

APPENDIX 15: GRADE EVIDENCE PROFILE TABLES

| | | |
|-------|--|----|
| 1.1 | <i>Service delivery models</i> | 2 |
| 1.1.1 | GRADE profile for randomised controlled trials comparing integrated service models with standard care | 2 |
| 1.1.2 | GRADE profile for randomised controlled trials comparing integrated assertive community treatment with integrated case management | 4 |
| 1.1.3 | GRADE profile for randomised controlled trials comparing staffed accommodation with standard care | 7 |
| 1.2 | <i>Psychological and psychosocial interventions</i> | 9 |
| 1.2.1 | GRADE profile for randomised controlled trials comparing cognitive behavioural therapy with standard care | 9 |
| 1.2.2 | GRADE profile for randomised controlled trials comparing motivational interviewing with standard care | 11 |
| 1.2.3 | GRADE profile for randomised controlled trials comparing cognitive behavioural therapy plus motivational interviewing with standard care | 12 |
| 1.2.4 | GRADE profile for randomised controlled trials comparing group psychotherapy with standard care | 15 |
| 1.2.5 | GRADE profile for randomised controlled trials comparing contingency management with standard care | 17 |

1.1 Service delivery models

1.1.1 GRADE profile for randomised controlled trials comparing integrated service models with standard care

| Quality assessment | | | | | | | Summary of findings | | | | Quality | Importance |
|---|-------------------|------------------------|--------------------------|-------------------------|-----------------------------|----------------------|---------------------------|---------------|-------------------|---|----------|------------|
| No. of studies | Design | Limitations | Inconsistency | Indirectness | Imprecision | Other considerations | No. of patients | | Effect | | | |
| | | | | | | | Integrated service models | Standard care | Relative (95% CI) | Absolute | | |
| Substance use: 1. Substance-use rating (high = poor) - by 6 months (better indicated by lower values) | | | | | | | | | | | | |
| 1 | Randomised trials | No serious limitations | No serious inconsistency | No serious indirectness | Very serious ^{1,2} | None | 46 | 49 | - | SMD 0.14 higher (0.26 lower to 0.54 higher) | ⊕⊕○○ LOW | CRITICAL |
| Substance use: 1. Substance-use rating (high = poor) - by 12 months (better indicated by lower values) | | | | | | | | | | | | |
| 1 | Randomised trials | No serious limitations | No serious inconsistency | No serious indirectness | Very serious ^{1,2} | None | 46 | 49 | - | SMD 0.18 higher (0.22 lower to 0.58 higher) | ⊕⊕○○ LOW | CRITICAL |
| Substance use: 1. Substance-use rating (high = poor) - by 18 months (better indicated by lower values) | | | | | | | | | | | | |
| 1 | Randomised trials | No serious limitations | No serious inconsistency | No serious indirectness | Very serious ^{1,2} | None | 46 | 49 | - | SMD 0.15 lower (0.55 lower to 0.25 higher) | ⊕⊕○○ LOW | CRITICAL |
| Substance use: 1. Substance-use rating (high = poor) - by 24 months (better indicated by lower values) | | | | | | | | | | | | |
| 1 | Randomised trials | No serious limitations | No serious inconsistency | No serious indirectness | Very serious ^{1,2} | None | 46 | 49 | - | SMD 0.05 higher (0.35 lower to 0.45 higher) | ⊕⊕○○ LOW | CRITICAL |
| Substance use: 2. Days used substances - by 6 months (better indicated by lower values) | | | | | | | | | | | | |
| 1 | Randomised trials | No serious limitations | No serious inconsistency | No serious indirectness | Very serious ^{1,2} | None | 46 | 49 | - | SMD 0.08 higher (0.33 lower to 0.48 higher) | ⊕⊕○○ LOW | CRITICAL |
| Substance use: 2. Days used substances - by 12 months (better indicated by lower values) | | | | | | | | | | | | |
| 1 | Randomised trials | No serious limitations | No serious inconsistency | No serious indirectness | Very serious ^{1,2} | None | 46 | 49 | - | SMD 0.11 higher (0.3 lower to 0.51 higher) | ⊕⊕○○ LOW | CRITICAL |
| Substance use: 2. Days used substances - by 18 months (better indicated by lower values) | | | | | | | | | | | | |
| 1 | Randomised trials | No serious limitations | No serious inconsistency | No serious indirectness | Very serious ^{1,2} | None | 46 | 49 | - | SMD 0.09 higher (0.31 lower to 0.49 higher) | ⊕⊕○○ LOW | CRITICAL |
| Substance use: 2. Days used substances - by 24 months (better indicated by lower values) | | | | | | | | | | | | |
| 1 | Randomised trials | No serious limitations | No serious inconsistency | No serious indirectness | Very serious ^{1,2} | None | 46 | 49 | - | SMD 0.13 higher (0.28 lower to 0.53 higher) | ⊕⊕○○ LOW | CRITICAL |

| Service use: 1. Days in stable community residences (not in hospital) – by 6 months (better indicated by lower values) | | | | | | | | | | | | |
|--|-------------------|------------------------|--------------------------|-------------------------|-----------------------------|------|----|----|---|--|-----------------|----------|
| 1 | Randomised trials | No serious limitations | No serious inconsistency | No serious indirectness | Very serious ^{1,2} | None | 46 | 49 | - | MD 3.17 higher (0.52 lower to 6.86 higher) | ⊕⊕⊕ LOW | CRITICAL |
| Service use: 1. Days in stable community residences (not in hospital) – by 12 months (better indicated by lower values) | | | | | | | | | | | | |
| 1 | Randomised trials | No serious limitations | No serious inconsistency | No serious indirectness | Very serious ^{1,2} | None | 46 | 49 | - | MD 2.84 higher (2.07 lower to 7.75 higher) | ⊕⊕⊕ LOW | CRITICAL |
| Service use: 1. Days in stable community residences (not in hospital) – by 18 months (better indicated by lower values) | | | | | | | | | | | | |
| 1 | Randomised trials | No serious limitations | No serious inconsistency | No serious indirectness | Serious ¹ | None | 46 | 49 | - | MD 6.46 higher (1.36 to 11.56 higher) | ⊕⊕⊕ MODERATE | CRITICAL |
| Service use: 1. Days in stable community residences (not in hospital) – by 24 months (better indicated by lower values) | | | | | | | | | | | | |
| 1 | Randomised trials | No serious limitations | No serious inconsistency | No serious indirectness | Serious ¹ | None | 46 | 49 | - | MD 5.7 higher (0.59 to 10.81 higher) | ⊕⊕⊕ MODERATE | CRITICAL |

¹Optimal information size (for dichotomous outcomes, OIS = 300 events; for continuous outcomes, OIS = 400 participants) not met.

²CI includes both (1) no effect and (2) appreciable benefit or appreciable harm.

1.1.2 GRADE profile for randomised controlled trials comparing integrated assertive community treatment with integrated case management

| Quality assessment | | | | | | | Summary of findings | | | | Importance | |
|---|-------------------|------------------------|--------------------------|-------------------------|-----------------------------|----------------------|---------------------|--------------------------|------------------------|--|------------------|----------|
| No. of studies | Design | Limitations | Inconsistency | Indirectness | Imprecision | Other considerations | No. of patients | | Effect | | | Quality |
| | | | | | | | Integrated act | Clinical case management | Relative (95% CI) | Absolute | | |
| Death - by 36 months | | | | | | | | | | | | |
| 2 | Randomised trials | No serious limitations | No serious inconsistency | No serious indirectness | Very serious ^{1,2} | None | 7/208 (3.4%) | 6/213 (2.8%) | RR 1.18 (0.39 to 3.57) | 5 more per 1000 (from 17 fewer to 72 more) | ⊕⊕○○ LOW | CRITICAL |
| Substance use: 1. Not in remission - by 36 months - alcohol | | | | | | | | | | | | |
| 1 | Randomised trials | No serious limitations | No serious inconsistency | No serious indirectness | Very serious ^{1,2} | None | 43/75 (57.3%) | 34/68 (50%) | RR 1.15 (0.84 to 1.56) | 75 more per 1000 (from 80 fewer to 280 more) | ⊕⊕○○ LOW | CRITICAL |
| Substance use: 1. Not in remission - by 36 months - drugs | | | | | | | | | | | | |
| 1 | Randomised trials | No serious limitations | No serious inconsistency | No serious indirectness | Very serious ^{1,2} | None | 26/45 (57.8%) | 26/40 (65%) | RR 0.89 (0.63 to 1.25) | 72 fewer per 1000 (from 240 fewer to 162 more) | ⊕⊕○○ LOW | CRITICAL |
| Substance use: 2. Substance abuse (SATS, low = poor) (skewed data) - by 6 months (better indicated by lower values) | | | | | | | | | | | | |
| 2 | Randomised trials | No serious limitations | No serious inconsistency | No serious indirectness | Serious ¹ | None | 198 | 181 | - | SMD 0.03 higher (0.17 lower to 0.23 higher) | ⊕⊕⊕○ MODERATE | CRITICAL |
| Substance use: 2. Substance abuse (SATS, low = poor) (skewed data) - by 12 months (better indicated by lower values) | | | | | | | | | | | | |
| 2 | Randomised trials | No serious limitations | No serious inconsistency | No serious indirectness | Serious ¹ | None | 192 | 182 | - | SMD 0.08 higher (0.23 lower to 0.39 higher) | ⊕⊕⊕○ MODERATE | CRITICAL |
| Substance use: 2. Substance abuse (SATS, low = poor) (skewed data) - by 18 months (better indicated by lower values) | | | | | | | | | | | | |
| 2 | Randomised trials | No serious limitations | No serious inconsistency | No serious indirectness | Serious ¹ | None | 193 | 182 | - | SMD 0.02 lower (0.22 lower to 0.19 higher) | ⊕⊕⊕○ MODERATE | CRITICAL |
| Substance use: 2. Substance abuse (SATS, low = poor) (skewed data) - by 24 months (better indicated by lower values) | | | | | | | | | | | | |
| 2 | Randomised trials | No serious limitations | No serious inconsistency | No serious indirectness | Serious ¹ | None | 184 | 181 | - | SMD 0.11 higher (0.14 lower to 0.37 higher) | ⊕⊕⊕○ MODERATE | CRITICAL |

| | | | | | | | | | | | | |
|--|-------------------|------------------------|--------------------------|-------------------------|-----------------------------|------|-----|-----|---|---|------------------|----------|
| Substance use: 2. Substance abuse (SATS, low = poor) (skewed data) – by 30 months (better indicated by lower values) | | | | | | | | | | | | |
| 2 | Randomised trials | No serious limitations | No serious inconsistency | No serious indirectness | Serious ¹ | None | 185 | 173 | - | SMD 0.11 higher (0.1 lower to 0.31 higher) | ⊕⊕⊕O MODERATE | CRITICAL |
| Substance use: 2. Substance abuse (SATS, low = poor) (skewed data) – by 36 months (better indicated by lower values) | | | | | | | | | | | | |
| 2 | Randomised trials | No serious limitations | No serious inconsistency | No serious indirectness | Serious ¹ | None | 183 | 177 | - | SMD 0.05 higher (0.15 lower to 0.26 higher) | ⊕⊕⊕O MODERATE | CRITICAL |
| Service use: 1. Days in stable community residences (not in hospital) – by 12 months (better indicated by lower values) | | | | | | | | | | | | |
| 2 | Randomised trials | No serious limitations | No serious inconsistency | No serious indirectness | Very serious ^{1,2} | None | 197 | 181 | - | MD 10 lower (38.61 lower to 18.6 higher) | ⊕⊕OO LOW | CRITICAL |
| Service use: 1. Days in stable community residences (not in hospital) – by 24 months (better indicated by lower values) | | | | | | | | | | | | |
| 2 | Randomised trials | No serious limitations | No serious inconsistency | No serious indirectness | Very serious ^{1,2} | None | 194 | 183 | - | MD 8.54 higher (4.46 lower to 21.55 higher) | ⊕⊕OO LOW | CRITICAL |
| Service use: 1. Days in stable community residences (not in hospital) – by 36 months (better indicated by lower values) | | | | | | | | | | | | |
| 2 | Randomised trials | No serious limitations | No serious inconsistency | No serious indirectness | Very serious ^{1,2} | None | 186 | 178 | - | MD 5.17 higher (9.2 lower to 19.55 higher) | ⊕⊕OO LOW | CRITICAL |
| Functioning: 1. Average general score (GAS, low = poor) – by 6 months (better indicated by lower values) | | | | | | | | | | | | |
| 1 | Randomised trials | No serious limitations | No serious inconsistency | No serious indirectness | Very serious ^{1,2} | None | 87 | 75 | - | SMD 0.13 higher (0.18 lower to 0.43 higher) | ⊕⊕OO LOW | CRITICAL |
| Functioning: 1. Average general score (GAS, low = poor) – by 12 months (better indicated by lower values) | | | | | | | | | | | | |
| 1 | Randomised trials | No serious limitations | No serious inconsistency | No serious indirectness | Very serious ^{1,2} | None | 89 | 82 | - | SMD 0.07 higher (0.23 lower to 0.38 higher) | ⊕⊕OO LOW | CRITICAL |
| Functioning: 1. Average general score (GAS, low = poor) – by 18 months (better indicated by lower values) | | | | | | | | | | | | |
| 1 | Randomised trials | No serious limitations | No serious inconsistency | No serious indirectness | Very serious ^{1,2} | None | 90 | 86 | - | SMD 0.11 higher (0.18 lower to 0.41 higher) | ⊕⊕OO LOW | CRITICAL |
| Functioning: 1. Average general score (GAS, low = poor) – by 24 months (better indicated by lower values) | | | | | | | | | | | | |
| 1 | Randomised trials | No serious limitations | No serious inconsistency | No serious indirectness | Very serious ^{1,2} | None | 81 | 85 | - | SMD 0.18 higher (0.13 lower to 0.48 higher) | ⊕⊕OO LOW | CRITICAL |
| Functioning: 1. Average general score (GAS, low = poor) – by 30 months (better indicated by lower values) | | | | | | | | | | | | |
| 1 | Randomised trials | No serious limitations | No serious inconsistency | No serious indirectness | Very serious ^{1,2} | None | 84 | 80 | - | SMD 0.06 lower (0.37 lower to 0.24 higher) | ⊕⊕OO LOW | CRITICAL |

| Functioning: 1. Average general score (GAS, low = poor) - by 36 months (better indicated by lower values) | | | | | | | | | | | | |
|--|-------------------|------------------------|--------------------------|-------------------------|-----------------------------|------|-----|-----|---|---|----------|----------|
| 1 | Randomised trials | No serious limitations | No serious inconsistency | No serious indirectness | Very serious ^{1,2} | None | 85 | 85 | - | SMD 0.04 higher (0.26 lower to 0.34 higher) | ⊕⊕⊕⊕ LOW | CRITICAL |
| Satisfaction: Average general score (QOLI, low = poor) - by 6 months (better indicated by lower values) | | | | | | | | | | | | |
| 2 | Randomised trials | No serious limitations | No serious inconsistency | No serious indirectness | Very serious ^{1,2} | None | 189 | 172 | - | SMD 0.07 lower (0.28 lower to 0.14 higher) | ⊕⊕⊕⊕ LOW | CRITICAL |
| Satisfaction: Average general score (QOLI, low = poor) - by 12 months (better indicated by lower values) | | | | | | | | | | | | |
| 2 | Randomised trials | No serious limitations | No serious inconsistency | No serious indirectness | Very serious ^{1,2} | None | 193 | 179 | - | SMD 0.01 higher (0.19 lower to 0.22 higher) | ⊕⊕⊕⊕ LOW | CRITICAL |
| Satisfaction: Average general score (QOLI, low = poor) - by 18 months (better indicated by lower values) | | | | | | | | | | | | |
| 2 | Randomised trials | No serious limitations | No serious inconsistency | No serious indirectness | Very serious ^{1,2} | None | 194 | 183 | - | SMD 0.06 higher (0.17 lower to 0.29 higher) | ⊕⊕⊕⊕ LOW | CRITICAL |
| Satisfaction: Average general score (QOLI, low = poor) - by 24 months (better indicated by lower values) | | | | | | | | | | | | |
| 2 | Randomised trials | No serious limitations | No serious inconsistency | No serious indirectness | Very serious ^{1,2} | None | 186 | 184 | - | SMD 0.01 higher (0.2 lower to 0.23 higher) | ⊕⊕⊕⊕ LOW | CRITICAL |
| Satisfaction: Average general score (QOLI, low = poor) - by 30 months (better indicated by lower values) | | | | | | | | | | | | |
| 2 | Randomised trials | No serious limitations | No serious inconsistency | No serious indirectness | Very serious ^{1,2} | None | 188 | 178 | - | SMD 0.02 higher (0.19 lower to 0.22 higher) | ⊕⊕⊕⊕ LOW | CRITICAL |
| Satisfaction: Average general score (QOLI, low = poor) - by 36 months (better indicated by lower values) | | | | | | | | | | | | |
| 2 | Randomised trials | No serious limitations | No serious inconsistency | No serious indirectness | Very serious ^{1,2} | None | 190 | 183 | - | SMD 0.07 higher (0.13 lower to 0.27 higher) | ⊕⊕⊕⊕ LOW | CRITICAL |

¹ Optimal information size (for dichotomous outcomes, OIS = 300 events; for continuous outcomes, OIS = 400 participants) not met.

² CI includes both (1) no effect and (2) appreciable benefit or appreciable harm.

1.1.3 GRADE profile for randomised controlled trials comparing staffed accommodation with standard care

| Quality assessment | | | | | | | Summary of findings | | | | Importance | |
|--|-------------------|------------------------|--------------------------|-------------------------|-----------------------------|----------------------|---------------------|---------------|-------------------|--|------------|----------|
| No. of studies | Design | Limitations | Inconsistency | Indirectness | Imprecision | Other considerations | No. of patients | | Effect | | | Quality |
| | | | | | | | Staff accommodation | Standard care | Relative (95% CI) | Absolute | | |
| Substance use: 1. Days used alcohol (low = poor) – 3 months (better indicated by lower values) | | | | | | | | | | | | |
| 1 | Randomised trials | No serious limitations | No serious inconsistency | No serious indirectness | Very serious ^{1,2} | None | 57 | 47 | - | SMD 0.32 lower (0.71 lower to 0.07 higher) | ⊕⊕⊕⊕ LOW | CRITICAL |
| Substance use: 1. Days used alcohol (low = poor) – 6 months (better indicated by lower values) | | | | | | | | | | | | |
| 1 | Randomised trials | No serious limitations | No serious inconsistency | No serious indirectness | Very serious ^{1,2} | None | 49 | 48 | - | SMD 0 higher (0.4 lower to 0.4 higher) | ⊕⊕⊕⊕ LOW | CRITICAL |
| Substance use: 1. Days used alcohol (low = poor) – 9 months (better indicated by lower values) | | | | | | | | | | | | |
| 1 | Randomised trials | No serious limitations | No serious inconsistency | No serious indirectness | Very serious ^{1,2} | None | 45 | 37 | - | SMD 0.05 lower (0.49 lower to 0.38 higher) | ⊕⊕⊕⊕ LOW | CRITICAL |
| Substance use: 2. Level of alcohol use (low = poor) – 3 months (better indicated by lower values) | | | | | | | | | | | | |
| 1 | Randomised trials | No serious limitations | No serious inconsistency | No serious indirectness | Very serious ^{1,2} | None | 57 | 47 | - | SMD 0.21 lower (0.6 lower to 0.18 higher) | ⊕⊕⊕⊕ LOW | CRITICAL |
| Substance use: 2. Level of alcohol use (low = poor) – 6 months (better indicated by lower values) | | | | | | | | | | | | |
| 1 | Randomised trials | No serious limitations | No serious inconsistency | No serious indirectness | Very serious ^{1,2} | None | 49 | 48 | - | SMD 0.06 lower (0.46 lower to 0.33 higher) | ⊕⊕⊕⊕ LOW | CRITICAL |
| Substance use: 2. Level of alcohol use (low = poor) – 9 months (better indicated by lower values) | | | | | | | | | | | | |
| 1 | Randomised trials | No serious limitations | No serious inconsistency | No serious indirectness | Very serious ^{1,2} | None | 45 | 37 | - | SMD 0.21 lower (0.65 lower to 0.23 higher) | ⊕⊕⊕⊕ LOW | CRITICAL |
| Substance use: 3. Days used drugs (low = poor) – 3 months (better indicated by lower values) | | | | | | | | | | | | |
| 1 | Randomised trials | No serious limitations | No serious inconsistency | No serious indirectness | Very serious ^{1,2} | None | 57 | 47 | - | SMD 0.22 lower (0.61 lower to 0.17 higher) | ⊕⊕⊕⊕ LOW | CRITICAL |
| Substance use: 3. Days used drugs (low = poor) – 6 months (better indicated by lower values) | | | | | | | | | | | | |
| 1 | Randomised trials | No serious limitations | No serious inconsistency | No serious indirectness | Very serious ^{1,2} | None | 49 | 48 | - | SMD 0.11 lower (0.51 lower to 0.28 higher) | ⊕⊕⊕⊕ LOW | CRITICAL |
| Substance use: 3. Days used drugs (low = poor) – 9 months (better indicated by lower values) | | | | | | | | | | | | |
| 1 | Randomised trials | No serious limitations | No serious inconsistency | No serious indirectness | Very serious ^{1,2} | None | 45 | 37 | - | SMD 0.04 lower (0.48 lower to 0.39 higher) | ⊕⊕⊕⊕ LOW | CRITICAL |

| Substance use: 4. Severity of drug use (low = poor) - 3 months (better indicated by lower values) | | | | | | | | | | | | |
|---|-------------------|------------------------|--------------------------|-------------------------|-----------------------------|------|----|----|---|---|----------|----------|
| 1 | Randomised trials | No serious limitations | No serious inconsistency | No serious indirectness | Very serious ^{1,2} | None | 57 | 47 | - | SMD 0.14 lower (0.52 lower to 0.25 higher) | ⊕⊕⊕⊕ LOW | CRITICAL |
| Substance use: 4. Severity of drug use (low = poor) - 6 months (better indicated by lower values) | | | | | | | | | | | | |
| 1 | Randomised trials | No serious limitations | No serious inconsistency | No serious indirectness | Very serious ^{1,2} | None | 49 | 48 | - | SMD 0.18 lower (0.57 lower to 0.22 higher) | ⊕⊕⊕⊕ LOW | CRITICAL |
| Substance use: 4. Severity of drug use (low = poor) - 9 months (better indicated by lower values) | | | | | | | | | | | | |
| 1 | Randomised trials | No serious limitations | No serious inconsistency | No serious indirectness | Very serious ^{1,2} | None | 45 | 37 | - | SMD 0.16 lower (0.6 lower to 0.28 higher) | ⊕⊕⊕⊕ LOW | CRITICAL |
| Functioning: 1. Percentage of time on streets (low = poor) - 3 months (better indicated by lower values) | | | | | | | | | | | | |
| 1 | Randomised trials | No serious limitations | No serious inconsistency | No serious indirectness | Very serious ^{1,2} | None | 57 | 47 | - | SMD 0.04 higher (0.35 lower to 0.42 higher) | ⊕⊕⊕⊕ LOW | CRITICAL |
| Functioning: 1. Percentage of time on streets (low = poor) - 6 months (better indicated by lower values) | | | | | | | | | | | | |
| 1 | Randomised trials | No serious limitations | No serious inconsistency | No serious indirectness | Very serious ^{1,2} | None | 49 | 48 | - | SMD 0.06 lower (0.46 lower to 0.34 higher) | ⊕⊕⊕⊕ LOW | CRITICAL |
| Functioning: 1. Percentage of time on streets (low = poor) - 9 months (better indicated by lower values) | | | | | | | | | | | | |
| 1 | Randomised trials | No serious limitations | No serious inconsistency | No serious indirectness | Very serious ^{1,2} | None | 45 | 37 | - | SMD 0.1 higher (0.34 lower to 0.54 higher) | ⊕⊕⊕⊕ LOW | CRITICAL |
| Functioning: 2. Percentage of time in independent housing (low = poor) - 3 months (better indicated by lower values) | | | | | | | | | | | | |
| 1 | Randomised trials | No serious limitations | No serious inconsistency | No serious indirectness | Very serious ^{1,2} | None | 57 | 47 | - | SMD 0.16 lower (0.55 lower to 0.23 higher) | ⊕⊕⊕⊕ LOW | CRITICAL |
| Functioning: 2. Percentage of time in independent housing (low = poor) - 6 months (better indicated by lower values) | | | | | | | | | | | | |
| 1 | Randomised trials | No serious limitations | No serious inconsistency | No serious indirectness | Very serious ^{1,2} | None | 49 | 48 | - | SMD 0.22 lower (0.61 lower to 0.18 higher) | ⊕⊕⊕⊕ LOW | CRITICAL |
| Functioning: 2. Percentage of time in independent housing (low = poor) - 9 months (better indicated by lower values) | | | | | | | | | | | | |
| 1 | Randomised trials | No serious limitations | No serious inconsistency | No serious indirectness | Very serious ^{1,2} | None | 45 | 37 | - | SMD 0.22 higher (0.22 lower to 0.66 higher) | ⊕⊕⊕⊕ LOW | CRITICAL |

¹ Optimal information size (for dichotomous outcomes, OIS = 300 events; for continuous outcomes, OIS = 400 participants) not met.

² CI includes both (1) no effect and (2) appreciable benefit or appreciable harm.

1.2 Psychological and psychosocial interventions

1.2.1 GRADE profile for randomised controlled trials comparing cognitive behavioural therapy with standard care

| Quality assessment | | | | | | | Summary of findings | | | | | Importance |
|--|-------------------|------------------------|--------------------------|-------------------------|-------------------------------|----------------------|---------------------|---------------|-------------------------|---|------------------|------------|
| No. of studies | Design | Limitations | Inconsistency | Indirectness | Imprecision | Other considerations | No. of patients | | Effect | | Quality | |
| | | | | | | | CBT | Standard care | Relative (95% CI) | Absolute | | |
| Substance use: 1. Using substances - by 1 month - alcohol or drugs | | | | | | | | | | | | |
| 1 | Randomised trials | No serious limitations | No serious inconsistency | No serious indirectness | Serious ¹ | None | 9/31 (29%) | 18/30 (60%) | RR 0.48 (0.26 to 0.9) | 31 fewer per 100 (from 6 fewer to 44 fewer) | ⊕⊕⊕O MODERATE | CRITICAL |
| Substance use: 2. Using substances - by 3 months - alcohol | | | | | | | | | | | | |
| 1 | Randomised trials | No serious limitations | No serious inconsistency | No serious indirectness | Very serious ^{1,2} | None | 7/25 (28%) | 1/21 (4.8%) | RR 5.88 (0.79 to 44.03) | 23 more per 100 (from 1 fewer to 205 more) | ⊕⊕OO LOW | CRITICAL |
| Substance use: 2. Using substances - by 3 months - drugs | | | | | | | | | | | | |
| 1 | Randomised trials | No serious limitations | No serious inconsistency | No serious indirectness | Very serious ^{1,2} | None | 12/25 (48%) | 5/21 (23.8%) | RR 2.02 (0.85 to 4.8) | 24 more per 100 (from 4 fewer to 90 more) | ⊕⊕OO LOW | CRITICAL |
| Substance use: 2. Using substances - by 3 months - alcohol or drugs | | | | | | | | | | | | |
| 1 | Randomised trials | No serious limitations | No serious inconsistency | No serious indirectness | Very serious ^{1,2} | None | 20/31 (64.5%) | 26/30 (86.7%) | RR 0.74 (0.55 to 1) | 23 fewer per 100 (from 39 fewer to 0 more) | ⊕⊕OO LOW | CRITICAL |
| Substance use: 3. Any substance (skewed data) - average score (ASI) by 3 months (better indicated by lower values) | | | | | | | | | | | | |
| 1 | Randomised trials | No serious limitations | No serious inconsistency | No serious indirectness | Very serious ^{1,3} | None | 31 | 31 | - | MD 0.07 lower (0.16 lower to 0.02 higher) | ⊕⊕OO LOW | CRITICAL |
| Substance use: 3. Any substance (skewed data) - average score (ASI) by 6 to 9 months (better indicated by lower values) | | | | | | | | | | | | |
| 1 | Randomised trials | No serious limitations | No serious inconsistency | No serious indirectness | Very serious ^{1,3} | None | 31 | 31 | - | MD 0.06 lower (0.16 lower to 0.04 higher) | ⊕⊕OO LOW | CRITICAL |
| Substance use: 3. Any substance (skewed data) - days reporting any substance use (ASI) by 3 months (better indicated by lower values) | | | | | | | | | | | | |
| 1 | Randomised trials | No serious limitations | No serious inconsistency | No serious indirectness | Very serious ^{1,2,3} | None | 31 | 30 | - | MD 2.1 lower (5.9 lower to 1.7 higher) | ⊕⊕OO LOW | CRITICAL |
| Substance use: 3. Any substance (skewed data) - days reporting any substance use (ASI) by 6 months (better indicated by lower values) | | | | | | | | | | | | |
| 1 | Randomised trials | No serious limitations | No serious inconsistency | No serious indirectness | Very serious ^{1,2,3} | None | 31 | 30 | - | MD 2.7 lower (7.25 lower to 1.85 higher) | ⊕⊕OO LOW | CRITICAL |

| Substance use: 4. Drugs use - by 3 months (skewed data) (better indicated by lower values) | | | | | | | | | | | | |
|--|-------------------|------------------------|--------------------------|-------------------------|-------------------------------|------|----|----|---|--|------------|----------|
| 2 | Randomised trials | No serious limitations | No serious inconsistency | No serious indirectness | Very serious ^{1,3} | None | 54 | 49 | - | MD 0.05 higher (1.55 lower to 1.66 higher) | ⊕⊕⊕ LOW | CRITICAL |
| Substance use: 5. Drugs use - by 6 months (skewed data) - days reporting drug use (ASI) by 6 months (better indicated by lower values) | | | | | | | | | | | | |
| 1 | Randomised trials | No serious limitations | No serious inconsistency | No serious indirectness | Very serious ^{1,2,3} | None | 29 | 28 | - | MD 3.7 lower (7.99 lower to 0.59 higher) | ⊕⊕⊕ LOW | CRITICAL |
| Substance use: 6. Alcohol use - by 3 months (skewed data) (better indicated by lower values) | | | | | | | | | | | | |
| 2 | Randomised trials | No serious limitations | No serious inconsistency | No serious indirectness | Very serious ^{1,2,3} | None | 54 | 49 | - | MD 1.95 lower (4.48 lower to 0.58 higher) | ⊕⊕⊕ LOW | CRITICAL |
| Substance use: 7. Alcohol use - by 6 months (skewed data) - days reporting alcohol use (ASI) by 6 months (better indicated by lower values) | | | | | | | | | | | | |
| 1 | Randomised trials | No serious limitations | No serious inconsistency | No serious indirectness | Very serious ^{1,2,3} | None | 29 | 28 | - | MD 0 higher (3.66 lower to 3.66 higher) | ⊕⊕⊕ LOW | CRITICAL |

¹Optimal information size (for dichotomous outcomes, OIS = 300 events; for continuous outcomes, OIS = 400 participants) not met.

²CI includes both (1) no effect and (2) appreciable benefit or appreciable harm.

³Skewed data.

1.2.2 GRADE profile for randomised controlled trials comparing motivational interviewing with standard care

| Quality assessment | | | | | | | Summary of findings | | | | Quality | Importance |
|---|-------------------|------------------------|--------------------------|-------------------------|-----------------------------|----------------------|---------------------|---------------|------------------------|--|------------------|------------|
| No. of studies | Design | Limitations | Inconsistency | Indirectness | Imprecision | Other considerations | No. of patients | | Effect | | | |
| | | | | | | | MI | Standard care | Relative (95% CI) | Absolute | | |
| Substance use: 1. Not abstinent or not improved on all substances - by 12 months | | | | | | | | | | | | |
| 1 | Randomised trials | No serious limitations | No serious inconsistency | No serious indirectness | Very serious ^{1,2} | None | 5/13 (38.5%) | 9/12 (75%) | RR 0.51 (0.24 to 1.1) | 37 fewer per 100 (from 57 fewer to 8 more) | ⊕⊕⊕⊕ LOW | CRITICAL |
| Substance use: 2. Not abstaining from alcohol - by 3 months | | | | | | | | | | | | |
| 1 | Randomised trials | No serious limitations | No serious inconsistency | No serious indirectness | Very serious ^{1,2} | None | 6/15 (40%) | 10/13 (76.9%) | RR 0.52 (0.26 to 1.03) | 37 fewer per 100 (from 57 fewer to 2 more) | ⊕⊕⊕⊕ LOW | CRITICAL |
| Substance use: 2. Not abstaining from alcohol - by 6 months | | | | | | | | | | | | |
| 1 | Randomised trials | No serious limitations | No serious inconsistency | No serious indirectness | Serious ¹ | None | 5/15 (33.3%) | 12/13 (92.3%) | RR 0.36 (0.17 to 0.75) | 59 fewer per 100 (from 23 fewer to 77 fewer) | ⊕⊕⊕⊕ MODERATE | CRITICAL |
| Substance use: 3. Other measures of alcohol use (skewed data) - drinking days - by 6 months (better indicated by lower values) | | | | | | | | | | | | |
| 1 | Randomised trials | No serious limitations | No serious inconsistency | No serious indirectness | Very serious ^{1,3} | None | 15 | 13 | - | SMD 1.29 lower (2.12 to 0.46 lower) | ⊕⊕⊕⊕ LOW | CRITICAL |

¹ Optimal information size (for dichotomous outcomes, OIS = 300 events; for continuous outcomes, OIS = 400 participants) not met.

² CI includes both (1) no effect and (2) appreciable benefit or appreciable harm.

³ Skewed data.

1.2.3 GRADE profile for randomised controlled trials comparing cognitive behavioural therapy plus motivational interviewing with standard care

| Quality assessment | | | | | | | Summary of findings | | | | Quality | Importance |
|---|-------------------|------------------------|--------------------------|-------------------------|----------------------|----------------------|---------------------|---|------------------------|---|-----------------|------------|
| No. of studies | Design | Limitations | Inconsistency | Indirectness | Imprecision | Other considerations | No. of patients | | Effect | | | |
| | | | | | | | CBT+MI | Standard care | Relative (95% CI) | Absolute | | |
| Death - by about 1 year | | | | | | | | | | | | |
| 3 | Randomised trials | No serious limitations | No serious inconsistency | No serious indirectness | Very serious | None | 6/246 (2.4%) | 8/246 (3.3%) | RR 0.73 (0.22 to 2.41) | 9 fewer per 1000 (from 25 fewer to 46 more) | ⊕⊕⊕ LOW | CRITICAL |
| | | | | | | | 3.1% | 8 fewer per 1000 (from 24 fewer to 44 more) | | | | |
| Substance use: 1. Average number of different drugs used during the past month (OTI, high = poor) - by 3 months (better indicated by lower values) | | | | | | | | | | | | |
| 1 | Randomised trials | No serious limitations | No serious inconsistency | No serious indirectness | Serious ¹ | None | 58 | 61 | - | MD 0.37 higher (0.01 lower to 0.75 higher) | ⊕⊕⊕ MODERATE | CRITICAL |
| Substance use: 1. Average number of different drugs used during the past month (OTI, high = poor) - by 6 months (better indicated by lower values) | | | | | | | | | | | | |
| 1 | Randomised trials | No serious limitations | No serious inconsistency | No serious indirectness | Serious ¹ | None | 58 | 61 | - | MD 0.19 higher (0.22 lower to 0.6 higher) | ⊕⊕⊕ MODERATE | CRITICAL |
| Substance use: 2. Average score - alcohol (skewed data) - estimated daily consumption - past month - 3 months (better indicated by lower values) | | | | | | | | | | | | |
| 1 | Randomised trials | No serious limitations | No serious inconsistency | No serious indirectness | Serious ¹ | None | 21 | 31 | - | MD 1.57 higher (0.9 lower to 4.04 higher) | ⊕⊕⊕ MODERATE | CRITICAL |
| Substance use: 2. Average score - alcohol (skewed data) - estimated daily consumption - past month - 6 months (better indicated by lower values) | | | | | | | | | | | | |
| 1 | Randomised trials | No serious limitations | No serious inconsistency | No serious indirectness | Serious ¹ | None | 21 | 31 | - | MD 1.21 higher (1.07 lower to 3.49 higher) | ⊕⊕⊕ MODERATE | CRITICAL |
| Substance use: 2. Average score - alcohol (skewed data) - alcohol - estimated daily consumption - past month - 12 months (better indicated by lower values) | | | | | | | | | | | | |
| 1 | Randomised trials | No serious limitations | No serious inconsistency | No serious indirectness | Serious ¹ | None | 18 | 28 | - | MD 1.39 higher (1.1 lower to 3.88 higher) | ⊕⊕⊕ MODERATE | CRITICAL |
| Substance use: 3. Average score - amphetamine (skewed data) - amphetamine - estimated daily consumption - past month - 3 months (better indicated by lower values) | | | | | | | | | | | | |
| 1 | Randomised trials | No serious limitations | No serious inconsistency | No serious indirectness | Serious ¹ | None | 11 | 9 | - | MD 0.09 higher (0.4 lower to 0.58 higher) | ⊕⊕⊕ MODERATE | CRITICAL |
| Substance use: 3. Average score - amphetamine (skewed data) - amphetamine - estimated daily consumption - past month - 6 months (better indicated by lower values) | | | | | | | | | | | | |
| 1 | Randomised trials | No serious limitations | No serious inconsistency | No serious indirectness | Serious ¹ | None | 11 | 9 | - | MD 1.28 lower (2.79) | ⊕⊕⊕ MODERATE | CRITICAL |

| | | | | | | | | | | | | |
|--|-------------------|------------------------|--------------------------|-------------------------|-----------------------------|------|-----|-----|---|---|------------------|----------|
| | trials | limitations | inconsistency | indirectness | | | | | | lower to 0.23 higher) | MODERATE | |
| Substance use: 3. Average score - amphetamine (skewed data) - amphetamine - estimated daily consumption - past month - 12 months (better indicated by lower values) | | | | | | | | | | | | |
| 1 | Randomised trials | No serious limitations | No serious inconsistency | No serious indirectness | Serious ¹ | None | 9 | 8 | - | MD 0.13 higher (0.11 lower to 0.37 higher) | ⊕⊕⊕O MODERATE | CRITICAL |
| Substance use: 4. Average score - cannabis (skewed data) - cannabis - estimated daily consumption - past month - 3 months (better indicated by lower values) | | | | | | | | | | | | |
| 1 | Randomised trials | No serious limitations | No serious inconsistency | No serious indirectness | Serious ¹ | None | 39 | 34 | - | MD 0.57 lower (4.27 lower to 3.13 higher) | ⊕⊕⊕O MODERATE | CRITICAL |
| Substance use: 4. Average score - cannabis (skewed data) - cannabis - estimated daily consumption - past month - 6 months (better indicated by lower values) | | | | | | | | | | | | |
| 1 | Randomised trials | No serious limitations | No serious inconsistency | No serious indirectness | Very serious ^{1,2} | None | 39 | 34 | - | MD 0.7 higher (4 lower to 5.4 higher) | ⊕⊕OO LOW | CRITICAL |
| Substance use: 4. Average score - cannabis (skewed data) - cannabis - estimated daily consumption - past month - 12 months (better indicated by lower values) | | | | | | | | | | | | |
| 1 | Randomised trials | No serious limitations | No serious inconsistency | No serious indirectness | Very serious ^{1,2} | None | 29 | 29 | - | MD 4.41 higher (1.4 lower to 10.22 higher) | ⊕⊕OO LOW | CRITICAL |
| Substance use: 7. TLFB: Percentage of days abstinent main substance (skewed data) - 12 months (better indicated by lower values) | | | | | | | | | | | | |
| 1 | Randomised trials | No serious limitations | No serious inconsistency | No serious indirectness | Very serious | None | 138 | 137 | - | MD 6.81 higher (2.07 lower to 15.69 higher) | ⊕⊕OO LOW | CRITICAL |
| Substance use: 7. TLFB: Percentage of days abstinent main substance (skewed data) - 18 months (better indicated by lower values) | | | | | | | | | | | | |
| 1 | Randomised trials | No serious limitations | No serious inconsistency | No serious indirectness | Very serious | None | 130 | 128 | - | MD 1.21 lower (10.74 lower to 8.32 higher) | ⊕⊕OO LOW | CRITICAL |
| Substance use: 7. TLFB: Percentage of days abstinent main substance (skewed data) - 24 months (better indicated by lower values) | | | | | | | | | | | | |
| 1 | Randomised trials | No serious limitations | No serious inconsistency | No serious indirectness | Very serious | None | 129 | 117 | - | MD 2.52 higher (7.42 lower to 12.46 higher) | ⊕⊕OO LOW | CRITICAL |
| Substance use: 8. TLFB: Percentage of days abstinent all substance (skewed data) - 12 months (better indicated by lower values) | | | | | | | | | | | | |
| 1 | Randomised trials | No serious limitations | No serious inconsistency | No serious indirectness | Very serious | None | 137 | 136 | - | MD 5.73 higher (2.62 lower to 14.08 higher) | ⊕⊕OO LOW | CRITICAL |
| Substance use: 8. TLFB: Percentage of days abstinent all substance (skewed data) - 18 months (better indicated by lower values) | | | | | | | | | | | | |
| 1 | Randomised trials | No serious limitations | No serious inconsistency | No serious indirectness | Very serious | None | 129 | 127 | - | MD 0.3 lower (9.14 lower to 8.54 higher) | ⊕⊕OO LOW | CRITICAL |
| Substance use: 8. TLFB: Percentage of days abstinent all substance (skewed data) - 24 months (better indicated by lower values) | | | | | | | | | | | | |
| 1 | Randomised trials | No serious limitations | No serious inconsistency | No serious indirectness | Very serious | None | 130 | 117 | - | MD 7.07 higher (2.32 lower to 16.46 higher) | ⊕⊕OO LOW | CRITICAL |
| Functioning: 1. Average global functioning score (GAF, low = poor) - 3 months (better indicated by lower values) | | | | | | | | | | | | |
| 1 | Randomised trials | No serious limitations | No serious inconsistency | No serious indirectness | Very serious ^{1,2} | None | 58 | 61 | - | MD 2.7 lower (7.05 lower to 1.65 higher) | ⊕⊕OO LOW | CRITICAL |
| Functioning: 1. Average global functioning score (GAF, low = poor) - 6 months (better indicated by lower values) | | | | | | | | | | | | |
| 1 | Randomised trials | No serious limitations | No serious inconsistency | No serious indirectness | Serious ¹ | None | 58 | 61 | - | MD 0.09 lower (3.7 | ⊕⊕⊕O | CRITICAL |

| | | | | | | | | | | | | |
|--|-------------------|------------------------|--------------------------|-------------------------|-----------------------------|------|-----|-----|---|---|------------------|----------|
| | trials | limitations | inconsistency | indirectness | | | | | | lower to 3.52 higher) | MODERATE | |
| Functioning: 1. Average global functioning score (GAF, low = poor) - 9 months (better indicated by lower values) | | | | | | | | | | | | |
| 1 | Randomised trials | No serious limitations | No serious inconsistency | No serious indirectness | Serious ¹ | None | 17 | 15 | - | MD 8.44 higher (0.48 to 16.4 higher) | ⊕⊕⊕O MODERATE | CRITICAL |
| Functioning: 1. Average global functioning score (GAF, low = poor) - 12 months (better indicated by lower values) | | | | | | | | | | | | |
| 3 | Randomised trials | No serious limitations | No serious inconsistency | No serious indirectness | Very serious | None | 196 | 202 | - | MD 1.87 higher (2.36 lower to 6.11 higher) | ⊕⊕OO LOW | CRITICAL |
| Functioning: 1. Average global functioning score (GAF, low = poor) - 18 to 24 months (better indicated by lower values) | | | | | | | | | | | | |
| 2 | Randomised trials | No serious limitations | No serious inconsistency | No serious indirectness | Very serious | None | 134 | 128 | - | MD 0.69 higher (3.86 lower to 5.25 higher) | ⊕⊕OO LOW | CRITICAL |
| Functioning: 2. Average social functioning score (SFS, low = poor) - by end of 9 month treatment (better indicated by lower values) | | | | | | | | | | | | |
| 1 | Randomised trials | No serious limitations | No serious inconsistency | No serious indirectness | Very serious ^{1,2} | None | 17 | 15 | - | MD 5.01 higher (0.55 lower to 10.57 higher) | ⊕⊕OO LOW | CRITICAL |
| Functioning: 2. Average social functioning score (SFS, low = poor) - by 12 months (3 months following treatment end) (better indicated by lower values) | | | | | | | | | | | | |
| 1 | Randomised trials | No serious limitations | No serious inconsistency | No serious indirectness | Serious ¹ | None | 17 | 15 | - | MD 7.27 higher (0.86 to 13.68 higher) | ⊕⊕⊕O MODERATE | CRITICAL |

¹ Optimal information size (for dichotomous outcomes, OIS = 300 events; for continuous outcomes, OIS = 400 participants) not met.

² CI includes both (1) no effect and (2) appreciable benefit or appreciable harm.

1.2.4 GRADE profile for randomised controlled trials comparing group psychotherapy with standard care

| Quality assessment | | | | | | | Summary of findings | | | | | Importance |
|--|-------------------|------------------------|--------------------------|-------------------------|-----------------------------|----------------------|--|---------------|-------------------|--|------------------|------------|
| No. of studies | Design | Limitations | Inconsistency | Indirectness | Imprecision | Other considerations | No. of patients | | Effect | | Quality | |
| | | | | | | | Social-skills training/psychoeducation | Standard care | Relative (95% CI) | Absolute | | |
| Substance use: 1. Average score - C-DIS-R Drugs (skewed data) - C-DIS-R DRUGS by 6 months (better indicated by lower values) | | | | | | | | | | | | |
| 1 | Randomised trials | No serious limitations | No serious inconsistency | No serious indirectness | Serious ¹ | None | 21 | 25 | - | MD 2.99 lower (5.51 to 0.47 lower) | ⊕⊕⊕O MODERATE | CRITICAL |
| Substance use: 1. Average score - C-DIS-R Drugs (skewed data) - C-DIS-R Drugs by 12 months (better indicated by lower values) | | | | | | | | | | | | |
| 1 | Randomised trials | No serious limitations | No serious inconsistency | No serious indirectness | Very serious ^{1,2} | None | 21 | 25 | - | MD 2.47 lower (5.76 lower to 0.82 higher) | ⊕⊕OO LOW | CRITICAL |
| Substance use: 1. Average score - C-DIS-R Drugs (skewed data) - C-DIS-R Drugs by 18 months (better indicated by lower values) | | | | | | | | | | | | |
| 1 | Randomised trials | No serious limitations | No serious inconsistency | No serious indirectness | Serious ¹ | None | 7 | 18 | - | MD 0.79 lower (3.35 lower to 1.77 higher) | ⊕⊕⊕O MODERATE | CRITICAL |
| Substance use: 2. Average score - C-DIS-R Alcohol (skewed data) - C-DIS-R Alcohol by 6 months (better indicated by lower values) | | | | | | | | | | | | |
| 1 | Randomised trials | No serious limitations | No serious inconsistency | No serious indirectness | Serious ¹ | None | 21 | 25 | - | MD 1.81 lower (3.41 to 0.21 lower) | ⊕⊕⊕O MODERATE | CRITICAL |
| Substance use: 2. Average score - C-DIS-R Alcohol (skewed data) - C-DIS-R Alcohol by 12 months (better indicated by lower values) | | | | | | | | | | | | |
| 1 | Randomised trials | No serious limitations | No serious inconsistency | No serious indirectness | Serious ¹ | None | 21 | 25 | - | MD 0.71 lower (2.54 lower to 1.12 higher) | ⊕⊕⊕O MODERATE | CRITICAL |
| Substance use: 2. Average score - C-DIS-R Alcohol (skewed data) - C-DIS-R Alcohol by 18 months (better indicated by lower values) | | | | | | | | | | | | |
| 1 | Randomised trials | No serious limitations | No serious inconsistency | No serious indirectness | Serious ¹ | None | 7 | 18 | - | MD 0.04 higher (2.27 lower to 2.35 higher) | ⊕⊕⊕O MODERATE | CRITICAL |
| Functioning: 1. Average role functioning score (RFS, high = better functioning) - by 6 months (better indicated by lower values) | | | | | | | | | | | | |
| 1 | Randomised trials | No serious limitations | No serious inconsistency | No serious indirectness | Serious ¹ | None | 22 | 25 | - | MD 0.61 higher (1.63 lower to 2.85 higher) | ⊕⊕⊕O MODERATE | CRITICAL |

| Functioning: 1. Average role functioning score (RFS, high = better functioning) - by 12 months (better indicated by lower values) | | | | | | | | | | | | |
|---|-------------------|------------------------|--------------------------|-------------------------|-----------------------------|------|----|----|---|--|---------------|----------|
| 1 | Randomised trials | No serious limitations | No serious inconsistency | No serious indirectness | Serious ¹ | None | 22 | 25 | - | MD 1.07 higher (1.15 lower to 3.29 higher) | ⊕⊕⊕O MODERATE | CRITICAL |
| Functioning: 1. Average role functioning score (RFS, high = better functioning) - by 18 months (better indicated by lower values) | | | | | | | | | | | | |
| 1 | Randomised trials | No serious limitations | No serious inconsistency | No serious indirectness | Very serious ^{1,2} | None | 7 | 18 | - | MD 2.55 lower (6.24 lower to 1.14 higher) | ⊕⊕OO LOW | CRITICAL |
| Functioning: 2. Average social adjustment score (SAS, high = better functioning) - by 6 months (better indicated by lower values) | | | | | | | | | | | | |
| 1 | Randomised trials | No serious limitations | No serious inconsistency | No serious indirectness | Very serious ^{1,2} | None | 22 | 25 | - | MD 0.92 lower (6.58 lower to 4.74 higher) | ⊕⊕OO LOW | CRITICAL |
| Functioning: 2. Average social adjustment score (SAS, high = better functioning) - by 12 months (better indicated by lower values) | | | | | | | | | | | | |
| 1 | Randomised trials | No serious limitations | No serious inconsistency | No serious indirectness | Very serious ^{1,2} | None | 22 | 25 | - | MD 2.58 higher (3.39 lower to 8.55 higher) | ⊕⊕OO LOW | CRITICAL |
| Functioning: 2. Average social adjustment score (SAS, high = better functioning) - by 18 months (better indicated by lower values) | | | | | | | | | | | | |
| 1 | Randomised trials | No serious limitations | No serious inconsistency | No serious indirectness | Very serious ^{1,2} | None | 7 | 18 | - | MD 4.66 lower (15.29 lower to 5.97 higher) | ⊕⊕OO LOW | CRITICAL |
| Service use: Days in hospital (skewed data) (better indicated by lower values) | | | | | | | | | | | | |
| 1 | Randomised trials | No serious limitations | No serious inconsistency | No serious indirectness | Very serious ^{1,2} | None | 16 | 13 | - | MD 1.8 higher (4.46 lower to 8.06 higher) | ⊕⊕OO LOW | CRITICAL |

¹ Optimal information size (for dichotomous outcomes, OIS = 300 events; for continuous outcomes, OIS = 400 participants) not met.

² CI includes both (1) no effect and (2) appreciable benefit or appreciable harm.

1.2.5 GRADE profile for randomised controlled trials comparing contingency management with standard care

| Quality assessment | | | | | | | Summary of findings | | | | Importance | |
|---|-------------------|------------------------|--------------------------|-------------------------|----------------------|----------------------|------------------------|---------------|-------------------|-------------------------------------|------------------|----------|
| No. of studies | Design | Limitations | Inconsistency | Indirectness | Imprecision | Other considerations | No. of patients | | Effect | | | Quality |
| | | | | | | | Contingency management | Standard care | Relative (95% CI) | Absolute | | |
| Substance use: 1. Number of days/weeks of drug use (confirmation by urine drug screen) – days of cocaine use (better indicated by lower values) | | | | | | | | | | | | |
| 1 | Randomised trials | No serious limitations | No serious inconsistency | No serious indirectness | Serious ¹ | None | 15 | 15 | - | SMD 1.04 lower (1.8 to 0.28 lower) | ⊕⊕⊕O MODERATE | CRITICAL |
| Substance use: 2. Number of days/weeks of alcohol use (confirmation by breathalyser) (better indicated by lower values) | | | | | | | | | | | | |
| 2 | Randomised trials | No serious limitations | No serious inconsistency | No serious indirectness | Serious ¹ | None | 37 | 34 | - | SMD 1.21 lower (1.68 to 0.73 lower) | ⊕⊕⊕O MODERATE | CRITICAL |
| Substance use: 3. Number of days/weeks using both drugs and alcohol (confirmation by urine or breathalyser) – weeks (better indicated by lower values) | | | | | | | | | | | | |
| 1 | Randomised trials | No serious limitations | No serious inconsistency | No serious indirectness | Serious ¹ | None | 22 | 19 | - | SMD 0.82 lower (1.47 to 0.17 lower) | ⊕⊕⊕O MODERATE | CRITICAL |
| Substance use: 4. Alcohol positive breathalyser samples (better indicated by lower values) | | | | | | | | | | | | |
| 1 | Randomised trials | No serious limitations | No serious inconsistency | No serious indirectness | Serious ¹ | None | 15 | 15 | - | SMD 0.97 lower (3.03 to 0.91 lower) | ⊕⊕⊕O MODERATE | CRITICAL |

¹ Optimal information size (for dichotomous outcomes, OIS = 300 events; for continuous outcomes, OIS = 400 participants) not met.