

## Technology Appraisal Committee Meeting (Committee D)

**Minutes:** Confirmed

**Date and Time:** **Wednesday 27 September 2017**, 10.00am – 16.00

**Venue:** National Institute for Health and Care Excellence  
Level 1A, City Tower  
Piccadilly Plaza  
Manchester  
M1 4BT

<b>Present:</b>	1. Professor Gary McVeigh (Chair)	Present for all notes
	2. Dr Lindsay Smith (Vice Chair)	Present for all notes
	3. Dr Nabeel Alsindi	Present for all notes
	4. Dr Graham Ash	Present for notes 1 to 16
	5. Dr Aomesh Bhatt	Present for notes 1 to 27
	6. Dr Matthew Bradley	Present for all notes
	7. Dr Ian Davidson	Present for all notes
	8. Professor Simon Dixon	Present for all notes
	9. Professor Rachel Elliott	Present for all notes
	10. Dr Peter Hall	Present for all notes
	11. Dr Rebecca Harmston	Present for all notes
	12. Dr David Meads	Present for all notes
	13. Dr Malcolm Oswald	Present for all notes
	14. Professor Oluwafemi Oyebodi	Present for all notes
	15. Dr Paul Tappenden	Present for notes 1 to 16 and 28 to 39
	16. Mr William Turner	Present for all notes
Nigel Armstrong	Evidence Review Group representative, Kleijnen Systematic Reviews Ltd	Present for notes 28 to 36
Adrian Bagust	Academic Group representative, Liverpool Reviews and Implementation Group (LRIG)	Present for notes 4 to 12
Anna Brett	Technical Analyst, National Institute for Health and Clinical Excellence	Present for notes 16 to 27
Meindert Boysen	Programme Director, National Institute for Health and Care Excellence	Present for all notes
Gareth Bowen	Patient expert, nominated by Butterfly Thyroid Cancer Trust	Present for notes 16 to 24
Professor Peter Clark	CDF Clinical Lead, NHS England	Present for all notes
Dr Simon Crabb	Clinical expert, Associate	Present for notes 28 to 36

	Professor in Medical Oncology, nominated by Bristol-Myers Squibb	
Kate Farnell	Patient expert, nominated by Butterfly Thyroid Cancer Trust	Present for notes 4 to 12 (attended by telephone)
Nigel Fleeman	Academic Group representative, Liverpool Reviews and Implementation Group (LRIG)	Present for notes 4 to 12
Sabine Grimm	Evidence Review Group representative, Kleijnen Systematic Reviews Ltd	Present for notes 28 to 36
Christian Griffiths	Technical Adviser, National Institute for Health and Clinical Excellence	Present for notes 28 to 39
Jean Hamilton	Academic Group representative, School of Health and Related Research (SchARR)	Present for notes 16 to 24
Phil Kelly	Patient expert, nominated by Action Bladder Cancer UK	Present for notes 28 to 36
Helen Knight	Associate Director, National Institute for Health and Care Excellence	Present for all notes
Kate Moore	Project Manager, National Institute for Health and Care Excellence	Present for all notes
Teri Morgan	Patient expert, nominated by Fight Bladder Cancer	Present for notes 28 to 36
Dr Kate Newbold	Clinical expert, Consultant Clinical Oncologist, nominated by NCRI-ACP-RCP-RCR	Present for notes 16 to 24 (attended by telephone)
Thomas Paling	Technical Analyst, National Institute for Health and Clinical Excellence	Present for notes 28 to 39
Julia Priestley	Patient expert, nominated by British Thyroid Foundation	Present for notes 4 to 12
Bram Ramaekers	Evidence Review Group representative, Kleijnen Systematic Reviews Ltd	Present for notes 28 to 36
Dr Yvonne Rimmer	Clinical expert, Consultant Clinical Oncologist,	Present for notes 28 to 36

nominated by BUG-NCRI-  
ACP-RCP-RCR

Abitha Senthinathan	Technical Analyst, National Institute for Health and Clinical Excellence	Present for notes 1 to 16
Alex Sexton	Administrator, National Institute for Health and Care Excellence	Present for all notes
Dr Paul Tappenden	Academic Group representative, School of Health and Related Research (SchARR)	Present for notes 16 to 24
Nwamaka Umeweni	Technical Adviser, National Institute for Health and Clinical Excellence	Present for notes 1 to 27
Dr Jonathan Wadsley	Clinical Expert, Consultant Clinical Oncologist, nominated by Eisai Ltd	Present for notes 4 to 12

**Non-public observers:**

Seifa Afiesimama	Administrator, National Institute for Health and Care Excellence	Present for notes 1 to 15
Lucy Beggs	Technical Analyst, National Institute for Health and Care Excellence	Present for all notes
Lindsay Claxton	Evidence Review Group, Centre for Reviews and Dissemination and Centre for Health Economics – York	Present for all notes
Ann Greenwood	Senior Medical Editor, National Institute for Health and Care Excellence	Present for all notes
Lydia Shears	PIP representative, National Institute for Health and Care Excellence	Present for notes 1 to 24 and 28 to 36

**Notes**

**Welcome**

1. The Chair welcomed all members of the Committee and other attendees present to the meeting. The Chair reviewed the agenda and timescales for the meeting, which included the appraisals of lenvatinib and sorafenib for treating differentiated thyroid cancer after radioactive iodine, cabozantinib and vandetanib for treating unresectable or metastatic

medullary thyroid cancer, and nivolumab for treating metastatic or unresectable urothelial cancer after platinum-based chemotherapy.

2. Apologies were received from Professor David Bowen, Mrs Susan Dutton, Mrs Gillian Ells, Professor Paula Ghaneh, Sumithra Maheswaran and Dr Paula Parvulescu.

### **Any other Business**

3. None

## **Appraisal of lenvatinib and sorafenib for treating differentiated thyroid cancer after radioactive iodine [ID1059]**

### **Part 1 – Open session**

4. The Chair welcomed the invited experts, Adrian Bagust, Professor Peter Clark, Kate Farnell, Nigel Fleeman, Julia Priestley, and Dr Jonathan Wadsley to the meeting and they introduced themselves to the Committee.
5. The Chair welcomed company representatives from Bayer and Eisai to the meeting.
6. The Chair asked all Committee members to declare any relevant interests
  - 6.1. Dr Nabeel Alsindi, Dr Graham Ash, Dr Aomesh Bhatt, Dr Matthew Bradley, Dr Ian Davidson, Professor Simon Dixon, Professor Rachel Elliott, Dr Rebecca Harmston, Professor Gary McVeigh, Dr David Meads, Dr Malcolm Oswald, Professor Oluwafemi Oyeboade, Dr Paul Tappenden, Dr Lindsay Smith, and Mr William Turner all declared that they knew of no personal specific financial interest, personal non-specific financial interest, non-personal specific financial interest, non-personal non-specific financial interest, personal specific family interest or personal non-specific family interest for any of the technologies to be considered as part of the appraisal of lenvatinib and sorafenib for treating differentiated thyroid cancer after radioactive iodine.
  - 6.2. Dr Peter Hall declared a non-specific non-personal financial interest as his employer, the University of Edinburgh, had received fees from Eisai for his participation in advisory board.
    - 6.2.1 It was agreed that this declaration would not prevent Dr Peter Hall from participating in this section of the meeting.
7. The Chair asked all NICE Staff to declare any relevant interests.
  - 7.1. All declared that they knew of no personal specific financial interest, personal non-specific financial interest, non-personal specific financial interest, non-personal non-specific financial interest, personal specific family interest or personal non-specific family interest for any of the technologies to be considered as part of the appraisal of lenvatinib and sorafenib for treating differentiated thyroid cancer after radioactive iodine.
8. The Chair asked all other invited guests (assessment group/ERG and invited experts, not including observers) to declare their relevant interests.
  - 8.1. Professor Adrian Bagust, Professor Peter Clark, Kate Farnell, Nigel Fleeman and Julia Priestley declared that they knew of no personal specific financial interest, personal non-specific financial interest, non-personal specific financial interest, non-personal non-specific financial interest, personal specific family interest or personal non-specific family interest for any of the technologies to be

considered as part of the appraisal of lenvatinib and sorafenib for treating differentiated thyroid cancer after radioactive iodine.

- 8.2. Dr Jonathan Wadsley declared a non-specific personal financial interest as he has acted as an advisor for Eisai and Bayer and received honoraria for this.

8.2.1 It was agreed that this declaration would not prevent Dr Wadsley from participating in this section of the meeting.

9. The Chair introduced the lead team, Dr David Meads, Dr Malcolm Oswald, and Professor Oluwafemi Oyebode, who gave presentations on the clinical effectiveness and cost effectiveness of lenvatinib and sorafenib for treating differentiated thyroid cancer after radioactive iodine.
10. The Chair asked the company representatives whether they wished to comment on any matters of factual accuracy.
11. The Chair explained that “representatives of the press and other members of the public be excluded from the remainder of this meeting having regard to the confidential nature of the business to be transacted, publicity on which would be prejudicial to the public interest” (Section 1(2) Public Bodies (Admission to Meetings) Act 1960)” and all public attendees left the meeting.
12. The Chair then thanked the experts and company representatives for their attendance, participation and contribution to the appraisal and they left the meeting.

## **Part 2 – Closed session**

13. Discussion on confidential information continued. This information was supplied by the company.
14. The Committee continued to discuss the clinical and cost effectiveness of lenvatinib and sorafenib for treating differentiated thyroid cancer after radioactive iodine.
15. The Committee instructed the technical team to prepare the Appraisal Consultation Document (ACD) in line with their decisions.

## **Appraisal of cabozantinib and vandetanib for treating unresectable or metastatic medullary thyroid cancer [ID56]**

### **Part 1 – Open session**

16. The Chair welcomed the invited experts: Gareth Bowen, Professor Peter Clark, Jean Hamilton, Dr Kate Newbold, and Dr Paul Tappenden, to the meeting and they introduced themselves to the Committee.
17. The Chair welcomed company representatives from SanofiGenzyme and Ipsen to the meeting.
18. The Chair asked all Committee members to declare any relevant interests
- 18.1. Dr Nabeel Alsindi, Dr Graham Ash, Dr Aomesh Bhatt, Dr Matthew Bradley, Dr Ian Davidson, Professor Simon Dixon, Professor Rachel Elliott, Dr Peter Hall, Dr Rebecca Harmston, Professor Gary McVeigh, Dr David Meads, Dr Malcolm Oswald, Professor Oluwafemi Oyebode, Dr Paul Tappenden, Dr Lindsay Smith, and Mr William Turner all declared that they knew of no personal specific financial interest, personal non-specific financial interest, non-personal specific financial interest, non-personal non-specific financial interest, personal specific family interest or personal non-specific family interest for any of the

technologies to be considered as part of the appraisal of cabozantinib and vandetanib for treating unresectable or metastatic medullary thyroid cancer.

19. The Chair asked all NICE Staff to declare any relevant interests.
  - 19.1. All declared that they knew of no personal specific financial interest, personal non-specific financial interest, non-personal specific financial interest, non-personal non-specific financial interest, personal specific family interest or personal non-specific family interest for any of the technologies to be considered as part of cabozantinib and vandetanib for treating unresectable or metastatic medullary thyroid cancer.
20. The Chair asked all other invited guests (assessment group/ERG and invited experts, not including observers) to declare their relevant interests.
  - 20.1. All declared that they knew of no personal specific financial interest, personal non-specific financial interest, non-personal specific financial interest, non-personal non-specific financial interest, personal specific family interest or personal non-specific family interest for any of the technologies to be considered as part of the appraisal of cabozantinib and vandetanib for treating unresectable or metastatic medullary thyroid cancer.
21. The Chair introduced the key themes arising from the consultation responses to the Appraisal Consultation Document (ACD) received from consultees, commentators and through the NICE website.
22. The Chair asked the company representatives whether they wished to comment on any matters of factual accuracy.
23. The Chair explained that “representatives of the press and other members of the public be excluded from the remainder of this meeting having regard to the confidential nature of the business to be transacted, publicity on which would be prejudicial to the public interest” (Section 1(2) Public Bodies (Admission to Meetings) Act 1960)” and all public attendees left the meeting.
24. The Chair then thanked the experts and company representatives for their attendance, participation and contribution to the appraisal and they left the meeting.

## **Part 2 – Closed session**

25. Discussion on confidential information continued. This information was supplied by the company.
26. The Committee continued to discuss the clinical and cost effectiveness of cabozantinib and vandetanib for treating unresectable or metastatic medullary thyroid cancer.
  - 26.1. The committee decision was based on consensus.
27. The Committee instructed the technical team to prepare the Appraisal Consultation Document (ACD) or Final Appraisal Determination (FAD) in line with their decisions.

## **Appraisal of nivolumab for treating metastatic or unresectable urothelial cancer after platinum-based chemotherapy [ID995]**

### **Part 1 – Open session**

28. The Chair welcomed the invited experts: Nigel Armstrong, Professor Peter Clark, Dr Simon Crabb, Sabine Grimm, Phil Kelly, Teri Morgan, Bram Ramaekers and Dr Yvonne Rimmer, to the meeting and they introduced themselves to the Committee.

29. The Chair welcomed company representatives from Bristol-Myers Squibb to the meeting.
30. The Chair asked all Committee members to declare any relevant interests
- 30.1. Dr Nabeel Alsindi, Dr Graham Ash, Dr Aomesh Bhatt, Dr Matthew Bradley, Dr Ian Davidson, Professor Rachel Elliott, Dr Peter Hall, Dr Rebecca Harmston, Professor Gary McVeigh, Dr David Meads, Dr Malcolm Oswald, Professor Oluwafemi Oyeboode, Dr Paul Tappenden, Dr Lindsay Smith, and Mr William Turner all declared that they knew of no personal specific financial interest, personal non-specific financial interest, non-personal specific financial interest, non-personal non-specific financial interest, personal specific family interest or personal non-specific family interest for any of the technologies to be considered as part of the appraisal of nivolumab for treating metastatic or unresectable urothelial cancer after platinum-based chemotherapy.
- 30.2. Professor Simon Dixon declared a non-personal specific financial interest as he is the director of the Health Economics Unit that has undertaken work for the company on different topics; the University of Sheffield received payment for the work.
- 32.2.1 It was agreed that this declaration would not prevent Professor Simon Dixon from participating in this section of the meeting.
- 30.3. Dr Paul Tappenden declared a non-personal specific financial interest as he is part a Health Economics Unit that has undertaken work for the company on different topics; the University of Sheffield received payment for the work.
- 32.2.1 It was agreed that this declaration would not prevent Dr Paul Tappenden from participating in this section of the meeting.
31. The Chair asked all NICE Staff to declare any relevant interests.
- 31.1. All declared that they knew of no personal specific financial interest, personal non-specific financial interest, non-personal specific financial interest, non-personal non-specific financial interest, personal specific family interest or personal non-specific family interest for any of the technologies to be considered as part of the appraisal of nivolumab for treating metastatic or unresectable urothelial cancer after platinum-based chemotherapy.
32. The Chair asked all other invited guests (assessment group/ERG and invited experts, not including observers) to declare their relevant interests.
- 32.1. Nigel Armstrong, Professor Peter Clark, Sabine Grimm, Teri Morgan, Bram Ramaekers and Dr Yvonne Rimmer declared that they knew of no personal specific financial interest, personal non-specific financial interest, non-personal specific financial interest, non-personal non-specific financial interest, personal specific family interest or personal non-specific family interest for any of the technologies to be considered as part of the appraisal of nivolumab for treating metastatic or unresectable urothelial cancer after platinum-based chemotherapy.
- 32.2. Dr Simon Crabb declared a non-specific personal financial interest as he has received funding for travel to research meetings, clinical research funding and consulting, advisory or speaker fees from the company and comparator companies.
- 32.2.1 It was agreed that this declaration would not prevent Dr Simon Crabb from participating in this section of the meeting.

- 32.3. Phil Kelly declared a non-specific personal financial interest as he had received a grant this year from the company.

32.2.1 It was agreed that this declaration would not prevent Phil Kelly from participating in this section of the meeting.

33. The Chair introduced the lead team, Dr Matthew Bradley, Mr Malcolm Oswald, and Mr William Turner, who gave presentations on the clinical effectiveness and cost effectiveness of nivolumab for treating metastatic or unresectable urothelial cancer after platinum-based chemotherapy.
34. The Chair asked the company representatives whether they wished to comment on any matters of factual accuracy.
35. The Chair explained that “representatives of the press and other members of the public be excluded from the remainder of this meeting having regard to the confidential nature of the business to be transacted, publicity on which would be prejudicial to the public interest” (Section 1(2) Public Bodies (Admission to Meetings) Act 1960)” and all public attendees left the meeting.
36. The Chair then thanked the experts and company representatives for their attendance, participation and contribution to the appraisal and they left the meeting.

## **Part 2 – Closed session**

37. Discussion on confidential information continued. This information was supplied by the company.
38. The Committee continued to discuss the clinical and cost effectiveness of nivolumab for treating metastatic or unresectable urothelial cancer after platinum-based chemotherapy.
- 38.1. The committee decision was based on consensus.
39. The Committee instructed the technical team to prepare the Appraisal Consultation Document (ACD) in line with their decisions.

## **Date, time and venue of the next meeting**

40. Thursday 26 October 2017 at National Institute for Health and Care Excellence, Level 1A, City Tower, Piccadilly Plaza, Manchester M1 4BT.