Technology Appraisal Committee Meeting Committee D

Minutes: Unconfirmed

Date and Time: Wednesday 26 July 2017, 10.00 – 17.30

Venue: Mercure Manchester Piccadilly Hotel
Portland Street
Manchester

Present:
1. Professor Gary McVeigh (Chair) Present for all notes
2. Dr Lindsay Smith (Vice Chair) Present for all notes
3. Dr Graham Ash Present for all notes
4. Dr Aomesh Bhatt Present for all notes
5. Professor David Bowen Present for all notes
6. Dr Ian Davidson Present for all notes
7. Mrs Susan Dutton Present for all notes
8. Professor Rachel Elliott Present for all notes
9. Mrs Gillian Ells Present for all notes
10. Dr Rebecca Harmston Present for all notes
11. Dr Malcolm Oswald Present for all notes
12. Professor Oluwafemi Oyebode Present for all notes
13. Professor Andrew Renehan Present for all notes
14. Dr Brian Shine Present for all notes

In attendance:
Dr Xavier Armoiry Evidence Review Group representative, Warwick Evidence Present for notes 38 to 46
Ailsa Bosworth Patient Expert, nominated by National Rheumatoid Arthritis Society Present for notes 16 to 24
Gareth Bowen Patient Expert, nominated by Butterfly Thyroid Cancer Trust Present for notes 1 to 12
Meindert Boysen Programme Director, National Institute for Health and Care Excellence Present for notes 13 to 49
Anna Brett Technical Analyst, National Institute for Health and Clinical Excellence Present for notes 1 to 15
Dr Chris Carroll Assessment Group representative, School of Health and Related Research (ScHARR) Present for notes 1 to 12
<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Name</th>
<th>Role and Affiliation</th>
<th>Present for Notes</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Professor Peter Clark</td>
<td>CDF Clinical Lead, NHS England</td>
<td>1 to 12 and 38 to 46</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sophie Cooper</td>
<td>Technical Analyst, National Institute for Health and Clinical Excellence</td>
<td>38 to 49</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Dr Ewen Cummins</td>
<td>Evidence Review Group representative, Warwick Evidence</td>
<td>38 to 46</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Kate Farnell</td>
<td>Patient Expert, nominated by Butterfly Thyroid Cancer Trust</td>
<td>1 to 12</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Dr James Galloway</td>
<td>Senior Lecturer in Rheumatology, Clinical Expert, nominated by Pfizer Ltd</td>
<td>16 to 24</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Christian Griffiths</td>
<td>Technical Adviser, National Institute for Health and Clinical Excellence</td>
<td>28 to 37</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Dr Jean Hamilton</td>
<td>Assessment Group representative, School of Health and Related Research (ScHARR)</td>
<td>1 to 12</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Jennie Jones</td>
<td>Patient Expert, nominated by National Rheumatoid Arthritis Society</td>
<td>16 to 24</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Helen Knight</td>
<td>Associate Director, National Institute for Health and Care Excellence</td>
<td>All notes</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Dr Mary Lei</td>
<td>Consultant Clinical Oncologist, Clinical Expert, nominated by Sanofi Genzyme</td>
<td>1 to 12</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Dr Rajan Madhok</td>
<td>Consultant Rheumatologist, Clinical Expert, nominated by British Society for Rheumatology</td>
<td>16 to 24</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Dr Marissa Martyn St James</td>
<td>Evidence Review Group representative, School of Health and Related</td>
<td>16 to 24</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Name</td>
<td>Position</td>
<td>Present for notes</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>-----------------------------</td>
<td>--------------------------------------------------------------------------</td>
<td>-------------------</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Fay McCracken</td>
<td>Technical Adviser, National Institute for Health and Clinical Excellence</td>
<td>16 to 27</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Kate Moore</td>
<td>Project Manager, National Institute for Health and Care Excellence</td>
<td>All notes</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Dr Kate Newbold</td>
<td>Consultant Clinical Oncologist, Clinical Expert, nominated by NCRI-ACP-RCP-RCR</td>
<td>1 to 12</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Helen Powell</td>
<td>Technical Analyst, National Institute for Health and Clinical Excellence</td>
<td>28 to 37</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Alex Sexton</td>
<td>Administrator, National Institute for Health and Care Excellence</td>
<td>All notes</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Raisa Sidhu</td>
<td>Technical Adviser, National Institute for Health and Clinical Excellence</td>
<td>38 to 49</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Professor Matthew Stevenson</td>
<td>Evidence Review Group representative, School of Health and Related Research (ScHARR)</td>
<td>16 to 24</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Dr Paul Tappenden</td>
<td>Assessment Group representative, School of Health and Related Research (ScHARR)</td>
<td>1 to 12</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Nwamaka Umeweni</td>
<td>Technical Adviser, National Institute for Health and Clinical Excellence</td>
<td>1 to 15</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Aminata Thiam</td>
<td>Technical Analyst, National Institute for Health and Clinical Excellence</td>
<td>16 to 27</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ian Watson</td>
<td>Technical Analyst, National Institute for Health and Clinical Excellence</td>
<td>28 to 37</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
### Non-public observers:

<table>
<thead>
<tr>
<th>Name</th>
<th>Title and Affiliation</th>
<th>Present for</th>
</tr>
</thead>
<tbody>
<tr>
<td>Henry Edwards</td>
<td>Technical Adviser, National Institute for Health and Care Excellence</td>
<td>notes 38 to 50</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Alex Filby</td>
<td>Technical Adviser, National Institute for Health and Care Excellence</td>
<td>notes 16 to 49</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Ann Greenwood</td>
<td>Senior Medical Editor, National Institute for Health and Care Excellence</td>
<td>all notes</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Michele Hilton-Boon</td>
<td>Research Fellow, National Institute for Health and Care Excellence</td>
<td>notes 16 to 49</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Victoria Kelly</td>
<td>Technical Adviser, National Institute for Health and Care Excellence</td>
<td>notes 16 to 27</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Dr Frances Sutcliff</td>
<td>Assistant Director, National Institute for Health and Care Excellence</td>
<td>notes 16 to 27</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Sally Taylor</td>
<td>Public Involvement Adviser, National Institute for Health and Care Excellence</td>
<td>notes 1 to 24</td>
</tr>
<tr>
<td>Maroulla Whitely</td>
<td>Business Analyst, National Institute for Health and Care Excellence</td>
<td>all notes</td>
</tr>
</tbody>
</table>
Notes

Welcome

1. The Chair welcomed all members of the Committee and other attendees present to the meeting. The Chair reviewed the agenda and timescales for the meeting, which included the appraisals of cabozantinib and vandetanib for treating unresectable locally advanced or metastatic medullary thyroid cancer, tofacitinib for treating moderate to severe active rheumatoid arthritis after the failure of disease-modifying anti-rheumatic drugs, immunosuppressive therapy for kidney transplantation in adults (review of technology appraisal guidance 85) and immunosuppressive therapy for kidney transplantation in children and adolescents (review of technology appraisal guidance 99), and ixazomib citrate for treating relapsed or refractory multiple myeloma.

2. Apologies were received from Dr Matthew Bradley, Professor Simon Dixon, Professor Paul Ghaneh, Dr Peter Hall, Sumithra Maheswaran, Dr David Meads, Dr Paula Parvulescu, Ram Rees and William Turner.

Any other Business

3. None

Appraisal of cabozantinib and vandetanib for treating unresectable locally advanced or metastatic medullary thyroid cancer

Part 1 – Open session

4. The Chair welcomed the invited experts: Gareth Bowen, Dr Chris Carroll, Professor Peter Clark, Kate Farnell, Dr Jean Hamilton, Dr Mary Lei, Dr Kate Newbold, and Dr Paul Tappenden to the meeting and they introduced themselves to the Committee.

5. The Chair welcomed company representatives from Ipsen Ltd and SanofiGenyzme to the meeting.

6. The Chair asked all Committee members to declare any relevant interests

   6.1. Dr Graham Ash, Dr Aomesh Bhatt, Professor David Bowen, Dr Ian Davidson, Mrs Susan Dutton, Professor Rachel Elliott, Mrs Gillian Ellis, Dr Rebecca Harmston, Professor Gary McVeigh, Dr Malcolm Oswald, Professor Oluwafemi Oyebode, Professor Andrew Renehan and Dr Lindsay Smith all declared that they knew of no personal specific financial interest, personal non-specific financial interest, non-personal specific financial interest, non-personal non-specific financial interest, personal specific family interest or personal non-specific family interest for any of the technologies to be considered as part of the appraisal of cabozantinib and vandetanib for treating unresectable locally advanced or metastatic medullary thyroid cancer.

   6.2 Dr Brian Shine declared a personal non-specific financial interest since he had received sponsorship from one of the company consultees to attend educational meetings.

       6.2.1 It was agreed that this declaration would not prevent Dr Brian Shine from participating in this section of the meeting.
7. The Chair asked all NICE Staff to declare any relevant interests.

7.1. All declared that they knew of no personal specific financial interest, personal non-specific financial interest, non-personal specific financial interest, non-personal non-specific financial interest, personal specific family interest or personal non-specific family interest for any of the technologies to be considered as part of the appraisal of regorafenib for treating advanced gastrointestinal stromal tumours.

8. The Chair asked all other invited guests (/ERG and invited experts, not including observers) to declare their relevant interests.

8.1. Gareth Bowen, Dr Chris Carroll, Professor Peter Clark, Kate Farnell, Dr Jean Hamilton and Dr Paul Tappenden declared that they knew of no personal specific financial interest, personal non-specific financial interest, non-personal specific financial interest, non-personal non-specific financial interest, personal specific family interest or personal non-specific family interest for any of the technologies to be considered as part of the appraisal of regorafenib for treating advanced gastrointestinal stromal tumours.

8.2 Dr Mary Lei declared a personal non-specific financial interest since she had received sponsorship for conference attendance and input into advisory groups from some of the comparator companies.

8.2.1 It was agreed that this declaration would not prevent Dr Mary Lei from participating in this section of the meeting.

8.3 Dr Kate Newbold declared a personal non-specific financial interest since she had received funding for consultancy and teaching from one of company consultees and comparator companies.

8.3.1 It was agreed that this declaration would not prevent Dr Kate Newbold from participating in this section of the meeting.

9. The Chair introduced the lead team, Professor David Bowen, Dr Ian Davidson and Dr Rebecca Harmston, who gave presentations on the clinical effectiveness and cost effectiveness of regorafenib for treating advanced gastrointestinal stromal tumours.

10. The Chair asked the company representatives whether they wished to comment on any matters of factual accuracy.

11. The Chair explained that “representatives of the press and other members of the public be excluded from the remainder of this meeting having regard to the confidential nature of the business to be transacted, publicity on which would be prejudicial to the public interest” (Section 1(2) Public Bodies (Admission to Meetings) Act 1960)” and all public attendees left the meeting.

12. The Chair then thanked the experts and company representatives for their attendance, participation and contribution to the appraisal and they left the meeting.
Part 2 – Closed session

13. Discussion on confidential information continued. This information was supplied by the company.

14. The Committee continued to discuss the clinical and cost effectiveness of regorafenib for treating advanced gastrointestinal stromal tumours.

15. The Committee instructed the technical team to prepare the Appraisal Consultation Document (ACD) or Final Appraisal Determination (FAD) in line with their decisions.

Appraisal of tofacitinib for treating moderate to severe active rheumatoid arthritis after the failure of disease-modifying anti-rheumatic drugs

Part 1 – Open session

16. The Chair welcomed the invited experts: Ailsa Bosworth, Dr James Galloway, Jennie Jones, Dr Rajan Madhok, Dr Marrissa Martyn St James and Professor Matthew Stevenson to the meeting and they introduced themselves to the Committee.

17. The Chair welcomed company representatives from Pfizer Ltd to the meeting.

18. The Chair asked all Committee members to declare any relevant interests

18.1. Dr Graham Ash, Dr Aomesh Bhatt, Professor David Bowen, Dr Ian Davidson, Mrs Susan Dutton, Professor Rachel Elliott, Mrs Gillian Ells, Dr Rebecca Harmston, Professor Gary McVeigh, Dr Malcolm Oswald, Professor Oluwafemi Oyebode, Dr Brian Shine and Dr Lindsay Smith all declared that they knew of no personal specific financial interest, personal non-specific financial interest, non-personal specific financial interest, non-personal non-specific financial interest, personal specific family interest or personal non-specific family interest for any of the technologies to be considered as part of the appraisal of tofacitinib for treating moderate to severe active rheumatoid arthritis after the failure of disease-modifying anti-rheumatic drugs.

18.2. Professor Andrew Renehan declared a personal non-specific financial interest as he had received lecture honorarium from a comparator company on an unrelated topic.

18.2.1 It was agreed that this declaration would not prevent Professor Andrew Renehan from participating in this section of the meeting.

19. The Chair asked all NICE Staff to declare any relevant interests.

19.1. All declared that they knew of no personal specific financial interest, personal non-specific financial interest, non-personal specific financial interest, non-personal non-specific financial interest, personal specific family interest or personal non-specific family interest for any of the technologies to be considered as part of the appraisal of tofacitinib for treating moderate to severe active rheumatoid arthritis after the failure of disease-modifying anti-rheumatic drugs.
20. The Chair asked all other invited guests (assessment group/ERG and invited experts, not including observers) to declare their relevant interests.

20.1. Dr Marrissa Martyn St James, Dr Rajan Madhok and Professor Matthew Stevenson declared that they knew of no personal specific financial interest, personal non-specific financial interest, non-personal specific financial interest, non-personal non-specific financial interest, personal specific family interest or personal non-specific family interest for any of the technologies to be considered as part of the appraisal of tofacitinib for treating moderate to severe active rheumatoid arthritis after the failure of disease-modifying anti-rheumatic drugs.

20.2. Ailsa Bosworth declared a non-personal non-specific financial interest as NRAS had received educational grants from the company and comparator companies.

20.2.1. It was agreed that this declaration would not prevent Ailsa Bosworth from participating in this section of the meeting.

20.3. Dr James Galloway declared a personal non-specific financial interest as he had received honoraria for speaking at educational meetings from the company and comparator companies, conference sponsorship from a comparator company, and had attended advisory boards.

20.3.1. It was agreed that this declaration would not prevent Dr James Galloway from participating in this section of the meeting.

20.4. Jennie Jones declared a non-personal non-specific financial interest as NRAS had received educational grants from the company and comparator companies.

20.4.1. It was agreed that this declaration would not prevent Jennie Jones from participating in this section of the meeting.

21. The Chair introduced the lead team, Professor Rachel Elliott, Dr Malcolm Oswald and Professor Oluwafemi Oyebode who gave presentations on the clinical effectiveness and cost effectiveness of tofacitinib for treating moderate to severe active rheumatoid arthritis after the failure of disease-modifying anti-rheumatic drugs.

22. The Chair asked the company representatives whether they wished to comment on any matters of factual accuracy.

23. The Chair explained that “representatives of the press and other members of the public be excluded from the remainder of this meeting having regard to the confidential nature of the business to be transacted, publicity on which would be prejudicial to the public interest” (Section 1(2) Public Bodies (Admission to Meetings) Act 1960) and all public attendees left the meeting.

24. The Chair then thanked the experts and company representatives for their attendance, participation and contribution to the appraisal and they left the meeting.

Part 2 – Closed session

25. Discussion on confidential information continued. This information was supplied by the company.
26. The Committee continued to discuss the clinical and cost effectiveness of tofacitinib for treating moderate to severe active rheumatoid arthritis after the failure of disease-modifying anti-rheumatic drugs.

26.1. The committee decision was based on consensus.

27. The Committee instructed the technical team to prepare the Appraisal Consultation Document (ACD) or Final Appraisal Determination (FAD) in line with their decisions.

Appraisal of immunosuppressive therapy for kidney transplantation in adults (review of technology appraisal guidance 85) and Immunosuppressive therapy for kidney transplantation in children and adolescents (review of technology appraisal guidance 99)

Part 1 – Open session

28. The Chair welcomed company representatives from Astellas Pharma UK Ltd, Chiesi Ltd, Novartis Pharmaceuticals UK Ltd, Sandoz Ltd, and Teva UK Ltd

29. The Chair asked all Committee members to declare any relevant interests

29.1. Dr Graham Ash, Dr Aomesh Bhatt, Professor David Bowen, Dr Ian Davidson, Mrs Susan Dutton, Professor Rachel Elliott, Mrs Gillian Ellis, Dr Rebecca Harmston, Professor Gary McVeigh, Dr Malcolm Oswald, Professor Oluwafemi Oyebode, Dr Brian Shine and Dr Lindsay Smith all declared that they knew of no personal specific financial interest, personal non-specific financial interest, non-personal specific financial interest, non-personal non-specific financial interest, personal specific family interest or personal non-specific family interest for any of the technologies to be considered as part of the appraisal of immunosuppressive therapy for kidney transplantation in adults (review of technology appraisal guidance 85) and immunosuppressive therapy for kidney transplantation in children and adolescents (review of technology appraisal guidance 99)

29.2. Professor Andrew Renehan declared a personal non-specific financial interest as he had received lecture honoraria and research funding from a comparator company on an unrelated topic.  
29.2.1 It was agreed that this declaration would not prevent Professor Andrew Renehan from participating in this section of the meeting.

30. The Chair asked all NICE Staff to declare any relevant interests.

30.1. All declared that they knew of no personal specific financial interest, personal non-specific financial interest, non-personal specific financial interest, non-personal non-specific financial interest, personal specific family interest or personal non-specific family interest for any of the technologies to be considered as part of the appraisal of appraisal of immunosuppressive therapy for kidney transplantation in adults (review of technology appraisal guidance 85) and immunosuppressive therapy for kidney transplantation in children and adolescents (review of technology appraisal guidance 99)
31. The Chair introduced the key themes arising from the consultation responses to the Appraisal Consultation Document (ACD) received from consultees, commentators and through the NICE website.

32. The Chair asked the company representatives whether they wished to comment on any matters of factual accuracy.

33. The Chair explained that “representatives of the press and other members of the public be excluded from the remainder of this meeting having regard to the confidential nature of the business to be transacted, publicity on which would be prejudicial to the public interest” (Section 1(2) Public Bodies (Admission to Meetings) Act 1960)" and all public attendees left the meeting.

34. The Chair then thanked the experts and company representatives for their attendance, participation and contribution to the appraisal and they left the meeting.

Part 2 – Closed session

35. Discussion on confidential information continued. This information was supplied by the company.

36. The Committee continued to discuss the clinical and cost effectiveness of Appraisal of immunosuppressive therapy for kidney transplantation in adults (review of technology appraisal guidance 85) and immunosuppressive therapy for kidney transplantation in children and adolescents (review of technology appraisal guidance 99)

36.1. The committee decision was based on consensus.

37. The Committee instructed the technical team to prepare the Appraisal Consultation Document (ACD) or Final Appraisal Determination (FAD) in line with their decisions.

Appraisal of ixazomib citrate for treating relapsed or refractory multiple myeloma

Part 1 – Open session

38. The Chair welcomed the invited experts: Dr Xavier Armoiry, Professor Peter Clark and Dr Ewen Cummins to the meeting and they introduced themselves to the Committee.

39. The Chair welcomed company representatives from Takeda UK to the meeting.

40. The Chair asked all Committee members to declare any relevant interests

40.1. Dr Aomesh Bhatt, Professor David Bowen, Dr Ian Davidson, Mrs Susan Dutton, Professor Rachel Elliott, Mrs Gillian Ells, Dr Rebecca Harmston, Professor Gary McVeigh, Dr Malcolm Oswald, Professor Oluwafemi Oyebode, Dr Lindsay Smith and Dr Brian Shine all declared that they knew of no personal specific financial interest, personal non-specific financial interest, non-personal specific financial interest, non-personal non-specific financial interest, personal specific family interest or personal non-specific family interest for any of the technologies to be
considered as part of the appraisal of ixazomib citrate for treating relapsed or refractory multiple myeloma

40.2. Dr Graham Ash declared a non-personal non-specific non-financial interest as he was an investigator in a study in mental health sponsored by a comparator company.

40.2.1 It was agreed that this declaration would not prevent Dr Graham Ash from participating in this section of the meeting.

40.3 Professor Andrew Renehan declared a personal non-specific financial interest as he had received lecture honoraria from a comparator company on an unrelated topic.

40.3.1 It was agreed that this declaration would not prevent Professor Andrew Renehan from participating in this section of the meeting.

41. The Chair asked all NICE Staff to declare any relevant interests.

41.1. All declared that they knew of no personal specific financial interest, personal non-specific financial interest, non-personal specific financial interest, non-personal non-specific financial interest, personal specific family interest or personal non-specific family interest for any of the technologies to be considered as part of the appraisal of ixazomib citrate for treating relapsed or refractory multiple myeloma

42. The Chair asked all other invited guests (assessment group/ERG and invited experts, not including observers) to declare their relevant interests.

42.1. All declared that they knew of no personal specific financial interest, personal non-specific financial interest, non-personal specific financial interest, non-personal non-specific financial interest, personal specific family interest or personal non-specific family interest for any of the technologies to be considered as part of the appraisal of ixazomib citrate for treating relapsed or refractory multiple myeloma

43. The Chair introduced the key themes arising from the consultation responses to the Appraisal Consultation Document (ACD) received from consultees, commentators and through the NICE website.

44. The Chair asked the company representatives whether they wished to comment on any matters of factual accuracy.

45. The Chair explained that “representatives of the press and other members of the public be excluded from the remainder of this meeting having regard to the confidential nature of the business to be transacted, publicity on which would be prejudicial to the public interest” (Section 1(2) Public Bodies (Admission to Meetings) Act 1960)” and all public attendees left the meeting.

46. The Chair then thanked the experts and company representatives for their attendance, participation and contribution to the appraisal and they left the meeting.

Part 2 – Closed session
47. Discussion on confidential information continued. This information was supplied by the company.

48. The Committee continued to discuss the clinical and cost effectiveness of ixazomib citrate for treating relapsed or refractory multiple myeloma

48.1. The committee decision was based on consensus.

49. The Committee instructed the technical team to prepare the Appraisal Consultation Document (ACD) or Final Appraisal Determination (FAD) in line with their decisions.

Date, time and venue of the next meeting

50. Wednesday 30 August 2017, 10.00 – 17.00, at National Institute for Health and Care Excellence, Level 1A, City Tower, Piccadilly Plaza, Manchester M1 4BT.