

Kidney Cancer GCOM 12 (day 2) minutes

Kidney Cancer update – committee meeting 12 (day 2) minutes

Date: 13/06/2025

Location: Virtual

Minutes: Final

Committee members present:		
Ana Semedo	Vice Chair, Oncology Cancer Nurse	Present for items 1-11
Axel Bex	Urological Surgeon	Present for items 2-partway through 4, 6-11
Janet Brown	Medical Oncologist	Present for items partway through 3-partway through 5, 6-11
Amarnath Challapalli	Clinical Oncologist (General)	Present for items 1-3, 6-11
Amy Clifford	Clinical Oncologist (SABR)	Present for items 1-11
John Connolly	Lay Member	Present for items 1-11
David Cullen	Urology Cancer Nurse	Present for items 1-11
Stuart Evans	Oncology Pharmacist	Present for items partway through 3-partway through 5
Geraldine Fox	Lay Member	Present for items 1-11
Fayiza Habeeb	Lead Nurse Practitioner	Present for items 1-5, 8-11
David Mole	Nephrologist (co-opted member)	Present for items 6-11
Vishal Patil	Anaesthetist (co-opted member)	Present for items 1-11
Sandeep Singh Randhawa	General Practitioner	Present for items 1-11
Grant Stewart	Topic Adviser	Present for items 1-11
Rose Woodward	Lay Member	Present for items 1-11

In attendance NICE:		
Marie Harrisingh	Topic Lead	Present for items 1-11
Sarah Boyce	Senior Technical Analyst	Present for items 1-11
Olivia Crane	Senior Technical Analyst	Present for items 1-11
Danielle Conroy	Project Manager	Present for items 1-11

Lindsay Claxton	Health Economics Adviser	Present for items 1-11
Lina Manounah	Technical Analyst	Present for items 1-11
Agnesa Mehmeti	Technical Analyst	Present for items 1-11
Hannah Tebbs	Senior Health Economist	Present for items 1-11
Ellie Zachariades	Senior Guidance Content Designer	Present for items 1-11
Yuanyuan Zhang	Senior Health Economist	Present for items 1-11

Apologies:

Lisa Browning	Histopathologist, committee member
Victoria Carter	Implementation Support Manager, NICE
Benjamin Gregory	Business Analyst, Resource Impact
Baljit Singh	Chair, committee member
Ankit Rao	Medical Oncologist, committee member
Katherine Saxby	Pharmacist Clinical Advisor, NICE
Maxine Tran	Urological Surgeon, committee member
Tze Min Wah	Interventional Radiologist
James Whitworth	Clinical Geneticist (co-opted member)
Sam Withey	Diagnostic Radiologist, committee member

1. Welcome, Introductions and DOIs

The Vice Chair, Ana Semedo (AS) welcomed the committee members and NICE attendees to the final in-development committee meeting for the NICE Kidney Cancer guideline.

AS informed attendees that apologies had been received as noted above. AS asked all committee members to verbally declare any new interests.

No new interests were declared but AS reminded the group of the following recorded interests which are relevant to the day's discussion:

Name	Job title, organisation	Declarations of Interest, date declared	Type of interest	Decision taken
Professor Axel Bex	Consultant Urologist and Clinical Lead Specialist Centre for Kidney	Oza, Bhavna, Eisen, Tim, Frangou, Eleni et al. (2022) External Validation of the 2003 Leibovich Prognostic Score in Patients Randomly Assigned to SORCE, an International Phase	Specific non-financial professional and personal	Declare and partial exclusion Must be excluded from making recommendations pertaining to the

Kidney Cancer GCOM 12 (day 2) minutes

	Cancer, Royal Free London NHS Foundation Trust, Specialist Centre for Kidney Cancer	III Trial of Adjuvant Sorafenib in Renal Cell Cancer. Journal of clinical oncology: official journal of the American Society of Clinical Oncology 40(16): 1772-1782 Declared 10/24.		Leibovich tool for RQ2c part 1 (prognostic models for non- metastatic kidney cancer). Participate in discussion but withdraw for drafting recommendations.
Professor Axel Bex	Consultant Urologist and Clinical Lead Specialist Centre for Kidney Cancer, Royal Free London NHS Foundation Trust, Specialist Centre for Kidney Cancer	Klatte, T., Gallagher, K.M., Afferi, L. et al. The VENUSS prognostic model to predict disease recurrence following surgery for non-metastatic papillary renal cell carcinoma: development and evaluation using the ASSURE prospective clinical trial cohort. BMC Med 17, 182 (2019). Declared 10/24	Specific non-financial professional and personal	Declare and partial exclusion Must be excluded from making recommendations pertaining to the VENUSS tool for papillary RCC for RQ2c part 1 (prognostic models for non- metastatic kidney cancer). Participate in discussion but withdraw for drafting recommendations.
Professor Axel Bex	Consultant Urologist and Clinical Lead Specialist Centre for Kidney Cancer, Royal Free London NHS Foundation Trust, Specialist Centre for Kidney Cancer	De Bruijn, Roderick Emile, Mulders, Peter, Jewett, Michael A et al. (2019) Surgical Safety of Cytoreductive Nephrectomy Following Sunitinib: Results from the Multicentre, Randomised Controlled Trial of Immediate Versus Deferred Nephrectomy (SURTIME). European urology 76(4): 437-440 Bex, Axel, Mulders, Peter, Jewett, Michael et al. (2019) Comparison of Immediate vs Deferred Cytoreductive Nephrectomy in Patients With Synchronous Metastatic Renal Cell Carcinoma Receiving Sunitinib: The SURTIME Randomized Clinical Trial. JAMA oncology 5(2): 164- 170	Specific non-financial professional and personal	Declare and partial exclusion Study included in the evidence base for RQ6 part 1 however committee member's expertise is essential to this discussion. Participate in discussion but withdraw for drafting recommendations.

Kidney Cancer GCOM 12 (day 2) minutes

		Declared 03/25		
Professor Axel Bex	Consultant Urologist and Clinical Lead Specialist Centre for Kidney Cancer, Royal Free London NHS Foundation Trust, Specialist Centre for Kidney Cancer	de Groot, Saskia, Redekop, William K, Sleijfer, Stefan et al. (2016) Survival in Patients With Primary Metastatic Renal Cell Carcinoma Treated With Sunitinib With or Without Previous Cytoreductive Nephrectomy: Results From a Population-based Registry. Urology 95: 121-7 Declared 03/25	Specific non-financial professional and personal	Declare and partial exclusion Study included in the evidence base for RQ6 part 1 however committee member's expertise is essential to this discussion. Participate in discussion but withdraw for drafting recommendations.
Professor Axel Bex	Consultant Urologist and Clinical Lead Specialist Centre for Kidney Cancer, Royal Free London NHS Foundation Trust, Specialist Centre for Kidney Cancer	Fransen van de Putte, Elisabeth E, van den Brink, Luna, Mansour, Mohamed A et al. (2023) Indications and Outcomes for Deferred Cytoreductive Nephrectomy Following Immune Checkpoint Inhibitor Combination Therapy: Can Systemic Therapy be Withdrawn in Patients with No Evidence of Disease?. European urology open science 55: 15-22 Declared 03/25	Specific non-financial professional and personal	Declare and partial exclusion Study included in the evidence base for RQ6 part 2 however committee member's expertise is essential to this discussion. Participate in discussion but withdraw for drafting recommendations.
Professor Axel Bex	Consultant Urologist and Clinical Lead Specialist Centre for Kidney Cancer, Royal Free London NHS Foundation Trust, Specialist Centre for Kidney Cancer	Dabestani, Saeed; Beisland, Christian; Stewart, Grant D; Bensalah, Karim; Gudmundsson, Eirikur; Lam, Thomas B; Gietzmann, William; Zakikhani, Paimaun; Marconi, Lorenzo; Fernandez-Pello, Sergio; Monagas, Serenella; Williams, Samuel P; Powles, Thomas; Van Werkhoven, Erik; Meijer, Richard; Volpe, Alessandro; Staehler, Michael; Ljungberg, Borje; Bex, Axel; Increased use of cross-sectional imaging for follow-up does not improve post-recurrence survival of surgically treated initially localized R.C.C.: results	Specific non-financial professional and personal	Declare and partial exclusion Study included in the evidence base for RQ5b on follow up however committee member's expertise is essential to this discussion. Participate in discussion but withdraw for drafting recommendations.

Kidney Cancer GCOM 12 (day 2) minutes

		from a European multicenter database (R.E.C.U.R.); Scandinavian journal of urology; 2019; vol. 53 (no. 1); 14-20 Declared 12/24		
Professor Axel Bex	Consultant Urologist and Clinical Lead Specialist Centre for Kidney Cancer, Royal Free London NHS Foundation Trust, Specialist Centre for Kidney Cancer	Dabestani, Saeed; Beisland, Christian; Stewart, Grant D; Bensalah, Karim; Gudmundsson, Eirikur; Lam, Thomas B; Gietzmann, William; Zakikhani, Paimaun; Marconi, Lorenzo; Fernandez-Pello, Sergio; Monagas, Serenella; Williams, Samuel Paul; Torbrand, Christian; Powles, Thomas; Van Werkhoven, Erik; Meijer, Richard; Volpe, Alessandro; Staehler, Michael; Ljungberg, Borje; Bex, Axel; Intensive Imaging-based Follow-up of Surgically Treated Localised Renal Cell Carcinoma Does Not Improve Post-recurrence Survival: Results from a European Multicentre Database (RECUR); European urology; 2019; vol. 75 (no. 2); 261-264 Declared 12/24	Specific non-financial professional and personal	Declare and partial exclusion Study included in the evidence base for RQ5b on follow up however committee member's expertise is essential to this discussion. Participate in discussion but withdraw for drafting recommendations.
Professor Grant Stewart	Professor of Surgical Oncology, University of Cambridge, Honorary Consultant in Urological Surgery, Cambridge University Hospitals NHS Foundation Trust	Laird A, Choy KC, Delaney H, Cutress ML, O'Connor KM, Tolley DA, McNeill SA, Stewart GD, Riddick AC. Matched pair analysis of laparoscopic versus open radical nephrectomy for the treatment of T3 renal cell carcinoma. World J Urol. 2015 Jan;33(1):25-32. doi: 10.1007/s00345-014-1280-y. Epub 2014 Mar 20. PMID: 24647880. Declared 06/24	Specific non-financial professional and personal	Declare and partial exclusion. Study included in the evidence base for RQ4a looking at nephrectomy and SABR for locally advanced RCC. The paper is broadly in line with other, larger studies in this area and the committee member's expertise is essential to this discussion. Participate in discussion but withdraw for drafting recommendations.

Kidney Cancer GCOM 12 (day 2) minutes

Professor Grant Stewart	Professor of Surgical Oncology, University of Cambridge, Honorary Consultant in Urological Surgery, Cambridge University Hospitals NHS Foundation Trust	Usher-Smith, J.A., Li, L., Roberts, L., Harrison, H., Rossi, S.H., Sharp, S.J., Coupland, C., Hippisley-Cox, J., Griffin, S.J., Klatte, T. and Stewart, G.D. (2022), Risk models for recurrence and survival after kidney cancer: a systematic review. BJU Int, 130: 562-579. https://doi.org/10.1111/bju.15673 Declared 08/24	Specific non-financial professional and personal	Declare and partial exclusion Study included in the evidence base for RQ2c part 1 (prognostic models for non- metastatic kidney cancer) however committee member's expertise is essential to this discussion. Participate in discussion but withdraw for drafting recommendations.
Professor Grant Stewart	Professor of Surgical Oncology, University of Cambridge, Honorary Consultant in Urological Surgery, Cambridge University Hospitals NHS Foundation Trust	Vasudev, Naveen S, Hutchinson, Michelle, Trainor, Sebastian et al. (2020) UK Multicenter Prospective Evaluation of the Leibovich Score in Localized Renal Cell Carcinoma: Performance has Altered Over Time. Urology 136: 162-168 Oza, Bhavna, Eisen, Tim, Frangou, Eleni et al. (2022) External Validation of the 2003 Leibovich Prognostic Score in Patients Randomly Assigned to SORCE, an International Phase III Trial of Adjuvant Sorafenib in Renal Cell Cancer. Journal of clinical oncology: official journal of the American Society of Clinical Oncology 40(16): 1772-1782 Um, In Hwa, Scott-Hayward, Lindesay, Mackenzie, Monique et al. (2020) Computerized Image Analysis of Tumor Cell Nuclear Morphology Can Improve Patient Selection for Clinical Trials in Localized Clear Cell Renal Cell Carcinoma. Journal of pathology informatics 11: 35 Declared 10/24	Specific non-financial professional and personal	Declare and partial exclusion Studies included in the evidence base for RQ2c part 1 (non-metastatic prediction models) however committee member's expertise is essential to this discussion. Participate in discussion but withdraw for drafting recommendations.
Professor Grant Stewart	Professor of Surgical Oncology, University of Cambridge, Honorary	Klatte, T., Gallagher, K.M., Afferi, L. et al. The VENUSS prognostic model to predict disease recurrence following surgery for non-metastatic papillary renal cell carcinoma: development and evaluation using the ASSURE	Specific non-financial professional and personal	Declare and partial exclusion Study included in the evidence base for RQ2c part 1 (non-metastatic

	Consultant in Urological Surgery, Cambridge University Hospitals NHS Foundation Trust	prospective clinical trial cohort. BMC Med 17, 182 (2019). https://doi.org/10.1186/s12916-019-1419-1 Declared 10/24		prediction models) however committee member's expertise is essential to this discussion. Participate in discussion but withdraw for drafting recommendations.
Professor Grant Stewart	Professor of Surgical Oncology, University of Cambridge, Honorary Consultant in Urological Surgery, Cambridge University Hospitals NHS Foundation Trust	Harrison, H., Stewart, G.D. and Usher-Smith, J.A. (2023), Patient experience of follow-up after surgery for kidney cancer: a focus group study. BJU Int, 132: 47-55. https://doi.org/10.1111/bju.15982 Declared 04/25	Specific non-financial professional and personal	Declare and partial exclusion. Included study for RQ1 on information needs. Participate in discussion but withdraw from drafting recommendations
Professor Grant Stewart	Professor of Surgical Oncology, University of Cambridge, Honorary Consultant in Urological Surgery, Cambridge University Hospitals NHS Foundation Trust	Ranieri, V., Warren, H., Florez, I., Neves, J.B., Walkden, M., Bernstein, D.E., Santiapillai, J., Williams, N., Wildgoose, W.H., Patki, P., Stewart, G.D., Kinsella, N., Pizzo, E., Barod, R., Bex, A., Mumtaz, F., El-Sheikh, S., Gurusamy, K. and Tran, M.G.B. (2024), Identifying the facilitators and barriers to implementation of renal tumour biopsy in the diagnostic pathway for small renal masses. BJU Int, 134: 796-804. https://doi.org/10.1111/bju.16470 Declared 04/25	Specific non-financial professional and personal	Declare and partial exclusion. Included study for RQ1 on information needs. Participate in discussion but withdraw from drafting recommendations.
Professor Grant Stewart	Professor of Surgical Oncology, University of Cambridge, Honorary Consultant in Urological Surgery, Cambridge University Hospitals NHS Foundation Trust	Dabestani, Saeed; Beisland, Christian; Stewart, Grant D; Bensalah, Karim; Gudmundsson, Eirikur; Lam, Thomas B; Gietzmann, William; Zakikhani, Paimaun; Marconi, Lorenzo; Fernandez-Pello, Sergio; Monagas, Serenella; Williams, Samuel P; Powles, Thomas; Van Werkhoven, Erik; Meijer, Richard; Volpe, Alessandro; Staehler, Udo	Specific non-financial professional and personal	Declare and partial exclusion Study included in the evidence base for RQ5b on follow up however committee member's expertise is essential to this discussion.

Kidney Cancer GCOM 12 (day 2) minutes

	University Hospitals NHS Foundation Trust	Michael; Ljungberg, Borje; Bex, Axel; Increased use of cross-sectional imaging for follow-up does not improve post-recurrence survival of surgically treated initially localized R.C.C.: results from a European multicenter database (R.E.C.U.R.); Scandinavian journal of urology; 2019; vol. 53 (no. 1); 14-20 Declared 12/24		Participate in discussion but withdraw for drafting recommendations.
Professor Grant Stewart	Professor of Surgical Oncology, University of Cambridge, Honorary Consultant in Urological Surgery, Cambridge University Hospitals NHS Foundation Trust	Dabestani, Saeed; Beisland, Christian; Stewart, Grant D; Bensalah, Karim; Gudmundsson, Eirikur; Lam, Thomas B; Gietzmann, William; Zakikhani, Paimaun; Marconi, Lorenzo; Fernandez-Pello, Sergio; Monagas, Serenella; Williams, Samuel Paul; Torbrand, Christian; Powles, Thomas; Van Werkhoven, Erik; Meijer, Richard; Volpe, Alessandro; Staehler, Michael; Ljungberg, Borje; Bex, Axel; Intensive Imaging-based Follow-up of Surgically Treated Localised Renal Cell Carcinoma Does Not Improve Post-recurrence Survival: Results from a European Multicentre Database (RECUR); European urology; 2019; vol. 75 (no. 2); 261-264 Declared 12/25	Specific non-financial professional and personal	Declare and partial exclusion Study included in the evidence base for RQ5b on follow up however committee member's expertise is essential to this discussion. Participate in discussion but withdraw for drafting recommendations.

AB (AB) was an author on papers included in the evidence review for RQ2ci, RQ5b, RQ6b(i) and RQ6b(ii) being discussed. It was agreed that the member could remain in the room to answer questions as his expertise was required but would need to remain silent whilst recommendations about the Leibovich tool, VENUSS tool for papillary renal cell carcinoma, follow-up and non-pharmacological interventions before and after systemic anti-cancer therapy for previously untreated renal cell carcinoma were being revised.

Grant Stewart (GS) was an author on papers included in the evidence review for RQ1, RQ2ci, RQ4a and RQ5b being discussed. It was agreed that the member could remain in the room to answer questions as his expertise was required but he would need to remain silent whilst recommendations on non-metastatic risk prediction models, nephrectomy and SABR for locally advanced renal cell carcinoma, general information needs and follow-up were being revised.

Finally, the minutes from committee 12 (day 1) were checked and agreed to be an accurate record.

<p>2. Meeting overview and remaining issues</p> <p>The Vice Chair introduced Marie Harrisingh (MH), Topic Lead who outlined how the meeting will be run and what topics will be covered.</p> <p>MH provided presented an overview of the results from the literature search re-runs which included the summary and impact of the evidence identified.</p> <p>The NICE team sought committee input on several outstanding issues about the guideline that needed to be resolved before considering whether it was appropriate to make any recommendations for research.</p> <p>The committee had the opportunity to discuss as a group and offer their expert input.</p> <p>The Vice Chair thanked the committee for their input.</p>
<p>3. Revisiting recs: RQ2ci non-metastatic risk prediction models</p> <p>MH presented the previously drafted recommendations for non-metastatic risk prediction models for committee review and further input.</p> <p>The committee had the opportunity to discuss as a group, answer questions from the NICE team and revise the recommendation wording as required.</p> <p>AB and GS withdrew from participating in recommendation drafting due to a conflict of interest.</p> <p>The Vice Chair thanked the committee for their input.</p>
<p>4. Revisiting recs: RQ3a and RQ3b (non-pharmacological management of localised RCC) and new HE study</p> <p>The Vice Chair introduced Hannah Tebbs (HT), Senior Health Economist, who presented an additional study which had been identified to be included in the cost-effectiveness review for non-pharmacological management of localised renal cell carcinoma.</p> <p>The Vice Chair introduced Sarah Boyce (SB), Senior Technical Analyst who presented the previously drafted recommendations which covered nephrectomy and non-surgical interventions for committee review.</p> <p>The committee considered whether any new recommendations were appropriate considering the new economic evidence. They discussed the recommendations as a group, answered questions from the NICE team and revised the recommendation wording as required.</p> <p>The Vice Chair thanked the committee for their input.</p>
<p>5. Revisiting recs: end of RQ5b (follow up) and RQ5a (active surveillance information) and RQ5cii (information during follow up and active surveillance)</p>

MH presented the recommendations on follow-up, active surveillance and what information should be provided to patients during follow-up and active surveillance for committee review and further input.

The committee discussed as a group and initial revisions to recommendation wording were made as required.

AB and GS withdrew from participating in recommendation drafting for follow-up due to a conflict of interest.

The Vice Chair thanked the committee for their input.

6. Revisiting recs: RQ4a (non-pharmacological management of locally advanced RCC)

SB presented the recommendations on non-pharmacological management of locally advanced renal cell carcinoma for committee review.

SB sought committee input on several outstanding questions including strengthening clarity of wording and filling identified gaps.

GS withdrew from participating in recommendation drafting due to a conflict of interest.

The Vice Chair thanked the committee for their input.

7. Revisiting recs: RQ6bi/ii (non-pharmacological management of Advanced RCC)

The Vice Chair introduced Olivia Crane (OC), Senior Technical Analyst, who presented the previously drafted recommendations on non-pharmacological management of advanced renal cell carcinoma for further committee input.

The committee had the opportunity to discuss as a group, answer questions from the NICE team and revise the recommendation wording as required.

AB withdrew from participating in recommendation drafting due to a conflict of interest.

The Vice Chair thanked the committee for their input.

8. Revisiting recs: RQ2cii metastatic risk prediction models

The committee discussed the recommendations on metastatic risk prediction models, answered questions from the NICE team and revised the recommendation wording as required.

The Vice Chair thanked the committee for their input.

9. Revisiting recs: RQ2a imaging

OC presented the recommendations for imaging for committee review and input.

The committee offered their expert input on questions from the NICE team. Any impact on or deviations from current practice were noted.

The Vice Chair thanked the committee for their input.

10. Revisiting recs: RQ1 general information revisited

The committee reviewed the previously drafted recommendations on what general information should be provided to patients for any necessary changes.

The group discussed terminology and what was considered best practice or specific to Kidney Cancer.

GS withdrew from recommendation drafting due to a conflict of interest.

The Vice Chair thanked the committee for their input.

11. Next steps and AOB

AS summarised the main actions from the day and asked for items of any other business. As there was no further business to discuss, AS brought the meeting to a close.

Date of next meeting: TBC - November 2025

Location of next meeting: Hybrid