

Kidney Cancer GCOM 13 (day 1) minutes

Kidney Cancer update – committee meeting 13 (day 1) minutes

Date: 19/11/2025

Location: Virtual and London

Minutes: Final

Committee members present:		
Baljit Singh	Chair	Present for items 1-8
Axel Bex	Urological Surgeon	Present for items 2-8
Janet Brown	Medical Oncologist	Present for partway through item 2- partway through item 7
Lisa Browning	Histopathologist	Present for items 1-3
Amarnath Challapalli	Clinical Oncologist (General)	Present for partway through item 2-8
Amy Clifford	Clinical Oncologist (SABR)	Present for items 1-8
John Connolly	Lay Member	Present for items 1-8
David Cullen	Urology Cancer Nurse	Present for items 1-8
Stuart Evans	Oncology Pharmacist	Present for items 1-8
Geraldine Fox	Lay Member	Present for items 1-8
David Mole	Nephrologist (co-opted member)	Present for items 1-8
Ankit Rao	Medical Oncologist	Present for items 1-4
Sandeep Singh Randhawa	General Practitioner	Present for items 4-8
Grant Stewart	Topic Adviser	Present for items 1-8
Maxine Tran	Urological Surgeon	Present for items 1-8
Tze Min Wah	Interventional Radiologist	Present for items 1- partway through item 2
James Whitworth	Clinical Geneticist	Present for items 1-8
Sam Withey	Diagnostic Radiologist	Present for items 1-8
Rose Woodward	Lay Member	Present for items 1-8

In attendance NICE:		
Adefisayo Abba-Abba	Technical Analyst	Present for items 1-8
Sarah Boyce	Senior Technical Analyst	Present for items 1-8
Victoria Carter	Implementation Support Manager	Present for items 1- partway through item 4
Olivia Crane	Senior Technical Analyst	Present for items 1-8

Danielle Conroy	Project Manager	Present for items 1-8
Lindsay Claxton	Health Economics Adviser	Present for items 1-8
Benjamin Gregory	Business Analyst, Resource Impact	Present for items 1-partway through item 7
Nicola Greenway	Measurement Lead, Quality Standards (observing)	Present for items 1-8
Marie Harrisingh	Topic Lead	Present for items 1-8
Agnesa Mehmeti	Technical Analyst	Present for items 1-8
Nisha Mehta	GP Clinical Adviser (observing)	Present for items 1-partway through item 2
Ellie Zachariades	Senior Guidance Content Designer	Present for items 1-8
Yuanyuan Zhang	Senior Health Economist	Present for items 1-8

Apologies:

Fayiza Habeeb	Lead Nurse Practitioner, Committee
Vishal Patil	Anaesthetist (co-opted member), Committee
Katherine Saxby	Pharmacist Clinical Advisor, NICE
Ana Semedo	Vice Chair, Oncology Cancer Nurse, Committee

1. Welcome, Introductions and DOIs

The Chair, Baljit Singh (BS) welcomed the committee members and NICE attendees to the first post-consultation committee meeting for the NICE Kidney Cancer guideline.

BS informed attendees that apologies had been received as noted above. BS asked all committee members to verbally declare any new interests.

No new interests were declared but BS reminded the group of the following recorded interests which are relevant to the day's discussion:

Name	Job title, organisation	Declarations of Interest, date declared	Type of interest	Decision taken
Geraldine Fox	Lay member	Trustee of Kidney Cancer UK Declared 11/23	Specific non-financial professional and personal	Declare and partial exclusion Can participate in discussion but excluded from decision making in response to

Kidney Cancer GCOM 13 (day 1) minutes

				Kidney Cancer UK consultation comments.
Professor Grant Stewart	Professor of Surgical Oncology, University of Cambridge, Honorary Consultant in Urological Surgery, Cambridge University Hospitals NHS Foundation Trust	Laird A, Choy KC, Delaney H, Cutress ML, O'Connor KM, Tolley DA, McNeill SA, Stewart GD, Riddick AC. Matched pair analysis of laparoscopic versus open radical nephrectomy for the treatment of T3 renal cell carcinoma. World J Urol. 2015 Jan;33(1):25-32. doi: 10.1007/s00345-014-1280-y. Epub 2014 Mar 20. PMID: 24647880. Declared 06/24	Specific non-financial professional and personal	Declare and partial exclusion. Study included in the evidence base for RQ4a looking at nephrectomy and SABR for locally advanced RCC. The paper is broadly in line with other, larger studies in this area and the committee member's expertise is essential to this discussion. Participate in discussion but withdraw for drafting recommendations.
Professor Grant Stewart	Professor of Surgical Oncology, University of Cambridge, Honorary Consultant in Urological Surgery, Cambridge University Hospitals NHS Foundation Trust	Harrison, H., Stewart, G.D. and Usher-Smith, J.A. (2023), Patient experience of follow-up after surgery for kidney cancer: a focus group study. BJU Int, 132: 47-55. https://doi.org/10.1111/bju.15982 Declared 04/25	Specific non-financial professional and personal	Declare and partial exclusion. Included study for RQ1 on information needs. Participate in discussion but withdraw from drafting recommendations
Professor Grant Stewart	Professor of Surgical Oncology, University of Cambridge, Honorary Consultant in Urological	Ranieri, V., Warren, H., Florez, I., Neves, J.B., Walkden, M., Bernstein, D.E., Santiapillai, J., Williams, N., Wildgoose, W.H., Patki, P., Stewart, G.D., Kinsella, N., Pizzo, E., Barod, R., Bex, A., Mumtaz, F., El-Sheikh, S., Gurusamy, K. and Tran, M.G.B. (2024), Identifying the facilitators and barriers to implementation of renal tumour biopsy in the diagnostic pathway for	Specific non-financial professional and personal	Declare and partial exclusion. Included study for RQ1 on information needs. Participate in discussion but

Kidney Cancer GCOM 13 (day 1) minutes

	Surgery, Cambridge University Hospitals NHS Foundation Trust	small renal masses. BJU Int, 134: 796-804. https://doi.org/10.1111/bju.16470 Declared 04/25		withdraw from drafting recommendations.
Professor Grant Stewart	Professor of Surgical Oncology, University of Cambridge, Honorary Consultant in Urological Surgery, Cambridge University Hospitals NHS Foundation Trust	Trustee of Kidney Cancer UK Declared 07/23	Specific non- financial professional and personal	Declare and partial exclusion Can participate in discussion but excluded from decision making in response to Kidney Cancer UK consultation comments
Professor Maxine Tran	Professor of Urology and Honorary Consultant Urological Surgeon, University College London and Specialist Centre for Kidney Cancer at the Royal Free Hospital, London	Trustee for Kidney Cancer UK charity. Declared 09/23	Specific non- financial professional and personal	Declare and partial exclusion Can participate in discussion but excluded from decision making in response to Kidney Cancer UK consultation comments
Professor Maxine Tran	Professor of Urology and Honorary Consultant Urological Surgeon, University College London and Specialist Centre for	Ranieri, V., Warren, H., Florez, I., Neves, J.B., Walkden, M., Bernstein, D.E., Santiapillai, J., Williams, N., Wildgoose, W.H., Patki, P., Stewart, G.D., Kinsella, N., Pizzo, E., Barod, R., Bex, A., Mumtaz, F., El-Sheikh, S., Gurusamy, K. and Tran, M.G.B. (2024), Identifying the facilitators and barriers to implementation of renal tumour biopsy in the diagnostic pathway for small renal masses . BJU Int, 134: 796-804. https://doi.org/10.1111/bju.16470	Specific non- financial professional and personal	Declare and partial exclusion. Included study for RQ1 on communication. Participate in discussion but withdraw from drafting recommendations about information

Kidney Cancer GCOM 13 (day 1) minutes

	Kidney Cancer at the Royal Free Hospital, London	Declared 04/25		to be provided about biopsy. Able to draft recommendations on information to be provided at other stages of the treatment pathway.
Professor Tze Min Wah	Professor of Interventional Radiology & Consultant Diagnostic and Interventional Radiologist, Leeds Teaching Hospitals NHS Trust	Author on an unpublished paper: A multi-centre feasibility study and cost effectiveness analysis to compare the outcomes of 99m Tc-SestaMIBI SPECT/CT, biopsy or empiric surgery in the diagnosis of kidney tumours Declared 05/25	Specific non-financial professional and personal	Declare and partial exclusion. Included study for RQ2b on biopsy. Participate in discussion but withdraw from recommendation drafting.
Professor Tze Min Wah	Professor of Interventional Radiology & Consultant Diagnostic and Interventional Radiologist, Leeds Teaching Hospitals NHS Trust	Long-term outcomes of image-guided ablation and laparoscopic partial nephrectomy for T1 renal cell carcinoma - https://pubmed.ncbi.nlm.nih.gov/35384457/v Declared 07/24	Specific non-financial professional and personal	Declare and partial exclusion. Included study for RQ3b on non-surgical interventions or active surveillance for localised RCC. Reasonable sized study which is an integral part of the evidence base. Participate in discussion but withdraw from drafting recommendations.
Professor Tze Min Wah	Professor of Interventional Radiology & Consultant Diagnostic and Interventional Radiologist, Leeds Teaching	Chan VW, Lenton J, Smith J, Jagdev S, Ralph C, Vasudev N, Bhattarai S, Lewington A, Kimuli M, Cartledge J, Wah TM. Multimodal image-guided ablation on management of renal cancer in Von-Hippel-Lindau syndrome patients from 2004 to 2021 at a specialist centre: A longitudinal observational study. Eur J Surg Oncol. 2022 Mar;48(3):672-679. doi: 10.1016/j.ejso.2021.10.022. Epub 2021 Oct 28. PMID: 34728141.	Specific non-financial professional and personal	Declare and partial exclusion. Included study for RQ5c(ii) on interventions and follow-up for heritable RCC. Participate in discussion but withdraw from

Kidney Cancer GCOM 13 (day 1) minutes

	Hospitals NHS Trust	Declared 04/25		drafting recommendations.
Professor Tze Min Wah	Professor of Interventional Radiology & Consultant Diagnostic and Interventional Radiologist, Leeds Teaching Hospitals NHS Trust	Osman FH, Chan VW, Breen DJ, King A, Nielsen TK, Garnon J, Alcorn D, Lagerveld B, Graumann O, Keeley FX Jr, Walkden M, de Kerviler É, Wah TM. Oncological and Peri-Operative Outcomes of Percutaneous Cryoablation of Renal Cell Carcinoma for Patients with Hereditary RCC Diseases-An Analysis of European Multi-Centre Prospective EuRECA Registry . Cancers (Basel). 2023 Jun 24;15(13):3322. doi: 10.3390/cancers15133322. PMID: 37444432; PMCID: PMC10340367. Declared 04/25	Specific non-financial professional and personal	Declare and partial exclusion. Included study for RQ5c(ii) on interventions and follow-up for heritable RCC. Participate in discussion but withdraw from drafting recommendations.
Rose Woodward	Lay member	Salaried role as part-time CEO of the charity Action Kidney Cancer Declared 11/23	Specific, Direct financial	Declare and partial exclusion Can participate in discussion but excluded from decision making in response to Action Kidney Cancer consultation comments.

Geraldine Fox (GF) holds a senior position at Kidney Cancer UK so was excluded from decision making in response to Kidney Cancer UK consultation comments.

Grant Stewart (GS) was an author on papers included in the evidence review for RQ1 and RQ4a being discussed. It was agreed that the member could remain in the room to answer questions as his expertise was required but he would need to remain silent whilst recommendations on nephrectomy and SABR for locally advanced renal cell carcinoma and general information needs were being revised.

GS also holds a senior position at Kidney Cancer UK so was excluded from decision making in response to Kidney Cancer UK consultation comments.

Maxine Tran (MT) was an author on papers included in the evidence review for RQ1 and RQ2b being discussed. It was agreed that the member could remain in the room to answer questions as her expertise was required but she would need to remain silent whilst recommendations on biopsy and biopsy information were being revised.

MT also holds a senior position at Kidney Cancer UK so was excluded from decision making in response to Kidney Cancer UK consultation comments.

Tze Min Wah (TMW) was an author on papers included in the evidence review for RQ1, RQ2b, RQ3b and RQ5c being discussed. It was agreed that the member could remain in the room to answer questions as her expertise was required but she would need to remain silent whilst recommendations on biopsy, biopsy information, non-surgical interventions for localised RCC and treatment for heritable RCC treatment were being revised.

Rose Woodward (RW) holds a senior position at Action Kidney Cancer so was excluded from decision making in response to Action Kidney Cancer consultation comments.

2. Non-pharmacological management of localised RCC

Marie Harrisingh (MH), Topic Lead outlined the aims of the meeting and explained how the meeting will run. MH provided an overview of the feedback received at consultation including several positive comments from stakeholders.

The Chair introduced Olivia Crane (OC), Senior Technical Analyst who presented stakeholder feedback on non-pharmacological management of localised renal cell carcinoma which required further consideration and input from committee.

This covered several themes including recurrence, terminology, biopsy feasibility and management options for 2-4cm small renal masses and Bosniak cysts.

The committee answered questions from the NICE team, discussed the comments as a group and initial revisions to recommendation wording and/or the rationale and impact section of the guideline were agreed as required.

Yuanyuan Zhang (YZ), Health Economist, presented an economics paper which was identified at consultation. The committee discussed and considered the findings and decided whether this should be incorporated into the cost-effectiveness review.

TMW withdrew from participating in revising recommendation wording in relation to non-surgical interventions due to a conflict of interest.

GF, GS and MT withdrew from participating in responding to Kidney Cancer UK consultation comments in this area due to a conflict of interest.

RW withdrew from participating in responding to Action Kidney Cancer consultation comments in this area due to a conflict of interest.

The Chair thanked MH, OC and YZ for their contribution to the meeting.

3. Biopsy and biopsy information

BS introduced Agnesa Mehmeti (AM), Technical Analyst who presented the stakeholder feedback received on biopsy and information provided about biopsy.

This included the themes of implementation, when not to biopsy, and biopsy information.

The committee answered questions from the NICE team, discussed the comments as a group and agreed whether revisions to the recommendation wording were required.

MT withdrew from participating in revising any recommendation wording in relation to biopsy and biopsy information due to a conflict of interest.

GS withdrew from participating in revision of any recommendation wording in regard to provision of information due to a conflict of interest.

GF, GS and MT withdrew from participating in responding to Kidney Cancer UK consultation comments in this area due to a conflict of interest.

RW withdrew from participating in responding to Action Kidney Cancer consultation comments in this area due to a conflict of interest.

The Chair thanked the committee for their input.

4.

- **Information around surgery**
- **Other information relating to thermal ablation and SABR adjuvant therapy**

BS introduced Sarah Boyce (SB), Senior Technical Analyst who presented the stakeholder feedback received on information before and after surgery, and information on adjuvant therapy and SABR.

This included the themes of perioperative care and information provided about adjuvant therapy, thermal ablation information and chronic kidney disease information.

The committee answered questions from the NICE team, discussed the comments as a group and agreed whether revisions to the recommendation wording were required.

GS withdrew from participating in revision of any recommendation wording in regard to provision of information due to a conflict of interest.

GF, GS and MT withdrew from participating in responding to Kidney Cancer UK consultation comments in this area due to a conflict of interest.

RW withdrew from participating in responding to Action Kidney Cancer consultation comments in this area due to a conflict of interest.

The Chair thanked the committee for their input.

5. Locally advanced RCC

SB presented the stakeholder feedback received on locally advanced renal cell carcinoma that required committee input.

This included the themes of timeliness and technical aspects of surgery.

The committee answered questions from the NICE team, discussed the comments as a

group and agreed whether revisions to the recommendation wording were required.

GS withdrew from participating in revision of any recommendation wording regarding SABR and nephrectomy due to a conflict of interest.

GF, GS and MT withdrew from participating in responding to Kidney Cancer UK consultation comments in this area due to a conflict of interest.

RW withdrew from participating in responding to Action Kidney Cancer consultation comments in this area due to a conflict of interest.

The Chair thanked the committee for their input.

6. Heritable RCC predisposition syndromes (including biopsy and information)

SB proceeded to present the stakeholder feedback received on heritable renal cell carcinoma predisposition syndromes.

This included the themes of specialist referral, management by tumour type, timeliness of genetic testing and genetic counselling.

The committee answered questions from the NICE team, discussed the comments as a group and agreed whether revisions to the recommendation wording were required.

MT withdrew from participating in revising any recommendation wording in relation to biopsy due to a conflict of interest.

GS withdrew from participating in revision of any recommendation wording regarding provision of information due to a conflict of interest.

GF, GS and MT withdrew from participating in responding to Kidney Cancer UK consultation comments in this area due to a conflict of interest.

RW withdrew from participating in responding to Action Kidney Cancer consultation comments in this area due to a conflict of interest.

The Chair thanked the committee for their input.

7. Active surveillance

The Chair introduced Adefisayo Abba-Abba (AA), Technical Analyst, who presented the stakeholder feedback on active surveillance.

This covered the sections of the guideline on active surveillance for oncocytomas and Bosniak cysts and active surveillance information, imaging types and scheduling.

The themes discussed included discharge and management of benign lesions.

The committee had the opportunity to discuss as a group, answer questions from the NICE team and revise the recommendation wording as required.

The Chair thanked the committee for their input.

8. Next steps and AOB

BS summarised the main actions from the day and asked for items of any other business. As there was no further business to discuss, BS brought the meeting to a close.

Date of next meeting: 25 November 2025

Location of next meeting: Virtual