabine Grimm  
Evidence Review Group representative, Kleijnen Systematic Reviews Ltd  
Present for notes 28 to 36

Christian Griffiths  
Technical Adviser, National Institute for Health and Clinical Excellence  
Present for notes 28 to 39

Jean Hamilton  
Academic Group representative, School of Health and Related Research (ScHARR)  
Present for notes 16 to 24

Phil Kelly  
Patient expert, nominated by Action Bladder Cancer UK  
Present for notes 28 to 36

Helen Knight  
Associate Director, National Institute for Health and Care Excellence  
Present for all notes

Kate Moore  
Project Manager, National Institute for Health and Care Excellence  
Present for all notes

Teri Morgan  
Patient expert, nominated by Fight Bladder Cancer  
Present for notes 28 to 36

Dr Kate Newbold  
Clinical expert, Consultant Clinical Oncologist, nominated by NCRI-ACP-RCP-RCR  
Present for notes 16 to 24 (attended by telephone)

Thomas Paling  
Technical Analyst, National Institute for Health and Clinical Excellence  
Present for notes 28 to 39

Julia Priestley  
Patient expert, nominated by British Thyroid Foundation  
Present for notes 4 to 12

Bram Ramaekers  
Evidence Review Group representative, Kleijnen Systematic Reviews Ltd  
Present for notes 28 to 36

Dr Yvonne Rimmer  
Clinical expert, Consultant Clinical Oncologist,  
Present for notes 28 to 36
nominated by BUG-NCRI-ACP-RCP-RCR

Abitha Senthinathan  Technical Analyst, National Institute for Health and Clinical Excellence  Present for notes 1 to 16

Alex Sexton  Administrator, National Institute for Health and Care Excellence  Present for all notes

Dr Paul Tappenden  Academic Group representative, School of Health and Related Research (ScHARR)  Present for notes 16 to 24

Nwamaka Umeweni  Technical Adviser, National Institute for Health and Clinical Excellence  Present for notes 1 to 27

Dr Jonathan Wadsley  Clinical Expert, Consultant Clinical Oncologist, nominated by Eisai Ltd  Present for notes 4 to 12

Non-public observers:

Seifa Afiesimama  Administrator, National Institute for Health and Care Excellence  Present for notes 1 to 15

Lucy Beggs  Technical Analyst, National Institute for Health and Care Excellence  Present for all notes

Lindsay Claxton  Evidence Review Group, Centre for Reviews and Dissemination and Centre for Health Economics – York  Present for all notes

Ann Greenwood  Senior Medical Editor, National Institute for Health and Care Excellence  Present for all notes

Lydia Shears  PIP representative, National Institute for Health and Care Excellence  Present for notes 1 to 24 and 28 to 36

Notes
Welcome

1. The Chair welcomed all members of the Committee and other attendees present to the meeting. The Chair reviewed the agenda and timescales for the meeting, which included the appraisals of lenvatinib and sorafenib for treating differentiated thyroid cancer after radioactive iodine, cabozantinib and vandetanib for treating unresectable or metastatic
medullary thyroid cancer, and nivolumab for treating metastic or unresectable urothelial cancer after platinum-based chemotherapy.

2. Apologies were received from Professor David Bowen, Mrs Susan Dutton, Mrs Gillian Ells, Professor Paula Ghaneh, Sumithra Maheswaran and Dr Paula Parvulescu.

Any other Business

3. None

Appraisal of lenvatinib and sorafenib for treating differentiated thyroid cancer after radioactive iodine [ID1059]

Part 1 – Open session

4. The Chair welcomed the invited experts, Adrian Bagust, Professor Peter Clark, Kate Farnell, Nigel Fleeman, Julia Priestley, and Dr Jonathan Wadsley to the meeting and they introduced themselves to the Committee.

5. The Chair welcomed company representatives from Bayer and Eisai to the meeting.

6. The Chair asked all Committee members to declare any relevant interests

6.1. Dr Nabeel Alsindi, Dr Graham Ash, Dr Aomesh Bhatt, Dr Matthew Bradley, Dr Ian Davidson, Professor Simon Dixon, Professor Rachel Elliott, Dr Rebecca Harmston, Professor Gary McVeigh, Dr David Meads, Dr Malcolm Oswald, Professor Oluwafemi Oyebode, Dr Paul Tappenden, Dr Lindsay Smith, and Mr William Turner all declared that they knew of no personal specific financial interest, personal non-specific financial interest, non-personal specific financial interest, non-personal non-specific financial interest, personal specific family interest or personal non-specific family interest for any of the technologies to be considered as part of the appraisal of lenvatinib and sorafenib for treating differentiated thyroid cancer after radioactive iodine.

6.2. Dr Peter Hall declared a non-specific non-personal financial interest as his employer, the University of Edinburgh, had received fees from Eisai for his participation in advisory board.

6.2.1 It was agreed that this declaration would not prevent Dr Peter Hall from participating in this section of the meeting.

7. The Chair asked all NICE Staff to declare any relevant interests.

7.1. All declared that they knew of no personal specific financial interest, personal non-specific financial interest, non-personal specific financial interest, non-personal non-specific financial interest, personal specific family interest or personal non-specific family interest for any of the technologies to be considered as part of the appraisal of lenvatinib and sorafenib for treating differentiated thyroid cancer after radioactive iodine.

8. The Chair asked all other invited guests (assessment group/ERG and invited experts, not including observers) to declare their relevant interests.

8.1. Professor Adrian Bagust, Professor Peter Clark, Kate Farnell, Nigel Fleeman and Julia Priestley declared that they knew of no personal specific financial interest, personal non-specific financial interest, non-personal specific financial interest, non-personal non-specific financial interest, personal specific family interest or personal non-specific family interest for any of the technologies to be
considered as part of the appraisal of lenvatinib and sorafenib for treating differentiated thyroid cancer after radioactive iodine.

8.2. Dr Jonathan Wadsley declared a non-specific personal financial interest as he has acted as an advisor for Eisai and Bayer and received honoraria for this.

8.2.1 It was agreed that this declaration would not prevent Dr Wadsley from participating in this section of the meeting.

9. The Chair introduced the lead team, Dr David Meads, Dr Malcolm Oswald, and Professor Oluwafemi Oyebode, who gave presentations on the clinical effectiveness and cost effectiveness of lenvatinib and sorafenib for treating differentiated thyroid cancer after radioactive iodine.

10. The Chair asked the company representatives whether they wished to comment on any matters of factual accuracy.

11. The Chair explained that “representatives of the press and other members of the public be excluded from the remainder of this meeting having regard to the confidential nature of the business to be transacted, publicity on which would be prejudicial to the public interest" (Section 1(2) Public Bodies (Admission to Meetings) Act 1960)" and all public attendees left the meeting.

12. The Chair then thanked the experts and company representatives for their attendance, participation and contribution to the appraisal and they left the meeting.

Part 2 – Closed session

13. Discussion on confidential information continued. This information was supplied by the company.

14. The Committee continued to discuss the clinical and cost effectiveness of lenvatinib and sorafenib for treating differentiated thyroid cancer after radioactive iodine.

15. The Committee instructed the technical team to prepare the Appraisal Consultation Document (ACD) in line with their decisions.

Appraisal of cabozantinib and vandetanib for treating unresectable or metastatic medullary thyroid cancer [ID56]

Part 1 – Open session

16. The Chair welcomed the invited experts: Gareth Bowen, Professor Peter Clark, Jean Hamilton, Dr Kate Newbold, and Dr Paul Tappenden, to the meeting and they introduced themselves to the Committee.

17. The Chair welcomed company representatives from SanofiGenzyme and Ipsen to the meeting.

18. The Chair asked all Committee members to declare any relevant interests

18.1. Dr Nabeel Alsindi, Dr Graham Ash, Dr Aomesh Bhatt, Dr Matthew Bradley, Dr Ian Davidson, Professor Simon Dixon, Professor Rachel Elliott, Dr Peter Hall, Dr Rebecca Harmston, Professor Gary McVeigh, Dr David Meads, Dr Malcolm Oswald, Professor Oluwafemi Oyebode, Dr Paul Tappenden, Dr Lindsay Smith, and Mr William Turner all declared that they knew of no personal specific financial interest, personal non-specific financial interest, non-personal specific financial interest, non-personal non-specific financial interest, personal specific family interest or personal non-specific family interest for any of the
technologies to be considered as part of the appraisal of cabozantinib and vandetanib for treating unresectable or metastatic medullary thyroid cancer.

19. The Chair asked all NICE Staff to declare any relevant interests.

19.1. All declared that they knew of no personal specific financial interest, personal non-specific financial interest, non-personal specific financial interest, non-personal non-specific financial interest, personal specific family interest or personal non-specific family interest for any of the technologies to be considered as part of cabozantinib and vandetanib for treating unresectable or metastatic medullary thyroid cancer.

20. The Chair asked all other invited guests (assessment group/ERG and invited experts, not including observers) to declare their relevant interests.

20.1. All declared that they knew of no personal specific financial interest, personal non-specific financial interest, non-personal specific financial interest, non-personal non-specific financial interest, personal specific family interest or personal non-specific family interest for any of the technologies to be considered as part of the appraisal of cabozantinib and vandetanib for treating unresectable or metastatic medullary thyroid cancer.

21. The Chair introduced the key themes arising from the consultation responses to the Appraisal Consultation Document (ACD) received from consultees, commentators and through the NICE website.

22. The Chair asked the company representatives whether they wished to comment on any matters of factual accuracy.

23. The Chair explained that “representatives of the press and other members of the public be excluded from the remainder of this meeting having regard to the confidential nature of the business to be transacted, publicity on which would be prejudicial to the public interest” (Section 1(2) Public Bodies (Admission to Meetings) Act 1960)” and all public attendees left the meeting.

24. The Chair then thanked the experts and company representatives for their attendance, participation and contribution to the appraisal and they left the meeting.

Part 2 – Closed session

25. Discussion on confidential information continued. This information was supplied by the company.

26. The Committee continued to discuss the clinical and cost effectiveness of cabozantinib and vandetanib for treating unresectable or metastatic medullary thyroid cancer.

26.1. The committee decision was based on consensus.

27. The Committee instructed the technical team to prepare the Appraisal Consultation Document (ACD) or Final Appraisal Determination (FAD) in line with their decisions.

Appraisal of nivolumab for treating metastic or unresectable urothelial cancer after platinum-based chemotherapy [ID995]

Part 1 – Open session

28. The Chair welcomed the invited experts: Nigel Armstrong, Professor Peter Clark, Dr Simon Crabb, Sabine Grimm, Phil Kelly, Teri Morgan, Bram Ramaekers and Dr Yvonne Rimmer, to the meeting and they introduced themselves to the Committee.
29. The Chair welcomed company representatives from Bristol-Myers Squibb to the meeting.

30. The Chair asked all Committee members to declare any relevant interests

30.1. Dr Nabeel Alsindi, Dr Graham Ash, Dr Aomesh Bhatt, Dr Matthew Bradley, Dr Ian Davidson, Professor Rachel Elliott, Dr Peter Hall, Dr Rebecca Harmston, Professor Gary McVeigh, Dr David Meads, Dr Malcolm Oswald, Professor Oluwafemi Oyebode, Dr Paul Tappenden, Dr Lindsay Smith, and Mr William Turner all declared that they knew of no personal specific financial interest, personal non-specific financial interest, non-personal specific financial interest, non-personal non-specific financial interest, personal specific family interest or personal non-specific family interest for any of the technologies to be considered as part of the appraisal of nivolumab for treating metastatic or unresectable urothelial cancer after platinum-based chemotherapy.

30.2. Professor Simon Dixon declared a non-personal specific financial interest as he is the director of the Health Economics Unit that has undertaken work for the company on different topics; the University of Sheffield received payment for the work.

30.2.1 It was agreed that this declaration would not prevent Professor Simon Dixon from participating in this section of the meeting.

30.3. Dr Paul Tappenden declared a non-personal specific financial interest as he is part a Health Economics Unit that has undertaken work for the company on different topics; the University of Sheffield received payment for the work.

30.3.1 It was agreed that this declaration would not prevent Dr Paul Tappenden from participating in this section of the meeting.

31. The Chair asked all NICE Staff to declare any relevant interests.

31.1. All declared that they knew of no personal specific financial interest, personal non-specific financial interest, non-personal specific financial interest, non-personal non-specific financial interest, personal specific family interest or personal non-specific family interest for any of the technologies to be considered as part of the appraisal of nivolumab for treating metastatic or unresectable urothelial cancer after platinum-based chemotherapy.

32. The Chair asked all other invited guests (assessment group/ERG and invited experts, not including observers) to declare their relevant interests.

32.1. Nigel Armstrong, Professor Peter Clark, Sabine Grimm, Teri Morgan, Bram Ramaekers and Dr Yvonne Rimmer declared that they knew of no personal specific financial interest, personal non-specific financial interest, non-personal specific financial interest, non-personal non-specific financial interest, personal specific family interest or personal non-specific family interest for any of the technologies to be considered as part of the appraisal of nivolumab for treating metastatic or unresectable urothelial cancer after platinum-based chemotherapy.

32.2. Dr Simon Crabb declared a non-specific personal financial interest as he has received funding for travel to research meetings, clinical research funding and consulting, advisory or speaker fees from the company and comparator companies.

32.2.1 It was agreed that this declaration would not prevent Dr Simon Crabb from participating in this section of the meeting.
32.3. Phil Kelly declared a non-specific personal financial interest as he had received a grant this year from the company.

32.2.1 It was agreed that this declaration would not prevent Phil Kelly from participating in this section of the meeting.

33. The Chair introduced the lead team, Dr Matthew Bradley, Mr Malcolm Oswald, and Mr William Turner, who gave presentations on the clinical effectiveness and cost effectiveness of nivolumab for treating metastatic or unresectable urothelial cancer after platinum-based chemotherapy.

34. The Chair asked the company representatives whether they wished to comment on any matters of factual accuracy.

35. The Chair explained that “representatives of the press and other members of the public be excluded from the remainder of this meeting having regard to the confidential nature of the business to be transacted, publicity on which would be prejudicial to the public interest” (Section 1(2) Public Bodies (Admission to Meetings) Act 1960)” and all public attendees left the meeting.

36. The Chair then thanked the experts and company representatives for their attendance, participation and contribution to the appraisal and they left the meeting.

**Part 2 – Closed session**

37. Discussion on confidential information continued. This information was supplied by the company.

38. The Committee continued to discuss the clinical and cost effectiveness of nivolumab for treating metastatic or unresectable urothelial cancer after platinum-based chemotherapy.

38.1. The committee decision was based on consensus.

39. The Committee instructed the technical team to prepare the Appraisal Consultation Document (ACD) in line with their decisions.

**Date, time and venue of the next meeting**

40. Thursday 26 October 2017 at National Institute for Health and Care Excellence, Level 1A, City Tower, Piccadilly Plaza, Manchester M1 4BT.