

## Technology Appraisal Committee Meeting Committee D

**Minutes:** **Unconfirmed**

**Date and Time:** **Wednesday 26 July 2017, 10.00 – 17.30**

**Venue:** **Mercure Manchester Piccadilly Hotel**  
**Portland Street**  
**Manchester**

<b>Present:</b>	1. Professor Gary McVeigh (Chair) 2. Dr Lindsay Smith (Vice Chair) 3. Dr Graham Ash 4. Dr Aomesh Bhatt 5. Professor David Bowen 6. Dr Ian Davidson 7. Mrs Susan Dutton 8. Professor Rachel Elliott 9. Mrs Gillian Ells 10. Dr Rebecca Harmston 11. Dr Malcolm Oswald 12. Professor Oluwafemi Oyebode 13. Professor Andrew Renahan 14. Dr Brian Shine	Present for all notes Present for all notes
-----------------	---	---

### **In attendance:**

Dr Xavier Armoiry	Evidence Review Group representative, Warwick Evidence	Present for notes 38 to 46
Ailsa Bosworth	Patient Expert, nominated by National Rheumatoid Arthritis Society	Present for notes 16 to 24
Gareth Bowen	Patient Expert, nominated by Butterfly Thyroid Cancer Trust	Present for notes 1 to 12
Meindert Boysen	Programme Director, National Institute for Health and Care Excellence	Present for notes 13 to 49
Anna Brett	Technical Analyst, National Institute for Health and Clinical Excellence	Present for notes 1 to 15
Dr Chris Carroll	Assessment Group representative, School of Health and Related Research (ScHARR)	Present for notes 1 to 12

Professor Peter Clark	CDF Clinical Lead, NHS England	Present for notes 1 to 12 and for notes 38 to 46
Sophie Cooper	Technical Analyst, National Institute for Health and Clinical Excellence	Present for notes 38 to 49
Dr Ewen Cummins	Evidence Review Group representative, Warwick Evidence	Present for notes 38 to 46
Kate Farnell	Patient Expert, nominated by Butterfly Thyroid Cancer Trust	Present for notes 1 to 12
Dr James Galloway	Senior Lecturer in Rheumatology, Clinical Expert, nominated by Pfizer Ltd	Present for notes 16 to 24
Christian Griffiths	Technical Adviser, National Institute for Health and Clinical Excellence	Present for notes 28 to 37
Dr Jean Hamilton	Assessment Group representative, School of Health and Related Research (ScHARR)	Present for notes 1 to 12
Jennie Jones	Patient Expert, nominated by National Rheumatoid Arthritis Society	Present for notes 16 to 24
Helen Knight	Associate Director, National Institute for Health and Care Excellence	Present for all notes
Dr Mary Lei	Consultant Clinical Oncologist, Clinical Expert, nominated by Sanofi Genzyme	Present for notes 1 to 12
Dr Rajan Madhok	Consultant Rheumatologist, Clinical Expert, nominated by British Society for Rheumatology	Present for notes 16 to 24
Dr Marissa Martyn St James	Evidence Review Group representative, School of Health and Related	Present for notes 16 to 24

	Research (ScHARR)	
Fay McCracken	Technical Adviser National Institute for Health and Clinical Excellence	Present for notes 16 to 27
Kate Moore	Project Manager, National Institute for Health and Care Excellence	Present for all notes
Dr Kate Newbold	Consultant Clinical Oncologist, Clinical Expert, nominated by NCRI-ACP-RCP-RCR	Present for notes 1 to 12
Helen Powell	Technical Analyst, National Institute for Health and Clinical Excellence	Present for notes 28 to 37
Alex Sexton	Administrator, National Institute for Health and Care Excellence	Present for all notes
Raisa Sidhu	Technical Adviser, National Institute for Health and Clinical Excellence	Present for notes 38 to 49
Professor Matthew Stevenson	Evidence Review Group representative, School of Health and Related Research (ScHARR)	Present for notes 16 to 24
Dr Paul Tappenden	Assessment Group representative, School of Health and Related Research (ScHARR)	Present for notes 1 to 12
Nwamaka Umeweni	Technical Adviser, National Institute for Health and Clinical Excellence	Present for notes 1 to 15
Aminata Thiam	Technical Analyst, National Institute for Health and Clinical Excellence	Present for notes 16 to 27
Ian Watson	Technical Analyst, National Institute for Health and Clinical Excellence	Present for notes 28 to 37

**Non-public observers:**

Henry Edwards	Technical Adviser, National Institute for Health and Care Excellence	Present for notes 38 to 50
Alex Filby	Technical Adviser, National Institute for Health and Care Excellence	Present for notes 16 to 49
Ann Greenwood	Senior Medical Editor, National Institute for Health and Care Excellence	Present for all notes
Michele Hilton-Boon	Research Fellow, National Institute for Health and Care Excellence	Present for notes 16 to 49
Victoria Kelly	Technical Adviser, National Institute for Health and Care Excellence	Present for notes 16 to 27
Dr Frances Sutcliff	Assistant Director, National Institute for Health and Care Excellence	Present for notes 16 to 27
Sally Taylor	Public Involvement Adviser, National Institute for Health and Care Excellence	Present for notes 1 to 24
Maroulla Whately	Business Analyst, National Institute for Health and Care Excellence	Present for all notes

## Notes

### Welcome

1. The Chair welcomed all members of the Committee and other attendees present to the meeting. The Chair reviewed the agenda and timescales for the meeting, which included the appraisals of cabozantinib and vandetanib for treating unresectable locally advanced or metastatic medullary thyroid cancer, tofacitinib for treating moderate to severe active rheumatoid arthritis after the failure of disease-modifying anti-rheumatic drugs, immunosuppressive therapy for kidney transplantation in adults (review of technology appraisal guidance 85) and immunosuppressive therapy for kidney transplantation in children and adolescents (review of technology appraisal guidance 99), and ixazomib citrate for treating relapsed or refractory multiple myeloma.
2. Apologies were received from Dr Matthew Bradley, Professor Simon Dixon, Professor Paul Ghaneh, Dr Peter Hall, Sumithra Maheswaran, Dr David Meads, Dr Paula Parvulescu, Ram Rees and William Turner.

### Any other Business

3. None

### **Appraisal of cabozantinib and vandetanib for treating unresectable locally advanced or metastatic medullary thyroid cancer**

#### **Part 1 – Open session**

4. The Chair welcomed the invited experts: Gareth Bowen, Dr Chris Carroll, Professor Peter Clark, Kate Farnell, Dr Jean Hamilton, Dr Mary Lei, Dr Kate Newbold, and Dr Paul Tappenden to the meeting and they introduced themselves to the Committee.
5. The Chair welcomed company representatives from Ipsen Ltd and SanofiGenzyme to the meeting.
6. The Chair asked all Committee members to declare any relevant interests
  - 6.1. Dr Graham Ash, Dr Aomesh Bhatt, Professor David Bowen, Dr Ian Davidson, Mrs Susan Dutton, Professor Rachel Elliott, Mrs Gillian Ells, Dr Rebecca Harmston, Professor Gary McVeigh, Dr Malcolm Oswald, Professor Oluwafemi Oyebode, Professor Andrew Renahan and Dr Lindsay Smith all declared that they knew of no personal specific financial interest, personal non-specific financial interest, non-personal specific financial interest, non-personal non-specific financial interest, personal specific family interest or personal non-specific family interest for any of the technologies to be considered as part of the appraisal of cabozantinib and vandetanib for treating unresectable locally advanced or metastatic medullary thyroid cancer.
  - 6.2. Dr Brian Shine declared a personal non-specific financial interest since he had received sponsorship from one of the company consultees to attend educational meetings.
    - 6.2.1. It was agreed that this declaration would not prevent Dr Brian Shine from participating in this section of the meeting.

7. The Chair asked all NICE Staff to declare any relevant interests.
  - 7.1. All declared that they knew of no personal specific financial interest, personal non-specific financial interest, non-personal specific financial interest, non-personal non-specific financial interest, personal specific family interest or personal non-specific family interest for any of the technologies to be considered as part of the appraisal of regorafenib for treating advanced gastrointestinal stromal tumours.
8. The Chair asked all other invited guests (/ERG and invited experts, not including observers) to declare their relevant interests.
  - 8.1. Gareth Bowen, Dr Chris Carroll, Professor Peter Clark, Kate Farnell, Dr Jean Hamilton and Dr Paul Tappenden declared that they knew of no personal specific financial interest, personal non-specific financial interest, non-personal specific financial interest, non-personal non-specific financial interest, personal specific family interest or personal non-specific family interest for any of the technologies to be considered as part of the appraisal of regorafenib for treating advanced gastrointestinal stromal tumours.
  - 8.2. Dr Mary Lei declared a personal non-specific financial interest since she had received sponsorship for conference attendance and input into advisory groups from some of the comparator companies.
    - 8.2.1. It was agreed that this declaration would not prevent Dr Mary Lei from participating in this section of the meeting.
  - 8.3. Dr Kate Newbold declared a personal non-specific financial interest since she had received funding for consultancy and teaching from one of company consultees and comparator companies.
    - 8.3.1. It was agreed that this declaration would not prevent Dr Kate Newbold from participating in this section of the meeting.
9. The Chair introduced the lead team, Professor David Bowen, Dr Ian Davidson and Dr Rebecca Harmston, who gave presentations on the clinical effectiveness and cost effectiveness of regorafenib for treating advanced gastrointestinal stromal tumours.
10. The Chair asked the company representatives whether they wished to comment on any matters of factual accuracy.
11. The Chair explained that "representatives of the press and other members of the public be excluded from the remainder of this meeting having regard to the confidential nature of the business to be transacted, publicity on which would be prejudicial to the public interest" (Section 1(2) Public Bodies (Admission to Meetings) Act 1960)" and all public attendees left the meeting.
12. The Chair then thanked the experts and company representatives for their attendance, participation and contribution to the appraisal and they left the meeting.

## **Part 2 – Closed session**

13. Discussion on confidential information continued. This information was supplied by the company.
14. The Committee continued to discuss the clinical and cost effectiveness of regorafenib for treating advanced gastrointestinal stromal tumours.
15. The Committee instructed the technical team to prepare the Appraisal Consultation Document (ACD) or Final Appraisal Determination (FAD) in line with their decisions.

## **Appraisal of tofacitinib for treating moderate to severe active rheumatoid arthritis after the failure of disease-modifying anti-rheumatic drugs**

### **Part 1 – Open session**

16. The Chair welcomed the invited experts: Ailsa Bosworth, Dr James Galloway, Jennie Jones, Dr Rajan Madhok, Dr Marissa Martyn St James and Professor Matthew Stevenson to the meeting and they introduced themselves to the Committee.
17. The Chair welcomed company representatives from Pfizer Ltd to the meeting.
18. The Chair asked all Committee members to declare any relevant interests
  - 18.1. Dr Graham Ash, Dr Aomesh Bhatt, Professor David Bowen, Dr Ian Davidson, Mrs Susan Dutton, Professor Rachel Elliott, Mrs Gillian Ells, Dr Rebecca Harmston, Professor Gary McVeigh, Dr Malcolm Oswald, Professor Oluwafemi Oyebode, Dr Brian Shine and Dr Lindsay Smith all declared that they knew of no personal specific financial interest, personal non-specific financial interest, non-personal specific financial interest, non-personal non-specific financial interest, personal specific family interest or personal non-specific family interest for any of the technologies to be considered as part of the appraisal of tofacitinib for treating moderate to severe active rheumatoid arthritis after the failure of disease-modifying anti-rheumatic drugs.
  - 18.2. Professor Andrew Renahan declared a personal non-specific financial interest as he had received lecture honorarium from a comparator company on an unrelated topic.
    - 18.2.1. It was agreed that this declaration would not prevent Professor Andrew Renahan from participating in this section of the meeting.
19. The Chair asked all NICE Staff to declare any relevant interests.
  - 19.1. All declared that they knew of no personal specific financial interest, personal non-specific financial interest, non-personal specific financial interest, non-personal non-specific financial interest, personal specific family interest or personal non-specific family interest for any of the technologies to be considered as part of the appraisal of tofacitinib for treating moderate to severe active rheumatoid arthritis after the failure of disease-modifying anti-rheumatic drugs.

20. The Chair asked all other invited guests (assessment group/ERG and invited experts, not including observers) to declare their relevant interests.
  - 20.1. Dr Marrissa Martyn St James, Dr Rajan Madhok and Professor Matthew Stevenson declared that they knew of no personal specific financial interest, personal non-specific financial interest, non-personal specific financial interest, non-personal non-specific financial interest, personal specific family interest or personal non-specific family interest for any of the technologies to be considered as part of the appraisal of tofacitinib for treating moderate to severe active rheumatoid arthritis after the failure of disease-modifying anti-rheumatic drugs.
  - 20.2. Ailsa Bosworth declared a non-personal non-specific financial interest as NRAS had received educational grants from the company and comparator companies.
    - 20.2.1. It was agreed that this declaration would not prevent Ailsa Bosworth from participating in this section of the meeting
  - 20.3. Dr James Galloway declared a personal non specific financial interest as he had received honoraria for speaking at educational meetings from the company and comparator companies, conference sponsorship from a comparator company, and had attended advisory boards.
    - 20.3.1. It was agreed that this declaration would not prevent Dr James Galloway from participating in this section of the meeting
  - 20.4. Jennie Jones declared a non-personal non-specific financial interest as NRAS had received educational grants from the company and comparator companies.
    - 20.4.1. It was agreed that this declaration would not prevent Jennie Jones from participating in this section of the meeting
21. The Chair introduced the lead team, Professor Rachel Elliott, Dr Malcolm Oswald and Professor Oluwafemi Oyebode who gave presentations on the clinical effectiveness and cost effectiveness of tofacitinib for treating moderate to severe active rheumatoid arthritis after the failure of disease-modifying anti-rheumatic drugs.
22. The Chair asked the company representatives whether they wished to comment on any matters of factual accuracy.
23. The Chair explained that "representatives of the press and other members of the public be excluded from the remainder of this meeting having regard to the confidential nature of the business to be transacted, publicity on which would be prejudicial to the public interest" (Section 1(2) Public Bodies (Admission to Meetings) Act 1960)" and all public attendees left the meeting.
24. The Chair then thanked the experts and company representatives for their attendance, participation and contribution to the appraisal and they left the meeting.

## **Part 2 – Closed session**

25. Discussion on confidential information continued. This information was supplied by the company.

26. The Committee continued to discuss the clinical and cost effectiveness of tofacitinib for treating moderate to severe active rheumatoid arthritis after the failure of disease-modifying anti-rheumatic drugs.
  - 26.1. The committee decision was based on consensus.
27. The Committee instructed the technical team to prepare the Appraisal Consultation Document (ACD) or Final Appraisal Determination (FAD) in line with their decisions.

**Appraisal of immunosuppressive therapy for kidney transplantation in adults (review of technology appraisal guidance 85) and Immunosuppressive therapy for kidney transplantation in children and adolescents (review of technology appraisal guidance 99)**

**Part 1 – Open session**

28. The Chair welcomed company representatives from Astellas Pharma UK Ltd, Chiesi Ltd, Novartis Pharmaceuticals UK Ltd, Sandoz Ltd, and Teva UK Ltd
29. The Chair asked all Committee members to declare any relevant interests
  - 29.1. Dr Graham Ash, Dr Aomesh Bhatt, Professor David Bowen, Dr Ian Davidson, Mrs Susan Dutton, Professor Rachel Elliott, Mrs Gillian Ells, Dr Rebecca Harmston, Professor Gary McVeigh, Dr Malcolm Oswald, Professor Oluwafemi Oyebode, Dr Brian Shine and Dr Lindsay Smith all declared that they knew of no personal specific financial interest, personal non-specific financial interest, non-personal specific financial interest, non-personal non-specific financial interest, personal specific family interest or personal non-specific family interest for any of the technologies to be considered as part of the appraisal of immunosuppressive therapy for kidney transplantation in adults (review of technology appraisal guidance 85) and immunosuppressive therapy for kidney transplantation in children and adolescents (review of technology appraisal guidance 99)
  - 29.2. Professor Andrew Renahan declared a personal non-specific financial interest as he had received lecture honoraria and research funding from a comparator company on an unrelated topic.
    - 29.2.1. It was agreed that this declaration would not prevent Professor Andrew Renahan from participating in this section of the meeting.
30. The Chair asked all NICE Staff to declare any relevant interests.
  - 30.1. All declared that they knew of no personal specific financial interest, personal non-specific financial interest, non-personal specific financial interest, non-personal non-specific financial interest, personal specific family interest or personal non-specific family interest for any of the technologies to be considered as part of the appraisal of appraisal of immunosuppressive therapy for kidney transplantation in adults (review of technology appraisal guidance 85) and immunosuppressive therapy for kidney transplantation in children and adolescents (review of technology appraisal guidance 99)

31. The Chair introduced the key themes arising from the consultation responses to the Appraisal Consultation Document (ACD) received from consultees, commentators and through the NICE website.
32. The Chair asked the company representatives whether they wished to comment on any matters of factual accuracy.
33. The Chair explained that "representatives of the press and other members of the public be excluded from the remainder of this meeting having regard to the confidential nature of the business to be transacted, publicity on which would be prejudicial to the public interest" (Section 1(2) Public Bodies (Admission to Meetings) Act 1960)" and all public attendees left the meeting.
34. The Chair then thanked the experts and company representatives for their attendance, participation and contribution to the appraisal and they left the meeting.

## **Part 2 – Closed session**

35. Discussion on confidential information continued. This information was supplied by the company.
36. The Committee continued to discuss the clinical and cost effectiveness of Appraisal of immunosuppressive therapy for kidney transplantation in adults (review of technology appraisal guidance 85) and immunosuppressive therapy for kidney transplantation in children and adolescents (review of technology appraisal guidance 99)
  - 36.1. The committee decision was based on consensus.
37. The Committee instructed the technical team to prepare the Appraisal Consultation Document (ACD) or Final Appraisal Determination (FAD) in line with their decisions.

## **Appraisal of ixazomib citrate for treating relapsed or refractory multiple myeloma**

### **Part 1 – Open session**

38. The Chair welcomed the invited experts: Dr Xavier Armoiry, Professor Peter Clark and Dr Ewen Cummins to the meeting and they introduced themselves to the Committee.
39. The Chair welcomed company representatives from Takeda UK to the meeting.
40. The Chair asked all Committee members to declare any relevant interests
  - 40.1. Dr Aomesh Bhatt, Professor David Bowen, Dr Ian Davidson, Mrs Susan Dutton, Professor Rachel Elliott, Mrs Gillian Ells, Dr Rebecca Harmston, Professor Gary McVeigh, Dr Malcolm Oswald, Professor Oluwafemi Oyebode, Dr Lindsay Smith and Dr Brian Shine all declared that they knew of no personal specific financial interest, personal non-specific financial interest, non-personal specific financial interest, non-personal non-specific financial interest, personal specific family interest or personal non-specific family interest for any of the technologies to be

considered as part of the appraisal of ixazomib citrate for treating relapsed or refractory multiple myeloma

40.2. Dr Graham Ash declared a non-personal non-specific non-financial interest as he was an investigator in a study in mental health sponsored by a comparator company.  
40.2.1 It was agreed that this declaration would not prevent Dr Graham Ash from participating in this section of the meeting.

40.3 Professor Andrew Renahan declared a personal non-specific financial interest as he had received lecture honoraria from a comparator company on an unrelated topic.  
40.3.1 It was agreed that this declaration would not prevent Professor Andrew Renahan from participating in this section of the meeting.

41. The Chair asked all NICE Staff to declare any relevant interests.

41.1. All declared that they knew of no personal specific financial interest, personal non-specific financial interest, non-personal specific financial interest, non-personal non-specific financial interest, personal specific family interest or personal non-specific family interest for any of the technologies to be considered as part of the appraisal of ixazomib citrate for treating relapsed or refractory multiple myeloma

42. The Chair asked all other invited guests (assessment group/ERG and invited experts, not including observers) to declare their relevant interests.

42.1. All declared that they knew of no personal specific financial interest, personal non-specific financial interest, non-personal specific financial interest, non-personal non-specific financial interest, personal specific family interest or personal non-specific family interest for any of the technologies to be considered as part of the appraisal of ixazomib citrate for treating relapsed or refractory multiple myeloma

43. The Chair introduced the key themes arising from the consultation responses to the Appraisal Consultation Document (ACD) received from consultees, commentators and through the NICE website.

44. The Chair asked the company representatives whether they wished to comment on any matters of factual accuracy.

45. The Chair explained that "representatives of the press and other members of the public be excluded from the remainder of this meeting having regard to the confidential nature of the business to be transacted, publicity on which would be prejudicial to the public interest" (Section 1(2) Public Bodies (Admission to Meetings) Act 1960)" and all public attendees left the meeting.

46. The Chair then thanked the experts and company representatives for their attendance, participation and contribution to the appraisal and they left the meeting.

## **Part 2 – Closed session**

47. Discussion on confidential information continued. This information was supplied by the company.
48. The Committee continued to discuss the clinical and cost effectiveness of ixazomib citrate for treating relapsed or refractory multiple myeloma
  - 48.1. The committee decision was based on consensus.
49. The Committee instructed the technical team to prepare the Appraisal Consultation Document (ACD) or Final Appraisal Determination (FAD) in line with their decisions.

**Date, time and venue of the next meeting**

50. Wednesday 30 August 2017, 10.00 – 17.00, at National Institute for Health and Care Excellence, Level 1A, City Tower, Piccadilly Plaza, Manchester M1 4BT.