# National Institute for Health and Care Excellence

#### Consultation draft

# Depression in adults: treatment and management

Appendix U2.4: Text from CG90 Appendix 16b that has been deleted

**NICE Guideline** 

**Appendices** 

May 2018

#### Disclaimer

Healthcare professionals are expected to take NICE clinical guidelines fully into account when exercising their clinical judgement. However, the guidance does not override the responsibility of healthcare professionals to make decisions appropriate to the circumstances of each patient, in consultation with the patient and/or their guardian or carer.

#### Copyright

National Institute for Health and Care Excellence [2018]. All rights reserved. Subject to Notice of rights.

# Appendix 16b: Clinical evidence profiles for psychological and psychological interventions

This appendix contains evidence profiles for reviews substantially updated or added to the guideline update (summary evidence profiles are included in the evidence chapters). The use of evidence profiles was introduced since the previous guideline was published.

Evidence profile tables summarise both the quality of the evidence and the results of the evidence synthesis. Each table includes details about the quality assessment of each outcome: quality of the included studies, number of studies and participants, limitations, information about the consistency of the evidence (based on heterogeneity – see Chapter 3), directness of the evidence (that is, how closely the outcome measures, interventions and participants match those of interest) and any other considerations (for example, effect sizes with wide confidence intervals [CIs] would be described as imprecise data). Each evidence profile also includes a summary of the findings: number of patients included in each group, an estimate of the magnitude of effect, quality of the evidence, and the importance of the evidence (where appropriate). The quality of the evidence was based on the quality assessment components (study design, limitations to study quality, consistency, directness and any other considerations) and graded using the following definitions:

**High** = further research is very unlikely to change our confidence in the estimate of the effects

**Moderate** = further research is likely to have an important impact on our confidence in the estimate of the effect and may change the estimate

**Low** = further research is very likely to have an important impact on our confidence in the estimate of the effect and is likely to change the estimate

**Very low** = any estimate of effect is very uncertain.

For further information about the process and the rationale of producing an evidence profile table see GRADE (2004) Grading quality of evidence and strength of recommendations. *British Medical Journal*, 328, 1490-1497.

#### Contents

| LOW-INTENSITY INTERVENTIONS                       | 3   |
|---|-----|
| Computerised cognitive behavioural therapy (CCBT) |     |
| Guided self-help                                  |     |
| Physical activity                                 | 20  |
| HIGH-INTENSITY INTERVENTIONS                      |     |
| Cognitive behavioural therapies                   | 40  |
| Behavioural activation                            |     |
| Problem solving                                   |     |
| Couples therapy                                   | 113 |
| Interpersonal therapy (IPT)                       | 120 |
| Counselling                                       | 158 |
| Short-term psychodynamic psychotherapy            | 164 |
| Rational emotive behaviour therapy                | 173 |

#### **LOW-INTENSITY INTERVENTIONS**

## Computerised cognitive behavioural therapy (CCBT)

#### Is CCBT effective compared with waitlist?

|                |                      |                           | Quality assess    | sment                      |                              |                      |                   | Su               | mmary of f           | indings  |         |            |
|----------------|----------------------|---------------------------|-------------------|----------------------------|------------------------------|----------------------|-------------------|------------------|----------------------|--|---------|------------|
|                |                      |                           | Quality assess    | , mene                     |                              |                      | No. of            | oatients         | ı                    | Effect   |         | Importance |
| No. of studies | Design               | Limitations               | Inconsistency     | Indirectness               | Imprecision                  | Other considerations | ССВТ              | Waitlist control | Relative<br>(95% CI) | Absolute   | Quality |            |
| Leaving        | study early fo       | or any reason             | •                 |                            | •                            | '                    |                   | •                |                      |  | 1       |            |
| 1              | randomised<br>trials | no serious<br>limitations |                   | no serious<br>indirectness | very<br>serious <sup>1</sup> | none                 | 35/102<br>(34.3%) | 42/100<br>(42%)  | RR 0.82<br>(0.57 to  | 76 fewer per<br>1000 (from<br>181 fewer to<br>67 more) | LOW     | CRITICAL   |
|                |                      |                           |                   |                            |                              |                      | ,                 | 0%               | 1.16)                | 0 fewer per<br>1000 (from 0<br>fewer to 0<br>more)     |         |            |
| Depress        | ion self-repoi       | rted measure              | s at endpoint (Be | etter indicated            | by lower val                 | ues)                 |                   |                  |                      |  |         |            |
| 1              | randomised<br>trials | no serious<br>limitations |                   | no serious<br>indirectness | very<br>serious <sup>1</sup> | none                 | 102               | 100              | -                    | SMD 0.27<br>lower (0.54<br>lower to 0.01<br>higher)    | LOW     | CRITICAL   |

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1</sup> Single study, inconclusive effect size

#### Is CCBT effective compared with discussion control?

|                |                      |                           | Quality asses               | sment                      |                           |                      |                 | Sum                | mary of fir          | ndings  |                          |            |
|----------------|----------------------|---------------------------|-----------------------------|----------------------------|---------------------------|----------------------|-----------------|--------------------|----------------------|---|--------------------------|------------|
|                |                      |                           | Quality asses               | , sincinc                  |                           |                      | No. o           | f patients         | E                    | Effect  |                          | Importance |
| No. of studies | Design               | Limitations               | Inconsistency               | Indirectness               | Imprecision               | Other considerations | ССВТ            | Discussion control | Relative<br>(95% CI) | Absolute  | Quality                  |            |
| Leaving        | study early          | •                         |                             | ·                          | •                         | '                    |                 | '                  |                      |   | •                        |            |
| 2              | randomised<br>trials | no serious<br>limitations | no serious<br>inconsistency | no serious<br>indirectness | no serious<br>imprecision | none                 | 67/239<br>(28%) | 30/238<br>(12.6%)  | RR 2.23<br>(1.51 to  | 155 more per<br>1000 (from<br>64 more to<br>287 more) | .000 (from<br>64 more to | CRITICAL   |
|                |                      |                           |                             |                            |                           |                      | , ,             | 0%                 | 3.28)                |   |                          |            |
| Depress        | ion self-repo        | rted measure              | s at endpoint (B            | etter indicate             | d by lower val            | lues)                |                 |                    |                      |   |                          |            |
| 2              | randomised<br>trials | no serious<br>limitations | very serious <sup>1</sup>   | no serious<br>indirectness | no serious<br>imprecision | none                 | 172             | 208                | -                    | SMD 0.61<br>lower (1.22<br>lower to 0<br>higher)      | LOW                      | CRITICAL   |

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1</sup> Heterogeneity >80%

#### Is CCBT effective compared with treatment as usual?

|                |   |                           | Quality assess              | sment                      |                              |                      |                 |                | Summary o                    | of findings   |          |            |
|----------------|---|---------------------------|-----------------------------|----------------------------|------------------------------|----------------------|-----------------|----------------|------------------------------|---|----------|------------|
|                |   |                           | Quality assess              |                            |                              |                      | No. of p        | atients        | E                            | ffect   |          | Importance |
| No. of studies | Design  | Limitations               | Inconsistency               | Indirectness               | Imprecision                  | Other considerations | ССВТ            | TAU<br>control | Relative<br>(95% CI)         | Absolute  | Quality  |            |
| Depress        | epression self-reported measures at endpoint (Better indicated by lower values) |                           |                             |                            |                              |                      |                 |                |                              |   |          |            |
| 1              | randomised<br>trials  | no serious<br>limitations |                             | no serious<br>indirectness | very<br>serious <sup>1</sup> | none                 | 32              | 22             | -                            | SMD 0.62<br>lower (0.91<br>lower to 0.33<br>higher) | LOW      | CRITICAL   |
| Leaving        | study early   |                           |                             |                            |                              |                      |                 |                |                              |   |          |            |
| 1              | randomised<br>trials  | no serious<br>limitations | no serious<br>inconsistency | no serious<br>indirectness | very<br>serious <sup>1</sup> | none                 | 54/146<br>(37%) | 0%             | RR 1.35<br>(0.95 to<br>1.93) | 0 more per<br>1000 (from 0<br>fewer to 0<br>more)   | LOW      | CRITICAL   |
| Depress        | ion self-repo   | rt at 3 months            | s (Better indicate          | ed by lower va             | lues)                        |                      | ı               |                |                              |   |          |            |
| 1              | randomised<br>trials  | no serious<br>limitations |                             | no serious<br>indirectness | serious <sup>2</sup>         | none                 | 95              | 100            | -                            | SMD 0.40<br>lower (0.7 to<br>0.11 lower)            | MODERATE | CRITICAL   |
| Depress        | ion self-repo   | rt at 5 months            | s (Better indicate          | ed by lower va             | lues)                        |                      |                 |                |                              |   |          |            |

| 1       | randomised<br>trials | no serious<br>limitations |                   | no serious<br>indirectness | serious <sup>2</sup> | none | 83 | 81 | - | SMD 0.42<br>lower (0.73<br>to 0.11<br>lower) | MODERATE | CRITICAL |
|---------|----------------------|---------------------------|-------------------|----------------------------|----------------------|------|----|----|---|--|----------|----------|
| Depress | ion self-repo        | rts at 8 mont             | hs (Better indica | ted by lower v             | alues)               |      |    |    |   |  |          |          |
| 1       | randomised<br>trials | no serious<br>limitations |                   | no serious<br>indirectness | serious <sup>2</sup> | none | 94 | 92 | - | SMD 0.56<br>lower (0.85<br>to 0.27<br>lower) | MODERATE | CRITICAL |

Single study, inconclusive effect size Single study

#### Is CCBT effective compared with information control?

|                |               |              | Quality asses   | sment        |                           |                      |                          | Sumi        | mary of fi              | ndings                                       |         |            |
|----------------|---------------|--------------|-----------------|--------------|---------------------------|----------------------|--------------------------|-------------|-------------------------|--|---------|------------|
|                |               |              |                 |              |                           |                      | No                       | of patients |                         | Effect                                       |         | Importance |
| No. of studies | Design        | Limitations  | Inconsistency   | Indirectness | Imprecision               | Other considerations | CCBT Informati<br>contro |             | Relative<br>(95%<br>CI) | Absolute                                     | Quality |            |
| Depressi       | on self-repor | ted measures | at endpoint (Be |              |                           |                      | ı                        |             |                         |  |         |            |
|                |               |              |                 |              | no serious<br>imprecision | none                 | 174                      | 195         | -                       | SMD 0.23<br>lower (0.43<br>to 0.02<br>lower) | HIGH    | CRITICAL   |

#### Is CCBT effective compared with any control?

|                |                     |                           |                      |                            |                           |                    |            | S               | ummary  | of findings                                       |          |            |
|----------------|---------------------|---------------------------|----------------------|----------------------------|---------------------------|--------------------|------------|-----------------|---|---|----------|------------|
|                |                     |                           | Quality asses        | ssment                     |                           |                    |            | o. of<br>tients |   | Effect  |          | Importance |
| No. of studies | Design              | Limitations               | Inconsistency        | Indirectness               | Imprecision               | Other any Relative |            |                 |   |   | Quality  |            |
| Depressi       | l<br>on self-report | l<br>t measures at        | <br>endpoint (Better | indicated by lo            | wer values)               | l                  | <b>!</b> ! |                 |   |   | l        |            |
|                |                     | no serious<br>limitations |                      | no serious<br>indirectness | none                      | 480                | 525        | -               | SMD 0.35 lower<br>(0.52 to 0.18<br>lower)         | HIGH  | CRITICAL |            |
| Depressi       | on self-report      | t measures at             | 3-month follow-      | up (Better indic           | ated by lower             | values)            |            |                 |   |   |          |            |
|                |                     | no serious<br>limitations |                      | no serious<br>indirectness | very serious <sup>1</sup> | none               | 33         | 21              | -   | SMD 0.10 higher<br>(0.45 lower to<br>0.65 higher) | LOW      | CRITICAL   |
| Depressi       | on self-report      | t measures at             | 5-month follow-      | up (Better indic           | ated by lower             | values)            | •          |                 |   |   |          |            |
|                |                     | no serious<br>limitations |                      | no serious<br>indirectness | none                      | 30                 | 17         | -               | SMD 0.39 higher<br>(0.21 lower to<br>0.99 higher) | LOW   | CRITICAL |            |
| Depressi       | on self-repor       | t measures at             | 6-month follow-      | up (Better indic           | values)                   | •                  |            |                 |   |   |          |            |

|          | randomised<br>trials | no serious<br>limitations | no serious<br>inconsistency | no serious<br>indirectness | very serious <sup>1</sup> | none      | 106 | 131 | - | SMD 0.20 lower<br>(0.46 lower to<br>0.06 higher) | LOW  | CRITICAL |
|----------|----------------------|---------------------------|-----------------------------|----------------------------|---------------------------|-----------|-----|-----|---|--|------|----------|
| Depressi | on self-report       | t measures at             | 8-month follow-u            | up (Better indic           | ated by lower             | values)   |     |     |   |  |      |          |
|          | randomised<br>trials | no serious<br>limitations | no serious<br>inconsistency | no serious<br>indirectness | very serious <sup>1</sup> | none      | 33  | 20  | - | SMD 0.04 higher<br>(0.51 lower to<br>0.6 higher) | LOW  | CRITICAL |
| Depressi | on self-report       | t measures at             | 12-month follow             | -up (Better ind            | icated by lowe            | r values) |     |     |   |  |      |          |
|          | randomised<br>trials | no serious<br>limitations | no serious<br>inconsistency | no serious<br>indirectness | no serious<br>imprecision | none      | 196 | 224 | - | SMD 0.23 lower<br>(0.43 to 0.04<br>lower)        | HIGH | CRITICAL |

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>†</sup> Single study, inconclusive effect size

#### Is CCBT effective compared with psychoeducation control?

|                |                      |               | Quality asses | ssment                     |                      |                      |                   | Summa                   | ry of find                   | ings  |          |            |
|----------------|----------------------|---------------|---------------|----------------------------|----------------------|----------------------|-------------------|-------------------------|------------------------------|---|----------|------------|
|                |                      |               |               |                            |                      |                      |                   | o. of patients          | Ef                           | fect  |          | Importance |
| No. of studies | Design               | Limitations   | Inconsistency | Indirectness               | Imprecision          | Other considerations | ССВТ              | Psychoeducation control | Relative<br>(95% CI)         | Absolute                                    | Quality  |            |
| Leaving        | study early f        | for any reaso | on            |                            |                      | '                    |                   |                         |                              |   |          |            |
| 1              | randomised<br>trials |               |               | no serious<br>indirectness | serious <sup>1</sup> |                      | 46/182<br>(25.3%) | 25/165 (15 2%)          | RR 1.67<br>(1.08 to<br>2.59) | 102 more<br>per 1000<br>(from 12<br>more to | MODERATE | CRITICAL   |

| Depress | sion self repo       | ort measures | at endpoint (B              | etter indicate | ed by lower v                | values) |     | 0%  |   | 241 more) 0 more per 1000 (from 0 more to 0 more)     |     |          |
|---------|----------------------|--------------|-----------------------------|----------------|------------------------------|---------|-----|-----|---|---|-----|----------|
|         | randomised<br>trials |              | no serious<br>inconsistency |                | very<br>serious <sup>2</sup> | none    | 136 | 140 | - | SMD 0.03<br>lower<br>(0.27<br>lower to<br>0.2 higher) | LOW | CRITICAL |

#### Is CCBT effective compared with group CBT?

|                |                |               | Quality assess | sment                      |                              |                      | Summary of findings |                         |                              |  |         |            |
|----------------|----------------|---------------|----------------|----------------------------|------------------------------|----------------------|---------------------|-------------------------|------------------------------|--|---------|------------|
|                |                |               |                |                            |                              |                      | No. of              | patients                | l                            | Effect   |         | Importance |
| No. of studies | Design         | Limitations   | Inconsistency  | Indirectness               | Imprecision                  | Other considerations | ССВТ                | Group<br>CBT<br>control | CBT Relative Absolute        |  | Quality |            |
| Leaving        | study early fo | or any reason | I              |                            | ı                            |                      |                     | '                       |                              |  | '       |            |
| 1              |                |               |                | no serious<br>indirectness | very<br>serious <sup>1</sup> | none                 | 35/102<br>(34.3%)   | 43/99<br>(43.4%)        | RR 0.79<br>(0.56 to<br>1.12) | 91 fewer per<br>1000 (from<br>191 fewer to<br>52 more) | LOW     | CRITICAL   |

Single study

2 Single study, inconclusive effect size

|         |                      |               |                 |                            |                              |      |     | 0% |   | 0 fewer per<br>1000 (from 0<br>fewer to 0<br>more)   |     |          |
|---------|----------------------|---------------|-----------------|----------------------------|------------------------------|------|-----|----|---|--|-----|----------|
| Depress | ion self repor       | t measures at | endpoint (Bette | er indicated by            | lower value                  | s)   |     |    |   |  |     |          |
| 1       | randomised<br>trials |               |                 | no serious<br>indirectness | very<br>serious <sup>1</sup> | none | 102 | 99 | 1 | SMD 0.06<br>higher (0.22<br>lower to 0.34<br>higher) | LOW | CRITICAL |

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1</sup> Single study, inconclusive effect size

#### Is CCBT effective compared with any active control?

|                |                      |                           | Quality assess       | ment                       |                              |                      |       | S          | ummary                  | of findings                                       |         |            |
|----------------|----------------------|---------------------------|----------------------|----------------------------|------------------------------|----------------------|-------|------------|-------------------------|---|---------|------------|
|                |                      |                           | •                    |                            |                              |                      | No. o | f patients |                         | Effect  |         | Importance |
| No. of studies | Design               | Limitations               | Inconsistency        | Indirectness               | Imprecision                  | Other considerations | ССВТ  | •          | Relative<br>(95%<br>CI) | Absolute  | Quality | •          |
| Depressi       | on self report       | measures at 6             | month follow u       | p (Better indica           | values)                      |                      |       |            |                         |   |         |            |
|                | randomised<br>trials | no serious<br>limitations |                      | no serious<br>indirectness | very<br>serious <sup>1</sup> | none                 | 106   | 115        | -                       | SMD 0.05 higher<br>(0.21 lower to<br>0.31 higher) | LOW     | CRITICAL   |
| Depressi       | on self report       | measures at1              | 2 month follow ι     | ıp (Better indica          | ated by lowe                 | r values)            |       |            |                         |   |         |            |
|                | randomised<br>trials | no serious<br>limitations | serious <sup>2</sup> | no serious<br>indirectness | serious <sup>3</sup>         | none                 | 196   | 206        | -                       | SMD 0.02 lower<br>(0.22 lower to                  | LOW     | CRITICAL   |

|  |  |  |  |  | 0.17 higher) |  |
|--|--|--|--|--|--------------|--|
|  |  |  |  |  |              |  |

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1</sup> Single study, inconclusive effect size <sup>2</sup> Heterogeneity >50% <sup>3</sup> Inconclusive effect size

## Guided self-help

Is individual guided self-help (with minimal support) effective compared with waitlist control?

|                |                      |                           | Quality asses   | ssment                                  |                           |                      |   | Sum   | mary of fi                   | ndings  |          |            |
|----------------|----------------------|---------------------------|-----------------|---|---------------------------|----------------------|---|-------|------------------------------|---|----------|------------|
|                |                      |                           | Quality asset   | ,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,, |                           |                      | No. of pat  | ients | Ef                           | ffect   |          |            |
| No. of studies | Design               | Limitations               | Inconsistency   | Indirectness                            | Imprecision               | Other considerations | Individual<br>guided self-<br>help (with<br>minimal<br>support) |       | Relative<br>(95% CI)         | Absolute  | Quality  | Importance |
| Leaving        | study early          |                           | l               |   |                           |                      |   |       |                              |   | I        |            |
| 6              | randomised<br>trials | no serious<br>limitations |                 | no serious<br>indirectness              | serious <sup>1</sup>      | none                 | 14/115<br>(12.2%)   | 0%    | RR 1.71<br>(0.62 to<br>4.69) | 0 more per<br>1000 (from<br>0 fewer to<br>0 more) |          | CRITICAL   |
| Depress        | ion self-repo        | rt (Better ind            | dicated by lowe | er values)                              |                           |                      |   |       |                              |   |          |            |
| 5              | randomised<br>trials | no serious<br>limitations |                 |   | no serious<br>imprecision | none                 | 78  | 81    | -                            | SMD 0.98<br>lower (1.5<br>to 0.47                 | MODERATE | CRITICAL   |

|         |                      |              |                  |                            |                           |      |     |     |   | lower)   |          |          |
|---------|----------------------|--------------|------------------|----------------------------|---------------------------|------|-----|-----|---|--|----------|----------|
| Depress | sion self-repo       | rt at 12 mon | ths (Better indi | cated by lowe              | er values)                | '    |     |     |   |  |          |          |
|         | randomised<br>trials |              |                  | no serious<br>indirectness | serious <sup>3</sup>      | none | 107 | 109 | - | SMD 0.20<br>lower (0.47<br>lower to<br>0.07<br>higher) | MODERATE | CRITICAL |
| Depress | sion clinician-      | report (Bett | er indicated by  | lower values)              |                           |      |     |     |   |  |          |          |
|         | randomised<br>trials |              |                  |                            | no serious<br>imprecision | none | 79  | 82  | - | SMD 1.54<br>lower (1.9<br>to 1.18<br>lower)            | HIGH     | CRITICAL |

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1</sup> Inconclusive ES
<sup>2</sup> Heterogeneity >50%
<sup>3</sup> Single study

#### Is individual guided self-help (with support) effective compared with treatment as usual?

|                |                      |                | Quality asses    | sment                      |                              |                      |  | Summa                 | ry of findi                   | ngs   |         |            |
|----------------|----------------------|----------------|------------------|----------------------------|------------------------------|----------------------|--|-----------------------|-------------------------------|---|---------|------------|
|                |                      |                | <b>4</b> ,       |                            |                              |                      | No. of p   | atients               | E                             | ffect   |         |            |
| No. of studies | Design               | Limitations    | Inconsistency    | Indirectness               | Imprecision                  | Other considerations | Individual<br>guided self-<br>help (with<br>support) | Treatment<br>as usual | Relative<br>(95% CI)          | Absolute  | Quality | Importance |
| Leaving        | study early          |                |                  |                            | ı                            | •                    | •  |                       | •                             | •   | '       | 1          |
|                | randomised<br>trials |                |                  | no serious<br>indirectness | very<br>serious <sup>1</sup> | none                 | 7/29 (24.1%)   | 0%                    | RR 7.24<br>(0.95 to<br>55.26) | 0 more per<br>1000 (from<br>0 fewer to 0<br>more)   |         | CRITICAL   |
| Depress        | sion self-repo       | rt (Better ind | licated by lower | r values)                  |                              |                      |  |                       |                               |   |         |            |
|                | randomised<br>trials |                |                  |                            | very<br>serious <sup>1</sup> | none                 | 19   | 23                    | -                             | SMD 0.27<br>lower (0.88<br>lower to<br>0.34 higher) | LOW     | CRITICAL   |

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1</sup> Single study; inconclusive ES

#### Is individual guided self-help (minimal support) effective compared with control?

|                |                      |                           | Quality asses    | ssment                     |                           |                      |  | Sun     | nmary of fir                   | ndings  |          |            |
|----------------|----------------------|---------------------------|------------------|----------------------------|---------------------------|----------------------|--|---------|--------------------------------|---|----------|------------|
|                |                      |                           |                  |                            |                           |                      | No. of pat   | ients   | Eff                            | ect   |          |            |
| No. of studies | Design               | Limitations               | Inconsistency    | Indirectness               | Imprecision               | Other considerations | Individual<br>guided self-<br>help<br>(minimal<br>support) | Control | Relative<br>(95% CI)           | Absolute  | Quality  | Importance |
| Leaving        | study early          |                           |                  | l                          | l                         | '                    | •  |         |                                | <u>I</u>  |          |            |
| 2              | randomised<br>trials | no serious<br>limitations |                  |                            | no serious<br>imprecision | none                 | 103/248<br>(41.5%)   | 0%      | RR 10.77<br>(0 to<br>31281.62) | 0 more per<br>1000 (from<br>0 fewer to<br>0 more) | MODERATE | CRITICAL   |
| Depress        | ion self-repo        | rt (Better in             | dicated by lowe  | er values)                 |                           |                      |  |         |                                |   |          |            |
| 1              | randomised<br>trials | no serious<br>Iimitations |                  | no serious<br>indirectness | serious <sup>2</sup>      | none                 | 102  | 102     | -                              | SMD 0.49<br>lower (0.77<br>to 0.21<br>lower)      | MODERATE | CRITICAL   |
| Depress        | ion self-repo        | rt at 12 mon              | ths (Better indi | icated by lowe             | er values)                |                      |  |         |                                |   |          |            |
| 1              | randomised<br>trials |                           |                  | no serious<br>indirectness | serious <sup>2</sup>      | none                 | 102  | 102     | -                              | SMD 0.42<br>lower (0.7<br>to 0.14<br>lower)       | MODERATE | CRITICAL   |

#### Is individual guided self-help (with support) effective compared with waitlist control?

|                |                      |                | Quality asses               | sment        |                              |                      |  | Summ  | ary of find                  | ings  |         |            |
|----------------|----------------------|----------------|-----------------------------|--------------|------------------------------|----------------------|--|-------|------------------------------|---|---------|------------|
|                |                      |                | <b>4</b> ,                  |              |                              |                      | No. of pat   | ients | E                            | ffect   |         |            |
| No. of studies | Design               | Limitations    | Inconsistency               | Indirectness | Imprecision                  | Other considerations | Individual<br>guided self-<br>help (with<br>support) |       | Relative<br>(95% CI)         | Absolute  | Quality | Importance |
| Leaving        | study early          |                |                             |              |                              | •                    |  |       |                              |   |         |            |
| 1              | randomised<br>trials |                | no serious<br>inconsistency |              | very<br>serious <sup>1</sup> | none                 | 1/15 (6.7%)  | 0%    | RR 0.50<br>(0.05 to<br>4.94) | 0 fewer per<br>1000 (from 0<br>fewer to 0<br>more)  | LOW     | CRITICAL   |
| Depress        | ion self-repo        | rt (Better ind | icated by lower             | values)      |                              |                      |  |       |                              |   |         |            |
| 1              | randomised<br>trials |                | no serious<br>inconsistency |              | very<br>serious <sup>1</sup> | none                 | 13   | 11    | -                            | SMD 0.28<br>lower (1.08<br>lower to<br>0.53 higher) | LOW     | CRITICAL   |

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1</sup> Single study; inconclusive ES

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1</sup> Heterogeneity >50% <sup>2</sup> Single study

#### Is group guided self-help effective compared with waitlist control?

|                |                      |                           | Quality asses               | sment                      |                              |                |                              | Su      | mmary o              | f findings  |          |            |
|----------------|----------------------|---------------------------|-----------------------------|----------------------------|------------------------------|----------------|------------------------------|---------|----------------------|---|----------|------------|
|                |                      |                           | Quality assess              |                            |                              |                | No. of p                     | atients | ا                    | Effect  |          | Importance |
| No. of studies | Design               | Limitations               | Inconsistency               | Indirectness               | Imprecision                  | considerations | Group<br>guided<br>self-help | control | Relative<br>(95% CI) | Absolute  | Quality  | importance |
| Leaving        | study early          | l                         | ı                           | ı                          | '                            | •              |                              |         |                      |   |          |            |
| 1              | randomised<br>trials | no serious<br>limitations | no serious<br>inconsistency | no serious<br>indirectness | serious <sup>1</sup>         | none           | 0/11<br>(0%)                 | 0%      | RR 0 (0<br>to 0)     | 0 fewer per<br>1000 (from 0<br>fewer to 0<br>fewer) | MODERATE | CRITICAL   |
| Depress        | ion self-repo        | rt (Better indi           | cated by lower              | values)                    |                              |                |                              |         |                      |   |          |            |
| 1              | randomised<br>trials | no serious<br>limitations | no serious<br>inconsistency | no serious<br>indirectness | very<br>serious <sup>2</sup> | none           | 11                           | 10      | -                    | SMD 0.67<br>lower (1.56<br>lower to 0.21<br>higher) | LOW      | CRITICAL   |
| Depress        | ion self-repo        | rt at 3-month             | s (Better indicat           | ted by lower v             | alues)                       |                |                              |         |                      |   |          |            |
| 1              | randomised<br>trials | no serious<br>limitations | no serious<br>inconsistency | no serious<br>indirectness | very<br>serious <sup>2</sup> | none           | 30                           | 25      | -                    | SMD 0.51<br>lower (1.05<br>lower to 0.03<br>higher) | LOW      | CRITICAL   |

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1</sup> Single study <sup>2</sup> Single study; inconclusive ES

#### Is group guided self-help effective compared with treatment as usual?

|                |                      |                           | Quality asses               | sment                      |                      |                 |                              | Sum                   | nmary of fi                  | indings  |          |            |
|----------------|----------------------|---------------------------|-----------------------------|----------------------------|----------------------|-----------------|------------------------------|-----------------------|------------------------------|--|----------|------------|
|                |                      |                           | Quality asses               | oc.ii                      |                      |                 | No. of                       | patients              | E-                           | ffect  |          | Importance |
| No. of studies | Design               | Limitations               | Inconsistency               | Indirectness               | Imprecision          | lconsiderations | Group<br>guided<br>self-help | Treatment<br>as usual | Relative<br>(95% CI)         | Absolute   | Quality  |            |
| Leaving        | study early          |                           | ı                           | l                          | ı                    |                 |                              |                       |                              |  | ı        |            |
| 1              | randomised<br>trials | no serious<br>limitations | no serious<br>inconsistency | no serious<br>indirectness | serious <sup>1</sup> | none            | 35/205<br>(17.1%)            | 0%                    | RR 2.16<br>(1.08 to<br>4.34) | 0 more per<br>1000 (from<br>0 more to 0<br>more) | MODERATE | CRITICAL   |
| Depress        | ion self-repo        | rt (Better ind            | licated by lowe             | r values)                  |                      |                 |                              |                       |                              |  |          |            |
| 1              | randomised<br>trials | no serious<br>limitations | no serious<br>inconsistency | no serious<br>indirectness | serious <sup>1</sup> | none            | 82                           | 40                    | -                            | SMD 0.45<br>lower (0.83<br>to 0.07<br>lower)     | MODERATE | CRITICAL   |

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1</sup> Single study

#### Is guided self-help (with support by mail) effective compared with waitlist control?

|                |                      |                | Quality asses               | ssment                     |                      |                      |   | Sun     | nmary of f                   | indings  |          |            |
|----------------|----------------------|----------------|-----------------------------|----------------------------|----------------------|----------------------|---|---------|------------------------------|--|----------|------------|
|                |                      |                |                             |                            |                      |                      | No. of pa   | itients | E                            | ffect  |          |            |
| No. of studies | Design               | Limitations    | Inconsistency               | Indirectness               | Imprecision          | Other considerations | Guided<br>self-help<br>(with<br>support by<br>mail) | control | Relative<br>(95% CI)         | Absolute   | Quality  | Importance |
| Leaving        | study early          | 1              |                             | l                          |                      | '                    |   |         |                              |  |          |            |
| 3              | randomised<br>trials |                | no serious<br>inconsistency | no serious<br>indirectness | serious <sup>1</sup> | none                 | 25/167<br>(15%)                                     | 0%      | RR 1.75<br>(0.67 to<br>4.65) | 0 more per<br>1000 (from<br>0 fewer to 0<br>more)  | MODERATE | CRITICAL   |
| Depress        | ion self-repo        | rt (Better ind | licated by lowe             | r values)                  |                      |                      |   |         |                              |  |          |            |
| 1              | randomised<br>trials |                |                             | no serious<br>indirectness | serious <sup>2</sup> | none                 | 28  | 67      | -                            | SMD 0.57<br>lower (1.02<br>to 0.12<br>lower)       | MODERATE | CRITICAL   |
| Depress        | ion self-repo        | rt at 1-montl  | n (Better indica            | ted by lower v             | alues)               |                      |   |         |                              |  |          |            |
| 3              | randomised<br>trials |                | no serious<br>inconsistency | no serious<br>indirectness | serious <sup>1</sup> | none                 | 158   | 100     | -                            | SMD 0.08<br>lower (0.3<br>lower to<br>0.13 higher) | MODERATE |            |

|      | randomised<br>trials | no serious<br>limitations | no serious<br>inconsistency | no serious<br>indirectness | very serious <sup>3</sup> | none | 50 | 46 | - | SMD 0.02<br>higher (0.38<br>lower to<br>0.42 higher) | LOW | CRITICA |
|------|----------------------|---------------------------|-----------------------------|----------------------------|---------------------------|------|----|----|---|--|-----|---------|
| pres | sion self-repo       | ort at 6-mont             | hs (Better indic            | ated by lower              | values)                   |      |    |    |   | 1  |     |         |
|      |                      | i                         |                             | no serious                 | no serious                |      |    |    |   | SMD 0.32   |     |         |

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1</sup> Inconclusive ES
<sup>2</sup> Single study
<sup>3</sup> Single study; inconclusive ES

## Physical activity

Is supervised aerobic physical activity plus antidepressants effective compared with combination antidepressants?

|                |                      |               | Quality asses               | ssment                                  |                      |                      |             | Summa       | ry of find                   | ings  |          |            |
|----------------|----------------------|---------------|-----------------------------|---|----------------------|----------------------|-------------|-------------|------------------------------|---|----------|------------|
|                |                      |               | Quality asset               | ,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,,, |                      |                      | No. of      | patients    | Ef                           | fect  |          | Importance |
| No. of studies | Design               | Limitations   | Inconsistency               | Indirectness                            | Imprecision          | Other considerations | l aerobic+  | Combination | Relative<br>(95% CI)         | l Absolute  | Quality  | importance |
| Clinicia       | n-rated depre        | ession scores | s (Better indica            | ted by lower                            | values)              | •                    | •           | •           |                              | -   | !        | '          |
| 1              | randomised<br>trials |               | no serious<br>inconsistency | no serious<br>indirectness              | serious <sup>1</sup> | none                 | 10          | 20          | -                            | SMD 1.04<br>lower<br>(1.85 to<br>0.23<br>lower)       | MODERATE | CRITICAL   |
| Leaving        | treatment e          | arly due side | effects                     |   |                      | '                    |             |             |                              |   |          |            |
| 1              | randomised<br>trials |               | no serious<br>inconsistency | no serious<br>indirectness              | - /                  | none                 | 5/55 (9.1%) | 0%          | RR 0.87<br>(0.27 to<br>2.83) | 0 fewer<br>per 1000<br>(from 0<br>fewer to 0<br>more) | LOW      | CRITICAL   |

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1</sup> Single study

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>2</sup> Single study and inconclusive effect size

#### Is physical activity (supervised) effective compared with no physical activity control?

|                |  |               | Quality asses               | ssment                     |                              |                      |                                      | Sumn                                  | nary of fin          | dings   |         |            |
|----------------|--|---------------|-----------------------------|----------------------------|------------------------------|----------------------|--------------------------------------|---------------------------------------|----------------------|---|---------|------------|
|                |  |               | •                           |                            |                              |                      | No. of pat                           | tients                                | Et                   | ffect   |         |            |
| No. of studies | Design   | Limitations   | Inconsistency               | Indirectness               | Imprecision                  | Other considerations | Physical<br>activity<br>(supervised) | No<br>physical<br>activity<br>control | Relative<br>(95% CI) | Absolute  | Quality | Importance |
| Clinicia       | n-rated depre  | ession scores | (Better indicat             | ed by lower v              | alues)                       |                      |                                      |                                       |                      |   |         | '          |
|                | randomised<br>trials   |               | no serious<br>inconsistency |                            | no serious<br>imprecision    | none                 | 110                                  | 103                                   | -                    | SMD 1.26<br>lower (2.12<br>to 0.37<br>lower)            | HIGH    | CRITICAL   |
| Clinicia       | n-rated depre  | ession scores | at 24 weeks (E              | Better indicate            | d by lower v                 | alues)               |                                      |                                       |                      |   |         |            |
|                | randomised<br>trials   |               | no serious<br>inconsistency | no serious<br>indirectness | very<br>serious <sup>1</sup> | none                 | 12                                   | 11                                    | -                    | SMD 0.15<br>higher<br>(0.67 lower<br>to 0.97<br>higher) | LOW     | CRITICAL   |
| Clinicia       | nician-rated depression scores at 34-36 weeks (Better indicated by lower values) |               |                             |                            |                              |                      |                                      |                                       |                      |   |         |            |
|                | randomised<br>trials   |               | no serious<br>inconsistency |                            | no serious<br>imprecision    | none                 | 56                                   | 57                                    | -                    | SMD 0.38<br>lower (0.75<br>to 0.01<br>lower)            | HIGH    | CRITICAL   |

| Self-rat | ed depressio         | n scores (Bet | ter indicated b             | y lower value              | s)                           |      |                   |     |                     |  |         |          |
|----------|----------------------|---------------|-----------------------------|----------------------------|------------------------------|------|-------------------|-----|---------------------|--|---------|----------|
| 7        | randomised<br>trials |               | no serious<br>inconsistency | no serious<br>indirectness | no serious<br>imprecision    | none | 214               | 190 | -                   | SMD 0.74<br>lower (1.19<br>to 0.29<br>lower)           | HIGH    | CRITICAL |
| Self-rat | ed depressio         | n scores at 4 | weeks (Better               | indicated by I             | ower values)                 |      |                   |     |                     |  |         |          |
| 1        | randomised<br>trials |               | no serious<br>inconsistency | no serious<br>indirectness | serious <sup>2</sup>         | none | 48                | 34  | -                   | SMD 1.58<br>lower (2.09<br>to 1.08 Mo<br>lower)        | ODERATE | CRITICAL |
| Self-rat | ed depression        | n scores at 8 | weeks (Better               | indicated by l             | ower values)                 |      |                   |     |                     |  | 1       |          |
| 1        | randomised<br>trials |               | no serious<br>inconsistency | no serious<br>indirectness | serious <sup>2</sup>         | none | 48                | 34  | -                   | SMD 1.06<br>lower (1.53<br>to 0.59 Milliower)          | ODERATE | CRITICAL |
| Self-rat | ed depression        | n scores at 3 | 4 weeks (Bette              | r indicated by             | lower values                 | 5)   |                   |     |                     | 1  |         |          |
| 1        | randomised<br>trials |               | no serious<br>inconsistency | no serious<br>indirectness | very<br>serious <sup>1</sup> | none | 43                | 43  | -                   | SMD 0.24<br>lower (0.67<br>lower to<br>0.18<br>higher) | LOW     | CRITICAL |
| Leaving  | treatment e          | arly          |                             |                            |                              |      |                   |     |                     |  |         | _        |
| 3        | randomised<br>trials |               | no serious<br>inconsistency | no serious<br>indirectness | serious <sup>3</sup>         | none | 17/104<br>(16.3%) | 0%  | RR 1.47<br>(0.72 to | 0 more per<br>1000 (from<br>0 fewer to                 | ODERATE | CRITICAL |

|  |  |  |  | 3.01) | 0 more) |  |
|--|--|--|--|-------|---------|--|
|  |  |  |  |       |         |  |

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1</sup> Single study and inconclusive effect size <sup>2</sup> Single study <sup>3</sup> Inconclusive effect size

#### Is physical activity (unsupervised) effective compared with no physical activity control?

|                |                      |                           | Quality asses               | sment          |                              |                      |                                     | Summary                               | of findin               | ıgs  |         |            |
|----------------|----------------------|---------------------------|-----------------------------|----------------|------------------------------|----------------------|-------------------------------------|---------------------------------------|-------------------------|--|---------|------------|
|                |                      |                           | Quality asses               |                |                              |                      | No. of pation                       | ents                                  | E                       | ffect  |         |            |
| No. of studies | Design               | Limitations               | Inconsistency               | Indirectness   | Imprecision                  | Other considerations | Physical activity<br>(unsupervised) | No<br>physical<br>activity<br>control | Relative<br>(95%<br>CI) | Absolute   | Quality | Importance |
| Self-rate      | ed depression        | scores (Bet               | ter indicated by            | lower values   | )                            |                      |                                     | _                                     | •                       | ı  | 1       |            |
| 1              | randomised<br>trials | no serious<br>Iimitations | no serious<br>inconsistency |                | very<br>serious <sup>1</sup> | none                 | 11                                  | 15                                    | -                       | SMD 0.42<br>higher (0.37<br>lower to<br>1.21 higher) | LOW     | CRITICAL   |
| Self-rate      | ed depression        | n scores at 24            | weeks (Better               | indicated by I | ower values                  | )                    |                                     |                                       |                         |  |         |            |
| 1              | randomised<br>trials | no serious<br>Iimitations | no serious<br>inconsistency |                | very<br>serious <sup>1</sup> | none                 | 14                                  | 18                                    | -                       | SMD 0.10<br>higher (0.6<br>lower to 0.8<br>higher)   | LOW     | CRITICAL   |

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1</sup> Single study and inconclusive effect size

#### Is physical activity (supervised) effective compared with pill placebo?

|                |                      |              | Quality asses               | ssment                     |                              |                      |                                | Sumi  | mary of fir                  | ndings   |         |            |
|----------------|----------------------|--------------|-----------------------------|----------------------------|------------------------------|----------------------|--------------------------------|-------|------------------------------|--|---------|------------|
|                |                      |              | <b>_</b>                    |                            |                              |                      | No. of pat                     | ients | E:                           | ffect  |         | Importance |
| No. of studies | Design               | Limitations  | Inconsistency               | Indirectness               | Imprecision                  | Other considerations | Physical activity (supervised) |       | Relative<br>(95% CI)         | Absolute   | Quality | portunec   |
| Cliniciar      | ı<br>n-rated depre   | ssion scores | (Better indicat             | ed by lower va             | alues)                       | ı                    |                                | ı     |                              |  | I       |            |
| 1              | randomised<br>trials |              |                             | no serious<br>indirectness | very<br>serious <sup>1</sup> | none                 | 51                             | 49    | -                            | SMD 0.27<br>lower (0.67<br>lower to<br>0.12<br>higher) | LOW     | CRITICAL   |
| Leaving        | treatment ea         | arly         |                             | '                          |                              | '                    |                                | _     |                              |  | '       |            |
| 3              | randomised<br>trials |              | no serious<br>inconsistency | no serious<br>indirectness | serious <sup>2</sup>         | none                 | 12/87<br>(13.8%)               | 0%    | RR 0.64<br>(0.33 to<br>1.23) | 0 fewer per<br>1000 (from<br>0 fewer to<br>0 more)     |         | CRITICAL   |

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1</sup> Single study and inconclusive effect size <sup>2</sup> Inconclusive effect size

#### Is physical activity (unsupervised) effective compared with pill placebo?

|                |                      |               | Quality asses  | coment                     |                              |                      |  | Summ | ary of find                  | lings  |          |            |
|----------------|----------------------|---------------|----------------|----------------------------|------------------------------|----------------------|--|------|------------------------------|--|----------|------------|
|                |                      |               | Quality asses  | Sillelli                   |                              |                      | No. of patie                           | ents | Ef                           | fect   |          | Importance |
| No. of studies | Design               | Limitations   | Inconsistency  | Indirectness               | Imprecision                  | Other considerations | Physical<br>activity<br>(unsupervised) |      | Relative<br>(95% CI)         | I Ahsolute   | Quality  | Importance |
| Clinicia       | n-rated depr         | ession scores | (Better indica | ted by lower               | values)                      | '                    | •                                      |      |                              |  | ı        | '          |
| 1              | randomised<br>trials |               |                | no serious<br>indirectness | very<br>serious <sup>1</sup> | none                 | 53                                     | 49   | -                            | SMD 0.12<br>lower (0.5<br>lower to<br>0.27<br>higher)  | LOW      | CRITICAL   |
| Leaving        | treatment            |               |                |                            |                              |                      |  |      |                              |  |          |            |
| 1              | randomised<br>trials |               |                | no serious<br>indirectness | serious <sup>2</sup>         | none                 | 3/53 (5.7%)                            | 0%   | RR 0.20<br>(0.06 to<br>0.65) | 0 fewer<br>per 1000<br>(from 0<br>fewer to 0<br>fewer) | MODERATE | CRITICAL   |

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1</sup> Single study and inconclusive effect size <sup>2</sup> Single study

#### Is physical activity (supervised) effective compared with waitlist control?

|                |                      |                           | Quality asses               | smant                      |                              |                      |                                | Summa               | ry of find              | lings   |         |            |
|----------------|----------------------|---------------------------|-----------------------------|----------------------------|------------------------------|----------------------|--------------------------------|---------------------|-------------------------|---|---------|------------|
|                |                      |                           | Quanty asses                | Silient                    |                              |                      | No. of pati                    | ents                |                         | Effect  |         | Importance |
| No. of studies | Design               | Limitations               | Inconsistency               | Indirectness               | Imprecision                  | Other considerations | Physical activity (supervised) | Waitlist<br>control | Relative<br>(95%<br>CI) | Absolute  | Quality |            |
| Clinician      | ı<br>ı-rated depre   | ssion scores (            | Better indicated            | d by lower valu            | ues)                         |                      |                                |                     | '                       |   |         |            |
|                | randomised<br>trials | no serious<br>limitations | no serious<br>inconsistency | no serious<br>indirectness | very<br>serious <sup>1</sup> | none                 | 10                             | 12                  | -                       | SMD 0.49<br>lower (1.35<br>lower to 0.36<br>higher) | LOW     | CRITICAL   |
| Clinician      | -rated depre         | ssion scores a            | at 12 weeks (Be             | tter indicated             | by lower valu                | ues)                 |                                |                     |                         |   | •       |            |
| 1              | randomised<br>trials | no serious<br>limitations | no serious<br>inconsistency | no serious<br>indirectness | very<br>serious <sup>1</sup> | none                 | 10                             | 9                   | -                       | SMD 0.34<br>lower (1.24<br>lower to 0.57<br>higher) | LOW     | CRITICAL   |

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1</sup> Single study and inconclusive effect size

#### Is physical activity (supervised aerobic) effective compared with antidepressants?

|                |                      |                           | Quality asses                           | sment                      |                              |                      |   | Sı | ımmary of            | findings   |          |            |
|----------------|----------------------|---------------------------|---|----------------------------|------------------------------|----------------------|---|----|----------------------|--|----------|------------|
|                |                      |                           | <b>4</b> ,                              |                            |                              |                      | No. of patien                                   | ts | E                    | ffect  |          |            |
| No. of studies | Design               | Limitations               | Inconsistency                           | Indirectness               | Imprecision                  | Other considerations | Physical<br>activity<br>(supervised<br>aerobic) | AD | Relative<br>(95% CI) | Absolute   | Quality  | Importance |
| Clinician      | rated depre          | ssion scores (            | Better indicated                        | d by lower valu            | ues)                         | •                    |   | •  |                      |  |          |            |
| 2              | randomised<br>trials | no serious<br>Iimitations | , | no serious<br>indirectness | serious <sup>2</sup>         | none                 | 51  | 49 | -                    | MD 0.75<br>lower (1.79<br>lower to 0.28<br>higher) | VERY LOW | CRITICAL   |
| Self-rate      | ed depression        | scores (Bette             | er indicated by I                       | ower values)               |                              | '                    |   |    |                      |  |          |            |
| 1              | randomised<br>trials |                           |   | no serious<br>indirectness | very<br>serious <sup>3</sup> | none                 | 53  | 48 | -                    | SMD 0.19<br>lower (0.58<br>lower to 0.2<br>higher) | LOW      | CRITICAL   |
| Leaving        | treatment ea         | rly                       |   |                            | '                            |                      |   | •  | '                    |  |          |            |
| 2              | randomised           | no serious                | no serious                              | no serious                 | serious <sup>2</sup>         | none                 | 24/104  | 0% | RR 1.59              | 0 more per   |          | CRITICAL   |

| trials | limitations | inconsistency | indirectness |  | (23.1%) | (0.87 to | 1000 (from 0 | MODERATE |  |
|--------|-------------|---------------|--------------|--|---------|----------|--------------|----------|--|
|        |             |               |              |  |         | 2.9)     | fewer to 0   |          |  |
|        |             |               |              |  |         |          | more)        |          |  |
|        |             |               |              |  |         |          |              |          |  |

#### Is physical activity (unsupervised aerobic) effective compared with antidepressants?

|                |   |             | Quality asses | sment                      |                      |                      |  | Sun | nmary of f                   | indings  |          |            |
|----------------|---|-------------|---------------|----------------------------|----------------------|----------------------|--|-----|------------------------------|--|----------|------------|
|                |   |             | <b></b>       |                            |                      |                      | No .of patient                                 | s   | E                            | ffect  |          | Importance |
| No. of studies | Design  | Limitations | Inconsistency | Indirectness               | Imprecision          | Other considerations | Physical activity<br>(unsupervised<br>aerobic) |     | Relative<br>(95% CI)         | Absolute   | Quality  |            |
| Clinician      | nician-rated depression scores (Better indicated by lower values) |             |               |                            |                      |                      |  |     |                              |  |          |            |
| 1              | randomised<br>trials  |             |               | no serious<br>indirectness | serious <sup>1</sup> | none                 | 53 49  |     | -                            | SMD 1.03<br>lower (1.44<br>to 0.61<br>lower)       | MODERATE | CRITICAL   |
| Leaving        | treatment ea  | irly        |               |                            |                      |                      |  |     |                              |  |          |            |
| 1              | randomised<br>trials  |             |               | no serious<br>indirectness | serious <sup>2</sup> | none                 | 3/53 (5.7%)                                    | 0%  | RR 0.40<br>(0.11 to<br>1.45) | 0 fewer per<br>1000 (from<br>0 fewer to 0<br>more) |          | CRITICAL   |
|                |   |             | 1             | '                          | '                    |                      | '  |     |                              |  | '        |            |

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1</sup> Heterogeneity >80%

<sup>2</sup> Inconclusive effect size

<sup>3</sup> Single study and inconclusive effect size

| Leavin | g treatment ea | arly due to si            | de effects |                            |                              |      |             |    |                              |   |     |          |
|--------|----------------|---------------------------|------------|----------------------------|------------------------------|------|-------------|----|------------------------------|---|-----|----------|
| 1      |                | no serious<br>limitations |            | no serious<br>indirectness | very<br>serious <sup>2</sup> | none | 3/53 (5.7%) | 0% | RR 2.77<br>(0.3 to<br>25.78) | 0 more per<br>1000 (from<br>0 fewer to 0<br>more) | LOW | CRITICAL |

#### Is physical activity (supervised aerobic) effective compared with psychosocial and psychological interventions?

|                |                      |              | Quality asses               | ssment                     |                      |                      |   | Summar  | y of findi           | ngs   |          |            |
|----------------|----------------------|--------------|-----------------------------|----------------------------|----------------------|----------------------|---|---|----------------------|---|----------|------------|
|                |                      |              | Z,                          |                            |                      |                      | No. of  | patients  | Ef                   | fect  |          |            |
| No. of studies | Design               | Limitations  | Inconsistency               | Indirectness               | Imprecision          | Other considerations | Physical<br>activity<br>(supervised<br>aerobic) | Psychosocial<br>and<br>psychological<br>interventions | Relative<br>(95% CI) | Absolute  | Quality  | Importance |
| Self-rate      | ed depressio         | n scores (Be | tter indicated              | by lower valu              | es)                  | · '                  |   |   | •                    |   |          |            |
|                | randomised<br>trials |              | no serious<br>inconsistency | no serious<br>indirectness | serious <sup>1</sup> | none                 | 39  | 40  | -                    | SMD 0.23<br>lower<br>(0.68<br>lower to<br>0.21<br>higher) | MODERATE | CRITICAL   |
| Leaving        | ring treatment early |              |                             |                            |                      |                      |   |   |                      |   |          |            |
| 1              | randomised           | no serious   | no serious                  | no serious                 | very                 | none                 | 2/10 (20%)                                      | 0%  | RR 1.20<br>(0.14 to  | 0 more<br>per 1000  |          | CRITICAL   |

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1</sup> Single study
<sup>2</sup> Single study and inconclusive effect size

| Solf-rat | trials   |                | inconsistency               |                |                              | ne)  |    |    | 10.58) | (from 0<br>fewer to<br>0 more)                            | LOW |          |  |
|----------|--|----------------|-----------------------------|----------------|------------------------------|------|----|----|--------|---|-----|----------|--|
| 3e11-1a1 | Self-rated depression scores at 8 weeks (Better indicated by lower values) |                |                             |                |                              |      |    |    |        |   |     |          |  |
| 1        | randomised<br>trials   |                | no serious<br>inconsistency |                | very<br>serious <sup>2</sup> | none | 15 | 16 | -      | SMD 0.09<br>lower<br>(0.79<br>lower to<br>0.62<br>higher) | LOW | CRITICAL |  |
| Self-rat | ed depressio   | on scores at : | 16 weeks (Bett              | er indicated b | y lower valu                 | ıes) |    |    |        |   |     |          |  |
| 1        | randomised<br>trials   |                | no serious<br>inconsistency |                | very<br>serious <sup>2</sup> | none | 13 | 13 | -      | SMD 0.41<br>lower<br>(1.18<br>lower to<br>0.37<br>higher) | LOW | CRITICAL |  |
| Self-rat | ed depression  | n scores at    | 34 weeks (Bett              | er indicated b | y lower valu                 | ies) |    |    |        | 1   |     |          |  |
| 1        | randomised<br>trials   |                | no serious<br>inconsistency |                | very<br>serious <sup>2</sup> | none | 8  | 10 | -      | SMD 0.63<br>lower<br>(1.59<br>lower to<br>0.33<br>higher) | LOW | CRITICAL |  |

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1</sup> Inconclusive effect size <sup>2</sup> Single study and inconclusive effect size

#### Is physical activity (supervised non-aerobic) effective compared with psychosocial and psychological interventions?

|                |  |             | Quality asses               | sment                      |                              |                      |   |   |                         |  |         |            |  |  |
|----------------|--|-------------|-----------------------------|----------------------------|------------------------------|----------------------|---|---|-------------------------|--|---------|------------|--|--|
|                |  |             | Quality asses               | No. of                     | patients                     | E                    | ffect   |   |                         |  |         |            |  |  |
| No. of studies | Design   | Limitations | Inconsistency               | Indirectness               | Imprecision                  | Other considerations | Physical<br>activity<br>(supervised<br>non-aerobic) | Psychosocial<br>and<br>psychological<br>interventions | Relative<br>(95%<br>CI) | Absolute   | Quality | Importance |  |  |
| Clinicia       |  |             |                             |                            |                              |                      |   |   |                         |  |         |            |  |  |
| 1              | randomised<br>trials   |             |                             | no serious<br>indirectness | very<br>serious <sup>1</sup> | none                 | 12  | 12  | -                       | SMD 0.80<br>higher<br>(0.04<br>lower to<br>1.64<br>higher) | LOW     | CRITICAL   |  |  |
| Clinicia       | Clinician-rated depression scores at 36 weeks (Better indicated by lower values) |             |                             |                            |                              |                      |   |   |                         |  |         |            |  |  |
| 1              | randomised<br>trials   |             | no serious<br>inconsistency | no serious<br>indirectness | very<br>serious <sup>1</sup> | none                 | 13  | 13  | -                       | SMD 0.17<br>lower<br>(0.94<br>lower to<br>0.6 higher)      | LOW     | CRITICAL   |  |  |

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1</sup> Single study and inconclusive effect size

#### Is supervised aerobic physical activity + antidepressants effective compared with antidepressants?

|                |                      |               | Quality assess     |                            |                              |                      |                         |    |                              |  |         |          |  |
|----------------|----------------------|---------------|--------------------|----------------------------|------------------------------|----------------------|-------------------------|----|------------------------------|--|---------|----------|--|
|                |                      |               |                    | No. of patients            |                              | Effect               |                         |    | Importance                   |  |         |          |  |
| No. of studies | Design               | Limitations   | Inconsistency      | Indirectness               | Imprecision                  | Other considerations | Supervised aerobic + AD | AD | Relative<br>(95% CI)         | Absolute   | Quality |          |  |
| Clinician      |                      |               |                    |                            |                              |                      |                         |    |                              |  |         |          |  |
| 1              | randomised<br>trials |               |                    | no serious<br>indirectness | very<br>serious <sup>1</sup> | none                 | 55                      | 48 | -                            | SMD 0.08<br>lower (0.47<br>lower to 0.31<br>higher)  | LOW     | CRITICAL |  |
| Leaving        | treatment ea         | rly           | '                  |                            | '                            |                      |                         |    |                              |  |         |          |  |
| 1              | randomised<br>trials |               |                    | no serious<br>indirectness | very<br>serious <sup>1</sup> | none                 | 11/55 (20%)             | 0% | RR 1.37<br>(0.58 to<br>3.26) | 0 more per<br>1000 (from 0<br>fewer to 0<br>more)    | LOW     | CRITICAL |  |
| Self-rate      | d depression         | scores (Bette | r indicated by lov | wer values)                |                              |                      |                         |    |                              |  |         |          |  |
| 1              | randomised<br>trials |               |                    | no serious<br>indirectness | very<br>serious <sup>1</sup> | none                 | 55                      | 48 | -                            | SMD 0.08<br>higher (0.31<br>lower to 0.47<br>higher) | LOW     | CRITICAL |  |

#### Is group physical activity (supervised aerobic) effective compared with no physical activity control?

| Quality assessment |  |              |                 |               |                              |                      |  | Summary of findings |                      |   |         |            |  |  |
|--------------------|--|--------------|-----------------|---------------|------------------------------|----------------------|--|---------------------|----------------------|---|---------|------------|--|--|
|                    |  |              |                 |               |                              |                      |  |                     | Effect               |   |         |            |  |  |
| No. of studies     | Design   | Limitations  | Inconsistency   | Indirectness  | Imprecision                  | Other considerations | Group<br>physical<br>activity<br>(supervised<br>aerobic) |                     | Relative<br>(95% CI) | Absolute  | Quality | Importance |  |  |
| Self-rate          | Self-rated mean depression scores (Better indicated by lower values) |              |                 |               |                              |                      |  |                     |                      |   |         |            |  |  |
| 2                  | randomised<br>trials   |              |                 |               | no serious<br>imprecision    | none                 | 84   | 63                  | -                    | SMD 0.94<br>lower<br>(1.29 to<br>0.59<br>lower)           | HIGH    | CRITICAL   |  |  |
| Self-rate          | ed depression  | n change sco | res (Better ind | icated by low | er values)                   |                      |  |                     |                      |   |         |            |  |  |
| 1                  | randomised<br>trials   |              |                 |               | very<br>serious <sup>1</sup> | none                 | 19   | 20                  | -                    | SMD 0.61<br>lower<br>(1.26<br>lower to<br>0.03<br>higher) | LOW     | CRITICAL   |  |  |
|                    |  |              |                 |               |                              |                      |  |                     |                      |   |         |            |  |  |

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1</sup> Single study and inconclusive effect size

| Leaving treatment early   |                      |  |                             |                            |                      |      |                  |    |                              |   |          |          |
|---|----------------------|--|-----------------------------|----------------------------|----------------------|------|------------------|----|------------------------------|---|----------|----------|
| 2   | randomised<br>trials |  | no serious<br>inconsistency | no serious<br>indirectness | serious <sup>2</sup> | none | 13/64<br>(20.3%) | 0% | RR 1.24<br>(0.56 to<br>2.79) | 0 more per<br>1000 (from<br>0 fewer to<br>0 more) |          | CRITICAL |
| Self-rated mean depression scores at 4 weeks (Better indicated by lower values) |                      |  |                             |                            |                      |      |                  |    |                              |   |          |          |
| 1   | randomised<br>trials |  | no serious<br>inconsistency | no serious<br>indirectness | serious <sup>3</sup> | none | 48               | 34 | -                            | SMD 1.58<br>lower<br>(2.09 to<br>1.08<br>lower)   | MODERATE | CRITICAL |
| Self-rated mean depression scores at 8 weeks (Better indicated by lower values) |                      |  |                             |                            |                      |      |                  |    |                              |   |          |          |
| 1   | randomised<br>trials |  | no serious<br>inconsistency | no serious<br>indirectness | serious <sup>3</sup> | none | 48               | 34 | -                            | SMD 1.06<br>lower<br>(1.53 to<br>0.59<br>lower)   | MODERATE | CRITICAL |

Single study and inconclusive effect size Inconclusive effect size

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>3</sup> Single study

#### Is group physical activity (supervised non-aerobic) effective compared with no physical activity control?

|                |                      |                           | Quality asse     | ssment                     |                           |                      |  | Summ  | nary of fin          | dings   |          |            |
|----------------|----------------------|---------------------------|------------------|----------------------------|---------------------------|----------------------|--|-------|----------------------|---|----------|------------|
|                |                      |                           | Quality asse     | Sincinc                    |                           |                      | No. of pat                                       | ients | Ef                   | fect  |          |            |
| No. of studies | Design               | Limitations               | Inconsistency    | Indirectness               | Imprecision               | Other considerations | Group physical activity (supervised non-aerobic) |       | Relative<br>(95% CI) | Absolute  | Quality  | Importance |
| Clinicia       | n-rated mear         | n depression              | scores (Better   | indicated by l             | ower values)              | ı                    |  |       | ı                    |   | ı        |            |
| 4              | randomised<br>trials | no serious<br>limitations |                  | no serious<br>indirectness | no serious<br>imprecision | none                 | 93   | 90    | -                    | SMD 0.77<br>lower<br>(1.08 to<br>0.45<br>lower) | MODERATE | CRITICAL   |
| Self-rat       | ed mean dep          | ression scor              | es (Better indic | ated by lower              | r values)                 | \<br>                |  |       |                      |   |          |            |
| 4              | randomised<br>trials | no serious<br>limitations |                  | no serious<br>indirectness | serious <sup>2</sup>      | none                 | 93   | 90    | -                    | SMD 0.54<br>lower<br>(0.84 to<br>0.24<br>lower) | MODERATE | CRITICAL   |
|                | I                    |                           |                  |                            | I                         |                      |  |       | l                    |   | I        | I          |

| Leaving  | g treatment e        | arly                      |                             |                            |                              |                  |            |    |                              |  |      |          |
|----------|----------------------|---------------------------|-----------------------------|----------------------------|------------------------------|------------------|------------|----|------------------------------|--|------|----------|
| 1        | randomised<br>trials | no serious<br>limitations | no serious<br>inconsistency | no serious<br>indirectness | very<br>serious <sup>3</sup> | none             | 2/20 (10%) | 0% | RR 2.00<br>(0.2 to<br>20.33) | 0 more per<br>1000 (from<br>0 fewer to<br>0 more)          | LOW  | CRITICAL |
| Leaving  | g treatment e        | arly due to s             | ide effects                 |                            |                              |                  |            |    |                              |  |      |          |
| 1        | randomised<br>trials | no serious<br>limitations | no serious<br>inconsistency | no serious<br>indirectness | very<br>serious <sup>3</sup> | none             | 2/20 (10%) | 0% | RR 5.00<br>(0.26 to<br>98)   | 0 more per<br>1000 (from<br>0 fewer to<br>0 more)          | LOW  | CRITICAL |
| Clinicia | n-rated mear         | n depression              | scores at 24 w              | eeks (Better i             | ndicated by l                | ower values)     |            |    |                              | '  |      |          |
| 1        | randomised<br>trials | no serious<br>limitations | no serious<br>inconsistency | no serious<br>indirectness | very<br>serious <sup>3</sup> | none             | 12         | 11 | -                            | SMD 0.15<br>higher<br>(0.67<br>lower to<br>0.97<br>higher) | LOW  | CRITICAL |
| Clinicia | an-rated mear        | n depression              | scores at 34-36             | 6 weeks (Bett              | er indicated l               | oy lower values) |            |    |                              |  |      |          |
| 2        | randomised<br>trials | no serious<br>limitations | no serious<br>inconsistency |                            | no serious<br>imprecision    | none             | 56         | 57 | -                            | SMD 0.38<br>lower<br>(0.75 to<br>0.01<br>lower)            | HIGH | CRITICAL |
|          | i                    | 1                         | 1                           | 1                          | 1                            | 1                |            | 1  | l                            | 1  |      |          |

| Self-ra | ted mean dep         | ression scor | es at 34 weeks | (Better indica             | ited by lower | values) |    |    |   |   |          |          |
|---------|----------------------|--------------|----------------|----------------------------|---------------|---------|----|----|---|---|----------|----------|
| 1       | randomised<br>trials |              |                | no serious<br>indirectness |               | none    | 43 | 43 | - | SMD 0.24<br>lower<br>(0.67<br>lower to<br>0.18<br>higher) | MODERATE | CRITICAL |

# Is individual physical activity (supervised aerobic) effective compared with no physical activity control?

|                |                      |                           | Quality asses   | sment                      |                      |                      |   | Summa                                 | ary of fin              | dings   |          |            |
|----------------|----------------------|---------------------------|-----------------|----------------------------|----------------------|----------------------|---|---------------------------------------|-------------------------|---|----------|------------|
|                |                      |                           | <b></b>         |                            |                      |                      | No. of pat  | ients                                 | E                       | ffect   |          |            |
| No. of studies | Design               | Limitations               | Inconsistency   | Indirectness               | Imprecision          | Other considerations | Individual<br>physical<br>activity<br>(supervised<br>aerobic) | No<br>physical<br>activity<br>control | Relative<br>(95%<br>CI) | Absolute  | Quality  | Importance |
| Cliniciar      | n-rated mean         | depression                | scores at endpo | oint (Better in            | dicated by lo        | ower values)         |   |                                       |                         |   |          |            |
|                | randomised<br>trials | no serious<br>limitations |                 | no serious<br>indirectness | serious <sup>1</sup> | none                 | 17  | 13                                    | -                       | SMD 1.16<br>lower<br>(1.94 to<br>0.37<br>lower) | MODERATE |            |

Heterogeneity >80%

Heterogeneity >50%

Single small study and inconclusive effect size

Inconclusive effect size

| Self-rat | ed mean dep          | ression score | es at endpoint (            | Better indicat | ted by lower | values) |    |    |   |
|----------|----------------------|---------------|-----------------------------|----------------|--------------|---------|----|----|---|
| 1        | randomised<br>trials |               | no serious<br>inconsistency |                |              | none    | 17 | 13 | SMD 0.87<br>lower<br>(1.54 to<br>0.2 lower) |

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1</sup> Single small study

#### Is individual physical activity (unsupervised non-aerobic) effective compared with no physical activity control?

|                |                      |                           | Quality asses     | sment                      |                                |                      |  | Summary                               | of finding              | gs  |         |            |
|----------------|----------------------|---------------------------|-------------------|----------------------------|--------------------------------|----------------------|--|---------------------------------------|-------------------------|---|---------|------------|
|                |                      |                           | Quanty asses      | Sincinc                    |                                |                      | No. of patie   | ents                                  | E                       | ffect   | )       |            |
| No. of studies | Design               | Limitations               | Inconsistency     | Indirectness               | Imprecision                    | Other considerations | Individual<br>physical activity<br>(unsupervised<br>non-aerobic) | No<br>physical<br>activity<br>control | Relative<br>(95%<br>CI) | Absolute  | Quality | Importance |
| Self-rate      | ed mean dep          | ression score             | es at endpoint (  | Better indicat             | ed by lower                    | values)              |  | J                                     |                         |   | ı       |            |
| 1              | randomised<br>trials | no serious<br>Iimitations |                   | no serious<br>indirectness | very<br>serious <sup>1,2</sup> | none                 | 11   | 15                                    | -                       | SMD 0.42<br>higher<br>(0.37 lower<br>to 1.21<br>higher) | LOW     |            |
| Self-rate      | ed mean dep          | ression score             | es at follow up ( | Better indicat             | ted by lower                   | values)              |  |                                       | '                       |   | •       |            |
| 1              | randomised<br>trials | no serious<br>limitations |                   | no serious<br>indirectness | very<br>serious <sup>1,2</sup> | none                 | 11   | 15                                    | -                       | SMD 0.10<br>higher (0.6<br>lower to                     | LOW     |            |

|  |  |  |  |  | 0.8 higher) |  |
|--|--|--|--|--|-------------|--|
|  |  |  |  |  |             |  |

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1</sup> Single small study
<sup>2</sup> Inconclusive effect size

#### HIGH-INTENSITY INTERVENTIONS

# Cognitive behavioural therapies

#### Is CBT effective compared with waitlist control?

|                |                      |                           | Quality asses     | sment                      |                           |                      |                 | Sui              | nmary of f                   | indings   |         |            |
|----------------|----------------------|---------------------------|-------------------|----------------------------|---------------------------|----------------------|-----------------|------------------|------------------------------|---|---------|------------|
|                |                      |                           | Quality asses     |                            |                           |                      | No. of          | patients         | E                            | ffect   |         | Importance |
| No. of studies | Design               | Limitations               | Inconsistency     | Indirectness               | Imprecision               | Other considerations | СВТ             | Waitlist control | Relative<br>(95% CI)         | Absolute  | Quality |            |
| Depress        | ion scores: co       | ntinuous mea              | asures at endpoi  | int (Better indi           | cated by lowe             | r values)            |                 |                  |                              |   |         |            |
| 2              |                      | no serious<br>limitations |                   | no serious<br>indirectness | no serious<br>imprecision | none                 | 54              | 0                | -                            | SMD 0.89<br>lower (1.45 to<br>0.33 lower)           | HIGH    | CRITICAL   |
| Depress        | ion scores (di       | chotomous o               | utcomes): self-re | eport                      |                           |                      |                 |                  |                              |   |         |            |
| 1              | randomised<br>trials | no serious<br>limitations |                   | no serious<br>indirectness | very serious <sup>1</sup> | none                 | 7/12<br>(58.3%) | 0%               | RR 0.70<br>(0.41 to<br>1.2)  | 0 fewer per<br>1000 (from 0<br>fewer to 0<br>more)  | LOW     | CRITICAL   |
| Depress        | ion scores (di       | chotomous o               | utcomes): clinici | an-rated                   |                           |                      |                 |                  |                              |   |         |            |
| 1              |                      | no serious<br>Iimitations |                   | no serious<br>indirectness | very serious <sup>1</sup> | none                 | 5/12<br>(41.7%) | 0%               | RR 0.45<br>(0.23 to<br>0.91) | 0 fewer per<br>1000 (from 0<br>fewer to 0<br>fewer) | LOW     | CRITICAL   |

# Is CBT effective compared with placebo?

|                |                      |                           | Quality asses     | sment                      |                           |                      |                  | S       | ummary o                     | f findings  |          |            |
|----------------|----------------------|---------------------------|-------------------|----------------------------|---------------------------|----------------------|------------------|---------|------------------------------|---|----------|------------|
|                |                      |                           | <b>Z</b> ,        |                            |                           |                      | N.o of p         | atients | E                            | ffect   |          | Importance |
| No. of studies | Design               | Limitations               | Inconsistency     | Indirectness               | Imprecision               | Other considerations | СВТ              | Placebo | Relative<br>(95% CI)         | Absolute  | Quality  |            |
| Leaving        | study early          |                           |                   |                            |                           |                      |                  |         |                              |   |          |            |
|                | randomised<br>trials | no serious<br>limitations |                   | no serious<br>indirectness | no serious<br>imprecision | none                 | 24/95<br>(25.3%) | 0%      | RR 0.44<br>(0.12 to<br>1.61) | 0 fewer per<br>1000 (from 0<br>fewer to 0<br>more)  | MODERATE | CRITICAL   |
| Depress        | on scores: co        | ntinuous me               | asures: self-rate | ed (Better indi            | cated by lowe             | r values)            |                  |         |                              |   |          |            |
| 1              | randomised<br>trials | no serious<br>limitations |                   | no serious<br>indirectness | very serious <sup>2</sup> | none                 | 59               | 62      | -                            | SMD 0.15<br>lower (0.51<br>lower to 0.21<br>higher) | LOW      | CRITICAL   |
| Depress        | on scores: co        | ntinuous me               | asures: clinician | ı-rated (Better            | indicated by              | lower values)        |                  |         |                              |   |          |            |
|                |                      | no serious<br>Iimitations |                   | no serious<br>indirectness | very serious <sup>2</sup> | none                 | 59               | 62      | -                            | SMD 0.32<br>lower (0.68<br>lower to 0.04<br>higher) | LOW      | CRITICAL   |
|                |                      |                           |                   |                            |                           |                      |                  |         |                              |   |          |            |

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1</sup> Single study; inconclusive effect size

| Depress | ion scores: di       | chotomous c                              | outcomes: self-ra           |                            |                           |      |                  |    |                              |   |     |          |
|---------|----------------------|--|-----------------------------|----------------------------|---------------------------|------|------------------|----|------------------------------|---|-----|----------|
|         | trials               | no serious<br>limitations<br>chotomous c |                             | indirectness               | very serious <sup>2</sup> | none | 30/59<br>(50.8%) | 0% | RR 0.85<br>(0.62 to<br>1.18) | 0 fewer per<br>1000 (from 0<br>fewer to 0<br>more)  | LOW | CRITICAL |
|         | randomised<br>trials | no serious<br>limitations                | no serious<br>inconsistency | no serious<br>indirectness | very serious <sup>2</sup> | none | 38/59<br>(64.4%) | 0% | RR 0.81<br>(0.65 to<br>0)    | 0 fewer per<br>1000 (from 0<br>fewer to 0<br>fewer) | LOW | CRITICAL |

#### Is CBT effective compared with non-directive psychotherapies?

|                |                      |             | Quality asses | ssment                     |                           |                      |                 | Summa                         | ry of find                   | ings     |         |            |
|----------------|----------------------|-------------|---------------|----------------------------|---------------------------|----------------------|-----------------|-------------------------------|------------------------------|----------|---------|------------|
|                |                      |             | •             |                            |                           |                      | No              | . of patients                 | Ef                           | fect     |         | Importance |
| No. of studies | Design               | Limitations | Inconsistency | Indirectness               | Imprecision               | Other considerations | СВТ             | Non-directive psychotherapies | Relative<br>(95% CI)         | Absolute | Quality |            |
| Leaving        | study early          |             |               |                            |                           |                      |                 |                               |                              |          |         |            |
| 1              | randomised<br>trials |             |               | no serious<br>indirectness | no serious<br>imprecision | none                 | 5/36<br>(13.9%) | 0%                            | RR 0.46<br>(0.17 to<br>1.23) |          | HIGH    | CRITICAL   |

Heterogeneity >50
<sup>2</sup> Single study; inconclusive effect size

| Depres | sion scores: c       | ontinuous n               | neasures: self-r            | eport (Better              | indicated by                 | lower values)     |                  |                     |                              |   |          |          |
|--------|----------------------|---------------------------|-----------------------------|----------------------------|------------------------------|-------------------|------------------|---------------------|------------------------------|---|----------|----------|
| 4      | randomised<br>trials | no serious<br>limitations | serious <sup>1</sup>        |                            | no serious<br>imprecision    | none              | 47               | 40                  | -                            | SMD 0.19<br>lower<br>(0.86<br>lower to<br>0.49<br>higher) | MODERATE | CRITICAL |
| Depres | sion scores: c       | ontinuous n               | neasures: self-ı            | eport (BDI 8 s             | sessions) (Be                | tter indicated by | y lower v        | alues)              |                              |   |          |          |
| 3      | randomised<br>trials |                           | no serious<br>inconsistency | no serious<br>indirectness | no serious<br>imprecision    | none              | 29               | 30                  | -                            | SMD 0.20<br>lower<br>(0.72<br>lower to<br>0.31<br>higher) | HIGH     | CRITICAL |
| Depres | sion scores: d       | ichotomous                | outcomes                    |                            |                              |                   |                  |                     |                              |   |          |          |
| 1      | randomised<br>trials | no serious<br>limitations | no serious<br>inconsistency | no serious<br>indirectness | very<br>serious <sup>2</sup> | none              | 12/36<br>(33.3%) | 0%                  | RR 0.59<br>(0.34 to<br>1.03) | 0 fewer<br>per 1000<br>(from 0<br>fewer to 0<br>more)     | LOW      | CRITICAL |
| Depres | sion scores: c       | ontinuous n               | neasures at fol             | low-up (6 mo               | nths) (follow                | -up mean 6 mor    | nths; Bet        | ter indicated by lo | wer valu                     | es)   |          |          |
| 3      | randomised<br>trials |                           | no serious<br>inconsistency | no serious<br>indirectness | no serious<br>imprecision    | none              | 30               | 26                  | -                            | SMD 0.13<br>lower<br>(0.67<br>lower to                    | HIGH     | CRITICAL |

| Depress | sion scores: c       | ontinuous n               | neasures at fol             | ow-up (1 yea               | r) (follow-up             | mean 1 years; I | Better in        | dicated by lower v | values)                      | 0.4<br>higher)   |          |          |
|---------|----------------------|---------------------------|-----------------------------|----------------------------|---------------------------|-----------------|------------------|--------------------|------------------------------|--|----------|----------|
| 3       | randomised<br>trials | no serious<br>limitations |                             | no serious<br>indirectness | no serious<br>imprecision | none            | 25               | 25                 | -                            | SMD 0.22<br>higher<br>(0.79<br>lower to<br>1.22<br>higher) | MODERATE | CRITICAL |
| Depress | sion scores: d       | lichotomous               | measures at f               | ollow-up (3 m              | onths) (follo             | w-up mean 3 m   | onths)           |                    |                              |  |          |          |
|         | randomised<br>trials |                           | no serious<br>inconsistency |                            | , _                       | none            | 17/36<br>(47.2%) | 0%                 | RR 0.75<br>(0.48 to<br>1.16) | 0 fewer<br>per 1000<br>(from 0<br>fewer to 0<br>more)      | LOW      | CRITICAL |

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1</sup> Heterogeneity > 50%
<sup>2</sup> Single study; inconclusive effect size

# Is CBT (primary care) effective compared with GP care?

|                |                      |                           | Quality asses     | ssment                     |                           |                      |                          |       | Summary              | of findings  |          |            |
|----------------|----------------------|---------------------------|-------------------|----------------------------|---------------------------|----------------------|--------------------------|-------|----------------------|--|----------|------------|
|                |                      |                           | Quality asses     |                            |                           |                      | No. of pat               | ients |                      | Effect   | '        | Importance |
| No. of studies | Design               | Limitations               | Inconsistency     | Indirectness               | Imprecision               | Other considerations | CBT<br>(primary<br>care) |       | Relative<br>(95% CI) | Absolute   | Quality  | importance |
| Leaving        | study early          |                           | l                 |                            |                           |                      | •                        | •     |                      |  |          |            |
|                | randomised<br>trials | no serious<br>Iimitations |                   | no serious<br>indirectness | no serious<br>imprecision | none                 | 29/100<br>(29%)          | 0%    | RR 0 (0<br>to 0)     | 0 fewer per<br>1000 (from 0<br>fewer to 0<br>fewer)  | HIGH     | CRITICAL   |
| Depress        | on scores: co        | ntinuous mea              | asures: self-repo | ort (Better indi           | cated by lowe             | r values)            |                          | Į     |                      |  |          |            |
| 2              |                      | no serious<br>limitations |                   | no serious<br>indirectness | no serious<br>imprecision | none                 | 52                       | 68    | -                    | SMD 0.01<br>higher (0.83<br>lower to 0.85<br>higher) | MODERATE | CRITICAL   |
| Depress        | on scores: co        | ntinuous mea              | asures: clinician | -rated (Better             | indicated by Id           | ower values)         |                          | Į     |                      |  |          |            |
| 2              |                      | no serious<br>Iimitations |                   | no serious<br>indirectness | no serious<br>imprecision | none                 | 47                       | 45    | -                    | SMD 0.33<br>lower (0.74<br>lower to 0.08<br>higher)  | HIGH     | CRITICAL   |
|                |                      |                           |                   |                            |                           |                      | 1                        | I     |                      |  |          |            |

|      | randomised<br>trials | no serious<br>limitations | no serious<br>inconsistency | no serious<br>indirectness | very serious <sup>2</sup> | none             | 26         | 44     | -         | SMD 0.13<br>higher (0.36<br>lower to 0.61<br>higher) | LOW     | CRITICA |
|------|----------------------|---------------------------|-----------------------------|----------------------------|---------------------------|------------------|------------|--------|-----------|--|---------|---------|
| ores | sion scores: co      | ontinuous me              | easures: clinician          | -rated at follo            | w-up (5 month             | s) (follow-up me | ean 5 mont | hs; Be | tter indi | cated by lower                                       | values) | ı       |
|      |                      |                           |                             |                            |                           |                  |            |        |           |  |         |         |

Theterogeneity > 50%

Single study; inconclusive effect size

# Is CBT effective compared with antidepressants?

|                |                      |                |                  |                            |                           |                      |                    |    | Summary                      | of findings   |         |            |
|----------------|----------------------|----------------|------------------|----------------------------|---------------------------|----------------------|--------------------|----|------------------------------|---|---------|------------|
|                |                      |                | Quality asses    | sment                      |                           |                      | No. of patient     |    | E                            | Effect  | Quality | Importance |
| No. of studies | Design               | Limitations    | Inconsistency    | Indirectness               | Imprecision               | Other considerations | СВТ                | AD | Relative<br>(95% CI)         | Absolute  | •       |            |
| Leaving        | the study ear        | ly             |                  |                            | •                         |                      | 1                  |    |                              |   |         |            |
| 14             | randomised<br>trials |                |                  | no serious<br>indirectness | no serious<br>imprecision | none                 | 146/686<br>(21.3%) | 0% | RR 0.75<br>(0.63 to<br>0.91) | 0 fewer per<br>1000 (from 0<br>fewer to 0<br>fewer) | HIGH    | CRITICAL   |
| Relapse        | at post-treat        | ment           |                  |                            |                           |                      |                    |    |                              |   |         |            |
| 1              | randomised<br>trials |                |                  | no serious<br>indirectness | very serious <sup>1</sup> | none                 | 4/14<br>(28.6%)    | 0% | RR 0.86<br>(0.27 to<br>2.71) | 0 fewer per<br>1000 (from 0<br>fewer to 0<br>more)  | LOW     | CRITICAL   |
| Relapse        | up to 12 mon         | nths (with con | tinuation treatn | nent) (follow-เ            | up mean 12 m              | onths)               | I                  | I  |                              |   |         |            |
| 2              | randomised<br>trials |                |                  | no serious<br>indirectness | no serious<br>imprecision | none                 | 2/29<br>(6.9%)     | 0% | RR 0.26<br>(0.06 to<br>1.21) | 0 fewer per<br>1000 (from 0<br>fewer to 0<br>more)  | HIGH    | CRITICAL   |
|                |                      |                |                  |                            | 1                         |                      | I                  | 1  |                              |   |         |            |

| Relaps | e up to 12 mor       | nths (no conti            | nuation treatme             | ent) (follow-up            | mean 12 mor               | iths)            |                  |     |                              |  |          |          |
|--------|----------------------|---------------------------|-----------------------------|----------------------------|---------------------------|------------------|------------------|-----|------------------------------|--|----------|----------|
| 1      | randomised<br>trials | no serious<br>limitations | no serious<br>inconsistency | no serious<br>indirectness | no serious<br>imprecision | none             | 12/95<br>(12.6%) | 0%  | RR 0.59<br>(0.3 to<br>1.14)  | 0 fewer per<br>1000 (from 0<br>fewer to 0<br>more) | HIGH     | CRITICAL |
| Relaps | e at 18 months       | (no continua              | ation treatment)            | (follow-up mo              | ean 18 months             | )<br>)           |                  |     |                              |  |          |          |
| L      | randomised<br>trials | no serious<br>limitations | no serious<br>inconsistency | no serious<br>indirectness | very serious <sup>1</sup> | none             | 3/15<br>(20%)    | 0%  | RR 0.40<br>(0.12 to<br>1.31) | 0 fewer per<br>1000 (from 0<br>fewer to 0<br>more) | LOW      | CRITICAL |
| Relaps | e at 24 months       | (no continua              | ation treatment)            | (follow-up mo              | ean 24 months             | )<br>)           |                  |     |                              |  |          |          |
| !      | randomised<br>trials | no serious<br>limitations | serious <sup>2</sup>        | no serious<br>indirectness | no serious<br>imprecision | none             | 8/22<br>(36.4%)  | 0%  | RR 0.69<br>(0.34 to<br>1.4)  | 0 fewer per<br>1000 (from 0<br>fewer to 0<br>more) | MODERATE | CRITICAL |
| elaps  | e at 24 months       | (with contin              | uation treatmer             | nt) (follow-up r           | nean 24 mont              | hs)              |                  |     |                              |  |          |          |
|        | randomised<br>trials | no serious<br>limitations | no serious<br>inconsistency | no serious<br>indirectness | very serious <sup>1</sup> | none             | 2/7<br>(28.6%)   | 0%  | RR 0.67<br>(0.16 to<br>2.84) | 0 fewer per<br>1000 (from 0<br>fewer to 0<br>more) | LOW      | CRITICAL |
| Depres | ssion scores: co     | ntinuous me               | asures at post-t            | reatment: self-            | report (Better            | indicated by low | er values        | )   |                              |  |          |          |
|        | randomised<br>trials | no serious<br>limitations | no serious<br>inconsistency | no serious<br>indirectness | no serious<br>imprecision | none             | 246              | 234 | -                            | SMD 0.06<br>lower (0.24<br>lower to 0.12           | HIGH     | CRITICAL |

|          |                   |                 |                      |                     |                           |                   |           |      |                     | higher)                     |          |          |
|----------|-------------------|-----------------|----------------------|---------------------|---------------------------|-------------------|-----------|------|---------------------|-----------------------------|----------|----------|
| Donrocc  | ion scores: so    | ntinuous mo     | <br>                 | <br>roatmont: clini | ician rated (Re           | tter indicated by | lower val | noc) |                     |                             |          |          |
| Debiess  | ion scores. co    | illilluous ille | asures at post-ti    | eatment. ciin       | iciali-lateu (be          | itter mulcateu by | lower var | uesj |                     |                             |          |          |
| 13       | randomised        | no serious      | no serious           | no serious          | no serious                | none              |           |      |                     | SMD 0.05                    |          |          |
|          | trials            | limitations     | inconsistency        | indirectness        | imprecision               |                   | 698       | 705  | -                   | higher (0.06                |          | CRITICAL |
|          |                   |                 |                      |                     |                           |                   |           |      |                     | lower to 0.15               | HIGH     |          |
|          |                   |                 |                      |                     |                           |                   |           |      |                     | higher)                     |          |          |
| Depress  | ion score: dicl   | hotomous me     | easures: cliniciar   | n-rated             |                           |                   |           |      |                     |                             |          |          |
| 1        | randomised        | no serious      | no serious           | no serious          | very serious <sup>1</sup> | none              |           |      | DD 4 00             | 0 fewer per                 |          |          |
|          | trials            | limitations     | inconsistency        | indirectness        |                           |                   | 35/60     | 0%   | RR 1.00<br>(0.77 to | 1000 (from 0                |          | CRITICAL |
|          |                   |                 |                      |                     |                           |                   | (58.3%)   | 070  | 1.3)                | fewer to 0                  | LOW      | CKITICAL |
|          |                   |                 |                      |                     |                           |                   |           |      | ŕ                   | more)                       |          |          |
| Depress  | ion scores: di    | chotomous m     | easures: self-re     | port                | .1                        |                   |           | , ,  |                     |                             |          |          |
| 3        | randomised        | no sorious      | serious <sup>2</sup> | no serious          | no serious                | none              | ı         | ı    |                     | O forwar nar                |          |          |
| 3        | trials            | limitations     | serious              | indirectness        | imprecision               | none              | 46/94     |      | RR 0.81             | 0 fewer per<br>1000 (from 0 |          |          |
|          |                   |                 |                      |                     |                           |                   | (48.9%)   | 0%   | (0.46 to            | fewer to 0                  | MODERATE | CRITICAL |
|          |                   |                 |                      |                     |                           |                   |           |      | 1.42)               | more)                       |          |          |
| No not:  | <br>achieving rem | <br>nission     |                      |                     |                           |                   | ļ         |      |                     |                             |          |          |
| 140.1100 | acine ving ren    | 11331011        |                      |                     |                           |                   |           |      |                     |                             |          |          |
| 1        |                   | no serious      | no serious           | no serious          | very serious <sup>1</sup> | none              |           |      | RR 1.11             | 0 more per                  |          |          |
|          | trials            | limitations     | inconsistency        | indirectness        |                           |                   | 36/60     | 0%   | (0.85 to            | 1000 (from 0                | 10)44    | CRITICAL |
|          |                   |                 |                      |                     |                           |                   | (60%)     |      | 1.44)               | fewer to 0<br>more)         | LOW      |          |
|          |                   |                 |                      |                     |                           |                   |           |      |                     | more)                       |          |          |
| HRSD-17  | />6 & HRSD-2      | 4>8 at end of   | ftreatment           |                     |                           |                   |           |      |                     |                             |          |          |
| 5        | randomised        | no serious      | no serious           | no serious          | no serious                | none              | 283/424   | 0%   | RR 1.00             | 0 fewer per                 |          | CRITICAL |
|          |                   |                 |                      |                     |                           |                   | 205/424   |      | (0.86 to            | 1000 (from 0                |          |          |

|          | trials               | limitations               | inconsistency               | indirectness               | imprecision               |                    | (66.7%)          |        | 1.15)                        | fewer to 0<br>more)                                  | HIGH       |          |
|----------|----------------------|---------------------------|-----------------------------|----------------------------|---------------------------|--------------------|------------------|--------|------------------------------|--|------------|----------|
| 50% dec  | rease in BDI s       | scores                    |                             |                            |                           |                    |                  |        |                              |  |            |          |
| 1        | randomised<br>trials | no serious<br>limitations | no serious<br>inconsistency | no serious<br>indirectness | very serious <sup>1</sup> | none               | 16/30<br>(53.3%) | 0%     | RR 1.45<br>(0.82 to<br>2.59) | 0 more per<br>1000 (from 0<br>fewer to 0<br>more)    | LOW        | CRITICAL |
| Depressi | ion scores: co       | ntinuous me               | asures at follow            | -up ( 1 month)             | : clinician-rate          | d (follow-up mea   | an 1 mont        | hs; B  | etter indic                  | ated by lower v                                      | alues)     |          |
| 1        | randomised<br>trials | no serious<br>limitations | no serious<br>inconsistency | no serious<br>indirectness | very serious <sup>1</sup> | none               | 19               | 16     | -                            | SMD 0.08<br>higher (0.59<br>lower to 0.74<br>higher) | LOW        | CRITICAL |
| Depressi | ion scores: co       | ntinuous mea              | asures at follow            | up (12 month               | s): clinician-ra          | ted (Better indica | ated by lov      | wer v  | values)                      | <u> </u>   |            |          |
| 3        | randomised<br>trials | no serious<br>limitations | no serious<br>inconsistency | no serious<br>indirectness | no serious<br>imprecision | none               | 73               | 64     | -                            | SMD 0.50<br>lower (0.84 to<br>0.15 lower)            | HIGH       | CRITICAL |
| Depressi | ion scores: co       | ntinuous mea              | asures at follow            | up (24 month               | s): clinician-ra          | ted (follow-up m   | ean 24 mo        | onth   | s; Better in                 | dicated by lowe                                      | er values) |          |
| 1        | randomised<br>trials | no serious<br>limitations | no serious<br>inconsistency | no serious<br>indirectness | very serious <sup>1</sup> | none               | 0                | 0      | -                            | SMD 0.37<br>lower (0.98<br>lower to 0.23<br>higher)  | LOW        | CRITICAL |
| Depressi | ion scores: co       | ntinuous me               | asures at follow            | up (12 month               | s): self-report           | (follow-up mean    | 12 month         | ıs; Be | etter indica                 | ited by lower va                                     | alues)     |          |
| 3        | randomised           | no serious                | no serious                  | no serious                 | no serious                | none               | 70               | 64     | -                            | SMD 0.41<br>lower (0.76 to                           |            | CRITICAL |

|         | trials               | limitations               | inconsistency               | indirectness               | imprecision               |                     |                  |       |                              | 0.07 lower)  | HIGH        |          |
|---------|----------------------|---------------------------|-----------------------------|----------------------------|---------------------------|---------------------|------------------|-------|------------------------------|--|-------------|----------|
| Depres  | sion scores: co      | ntinuous me               | asures at follow            | up (24 month               | s): self-report           | (follow-up mean     | 24 month         | ıs; B | etter indica                 | nted by lower va                                     | alues)      |          |
| 1       | randomised<br>trials | limitations               | no serious<br>inconsistency | no serious<br>indirectness | ,                         | none                | 22               | 20    | -                            | SMD 0.40<br>lower (1.01<br>lower to 0.22<br>higher)  | LOW         | CRITICAL |
| Depres  | sion scores: co      | ntinuous me               | asures (clinican-           | rated) after 6             | months maint              | enance (follow-u    | p mean 6         | mor   | itns; Bettei                 | r indicated by ic                                    | wer values) |          |
| 1       | randomised<br>trials | no serious<br>limitations | no serious<br>inconsistency | no serious<br>indirectness | very serious <sup>1</sup> | none                | 13               | 6     | -                            | SMD 0.41<br>higher (0.57<br>lower to 1.39<br>higher) | LOW         | CRITICAL |
| Depres  | sion scores: co      | ntinuous me               | asures (self-repo           | ort) after 6 mo            | nths maintena             | nce (follow-up n    | nean 6 mo        | nths  | ; Better in                  | dicated by lowe                                      | r values)   |          |
| 1       | randomised<br>trials | no serious<br>limitations | no serious<br>inconsistency | no serious<br>indirectness | very serious <sup>1</sup> | none                | 14               | 6     | -                            | SMD 0.03<br>higher (0.92<br>lower to 0.99<br>higher) | LOW         | CRITICAL |
| Depres  | sion scores: di      | <br>chotomous n           | neasures (self-re           | port) at follow            | <br>v-up (1 year) (f      | <br>ollow-up mean 1 | years)           |       |                              |  |             |          |
| 1       | randomised<br>trials | no serious<br>limitations | no serious<br>inconsistency | no serious<br>indirectness | very serious <sup>1</sup> | none                | 16/24<br>(66.7%) | 0%    | RR 0.76<br>(0.55 to<br>1.05) | 0 fewer per<br>1000 (from 0<br>fewer to 0<br>more)   | LOW         | CRITICAL |
| By seve | erity: Moderat       | e or moderat              | e/severe: Leavir            | ng the study ea            | rly                       |                     |                  | ı     |                              |  |             |          |
| 5       | randomised           | no serious                | no serious                  | no serious                 | serious <sup>3</sup>      | none                | 80/349           | 0%    | RR 0.83<br>(0.64 to          | 0 fewer per<br>1000 (from 0                          |             | CRITICAL |

|        | trials               | limitations               | inconsistency               | indirectness               |                           |                    | (22.9%)           |      | 1.07)                        | fewer to 0<br>more)                                 | MODERATE |          |
|--------|----------------------|---------------------------|-----------------------------|----------------------------|---------------------------|--------------------|-------------------|------|------------------------------|---|----------|----------|
| By sev | erity: Severe: L     | eaving the st             | udy early                   |                            | •                         |                    |                   | ļ    |                              |   |          |          |
| 3      | randomised<br>trials | no serious<br>limitations | no serious<br>inconsistency | no serious<br>indirectness | serious <sup>3</sup>      | none               | 30/110<br>(27.3%) | 0%   | RR 1.04<br>(0.68 to<br>1.61) | 0 more per<br>1000 (from 0<br>fewer to 0<br>more)   | MODERATE | CRITICAL |
| By sev | erity: Severe/v      | ery severe: Lo            | eaving the study            | early                      |                           |                    | •                 | •    |                              |   |          |          |
| 2      | randomised<br>trials | no serious<br>limitations | no serious<br>inconsistency | no serious<br>indirectness | no serious<br>imprecision | none               | 15/66<br>(22.7%)  | 0%   | RR 0.55<br>(0.32 to<br>0.94) | 0 fewer per<br>1000 (from 0<br>fewer to 0<br>fewer) | HIGH     | CRITICAL |
| By sev | erity: Moderat       | e or moderat              | e/severe: Depre             | ession scores: c           | ontinuous me              | asures (self-repo  | rt) (Bettei       | indi | cated by lo                  | ower values)  |          |          |
| 4      | randomised<br>trials | no serious<br>limitations | no serious<br>inconsistency | no serious<br>indirectness | serious <sup>3</sup>      | none               | 108               | 121  | -                            | SMD 0.07<br>lower (0.33<br>lower to 0.2<br>higher)  | MODERATE | CRITICAL |
| By sev | erity: Severe: D     | epression sco             | ores: continuou             | s measures (se             | lf-report) (Bet           | ter indicated by I | ower valu         | es)  |                              |   | '        |          |
| 3      | randomised<br>trials | no serious<br>limitations | no serious<br>inconsistency | no serious<br>indirectness | serious <sup>3</sup>      | none               | 101               | 96   | -                            | SMD 0.03<br>lower (0.38<br>lower to 0.31<br>higher) | MODERATE | CRITICAL |
|        | ,                    | ·                         |                             |                            |                           | '                  | '                 | •    |                              |   |          |          |

|        | randomised<br>trials | no serious<br>limitations | serious <sup>2</sup>        | no serious<br>indirectness | serious <sup>3</sup> | none               | 75         | 83    | -               | SMD 0.06<br>higher (0.42<br>lower to 0.53<br>higher) | LOW      | CRITICA |
|--------|----------------------|---------------------------|-----------------------------|----------------------------|----------------------|--------------------|------------|-------|-----------------|--|----------|---------|
| y seve | erity: Moderat       | e or moderat              | e/severe: Depre             | ession scores: c           | ontinuous me         | asures (clinician- | report) (E | ette  | rindicated      | by lower value                                       | es)      |         |
|        | randomised<br>trials | no serious<br>limitations | no serious<br>inconsistency | no serious<br>indirectness | serious <sup>3</sup> | none               | 451        | 459   | -               | SMD 0.04<br>higher (0.09<br>lower to 0.17<br>higher) | MODERATE | CRITICA |
| y seve | erity: Severe: [     | Depression sc             | ores: continuou             | measures (cli              | nician-rated) (      | Better indicated   | by lower   | value | es)             | '  | '        |         |
|        | randomised<br>trials | no serious<br>limitations | no serious<br>inconsistency | no serious<br>indirectness | serious <sup>3</sup> | none               | 151        | 196   | -               | SMD 0.02<br>higher (0.2                              | MODERATE | CRITICA |
|        |                      |                           |                             |                            |                      |                    |            |       |                 | lower to 0.24<br>higher)                             | MODERATE |         |
| y seve | erity: Severe/v      | ery severe: c             | ontinuous meas              | ures (clinician-           | rated) (Better       | indicated by low   | er values  | )     |                 |  | MODERATE |         |
| y seve | randomised<br>trials |                           | no serious<br>inconsistency | no serious indirectness    | rated) (Better       | indicated by low   | er values  | 84    | -               |  |          | CRITICA |
|        | randomised<br>trials | no serious<br>limitations | no serious<br>inconsistency | no serious<br>indirectness | serious <sup>3</sup> |                    | 76         | 84    | -<br>ndicated b | SMD 0.90<br>lower (0.4<br>lower to 0.23<br>higher)   | MODERATE | CRITICA |

|         |                      |                           |                           |                            |                           |                     |                  |       |                             | higher)  |          |          |
|---------|----------------------|---------------------------|---------------------------|----------------------------|---------------------------|---------------------|------------------|-------|-----------------------------|--|----------|----------|
| By seve | erity: Moderat       | e or moderat              | e/severe: conti           | nuous measure              | es at 16-week f           | follow-up (clinicia | an-rated) (      | Bett  | er indicate                 | d by lower valu                                      | ues)     |          |
| 1       | randomised<br>trials | no serious<br>limitations | serious <sup>1</sup>      | no serious<br>indirectness | no serious<br>imprecision | none                | 16               | 22    | -                           | SMD 0.26<br>lower (0.9<br>lower to 0.39<br>higher)   | MODERATE | CRITICAL |
| By seve | erity: Severe ar     | nd severe/ve              | ry severe: contir         | nuous measure              | es at 16-week f           | ollow-up (self-re   | port) (Bet       | ter i | ndicated by                 | lower values)  |          |          |
| 1       | randomised<br>trials | no serious<br>limitations | very serious <sup>1</sup> | no serious<br>indirectness | no serious<br>imprecision | none                | 18               | 27    | -                           | SMD 0.23<br>higher (0.37<br>lower to 0.83<br>higher) | LOW      | CRITICAL |
| By seve | erity: Severe ar     | nd severe/ve              | ry severe: contin         | nuous measure              | es at 16-week f           | ollow-up (clinicia  | an-rated) (      | Bett  | er indicate                 | d by lower valu                                      | ıes)     |          |
| 1       | randomised<br>trials | no serious<br>limitations | very serious <sup>1</sup> | no serious<br>indirectness | no serious<br>imprecision | none                | 18               | 27    | -                           | SMD 0.23<br>higher (0.05<br>lower to 0.57<br>higher) | LOW      | CRITICAL |
| By seve | erity: Moderate      | <br>e or moderat          | e/severe: dicho           | tomous outcor              | mes (self-repo            | rt)                 |                  |       |                             |  |          |          |
| 2       | randomised<br>trials | no serious<br>limitations | serious <sup>3</sup>      | no serious<br>indirectness | very serious <sup>4</sup> | none                | 16/35<br>(45.7%) | 0%    | RR 0.50<br>(0.11 to<br>2.3) | 0 fewer per<br>1000 (from 0<br>fewer to 0<br>more)   | VERY LOW | CRITICAL |
| By seve | erity: Severe: d     | ichotomous                | outcomes (self-r          | eport)                     |                           |                     |                  |       |                             |  |          |          |
| 1       | randomised           | no serious                | very serious <sup>1</sup> | no serious                 | no serious                | none                | 30/59            | 0%    | RR 1.07<br>(0.74 to         | 0 more per<br>1000 (from 0                           |          |          |

|        | trials               | limitations               |                           | indirectness               | imprecision               |      | (50.8%)            |          | 1.56)                        | fewer to 0<br>more)                                | LOW      |          |
|--------|----------------------|---------------------------|---------------------------|----------------------------|---------------------------|------|--------------------|----------|------------------------------|--|----------|----------|
| y seve | erity: Moderate      | <br>e or moderat          | <br>e/severe: dichot      | comous (clinici            | an-rated)                 |      |                    | <u> </u> |                              |  |          |          |
|        | randomised<br>trials | no serious<br>limitations | serious <sup>3</sup>      | no serious<br>indirectness | serious <sup>2</sup>      | none | 231/353<br>(65.4%) | 0%       | RR 0.94<br>(0.71 to<br>1.24) | 0 fewer per<br>1000 (from 0<br>fewer to 0<br>more) | LOW      | CRITICAL |
| y seve | erity: Severe: d     | ichotomous (              | (clinician-rated)         |                            |                           |      |                    | Į.       |                              |  |          |          |
|        | randomised<br>trials | no serious<br>limitations | serious <sup>3</sup>      | no serious<br>indirectness | no serious<br>imprecision | none | 53/82<br>(64.6%)   | 0%       | RR 1.02<br>(0.81 to<br>1.29) | 0 more per<br>1000 (from 0<br>fewer to 0<br>more)  | MODERATE | CRITICAL |
| seve   | erity: Moderat       | e: Relapse po             | st-treatment              | <u>'</u>                   |                           |      |                    |          |                              |  | 1        |          |
|        | randomised<br>trials | no serious<br>limitations | very serious <sup>1</sup> | no serious<br>indirectness | no serious<br>imprecision | none | 4/14<br>(28.6%)    | 0%       | RR 0.86<br>(0.27 to<br>2.71) | 0 fewer per<br>1000 (from 0<br>fewer to 0<br>more) | LOW      | CRITICAL |
| y seve | erity: Moderat       | e/severe: Rel             | apse up to 12 m           | onths                      |                           |      |                    | <b> </b> |                              |  |          |          |
|        | randomised<br>trials | no serious<br>limitations | serious <sup>3</sup>      | no serious<br>indirectness | no serious<br>imprecision | none | 9/46<br>(19.6%)    | 0%       | RR 0.66<br>(0.28 to<br>1.56) | 0 fewer per<br>1000 (from 0<br>fewer to 0<br>more) | MODERATE | CRITICAL |
|        |                      | _                         |                           |                            |                           |      |                    |          |                              |  |          |          |

| By seve | rity: Moderat        | e/severe: Rel             | apse at 18 mont           | :hs                        |                           |      |                  |    |                              |  |          |          |
|---------|----------------------|---------------------------|---------------------------|----------------------------|---------------------------|------|------------------|----|------------------------------|--|----------|----------|
| 1       | randomised<br>trials | no serious<br>limitations | very serious <sup>1</sup> | no serious<br>indirectness | no serious<br>imprecision | none | 3/15<br>(20%)    | 0% | RR 0.40<br>(0.12 to<br>1.31) | 0 fewer per<br>1000 (from 0<br>fewer to 0<br>more) | LOW      | CRITICAL |
| By seve | rity: Moderat        | e/severe: Rel             | apse at 24 mont           | ths                        |                           |      |                  |    |                              |  |          |          |
| 2       | randomised<br>trials | no serious<br>limitations | serious <sup>3</sup>      | no serious<br>indirectness | serious <sup>2</sup>      | none | 8/22<br>(36.4%)  | 0% | RR 0.74<br>(0.24 to<br>2.26) | 0 fewer per<br>1000 (from 0<br>fewer to 0<br>more) | LOW      | CRITICAL |
| By seve | rity: Moderat        | e: Relapse at             | 24 months                 |                            |                           |      | I                |    |                              |  |          |          |
| 1       | randomised<br>trials | no serious<br>limitations | very serious <sup>1</sup> | no serious<br>indirectness | no serious<br>imprecision | none | 2/7<br>(28.6%)   | 0% | RR 0.67<br>(0.16 to<br>2.84) | 0 fewer per<br>1000 (from 0<br>fewer to 0<br>more) | LOW      | CRITICAL |
| By seve | rity: Severe: N      | lo. not achiev            | ing remission (s          | elf-report)                | •                         | '    |                  |    |                              |  |          |          |
| 1       | randomised<br>trials | no serious<br>limitations | serious <sup>5</sup>      | no serious<br>indirectness | no serious<br>imprecision | none | 29/45<br>(64.4%) | 0% | RR 2.01<br>(1.41 to<br>2.88) | 0 more per<br>1000 (from 0<br>more to 0<br>more)   | MODERATE | CRITICAL |
| By seve | rity: Severe: N      | lo. not achiev            | ing remission (c          | linician-rated)            |                           |      | ı                |    |                              |  |          |          |
| 1       | randomised<br>trials | no serious<br>limitations | serious <sup>5</sup>      | no serious<br>indirectness | no serious<br>imprecision | none | 30/45<br>(66.7%) | 0% | RR 1.55<br>(1.14 to<br>2.11) | 0 more per<br>1000 (from 0<br>more to 0            | MODERATE | CRITICAL |

| By seve                 | randomised   |              |         | no serious                 | no serious<br>imprecision | none | 28/45<br>(62.2%) | 0% | RR 1.64<br>(1.17 to<br>2.3)  | 0 more per<br>1000 (from 0<br>more to 0<br>more) | MODERATE | CRITICAL |
|-------------------------|--|--------------|---------|----------------------------|---------------------------|------|------------------|----|------------------------------|--|----------|----------|
| By seve                 | randomised   |              |         | no serious<br>indirectness | no serious<br>imprecision | none | 29/45<br>(64.4%) | 0% | RR 2.15<br>(1.48 to<br>3.11) | 0 more per<br>1000 (from 0<br>more to 0<br>more) | MODERATE | CRITICAL |
| Heter<br>Incon<br>Heter | e study; incor<br>ogeneity > 50<br>clusive effect<br>ogeneity >80<br>e study | )%<br>: size | ct size |                            |                           |      |                  |    |                              |  | 1        |          |

# Is CBT + antidepressants effective compared with antidepressants?

|                |                      |                           |                 |                            |                           |                      |                    |          | Summary                      | of findings  |          |            |
|----------------|----------------------|---------------------------|-----------------|----------------------------|---------------------------|----------------------|--------------------|----------|------------------------------|--|----------|------------|
|                |                      |                           | Quality asses   | ssment                     |                           |                      | No. of patient     |          | E                            | Effect   | Quality  | Importance |
| No. of studies | Design               | Limitations               | Inconsistency   | Indirectness               | Imprecision               | Other considerations | CBT + AD           | AD       | Relative<br>(95% CI)         | Absolute   |          |            |
| Leaving        | study early          |                           |                 |                            |                           | 1                    | ı                  |          |                              |  |          |            |
| 8              | randomised<br>trials | no serious<br>limitations |                 | no serious<br>indirectness | no serious<br>imprecision | none                 | 102/416<br>(24.5%) | 0%       | RR 0.81<br>(0.65 to<br>1.01) | 0 fewer per<br>1000 (from 0<br>fewer to 0<br>more) | MODERATE | CRITICAL   |
| Relapse        | at 6 months (        | with continua             | ation treatment | )                          |                           | '                    | '                  |          |                              |  |          |            |
| 1              | randomised<br>trials | no serious<br>Iimitations | '               |                            | no serious<br>imprecision | none                 | 0/16<br>(0%)       | 0%       | RR 0.09<br>(0.01 to<br>1.62) | 0 fewer per<br>1000 (from 0<br>fewer to 0<br>more) | LOW      | CRITICAL   |
| Relapse        | at 12 months         | (no continua              | tion treatment) |                            |                           |                      | l                  | <b>,</b> |                              |  |          |            |
| 1              | randomised<br>trials | no serious<br>Iimitations |                 | no serious<br>indirectness | no serious<br>imprecision | none                 | 4/16<br>(25%)      | 0%       | RR 0.63<br>(0.2 to<br>1.95)  | 0 fewer per<br>1000 (from 0<br>fewer to 0<br>more) | LOW      | CRITICAL   |
|                |                      |                           |                 |                            |                           |                      |                    |          |                              |  |          |            |

| Relapse | at 18 months         | s (no continua            | tion treatment)             |                            |                           |                  |                 |     |                              |   |          |          |
|---------|----------------------|---------------------------|-----------------------------|----------------------------|---------------------------|------------------|-----------------|-----|------------------------------|---|----------|----------|
| 1       | randomised<br>trials | no serious<br>limitations | very serious <sup>2</sup>   | no serious<br>indirectness | no serious<br>imprecision | none             | 2/10<br>(20%)   | 0%  | RR 0.40<br>(0.1 to<br>1.6)   | 0 fewer per<br>1000 (from 0<br>fewer to 0<br>more)  | LOW      | CRITICAL |
| Relapse | at 24 months         | (no continua              | tion treatment)             |                            |                           |                  |                 |     |                              |   |          |          |
| 1       | randomised<br>trials | no serious<br>limitations | very serious <sup>2</sup>   | no serious<br>indirectness | no serious<br>imprecision | none             | 4/16<br>(25%)   | 0%  | RR 0.50<br>(0.17 to<br>1.43) | 0 fewer per<br>1000 (from 0<br>fewer to 0<br>more)  | LOW      | CRITICAL |
| Relapse | at 6 months          | no continua               | tion treatment)             |                            |                           | '                | I               |     |                              |   |          |          |
| 1       | randomised<br>trials | no serious<br>limitations | very serious <sup>2</sup>   | no serious<br>indirectness | no serious<br>imprecision | none             | 6/22<br>(27.3%) | 0%  | RR 1.09<br>(0.41 to<br>2.89) | 0 more per<br>1000 (from 0<br>fewer to 0<br>more)   | LOW      | CRITICAL |
| Relapse | at 6 years (no       | continuation              | treatment)                  |                            | 1                         | '                |                 |     |                              |   |          |          |
| 1       | randomised<br>trials | no serious<br>limitations | serious <sup>3</sup>        | no serious<br>indirectness | no serious<br>imprecision | none             | 8/20<br>(40%)   | 0%  | RR 0.44<br>(0.25 to<br>0.78) | 0 fewer per<br>1000 (from 0<br>fewer to 0<br>fewer) | MODERATE | CRITICAL |
| Depress | sion scores: co      | ntinuous me               | asures post-trea            | tment (self-re             | port) (Better i           | ndicated by lowe | r values)       |     |                              |   |          |          |
| 6       | randomised<br>trials | no serious<br>limitations | no serious<br>inconsistency | no serious<br>indirectness | no serious<br>imprecision | none             | 142             | 135 | -                            | SMD 0.38<br>lower (0.62 to<br>0.14 lower)           | HIGH     | CRITICAL |

| Depres | sion scores: co      | ntinuous me               | asures post-trea            | ntment (clinicia           | an-report) (Bet           | ter indicated by   | lower valu         | ıes)  |                              |   |          |          |
|--------|----------------------|---------------------------|-----------------------------|----------------------------|---------------------------|--------------------|--------------------|-------|------------------------------|---|----------|----------|
| 7      | randomised<br>trials | no serious<br>limitations | no serious<br>inconsistency | no serious<br>indirectness | no serious<br>imprecision | none               | 368                | 356   | -                            | SMD 0.46<br>lower (0.61 to<br>0.31 lower)           | HIGH     |          |
| Depres | sion scores: di      | chotomous n               | neasures post-tro           | eatment (clinic            | cian-report)              |                    |                    | ,     |                              |   |          |          |
| 4      | randomised<br>trials | no serious<br>limitations | serious <sup>1</sup>        | no serious<br>indirectness | serious <sup>4</sup>      | none               | 171/322<br>(53.1%) | 0%    | RR 0.76<br>(0.55 to<br>1.03) | 0 fewer per<br>1000 (from 0<br>fewer to 0<br>more)  | LOW      | CRITICAL |
| Depres | sion scores: di      | chotomous n               | neasures post-tro           | eatment (self-             | report)                   | '                  | _                  |       |                              |   |          |          |
| 3      | randomised<br>trials | no serious<br>limitations | serious <sup>1</sup>        | no serious<br>indirectness | no serious<br>imprecision | none               | 43/95<br>(45.3%)   | 0%    | RR 0.88<br>(0.65 to<br>1.18) | 0 fewer per<br>1000 (from 0<br>fewer to 0<br>more)  | MODERATE | CRITICAL |
| Depres | sion scores: di      | chotomous n               | neasures post-tr            | eatment (self-             | report: 50% in            | crease BDI)        |                    |       |                              |   |          |          |
| 1      | randomised<br>trials | no serious<br>limitations | very serious <sup>2</sup>   | no serious<br>indirectness | no serious<br>imprecision | none               | 18/30<br>(60%)     | 0%    | RR 1.53<br>(0.89 to<br>2.63) | 0 more per<br>1000 (from 0<br>fewer to 0<br>more)   | LOW      | CRITICAL |
| Depres | sion scores: co      | ntinuous me               | asures at 6 mon             | ths' maintena              | nce (self-repor           | t) (Better indicat | ed by low          | er va | lues)                        |   |          |          |
| 1      | randomised<br>trials | no serious<br>limitations | very serious <sup>2</sup>   | no serious<br>indirectness | no serious<br>imprecision | none               | 9                  | 6     | -                            | SMD 0.35<br>higher (0.69<br>lower to 1.4<br>higher) | LOW      | CRITICAL |

| Depres  | sion scores: co      | ontinuous me              | asures at 6 mon           | ths' maintena              | nce (clinician-r          | eport) (Better in  | dicated by        | low   | er values)                   |  |          |          |
|---------|----------------------|---------------------------|---------------------------|----------------------------|---------------------------|--------------------|-------------------|-------|------------------------------|--|----------|----------|
| 1       | randomised<br>trials | no serious<br>limitations | very serious <sup>2</sup> | no serious<br>indirectness | no serious<br>imprecision | none               | 10                | 6     | -                            | SMD 0.50<br>higher (0.53<br>lower to 1.53<br>higher) | LOW      | CRITICAL |
| Depres  | sion scores: co      | ontinuous me              | asures at 1 year          | follow-up (sel             | f-report) (Bett           | er indicated by lo | ower value        | es)   |                              |  |          |          |
| 2       | randomised<br>trials | no serious<br>limitations | serious <sup>1</sup>      | no serious<br>indirectness | no serious<br>imprecision | none               | 48                | 44    | -                            | SMD 0.29<br>lower (0.7<br>lower to 0.12<br>higher)   | MODERATE | CRITICAL |
| Depres  | sion scores: co      | ontinuous me              | asures at 1-mon           | th follow-up (             | clinician-rated           | ) (Better indicate | d by lowe         | r val | ues)                         |  | I        |          |
| 3       | randomised<br>trials | no serious<br>limitations | serious <sup>1</sup>      | no serious<br>indirectness | no serious<br>imprecision | none               | 66                | 60    | -                            | SMD 0.29<br>lower (0.64<br>lower to 0.07<br>higher)  | MODERATE | CRITICAL |
| Depres  | sion scores: co      | ontinuous me              | asures at 1-mor           | th follow-up (             | self-report) (Be          | etter indicated by | y lower va        | lues  |                              |  |          |          |
| 1       | randomised<br>trials | no serious<br>limitations | very serious <sup>2</sup> | no serious<br>indirectness | no serious<br>imprecision | none               | 18                | 16    | -                            | SMD 0.33<br>lower (1.01<br>lower to 0.35<br>higher)  | LOW      | CRITICAL |
| By seve | erity: Moderat       | e and modera              | ate/severe: Leav          | ving the study             | early                     |                    | l                 | ļ     |                              |  | !        |          |
| 4       | randomised<br>trials | no serious<br>limitations | serious <sup>1</sup>      | no serious<br>indirectness | no serious<br>imprecision | none               | 72/315<br>(22.9%) | 0%    | RR 0.81<br>(0.62 to<br>1.07) | 0 fewer per<br>1000 (from 0<br>fewer to 0            | MODERATE | CRITICAL |

|          |                      |                           |                           |                            |                           |                        |                  |       |                              | more)   |              |          |
|----------|----------------------|---------------------------|---------------------------|----------------------------|---------------------------|------------------------|------------------|-------|------------------------------|---|--------------|----------|
| By sever | ity: Severe: Lo      | eaving the st             | udy early                 |                            |                           |                        |                  |       |                              |   |              |          |
|          | randomised<br>trials | no serious<br>limitations | very serious <sup>2</sup> | no serious<br>indirectness | no serious<br>imprecision | none                   | 8/24<br>(33.3%)  | 0%    | RR 1.33<br>(0.55 to<br>3.26) | 0 more per<br>1000 (from 0<br>fewer to 0<br>more)   | LOW          | CRITICAL |
| By sever | ity: severe/ve       | ery Severe: Le            | eaving the study          | early                      |                           |                        |                  |       |                              |   |              |          |
|          | randomised<br>trials | no serious<br>limitations | serious <sup>1</sup>      | no serious<br>indirectness | no serious<br>imprecision | none                   | 22/77<br>(28.6%) | 0%    | RR 0.69<br>(0.45 to<br>1.07) | 0 fewer per<br>1000 (from 0<br>fewer to 0<br>more)  | MODERATE     | CRITICAL |
| By sever | ity: Moderate        | e and modera              | te/severe: Depr           | ession scores              | continuous me             | easures post-trea      | itment (se       | lf-re | port) (Bett                  | er indicated by                                     | lower values | s)       |
|          | randomised<br>trials | no serious<br>limitations | serious <sup>1</sup>      | no serious<br>indirectness | no serious<br>imprecision | none                   | 58               | 57    | 1                            | SMD 0.32<br>lower (0.68<br>lower to 0.05<br>higher) | MODERATE     | CRITICAL |
| By sever | ity: Severe: D       | epression sco             | res continuous            | <br>measures post          | <br>t-treatment (se       | <br>elf-report) (Bette | er indicate      | d by  | lower valu                   | es)   |              |          |
|          | randomised<br>trials | no serious<br>Iimitations | very serious <sup>2</sup> | no serious<br>indirectness | no serious<br>imprecision | none                   | 18               | 16    | -                            | SMD 0.46<br>lower (1.14<br>lower to 0.22<br>higher) | LOW          | CRITICAL |
| By sever | ity: Severe/v        | ery severe: D             | epression scores          | s continuous m             | easures post-             | treatment (self-r      | eport) (Be       | tter  | indicated b                  | y lower values                                      | s)           |          |
| 3        | randomised           | no serious                | no serious                | no serious                 | no serious                | none                   | 66               | 62    | -                            | SMD 0.42<br>lower (0.78 to                          |              | CRITICAL |

|         | trials               | limitations               | inconsistency               | indirectness               | imprecision               |                    |                  |        |                             | 0.07 lower)   | HIGH          |          |
|---------|----------------------|---------------------------|-----------------------------|----------------------------|---------------------------|--------------------|------------------|--------|-----------------------------|---|---------------|----------|
| By seve | rity: Moderat        | e and modera              | ate/severe: Dep             | ression scores             | continuous m              | easures post-trea  | atment (cl       | inicia | an-rated) (I                | Better indicated                                    | d by lower va | alues)   |
| 3       | randomised<br>trials | no serious<br>limitations | no serious<br>inconsistency | no serious<br>indirectness | no serious<br>imprecision | none               | 284              | 277    | -                           | SMD 0.50<br>lower (0.67 to<br>0.33 lower)           | HIGH          | CRITICAL |
| By seve | rity: Severe: D      | epression sc              | ores continuous             | measures pos               | t-treatment (c            | linician-rated) (B | etter indi       | cated  | by lower                    | values)   |               |          |
| l       | randomised<br>trials | no serious<br>limitations | very serious <sup>2</sup>   | no serious<br>indirectness | no serious<br>imprecision | none               | 18               | 16     | -                           | SMD 0.48<br>lower (1.17<br>lower to 0.2<br>higher)  | LOW           | CRITICAL |
| By seve | rity: Severe/v       | ery severe: D             | epression score             | s continuous m             | neasures post-            | treatment (clinic  | ian-rated)       | (Be    | ter indicat                 | ed by lower val                                     | lues)         |          |
| }       | randomised<br>trials | no serious<br>limitations | serious <sup>1</sup>        | no serious<br>indirectness | no serious<br>imprecision | none               | 66               | 63     | -                           | SMD 0.28<br>lower (0.63<br>lower to 0.07<br>higher) | MODERATE      | CRITICAL |
| sy seve | rity: Moderat        | e and modera              | ate/severe: Dep             | ression scores             | dichotomous ı             | neasures post-tr   | eatment (        | self-  | report)                     |   |               |          |
|         | randomised<br>trials | no serious<br>limitations | very serious <sup>2</sup>   | no serious<br>indirectness | no serious<br>imprecision | none               | 8/22<br>(36.4%)  | 0%     | RR 0.58<br>(0.31 to<br>1.1) | 0 fewer per<br>1000 (from 0<br>fewer to 0<br>more)  | LOW           | CRITICAL |
| 3y seve | rity: Severe: D      | epression sco             | ores dichotomou             | us measures (s             | elf-report)               | I                  | I                |        |                             |   |               |          |
| L       | randomised<br>trials | no serious<br>limitations | very serious <sup>2</sup>   | no serious<br>indirectness | no serious<br>imprecision | none               | 30/59<br>(50.8%) | 0%     | RR 1.07<br>(0.74 to         | 0 more per<br>1000 (from 0<br>fewer to 0            | LOW           | CRITICAL |

|        |                      |                           |                             |                            |                           |                   |                    |       | 1.56)                        | more)   |      |          |
|--------|----------------------|---------------------------|-----------------------------|----------------------------|---------------------------|-------------------|--------------------|-------|------------------------------|---|------|----------|
| y seve | rity: Severe/v       | ery severe: D             | epression score             | s dichotomous              | measures (se              | lf-report)        |                    |       |                              |   |      |          |
|        | randomised<br>trials | no serious<br>limitations | very serious <sup>2</sup>   | no serious<br>indirectness | no serious<br>imprecision | none              | 5/14<br>(35.7%)    | 0%    | RR 0.71<br>(0.3 to<br>1.72)  | 0 fewer per<br>1000 (from 0<br>fewer to 0<br>more)  | LOW  | CRITICA  |
| y seve | rity: Moderat        | e and modera              | ate/severe: Dep             | ression scores             | dichotomous               | measures post-ti  | reatment (         | clini | cian-rated)                  |   |      |          |
|        | randomised<br>trials | no serious<br>limitations | no serious<br>inconsistency | no serious<br>indirectness | no serious<br>imprecision | none              | 128/249<br>(51.4%) | 0%    | RR 0.71<br>(0.62 to<br>0.82) | 0 fewer per<br>1000 (from 0<br>fewer to 0<br>fewer) | HIGH | CRITICAI |
| y seve | rity: Severe: D      | epression sc              | ores dichotomo              | us measures po             | ost-treatment             | (clinician-rated) |                    |       |                              |   |      |          |
|        | randomised<br>trials | no serious<br>limitations | very serious <sup>2</sup>   | no serious<br>indirectness | no serious<br>imprecision | none              | 38/59<br>(64.4%)   | 0%    | RR 1.11<br>(0.83 to<br>1.49) | 0 more per<br>1000 (from 0<br>fewer to 0<br>more)   | LOW  | CRITICA  |
| y seve | rity: severe/v       | ery Severe: D             | epression score             | s dichotomous              | measures pos              | st-treatment (cli | nician-rate        | d)    |                              |   |      |          |
|        | randomised           | no serious                | serious <sup>3</sup>        | no serious                 | no serious                | none              |                    |       | RR 0.47                      | 0 fewer per   |      |          |

Inconclusive effect size

<sup>2</sup> Single study; inconclusive effect size

<sup>3</sup> Single study

<sup>4</sup> Heterogeneity >50%

# Is CBT + antidepressants effective compared with CBT?

|                |              |                           | Quality assess  | sment                      |                              |                      |                   | S                 | ummary o                     | f findings   |          |            |
|----------------|--------------|---------------------------|-----------------|----------------------------|------------------------------|----------------------|-------------------|-------------------|------------------------------|--|----------|------------|
|                |              |                           | ·               |                            |                              |                      | No. of p          | atients           | E                            | ffect  |          | Importance |
| No. of studies | Design       | Limitations               | Inconsistency   | Indirectness               | Imprecision                  | Other considerations | CBT+              | СВТ               | Relative<br>(95% CI)         | Absolute   | Quality  |            |
| Leaving        | study early  |                           |                 |                            |                              |                      |                   |                   |                              |  |          |            |
|                |              |                           |                 | no serious<br>indirectness | serious <sup>1</sup>         | none                 | 85/355<br>(23.9%) | 85/355<br>(23.9%) | RR 1.00<br>(0.77 to<br>1.3)  | 0 fewer per<br>1000 (from<br>55 fewer to<br>72 more)   | MODERATE | CRITICAL   |
| Relapse        | at 6 months  | (with continu             | ation treatmen  | t)                         |                              |                      |                   | 0%                |                              | 1000 (from 0 fewer to 0 more)                          |          |            |
| 1              |              | no serious<br>limitations |                 | no serious<br>indirectness | very<br>serious <sup>2</sup> | none                 | 0/16<br>(0%)      | 1/15<br>(6.7%)    | RR 0.31<br>(0.01 to<br>7.15) | 46 fewer per<br>1000 (from<br>66 fewer to<br>410 more) | LOW      | CRITICAL   |
|                |              |                           |                 |                            |                              |                      |                   | 0%                | 7.13)                        | 0 fewer per<br>1000 (from 0<br>fewer to 0<br>more)     |          |            |
| Relapse        | at 12 months | s (no continua            | ation treatment | )                          |                              |                      |                   |                   |                              |  |          |            |
| 1              | randomised   | no serious                | no serious      | no serious                 | very                         | none                 | 4/16              | 3/15              | RR 1.25<br>(0.33 to          | 50 more per<br>1000 (from                              |          | CRITICAL   |

|         | trials               | limitations               | inconsistency               | indirectness               | serious <sup>2</sup>         |                    | (25%)           | (20%)         | 4.68)               | 134 fewer to<br>736 more)                               | LOW      |          |
|---------|----------------------|---------------------------|-----------------------------|----------------------------|------------------------------|--------------------|-----------------|---------------|---------------------|---|----------|----------|
|         |                      |                           |                             |                            |                              |                    |                 | 0%            |                     | 0 more per<br>1000 (from 0<br>fewer to 0<br>more)       |          |          |
| Relapse | at 18 months         | s (no continu             | ation treatment             | :)                         |                              |                    |                 |               |                     |   |          |          |
| 1       | randomised<br>trials | no serious<br>limitations | no serious<br>inconsistency | no serious<br>indirectness | very<br>serious <sup>2</sup> | none               | 2/16<br>(12.5%) | 3/15<br>(20%) | RR 0.63<br>(0.12 to | 74 fewer per<br>1000 (from<br>176 fewer to<br>448 more) | LOW      | CRITICAL |
|         |                      |                           |                             |                            |                              |                    |                 | 0%            | 3.24)               | 0 fewer per<br>1000 (from 0<br>fewer to 0<br>more)      |          |          |
| Relapse | at 24 months         | s (no continu             | ation treatment             | t)                         |                              |                    |                 |               |                     |   |          |          |
| 1       | randomised<br>trials | no serious<br>limitations | no serious<br>inconsistency | no serious<br>indirectness | very<br>serious <sup>2</sup> | none               | 4/16<br>(25%)   | 3/15<br>(20%) | RR 1.25<br>(0.33 to | 50 more per<br>1000 (from<br>134 fewer to<br>736 more)  | LOW      | CRITICAL |
|         |                      |                           |                             |                            |                              |                    |                 | 0%            | 4.68)               | 0 more per<br>1000 (from 0<br>fewer to 0<br>more)       |          |          |
| Depress | ion scores: co       | ontinuous me              | asures post-tre             | atment (self-r             | eport) (Bette                | er indicated by lo | wer valu        | es)           |                     |   |          |          |
| 4       | randomised<br>trials | no serious<br>limitations | no serious<br>inconsistency | no serious<br>indirectness | serious <sup>1</sup>         | none               | 110             | 109           | -                   | SMD 0.17<br>lower (0.44<br>lower to 0.1                 | MODERATE | CRITICAL |

|         |                      |                           |                             |                            |                              |                    |            |           |            | higher)   |          |          |
|---------|----------------------|---------------------------|-----------------------------|----------------------------|------------------------------|--------------------|------------|-----------|------------|---|----------|----------|
| Depress | sion scores: co      | ontinuous me              | easures post-tre            | atment (clinic             | ian-report) (I               | Better indicated I | oy lower v | values)   |            |   |          |          |
| 4       | randomised<br>trials | no serious<br>limitations | no serious<br>inconsistency | no serious<br>indirectness | serious <sup>1</sup>         | none               | 110        | 110       | -          | SMD 0.05<br>lower (0.31<br>lower to 0.22<br>higher) | MODERATE | CRITICAL |
| Depress | sion scores: co      | ontinuous me              | easures at 1-mo             | nth follow-up              | (self-report)                | (Better indicated  | l by lowe  | r values) |            |   |          |          |
| 1       | randomised<br>trials | no serious<br>limitations | no serious<br>inconsistency | no serious<br>indirectness | very<br>serious <sup>2</sup> | none               | 18         | 19        | -          | SMD 0.29<br>lower (0.94<br>lower to 0.36<br>higher) | LOW      | CRITICAL |
| Depress | sion scores: co      | ontinuous me              | easures at 1-mo             | nth follow-up              | (clinician-rep               | ort) (Better indi  | cated by I | ower val  | ues)       |   |          |          |
| 1       | randomised<br>trials | no serious<br>limitations | no serious<br>inconsistency | no serious<br>indirectness | very<br>serious <sup>2</sup> | none               | 18         | 19        |            | SMD 0.08<br>lower (0.72<br>lower to 0.57<br>higher) | LOW      | CRITICAL |
| Depress | sion scores: co      | ntinuous me               | easures at 6 mor            | <br>nths' maintena         | <br>ance (self-rep           | oort) (Better indi | cated by I | lower val | ues)       |   |          |          |
| 1       | randomised<br>trials | no serious<br>limitations | no serious<br>inconsistency | no serious<br>indirectness | very<br>serious <sup>2</sup> | none               | 9          | 14        | -          | SMD 0.35<br>higher (0.49<br>lower to 1.2<br>higher) | LOW      | CRITICAL |
| Depress | sion scores: co      | ontinuous me              | easures at 6 moi            | nths' maintena             | nce (clinicia                | n-report) (Better  | indicated  | d by lowe | er values) |   |          |          |
| 1       | randomised           | no serious                | no serious                  | no serious                 | very                         | none               | 10         | 13        | -          | SMD 0.04<br>lower (0.87                             |          | CRITICAL |

|  | trials               | limitations               | inconsistency               | indirectness               | serious <sup>2</sup> |      |                   |                   |                                | lower to 0.78<br>higher)                              | LOW      |          |
|--|----------------------|---------------------------|-----------------------------|----------------------------|----------------------|------|-------------------|-------------------|--------------------------------|---|----------|----------|
| Depression scores: continuous measures at 1-year follow-up (self-report) (Better indicated by lower values)      |                      |                           |                             |                            |                      |      |                   |                   |                                |   |          |          |
| 2  | randomised<br>trials | no serious<br>limitations | no serious<br>inconsistency | no serious<br>indirectness | serious <sup>1</sup> | none | 48                | 48                | -                              | SMD 0.14<br>higher (0.26<br>lower to 0.54<br>higher)  | MODERATE | CRITICAL |
| Depression scores: continuous measures at 1-year follow-up (clinician-report) (Better indicated by lower values) |                      |                           |                             |                            |                      |      |                   |                   |                                |   |          |          |
| 2  | randomised<br>trials | no serious<br>limitations | no serious<br>inconsistency | no serious<br>indirectness | serious <sup>1</sup> | none | 48                | 50                | -                              | SMD 0.14<br>higher (0.26<br>lower to 0.53<br>higher)  | MODERATE | CRITICAL |
| By severity: Moderate and moderate/severe: leaving study early   |                      |                           |                             |                            |                      |      |                   |                   |                                |   |          |          |
| 3  | randomised<br>trials | no serious<br>limitations | no serious<br>inconsistency | no serious<br>indirectness | serious <sup>1</sup> | none | 68/293<br>(23.2%) | 70/289<br>(24.2%) | RR 0.95<br>(0.71 to<br>- 1.28) | 12 fewer per<br>1000 (from<br>70 fewer to<br>68 more) | MODERATE | CRITICAL |
|  |                      |                           |                             |                            |                      |      |                   | 0%                |                                | 0 fewer per<br>1000 (from 0<br>fewer to 0<br>more)    |          |          |
| By severity: Severe/very severe: Leaving study early   |                      |                           |                             |                            |                      |      |                   |                   |                                |   |          |          |
| 2  | randomised<br>trials | no serious<br>limitations | no serious<br>inconsistency | no serious<br>indirectness | serious <sup>1</sup> | none | 17/62<br>(27.4%)  | 15/66<br>(22.7%)  | RR 1.20<br>(0.66 to            | 45 more per<br>1000 (from<br>77 fewer to              | MODERATE | CRITICAL |

|         |                      |                           |                             |                            |                      |                   |            | 00/          | 2.19)       | 270 more)  0 more per 1000 (from 0                  |               |          |
|---------|----------------------|---------------------------|-----------------------------|----------------------------|----------------------|-------------------|------------|--------------|-------------|---|---------------|----------|
|         |                      |                           |                             |                            |                      |                   |            | 0%           |             | fewer to 0 more)                                    |               |          |
| By seve | rity: Moderat        | e and moder               | ate/severe: Dep             | oression scores            | s: continuous        | measures post-    | treatmen   | ıt (self-re  | port) (Bett | er indicated by                                     | y lower value | es)      |
| 2       | randomised<br>trials | no serious<br>limitations | no serious<br>inconsistency | no serious<br>indirectness | serious <sup>1</sup> | none              | 58         | 55           | -           | SMD 0.08<br>lower (0.45<br>lower to 0.29<br>higher) | MODERATE      | CRITICAL |
| By seve | rity: Severe/v       | ery severe: [             | Depression score            | es: continuous             | measures po          | ost-treatment (se | elf-report | ) (Better    | indicated   | oy lower value                                      | s)            |          |
| 2       | randomised<br>trials | no serious<br>limitations | no serious<br>inconsistency | no serious<br>indirectness | serious <sup>1</sup> | none              | 52         | 54           | -           | SMD 0.27<br>lower (0.65<br>lower to 0.11<br>higher) | MODERATE      | CRITICAL |
| By seve | <br>rity: Moderat    | e and moder               | <br>ate/severe: Dep         | ression scores             | <br>s: continuous    | measures post-    | treatmen   | it (clinicia | n-report)   | (Better indicat                                     | ed by lower   | values)  |
| 2       | randomised<br>trials | no serious<br>limitations | no serious<br>inconsistency | no serious<br>indirectness | serious <sup>1</sup> | none              | 58         | 55           | -           | SMD 0.01<br>lower (0.38<br>lower to 0.36<br>higher) | MODERATE      | CRITICAL |
| By seve | rity: Severe/v       | ery severe: [             | epression score             | es: continuous             | measures po          | ost-treatment (cl | inician-re | port) (Be    | tter indica | ited by lower v                                     | values)       |          |
| 2       | randomised<br>trials | no serious<br>limitations | no serious<br>inconsistency | no serious<br>indirectness | serious <sup>1</sup> | none              | 52         | 55           | -           | SMD 0.09<br>lower (0.47<br>lower to 0.29<br>higher) | MODERATE      | CRITICAL |

| By sever | ity: Moderat         | e: Relapse at             | 6 months (with              | continuation               | treatment)                   |      |                 |                |                                |   |     |          |
|----------|----------------------|---------------------------|-----------------------------|----------------------------|------------------------------|------|-----------------|----------------|--------------------------------|---|-----|----------|
| 1        | randomised<br>trials | no serious<br>limitations | no serious<br>inconsistency | no serious<br>indirectness | very<br>serious <sup>2</sup> | none | 0/16<br>(0%)    | 1/15<br>(6.7%) | RR 0.31<br>(0.01 to<br>7.15)   | 46 fewer per<br>1000 (from<br>66 fewer to<br>410 more)  | LOW | CRITICAL |
|          |                      |                           |                             |                            |                              |      |                 | 0%             |                                | 0 fewer per<br>1000 (from 0<br>fewer to 0<br>more)      |     |          |
| By sever | ity: Moderat         | e: Relapse at             | 12 months (no               | continuation t             | reatment)                    |      |                 |                |                                |   |     |          |
| 1        | randomised<br>trials | no serious<br>limitations | no serious<br>inconsistency | no serious<br>indirectness | very<br>serious <sup>2</sup> | none | 4/16<br>(25%)   | 3/15<br>(20%)  | RR 1.25<br>(0.33 to<br>- 4.68) | 50 more per<br>1000 (from<br>134 fewer to<br>736 more)  | LOW | CRITICAL |
|          |                      |                           |                             |                            |                              |      |                 | 0%             |                                | 0 more per<br>1000 (from 0<br>fewer to 0<br>more)       |     |          |
| By sever | ity: Moderat         | e: Relapse at             | 18 months (no               | continuation t             | reatment)                    |      |                 |                |                                |   |     |          |
| 1        | randomised<br>trials | no serious<br>limitations | no serious<br>inconsistency | no serious<br>indirectness | very<br>serious <sup>2</sup> | none | 2/16<br>(12.5%) | 3/15<br>(20%)  | RR 0.63<br>(0.12 to            | 74 fewer per<br>1000 (from<br>176 fewer to<br>448 more) | LOW | CRITICAL |
|          |                      |                           |                             |                            |                              |      |                 | 0%             | 3.24)                          | 0 fewer per<br>1000 (from 0<br>fewer to 0<br>more)      |     |          |
| By sever | ity: Moderat         | e: Relapse at             | 24 months (no               | continuation t             | reatment)                    |      |                 |                |                                | '   |     |          |

| 1       | randomised<br>trials |               | no serious<br>inconsistency | no serious<br>indirectness | very<br>serious <sup>2</sup> | none                    | 4/16<br>(25%) | 3/15<br>(20%) | RR 1.25<br>(0.33 to<br>4.68) | 50 more per<br>1000 (from<br>134 fewer to<br>736 more)<br>0 more per<br>1000 (from 0<br>fewer to 0<br>more) | LOW          | CRITICAL |
|---------|----------------------|---------------|-----------------------------|----------------------------|------------------------------|-------------------------|---------------|---------------|------------------------------|---|--------------|----------|
| By seve | ।<br>rity: Moderat   | e: Depressior | scores: contin              | l<br>uous measure          | s at 1-month                 | <br>  follow-up (self-r | report) (B    | etter ind     | icated by I                  | /   |              |          |
| 1       | randomised<br>trials |               |                             | no serious<br>indirectness | very<br>serious <sup>2</sup> | none                    | 18            | 19            | -                            | SMD 0.29<br>lower (0.94<br>lower to 0.36<br>higher)   | LOW          | CRITICAL |
| By seve | rity: Moderat        | e: Depressior | scores: contin              | uous measure               | s at 1-month                 | follow-up (clinic       | cian-repo     | rt) (Bette    | r indicated                  | l by lower value  | es)          |          |
| 1       | randomised<br>trials |               |                             | no serious<br>indirectness | very<br>serious <sup>2</sup> | none                    | 18            | 19            | -                            | SMD 0.08<br>lower (0.72<br>lower to 0.57<br>higher)   | LOW          | CRITICAL |
| By seve | rity: Moderat        | e/severe: De  | pression scores             | : continuous n             | neasures at 6                | months' mainte          | nance (se     | elf-report    | t) (Better ii                | ndicated by low   | er values)   |          |
| 1       | randomised<br>trials |               |                             | no serious<br>indirectness | very<br>serious <sup>2</sup> | none                    | 9             | 14            | -                            | SMD 0.35<br>higher (0.49<br>lower to 1.2<br>higher)   | LOW          | CRITICAL |
| By seve | rity: Moderat        | e/severe: De  | pression scores             | : continuous n             | neasures at 6                | months' mainte          | nance (cl     | inician-re    | eport) (Bet                  | ter indicated by  | / lower valu | es)      |
| 1       | randomised           | no serious    | no serious                  | no serious                 | very                         | none                    | 10            | 13            | -                            | SMD 0.04<br>lower (0.87   |              | CRITICAL |

|         | trials               | limitations   | inconsistency               | indirectness               | serious <sup>2</sup> |                    |           |            |             | lower to 0.78<br>higher)                             | LOW      |          |
|---------|----------------------|---------------|-----------------------------|----------------------------|----------------------|--------------------|-----------|------------|-------------|--|----------|----------|
| By seve | rity: Very sev       | ere: Depressi | on scores: cont             | inuous measur              | es at 1-year         | follow-up (self-re | eport) (B | etter indi | cated by lo | ower values)   |          |          |
| 2       | randomised<br>trials |               | no serious<br>inconsistency | no serious<br>indirectness | serious <sup>1</sup> | none               | 48        | 48         | -           | SMD 0.14<br>higher (0.26<br>lower to 0.54<br>higher) | MODERATE | CRITICAL |
| By seve | rity: Very sev       | ere: Depressi | on scores: conti            | nuous measur               | es at 1-year         | follow-up (clinici | an-repor  | t) (Better | indicated   | by lower value                                       | es)      |          |
| 2       | randomised<br>trials |               | no serious<br>inconsistency | no serious<br>indirectness | serious <sup>1</sup> | none               | 48        | 50         | -           | SMD 0.14<br>higher (0.26<br>lower to 0.53<br>higher) | MODERATE | CRITICAL |

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1</sup> Inconclusive effect size
<sup>2</sup> Single study, inconclusive effect size

# Is CBT (for insomnia) + antidepressants effective compared with non-directive interventions (quasi-desens for insomnia) + antidepressants?

|                |                      |             | Quality asses               | esment                     |                              |                      |                               | Summary  | of finding                   | ;s   |         |            |
|----------------|----------------------|-------------|-----------------------------|----------------------------|------------------------------|----------------------|-------------------------------|--|------------------------------|--|---------|------------|
|                |                      |             | Quality asses               | Silient                    |                              |                      | No.                           | of patients  | E                            | ffect  |         |            |
| No. of studies | Design               | Limitations | Inconsistency               | Indirectness               | Imprecision                  | Other considerations | CBT (for<br>insomnia)<br>+ AD | Non-directive<br>interventions<br>(quasi-desens<br>for insomnia) +<br>AD | Relative<br>(95% CI)         | Absolute   | Quality | Importance |
| Leaving        | study early          | l           | l                           |                            |                              | l                    |                               |  | I                            | l  |         |            |
|                | randomised<br>trials |             | no serious<br>inconsistency |                            | very<br>serious <sup>1</sup> | none                 | 5/15<br>(33.3%)               | 3/15 (20%)   | RR 1.67<br>(0.48 to<br>5.76) | 134 more<br>per 1000<br>(from 104<br>fewer to<br>952 more) | LOW     | CRITICAL   |
|                |                      |             |                             |                            |                              |                      |                               | 0%   |                              | 0 more per<br>1000 (from<br>0 fewer to<br>0 more)          |         |            |
| Depress        | sion scores: c       | ontinuous m | easures post-t              | reatment (clir             | nician-report                | ed) (Better indic    | ated by lov                   | ver values)  |                              |  |         |            |
|                | randomised<br>trials |             |                             | no serious<br>indirectness | very<br>serious <sup>1</sup> | none                 | 15                            | 15   | -                            | SMD 0.39<br>lower (1.11<br>lower to<br>0.33<br>higher)     | LOW     | CRITICAL   |

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1</sup> Single study, inconclusive effect size

## Is CBT effective compared with treatment as usual (TAU)/antidepressants in older adults?

|                |                      |              | Quality asses                                  | ssment                     |                           |                      |                 | S                | ummary o                     | findings   |          |            |
|----------------|----------------------|--------------|--|----------------------------|---------------------------|----------------------|-----------------|------------------|------------------------------|--|----------|------------|
|                |                      |              | <b>X</b> • • • • • • • • • • • • • • • • • • • |                            |                           |                      | No. of          | patients         | E                            | ffect  |          | Importance |
| No. of studies | Design               | Limitations  | Inconsistency                                  | Indirectness               | Imprecision               | Other considerations | СВТ             | TAU/AD           | Relative<br>(95% CI)         | Absolute   | Quality  |            |
| Leaving        | study for any        | reason       |  | 1                          | 1                         |                      |                 |                  |                              |  |          |            |
|                | randomised<br>trials |              |  | no serious<br>indirectness | serious <sup>1</sup>      | none                 | 8/52<br>(15.4%) | 15/56<br>(26.8%) | RR 0.57<br>(0.27 to<br>1.21) | 115 fewer<br>per 1000<br>(from 196<br>fewer to 56<br>more) | MODERATE | CRITICAL   |
|                |                      |              |  |                            |                           |                      |                 | 0%               |                              | 0 fewer per<br>1000 (from 0<br>fewer to 0<br>more)         |          |            |
| Depress        | ion scores: co       | ontinuous me | easures post-tre                               | eatment (self-r            | eport) (Bette             | r indicated by lov   | wer valu        | es)              |                              |  |          |            |
|                |                      |              |  | no serious<br>indirectness | serious <sup>1</sup>      | none                 | 52              | 56               | -                            | SMD 0.31<br>lower (0.69<br>lower to 0.07<br>higher)        | MODERATE | CRITICAL   |
| Depress        | ion scores: co       | ontinuous me | easures post-tre                               | eatment (clinic            | ian-report) (B            | etter indicated b    | y lower         | values)          |                              |  |          |            |
| 2              | randomised<br>trials |              |  | no serious<br>indirectness | no serious<br>imprecision | none                 | 52              | 56               | -                            | SMD 0.41<br>lower (0.79<br>to 0.03                         | HIGH     | CRITICAL   |

|        |                      |                           |                             |                            |                           |                    |           |           |      | lower)  |     |          |
|--------|----------------------|---------------------------|-----------------------------|----------------------------|---------------------------|--------------------|-----------|-----------|------|---|-----|----------|
| Depres | sion scores: co      | ontinuous m               | easures at 3-mo             | nth follow-up              | (self-report) (           | Better indicated   | by lowe   | r values) |      |   |     |          |
| 1      | randomised<br>trials | no serious<br>limitations | no serious<br>inconsistency | no serious<br>indirectness | very serious <sup>2</sup> | none               | 21        | 23        | -    | SMD 0.44<br>lower (1.03<br>lower to 0.16<br>higher) | LOW | CRITICAL |
| Depres | sion scores: co      | ontinuous m               | easures at 3-mo             | nth follow-up              | (clinician-rep            | ort) (Better indic | ated by I | ower valu | ues) | '   |     |          |
| 1      | randomised<br>trials | no serious<br>limitations | no serious<br>inconsistency | no serious<br>indirectness | very serious <sup>2</sup> | none               | 21        | 23        | -    | SMD 0.27<br>lower (0.87<br>lower to 0.32<br>higher) | LOW | CRITICAL |
| Depres | sion scores: co      | ontinuous m               | easures at 6-mo             | nth follow-up              | (self-report) (           | Better indicated   | by lowe   | r values) |      | '   |     |          |
| 1      | randomised<br>trials | no serious<br>limitations | no serious<br>inconsistency | no serious<br>indirectness | very serious <sup>2</sup> | none               | 21        | 23        | -    | SMD 0.42<br>lower (1.02<br>lower to 0.18<br>higher) | LOW | CRITICAL |
| Depres | sion scores: co      | ontinuous m               | easures at 6-mo             | nth follow-up              | (clinician-rep            | ort) (Better indic | ated by I | ower valu | ies) | '   |     |          |
| 1      | randomised<br>trials | no serious<br>limitations | no serious<br>inconsistency | no serious<br>indirectness | very serious <sup>2</sup> | none               | 21        | 23        | -    | SMD 0.15<br>lower (0.74<br>lower to 0.44<br>higher) | LOW | CRITICAL |

Inconclusive effect size

<sup>2</sup> Single study, inconclusive effect size

Is CBT + antidepressants effective compared with antidepressants in older adults?

|                |                      |               | Quality assess              | sment                      |                              |                      |                  | Su               | mmary of                     | findings  |         |            |
|----------------|----------------------|---------------|-----------------------------|----------------------------|------------------------------|----------------------|------------------|------------------|------------------------------|---|---------|------------|
|                |                      |               | Quality assess              | Silient.                   |                              |                      | No. of p         | atients          |                              | Effect  |         | Importance |
| No. of studies | Design               | Limitations   | Inconsistency               | Indirectness               | Imprecision                  | Other considerations | CBT+             | AD               | Relative<br>(95% CI)         | Absolute  | Quality |            |
| Leaving        | study early fo       | or any reason | '                           |                            |                              |                      |                  |                  |                              | '   | ı       | ı          |
| 1              | randomised<br>trials |               | no serious<br>inconsistency | no serious<br>indirectness | very<br>serious <sup>1</sup> | none                 | 12/36<br>(33.3%) | 12/33<br>(36.4%) | RR 0.92<br>(0.48 to<br>1.75) | 29 fewer per<br>1000 (from 189<br>fewer to 273<br>more) | LOW     | CRITICAL   |
|                |                      |               |                             |                            |                              |                      |                  | 0%               | 1.75)                        | 0 fewer per<br>1000 (from 0<br>fewer to 0<br>more)      |         |            |
| Depressi       | ion scores: co       | ntinuous mea  | asures post-trea            | tment (self-rep            | oort) (Better                | indicated by low     | er values        | )                |                              |   |         |            |
| 1              | randomised<br>trials |               | no serious<br>inconsistency | no serious<br>indirectness | very<br>serious <sup>1</sup> | none                 | 36               | 33               | -                            | SMD 0.36<br>lower (0.84<br>lower to 0.12<br>higher)     | LOW     | CRITICAL   |
| Depressi       | ion scores: co       | ntinuous mea  | sures post-trea             | tment (clinicia            | n-report) (Be                | tter indicated by    | lower va         | lues)            |                              |   |         |            |
| 1              | randomised<br>trials |               | no serious<br>inconsistency | no serious<br>indirectness | very<br>serious <sup>1</sup> | none                 | 36               | 33               | -                            | SMD 0.45<br>lower (0.93<br>lower to 0.03<br>higher)     | LOW     | CRITICAL   |

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1</sup> Single study, inconclusive effect size

## Is group CBT + antidepressants effective compared with antidepressants in older adults?

|                |                      |                           | Quality asses               | smant                      |                              |                      |                      | Su              | mmary of             | findings   |         |            |
|----------------|----------------------|---------------------------|-----------------------------|----------------------------|------------------------------|----------------------|----------------------|-----------------|----------------------|--|---------|------------|
|                |                      |                           | Quality assess              | Silicit                    |                              |                      | No. of p             | atients         |                      | Effect   |         | Importance |
| No. of studies | Design               | Limitations               | Inconsistency               | Indirectness               | Imprecision                  | Other considerations | Group<br>CBT +<br>AD | AD              | Relative<br>(95% CI) | Absolute   | Quality | -          |
| Leaving s      | study early fo       | or any reason             | I                           |                            | ı                            |                      |                      |                 |                      | 1  | 1       |            |
|                | randomised<br>trials | no serious<br>limitations | no serious<br>inconsistency | no serious<br>indirectness | very<br>serious <sup>1</sup> | none                 | 4/22<br>(18.2%)      | 5/23<br>(21.7%) | RR 0.84<br>(0.26 to  | 35 fewer per<br>1000 (from 161<br>fewer to 374<br>more)  | LOW     | CRITICAL   |
|                |                      |                           |                             |                            |                              |                      |                      | 0%              | 2.72)                | 0 fewer per<br>1000 (from 0<br>fewer to 0<br>more)       |         |            |
| Depressi       | ion scores: Re       | ecurrence (M              | ADRS >=10) at 6             | months                     |                              |                      |                      |                 |                      |  |         |            |
|                | randomised<br>trials | no serious<br>limitations | no serious<br>inconsistency | no serious<br>indirectness | very<br>serious <sup>1</sup> | none                 | 1/18<br>(5.6%)       | 4/19<br>(21.1%) | RR 0.26<br>(0.03 to  | 156 fewer per<br>1000 (from 204<br>fewer to 240<br>more) | LOW     | CRITICAL   |
|                |                      |                           |                             |                            |                              |                      |                      | 0%              | 2.14)                | 0 fewer per<br>1000 (from 0<br>fewer to 0<br>more)       |         |            |

| randomised<br>trials | no serious<br>limitations | no serious<br>inconsistency | no serious<br>indirectness | very serious                 | none | 5/18<br>(27.8%) | 8/18<br>(44.4%)                                     | RR 0.63<br>(0.25 to<br>1.55) | 164 fewer per<br>1000 (from 333<br>fewer to 244<br>more) | LOW | CRITI  |
|----------------------|---------------------------|-----------------------------|----------------------------|------------------------------|------|-----------------|---|------------------------------|--|-----|--------|
|                      |                           |                             |                            |                              |      |                 | 0%  | 1.331                        | 0 fewer per<br>1000 (from 0<br>fewer to 0<br>more)       |     |        |
| ession scores: B     | DI >=12 at 6 n            | nonths                      |                            |                              |      |                 |   |                              |  |     |        |
| randomised<br>trials | no serious<br>limitations | no serious<br>inconsistency | no serious<br>indirectness | very<br>serious <sup>1</sup> | none |                 | 5/19<br>(26.3%)                                     | RR 1.69                      | 182 more per<br>1000 (from 84<br>fewer to 845            |     |        |
|                      |                           |                             |                            |                              |      | 8/18<br>(44.4%) |   | (0.68 to                     | more)  | LOW | CRITI  |
|                      |                           |                             |                            |                              |      |                 | 0%  | 4.21)                        | 0 more per<br>1000 (from 0<br>fewer to 0<br>more)        |     |        |
| ession scores: B     | DI >=12 at 12             | months                      | '                          |                              |      |                 |   |                              |  |     |        |
| randomised<br>trials | no serious<br>limitations | no serious<br>inconsistency | no serious<br>indirectness | very<br>serious <sup>1</sup> | none | 7/18<br>(38.9%) | $\left \begin{array}{c}3\\26\end{array}\right $ (0. | RR 1.40<br>(0.54 to          | 111 more per<br>1000 (from 128<br>fewer to 722<br>more)  | LOW | CRITIO |
|                      |                           |                             |                            |                              |      | ,               | 0%  | 3.6)                         | 0 more per<br>1000 (from 0<br>fewer to 0<br>more)        |     |        |

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1</sup> Single study, inconclusive effect size

## Is CBT effective compared with placebo + clinical management in relapse prevention?

|                |                      |                           | Quality asse                | ssment                     |                      |                      |                               | Summa                               | ry of findi                  | ngs  |          |            |
|----------------|----------------------|---------------------------|-----------------------------|----------------------------|----------------------|----------------------|-------------------------------|-------------------------------------|------------------------------|--|----------|------------|
|                |                      |                           | <b>~</b> ,                  |                            |                      |                      | No. of                        | patients                            | Ef                           | fect   |          | Importance |
| No. of studies | Design               | Limitations               | Inconsistency               | Indirectness               | Imprecision          | Other considerations | Relapse<br>prevention:<br>CBT | Placebo +<br>clinical<br>management | Relative<br>(95% CI)         | Absolute                                       | Quality  | ·          |
| Leaving        | study early          |                           | !                           | ı                          | l                    |                      | •                             | •                                   |                              | '  |          |            |
|                | randomised<br>trials |                           | no serious<br>inconsistency |                            | serious <sup>1</sup> | none                 | 16/97<br>(16.5%)              | 6/90 (6.7%)                         | RR 2.47<br>(1.01 to<br>6.05) | 337 more)                                      | MODERATE | CRITICAL   |
|                |                      |                           |                             |                            |                      |                      |                               | 0%                                  |                              | per 1000<br>(from 0<br>more to 0<br>more)      |          |            |
| Relapse        |                      |                           |                             |                            |                      |                      |                               |                                     |                              |  |          |            |
|                | randomised<br>trials | no serious<br>limitations | serious <sup>2</sup>        | no serious<br>indirectness | serious <sup>3</sup> | none                 | 61/187<br>(32.6%)             | 75/175<br>(42.9%)                   | (0.42 to                     | 133 fewer<br>per 1000<br>(from 249<br>fewer to | LOW      | CRITICAL   |

| Remissi | on (68 weeks         | s)           |                             |                 |                              |                       |                | 0%                     |                             | 0 fewer<br>per 1000<br>(from 0<br>fewer to 0<br>more)               |       |          |
|---------|----------------------|--------------|-----------------------------|-----------------|------------------------------|-----------------------|----------------|------------------------|-----------------------------|---|-------|----------|
|         | randomised<br>trials |              | no serious<br>inconsistency |                 | very<br>serious <sup>4</sup> | none                  | 42/70 (60%)    | 30/65 (46.2%)          | RR 1.30<br>(0.94 to<br>1.8) | 138 more<br>per 1000<br>(from 28<br>fewer to<br>369 more)           | LOW   | CRITICAL |
| Depress | sion scores: c       | continuous o | outcomes in pa              | tients with 5   | or more pre                  | vious episodes (      | clinician-repo | 0%<br>orted) (Better i |                             | 0 more<br>per 1000<br>(from 0<br>fewer to 0<br>more)<br>by lower va | lues) |          |
| 1       | randomised           | no serious   |                             | no serious      | very                         | none                  | 37             | 34                     | -                           | SMD 0.08<br>lower<br>(0.54<br>lower to<br>0.39<br>higher)           | LOW   | CRITICAL |
| Depress | sion scores: c       | continuous o | utcomes in pa               | tients with 5 o | or more pre                  | ।<br>vious episodes ( | self-reported  | l) (Better indica      | ated by lo                  | wer values)   |       |          |
|         | randomised<br>trials |              | no serious<br>inconsistency |                 | very<br>serious <sup>4</sup> | none                  | 51             | 50                     | -                           | SMD 0.18<br>higher<br>(0.21   | LOW   | CRITICAL |

|  |  |  |  |  | lower to |  |
|--|--|--|--|--|----------|--|
|  |  |  |  |  | 0.57     |  |
|  |  |  |  |  | higher)  |  |
|  |  |  |  |  |          |  |

#### Is CBT effective compared with antidepressants in relapse prevention?

|                |                      |                           | Quality assess | sment                      |                              |                      |                               | Sumi            | mary of fin                 | dings   |         |            |
|----------------|----------------------|---------------------------|----------------|----------------------------|------------------------------|----------------------|-------------------------------|-----------------|-----------------------------|---|---------|------------|
|                |                      |                           | ,              |                            |                              |                      | No. of pati                   | ents            | E                           | ffect   |         | Importance |
| No. of studies | Design               | Limitations               | Inconsistency  | Indirectness               | Imprecision                  | Other considerations | Relapse<br>prevention:<br>CBT | AD              | Relative<br>(95% CI)        | Absolute  | Quality | •          |
| Leaving        | study early          | ı                         | ı              | ı                          | ı                            |                      |                               |                 |                             |   | 1       |            |
| 1              | randomised<br>trials | no serious<br>limitations |                | no serious<br>indirectness | very<br>serious <sup>1</sup> | none                 | 3/60 (5%)                     | 5/120<br>(4.2%) | RR 1.20<br>(0.3 to<br>4.85) | 8 more per<br>1000 (from<br>29 fewer to<br>160 more)<br>0 more per<br>1000 (from 0<br>fewer to 0<br>more) | LOW     | CRITICAL   |
| Relapse        | apse                 |                           |                |                            |                              |                      |                               |                 |                             |   |         |            |
| 1              | randomised           | no serious                | no serious     | no serious                 | very                         | none                 | 21/27                         | 0%              | RR 0.46<br>(0.27 to         | 0 fewer per<br>1000 (from 0   |         | CRITICAL   |

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1</sup> Single study

<sup>2</sup> Heterogeneity >50%

<sup>3</sup> Inconclusive effect size

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>4</sup> Single study, inconclusive effect size

| trials | limitations | inconsistency | indirectness | serious <sup>1</sup> | (77.8%) | 0.79) | fewer to 0 | LOW |  |
|--------|-------------|---------------|--------------|----------------------|---------|-------|------------|-----|--|
|        |             |               |              |                      |         |       | fewer)     |     |  |
|        |             |               |              |                      |         |       |            |     |  |

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1</sup> Single study, inconclusive effect size

#### Is CBT + antidepressants effective compared with antidepressants in relapse prevention?

|                |             |                           | Quality asses               | sment                      |                              |                      |                                    | Summ             | nary of find                 | lings   |         |            |
|----------------|-------------|---------------------------|-----------------------------|----------------------------|------------------------------|----------------------|------------------------------------|------------------|------------------------------|---|---------|------------|
|                |             |                           | Quality asses               | oc.iii                     |                              |                      | No. of pat                         | ients            | E                            | ffect   |         | Importance |
| No. of studies | Design      | Limitations               | Inconsistency               | Indirectness               | Imprecision                  | Other considerations | Relapse<br>prevention:<br>CBT + AD | AD               | Relative<br>(95% CI)         | Absolute  | Quality | -          |
| Leaving        | study early | l                         | l                           | l                          | ı                            | '                    |                                    | •                | ı                            |   | 1       |            |
| 1              |             | no serious<br>Iimitations |                             | no serious<br>indirectness | very<br>serious <sup>1</sup> | none                 | 23/66<br>(34.8%)                   | 24/66<br>(36.4%) | RR 0.96<br>(0.61 to          | 15 fewer per<br>1000 (from<br>142 fewer to<br>189 more) |         | CRITICAL   |
|                |             |                           |                             |                            |                              |                      | ,                                  | 0%               | 1.52)                        | 0 fewer per<br>1000 (from 0<br>fewer to 0<br>more)      |         |            |
| Relapse        |             |                           |                             |                            |                              |                      |                                    |                  |                              |   |         |            |
| 1              |             | no serious<br>limitations | no serious<br>inconsistency | no serious<br>indirectness | very<br>serious <sup>1</sup> | none                 | 4/66 (6.1%)                        | 5/66<br>(7.6%)   | RR 0.80<br>(0.22 to<br>2.85) | 15 fewer per<br>1000 (from<br>59 fewer to<br>140 more)  | LOW     | CRITICAL   |
|                |             |                           |                             |                            |                              |                      |                                    | 0%               |                              | 0 fewer per   |         |            |

|        |                      |                           |                  |                |                              |                   |      |    |   | 1000 (from 0<br>fewer to 0<br>more)                 |     |          |
|--------|----------------------|---------------------------|------------------|----------------|------------------------------|-------------------|------|----|---|---|-----|----------|
| Depres | sion scores: co      | ontinuous ou              | tcomes (clinicia | n-reported) (E | Better indicat               | ted by lower valu | ies) |    |   |   |     |          |
| 1      | randomised<br>trials | no serious<br>limitations |                  |                | very<br>serious <sup>1</sup> | none              | 66   | 66 | - | SMD 0.18<br>lower (0.52<br>lower to 0.16<br>higher) | LOW | CRITICAL |

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1</sup> Single study, inconclusive effect size

## Is CBT effective compared with behavioural activation?

|                |                      |             | Quality assess | sment                      |                      |                      |                 | S                | ummary o                     | f findings  |          |            |
|----------------|----------------------|-------------|----------------|----------------------------|----------------------|----------------------|-----------------|------------------|------------------------------|---|----------|------------|
|                |                      |             | <b>,</b>       |                            |                      |                      | No. of p        | patients         | E                            | iffect  |          | Importance |
| No. of studies | Design               | Limitations | Inconsistency  | Indirectness               | Imprecision          | Other considerations | СВТ             | ВА               | Relative<br>(95% CI)         | Absolute  | Quality  |            |
| Leaving        | study early          |             |                |                            | 1                    |                      |                 |                  |                              |   |          |            |
|                | randomised<br>trials |             |                | no serious<br>indirectness | serious <sup>1</sup> | none                 | 7/55<br>(12.7%) | 12/53<br>(22.6%) | RR 0.56<br>(0.24 to<br>1.33) | 100 fewer per<br>1000 (from<br>172 fewer to<br>75 more)<br>0 fewer per<br>1000 (from 0<br>fewer to 0<br>more) | MODERATE | CRITICAL   |
|                |                      |             |                |                            |                      |                      |                 |                  |                              | •   |          |            |

| By sev | erity: High seve     | erity: Depres             | sion scores: con            | tinuous meas               | ures at 8-we                 | ek endpoint (self | -reported  | l) (Bettei | · indicated | by lower value                                       | s)      |          |
|--------|----------------------|---------------------------|-----------------------------|----------------------------|------------------------------|-------------------|------------|------------|-------------|--|---------|----------|
| 1      | randomised<br>trials | no serious<br>limitations | no serious<br>inconsistency | no serious<br>indirectness | very<br>serious <sup>2</sup> | none              | 21         | 22         | -           | SMD 0.34<br>higher (0.26<br>lower to 0.95<br>higher) | LOW     | CRITICAL |
| By sev | erity: High seve     | erity: Depres             | sion scores: con            | tinuous meası              | ures at 8-we                 | ek endpoint (clin | ician-repo | orted) (B  | etter indic | ated by lower v                                      | alues)  |          |
| 1      | randomised<br>trials | no serious<br>limitations | no serious<br>inconsistency | no serious<br>indirectness | very<br>serious <sup>2</sup> | none              | 21         | 22         | -           | SMD 0.03<br>lower (0.62<br>lower to 0.57<br>higher)  | LOW     | CRITICAL |
| By sev | erity: High sev      | erity: Depres             | sion scores: con            | tinuous meas               | ures at 16-w                 | eek endpoint (se  | lf-reporte | ed) (Bette | er indicate | d by lower valu                                      | es)     |          |
| 1      | randomised<br>trials | no serious<br>limitations | no serious<br>inconsistency | no serious<br>indirectness | very<br>serious <sup>2</sup> | none              | 18         | 16         | -           | SMD 0.67<br>higher (0.02<br>lower to 1.37<br>higher) | LOW     | CRITICAL |
| By sev | erity: High seve     | erity: Depres             | sion scores: con            | tinuous meası              | ures at 16-w                 | eek endpoint (cli | nician-rep | oorted) (I | Better indi | cated by lower                                       | values) |          |
| 1      | randomised<br>trials | no serious<br>limitations | no serious inconsistency    | no serious indirectness    | very<br>serious <sup>2</sup> | none              |            |            |             | SMD 0.37<br>lower (1.05                              |         |          |
|        | uiais                | Immedians                 | meonsistency                | indirectives.              | 00.7000                      |                   | 16         | 18         | -           | lower to 0.31<br>higher)                             | LOW     | CRITICAL |
| By sev |                      |                           |                             |                            |                              | endpoint (self-re |            |            | dicated by  | lower to 0.31<br>higher)                             | LOW     | CRITICAL |

|          |                      |                           |                             |                            |                              |                    |               |                 |                              | higher)   |          |          |
|----------|----------------------|---------------------------|-----------------------------|----------------------------|------------------------------|--------------------|---------------|-----------------|------------------------------|---|----------|----------|
| By sever | ity: Moderat         | e: Depression             | scores: contin              | uous measure               | s at 8-week                  | endpoint (clinicia | n-report      | ed) (Bette      | er indicate                  | d by lower val  | ues)     |          |
| 1        | randomised<br>trials | no serious<br>limitations | no serious<br>inconsistency | no serious<br>indirectness | very<br>serious <sup>2</sup> | none               | 17            | 15              | -                            | SMD 0.36<br>lower (1.06<br>lower to 0.34<br>higher)   | LOW      | CRITICAL |
| By sever | ity: Moderat         | e: Depressior             | scores: contin              | uous measure               | s at 16-week                 | endpoint (self-re  | eported)      | (Better ir      | ndicated by                  | / lower values)   |          |          |
| 2        | randomised<br>trials | no serious<br>limitations | no serious<br>inconsistency | no serious<br>indirectness | serious <sup>1</sup>         | none               | 67            | 69              | -                            | SMD 0.06<br>higher (0.28<br>lower to 0.4<br>higher)   | MODERATE | CRITICAL |
| By sever | ity: Moderat         | e: Depressior             | scores: contin              | uous measure               | s at 16-week                 | endpoint (clinici  | an-repor      | ted) (Bet       | ter indicat                  | ed by lower va  | lues)    |          |
|          | randomised<br>trials | no serious<br>limitations | no serious<br>inconsistency | no serious<br>indirectness | serious <sup>1</sup>         | none               | 64            | 66              | -                            | SMD 0.08<br>higher (0.26<br>lower to 0.43<br>higher)  | MODERATE | CRITICAL |
| Relapse  | at 1 year            |                           |                             |                            |                              | '                  |               |                 |                              |   |          |          |
|          | randomised<br>trials | no serious<br>limitations | no serious<br>inconsistency | no serious<br>indirectness | very<br>serious <sup>2</sup> | none               | 9/30<br>(30%) | 9/27<br>(33.3%) | RR 0.90<br>(0.42 to<br>1.93) | 33 fewer per<br>1000 (from<br>193 fewer to<br>310 more)<br>0 fewer per<br>1000 (from 0<br>fewer to 0<br>more) | LOW      | CRITICAL |

| curre   | nce at 2 years       | S                         |                             |                            |                              |      |                  |                  |                              |   |     |          |
|---------|----------------------|---------------------------|-----------------------------|----------------------------|------------------------------|------|------------------|------------------|------------------------------|---|-----|----------|
|         | randomised<br>trials | no serious<br>limitations | no serious<br>inconsistency | no serious<br>indirectness | very<br>serious <sup>2</sup> | none | 4/17<br>(23.5%)  | 3/12<br>(25%)    | RR 0.94<br>(0.26 to          | 15 fewer per<br>1000 (from<br>185 fewer to<br>615 more) | LOW | CRITICAL |
|         |                      |                           |                             |                            |                              |      |                  | 0%               | 3.46)                        | 0 fewer per<br>1000 (from 0<br>fewer to 0<br>more)      |     |          |
| ot achi | eving remissi        | ion (BDI <=10             | 0)                          |                            |                              |      |                  |                  |                              |   |     |          |
|         | randomised<br>trials | no serious<br>limitations | no serious<br>inconsistency | no serious<br>indirectness | very<br>serious <sup>2</sup> | none | 33/45<br>(73.3%) | 24/43<br>(55.8%) | RR 1.31<br>(0.96 to          | 173 more per<br>1000 (from 22<br>fewer to 452<br>more)  | LOW | CRITICAL |
|         |                      |                           |                             |                            |                              |      |                  | 0%               | 1.611                        | 0 more per<br>1000 (from 0<br>fewer to 0<br>more)       |     |          |
| ot achi | eving remissi        | on (HRSD <=               | 7)                          |                            |                              |      |                  |                  |                              |   |     |          |
|         | randomised<br>trials | no serious<br>limitations | no serious<br>inconsistency | no serious<br>indirectness | very<br>serious <sup>2</sup> | none | 35/45<br>(77.8%) | 28/43<br>(65.1%) | RR 1.19<br>(0.91 to<br>1.56) | 124 more per<br>1000 (from 59<br>fewer to 365<br>more)  | LOW | CRITICAL |
|         |                      |                           |                             |                            |                              |      |                  | 0%               |                              | 0 more per<br>1000 (from 0<br>fewer to 0<br>more)       |     |          |

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1</sup> Inconclusive effect size <sup>2</sup> Single study, inconclusive effect size

#### Is CBT effective compared with IPT?

|                |                      |                           | Quality asses   | ssment                     |                           |                      |                   | S                 | ummary o                     | f findings  |          |            |
|----------------|----------------------|---------------------------|-----------------|----------------------------|---------------------------|----------------------|-------------------|-------------------|------------------------------|---|----------|------------|
|                |                      |                           |                 |                            |                           |                      | No. of p          | atients           | E                            | ffect   |          | Importance |
| No. of studies | Design               | Limitations               | Inconsistency   | Indirectness               | Imprecision               | Other considerations | СВТ               | IPT               | Relative<br>(95% CI)         | Absolute  | Quality  |            |
| Leaving        | study early          | •                         |                 |                            |                           |                      |                   |                   |                              |   |          |            |
| 3              | randomised<br>trials |                           |                 | no serious<br>indirectness | serious <sup>1</sup>      | none                 | 50/202<br>(24.8%) | 40/203<br>(19.7%) | RR 1.29<br>(0.91 to<br>1.85) | 57 more per<br>1000 (from<br>18 fewer to<br>167 more) | MODERATE | CRITICAL   |
|                |                      |                           |                 |                            |                           |                      |                   | 0%                | 1.63)                        | 0 more per<br>1000 (from 0<br>fewer to 0<br>more)     |          |            |
| Depress        | ion scores: co       | ontinuous me              | asures post-tre | atment (self-r             | eport) (Better            | indicated by lov     | ver value         | s)                |                              |   |          |            |
| 3              | randomised<br>trials |                           |                 |                            | no serious<br>imprecision | none                 | 184               | 199               | -                            | SMD 0.21<br>higher (0.01<br>to 0.41<br>higher)        | HIGH     | CRITICAL   |
| Depress        | ion scores: co       | ontinuous me              | asures post-tre | atment (clinic             | ian-report) (B            | etter indicated b    | y lower v         | values)           |                              |   |          |            |
| 4              | randomised<br>trials | no serious<br>limitations |                 | no serious<br>indirectness | serious <sup>1</sup>      | none                 | 207               | 223               | -                            | SMD 0.13<br>higher (0.06<br>lower to 0.32<br>higher)  | LOW      | CRITICAL   |

| scores: condomised | no serious<br>limitations | no serious inconsistency  easures at 5 to 0  no serious inconsistency  outcomes (BDI> | no serious<br>indirectness | very serious <sup>3</sup> v-up (clinician)  very serious <sup>3</sup> | -report) (Better | 26<br>indicated  | 44 by lower                                  | · values)  | SMD 0.13<br>higher (0.36<br>lower to 0.61<br>higher)                                | LOW   | CRITICAL  |
|--------------------|---------------------------|---|----------------------------|---|------------------|------------------|--|--|---|---|---|
| ndomised<br>als    | no serious<br>limitations | no serious<br>inconsistency   | no serious<br>indirectness |   |                  |                  |  | values)  |   |   |   |
| als                | limitations               | inconsistency   | indirectness               | very serious <sup>3</sup>   | none             | 23               | 35   |  |   |   |   |
| scores: di         | ichotomous                | outcomes (BDI>  | •                          |   |                  |                  | . JJ   | -  | lower to 0.84<br>higher)  | LOW   | CRITICAL  |
|                    |                           |   | 9) post-treatm             | nent  |                  |                  |  |  |   |   |   |
| ndomised<br>als    | no serious<br>limitations | no serious<br>inconsistency   | no serious<br>indirectness | very serious <sup>3</sup>   | none             | 0/0 (0%)         | 0%   | RR 0 (0 to<br>0)                                     | 0 fewer per<br>1000 (from 0<br>fewer to 0<br>fewer)                                 | LOW   | CRITICAL  |
| scores: D          | ichotomous                | outcomes (HRS   | D>6) post trea             | tment   |                  |                  |  |  | Ì   |   |   |
| ndomised<br>als    | no serious<br>limitations | no serious<br>inconsistency   | no serious<br>indirectness | very serious <sup>3</sup>   | none             | 38/59<br>(64.4%) | 35/61<br>(57.4%)                             | RR 1.12<br>(0.84 to<br>1.5)                          | 69 more per<br>1000 (from<br>92 fewer to<br>287 more)<br>0 more per<br>1000 (from 0 | LOW   | CRITICAL  |
|                    | mised                     |   |                            |   |                  |                  | limitations inconsistency indirectness 38/59 | limitations inconsistency indirectness 35/61 (57.4%) | limitations inconsistency indirectness   35/61 (57.4%)   RR 1.12 (0.84 to 1.5)      | limitations inconsistency indirectness   35/61   1000 (from 92 fewer to 287 more)   38/59   (64.4%)   1.5)   0 more per 1000 (from 0) | limitations inconsistency indirectness   38/59 (64.4%)   38/59 (64.4%)   38/59 (64.4%)   38/59 (64.4%)   38/59 (0.84 to 287 more)   1000 (from 0 fewer to 0 |

#### Is CBT effective compared with rational emotive behaviour therapy (REBT)?

|                |                      |                | Quality assess   | sment                      |                              |                      |                 | S              | ummary of                   | findings  |         |            |
|----------------|----------------------|----------------|------------------|----------------------------|------------------------------|----------------------|-----------------|----------------|-----------------------------|---|---------|------------|
|                |                      |                | <b>4,</b>        |                            |                              |                      | No. of p        | atients        |                             | Effect  |         | Importance |
| No. of studies | Design               | Limitations    | Inconsistency    | Indirectness               | Imprecision                  | Other considerations | СВТ             | REBT           | Relative<br>(95% CI)        | Absolute  | Quality |            |
| Leaving        | study early          | '              |                  |                            | •                            |                      | 1               | •              |                             |   | 1       |            |
| 1              | randomised<br>trials |                |                  | no serious<br>indirectness | very<br>serious <sup>1</sup> | none                 | 6/56<br>(10.7%) | 5/57<br>(8.8%) | RR 1.22<br>(0.4 to<br>3.77) | 19 more per<br>1000 (from 53<br>fewer to 243<br>more) | LOW     | CRITICAL   |
|                |                      |                |                  |                            |                              |                      |                 | 0%             | 3.7.7                       | 0 more per<br>1000 (from 0<br>fewer to 0<br>more)     |         |            |
| Relapse        | at 6-month fo        | ollow-up (no c | ontinuation trea | atment)                    |                              |                      |                 |                |                             |   |         |            |
| 1              | randomised<br>trials |                |                  | no serious<br>indirectness | very<br>serious <sup>1</sup> | none                 | 3/49<br>(6.1%)  | 1/48<br>(2.1%) | RR 2.94<br>(0.32 to         | 40 more per<br>1000 (from 14<br>fewer to 547<br>more) | LOW     | CRITICAL   |
|                |                      |                |                  |                            |                              |                      |                 | 0%             | 27.27)                      | 0 more per<br>1000 (from 0<br>fewer to 0<br>more)     |         |            |

 <sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1</sup> Inconclusive effect size
 <sup>2</sup> Heterogeneity >50%
 <sup>3</sup> Single study, inconclusive effect size

| epress | sion scores: co      | ntinuous me               | asures post-trea            | tment (self-rep            | oort) (Better                | indicated by lowe   | er values) |          |         |  |     |          |
|--------|----------------------|---------------------------|-----------------------------|----------------------------|------------------------------|---------------------|------------|----------|---------|--|-----|----------|
|        | randomised<br>trials | no serious<br>limitations | no serious<br>inconsistency | no serious<br>indirectness | very<br>serious <sup>1</sup> | none                | 56         | 57       | -       | SMD 0.00<br>higher (0.37<br>lower to 0.37<br>higher) | LOW | CRITICAL |
| epress | sion scores: co      | ntinuous me               | asures post-trea            | tment (clinicia            | n-report) (Be                | etter indicated by  | lower va   | lues)    | '       | '  |     |          |
|        | randomised<br>trials | no serious<br>limitations | no serious<br>inconsistency | no serious<br>indirectness | very<br>serious <sup>1</sup> | none                | 56         | 57       | -       | SMD 0.03 lower<br>(0.4 lower to<br>0.34 higher)      | LOW | CRITICAL |
| epress | sion scores: co      | ntinuous me               | asures at 5 to 6-ı          | month follow-              | up (self-repo                | rt) (Better indicat | ted by lov | ver valu | ies)    | '  |     |          |
|        | randomised<br>trials | no serious<br>limitations | no serious<br>inconsistency | no serious<br>indirectness | very<br>serious <sup>1</sup> | none                | 56         | 57       | -       | SMD 0.06<br>higher (0.31<br>lower to 0.43<br>higher) | LOW | CRITICAL |
| epress | sion scores: co      | ntinuous me               | asures at 5 to 6-ı          | month follow-              | up (clinician-               | report) (Better in  | dicated b  | y lower  | values) | '  |     |          |
|        | randomised<br>trials | no serious<br>limitations | no serious                  | no serious indirectness    | very<br>serious <sup>1</sup> | none                | 56         | 57       |         | SMD 0.03<br>higher (0.34                             |     |          |

Single study, inconclusive effect size

## Is CBT effective compared with integrative CBT?

|                |                      |                           | Quality assess   | sment           |                              |                      |                 | Sum                | mary of fin          | dings   |         |            |
|----------------|----------------------|---------------------------|------------------|-----------------|------------------------------|----------------------|-----------------|--------------------|----------------------|---|---------|------------|
|                |                      |                           | <b>4</b> ,       |                 |                              |                      | No. of          | fpatients          | E                    | ffect   |         | Importance |
| No. of studies | Design               | Limitations               | Inconsistency    | Indirectness    | Imprecision                  | Other considerations | СВТ             | Integrative<br>CBT | Relative<br>(95% CI) | Absolute  | Quality |            |
| Leaving        | study early          | •                         | •                | -               |                              |                      |                 |                    | •                    | -   | •       | '          |
| 1              | randomised<br>trials | no serious<br>limitations |                  |                 | very<br>serious <sup>1</sup> | none                 | 3/11<br>(27.3%) | 0/11 (0%)          | RR 7.00<br>(0.4 to   | 0 more per<br>1000 (from 0<br>fewer to 0<br>more)   | LOW     | CRITICAL   |
|                |                      |                           |                  |                 |                              |                      |                 | 0%                 | 121.39)              | 0 more per<br>1000 (from 0<br>fewer to 0<br>more)   |         |            |
| Depress        | ion scores: co       | ontinuous me              | asures post-trea | itment (self-re | port) (Better                | indicated by lov     | ver value       | es)                |                      |   |         |            |
|                |                      | no serious<br>limitations |                  |                 | very<br>serious <sup>1</sup> | none                 | 11              | 11                 | -                    | SMD 0.30<br>lower (1.14<br>lower to 0.54<br>higher) | LOW     | CRITICAL   |

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1</sup> Single study, inconclusive effect size

## Is group CBT effective compared with other group therapies?

|                |                      |                           | Quality asses               | ssment                     |                      |                      |                  | Su                    | mmary of             | findings  |          |            |
|----------------|----------------------|---------------------------|-----------------------------|----------------------------|----------------------|----------------------|------------------|-----------------------|----------------------|---|----------|------------|
|                |                      |                           | Quality associ              | ,                          |                      |                      | No. of           | patients              | E                    | ffect   |          | Importance |
| No. of studies | Design               | Limitations               | Inconsistency               | Indirectness               | Imprecision          | Other considerations | Group<br>CBT     | Other group therapies | Relative<br>(95% CI) | Absolute  | Quality  |            |
| Leaving        | study early          | I                         |                             |                            | l                    | l                    |                  |                       |                      |   | l        |            |
| 3              | randomised<br>trials | no serious<br>limitations | no serious<br>inconsistency | no serious<br>indirectness | serious <sup>1</sup> | none                 | 22/83<br>(26.5%) | 22/75<br>(29.3%)      | RR 0.94<br>(0.57 to  | 18 fewer per<br>1000 (from<br>126 fewer to<br>155 more) | MODERATE | CRITICAL   |
| D              |                      | A:                        |                             |                            | (D-44)               |                      |                  | 0%                    | 1.53)                | 0 fewer per<br>1000 (from 0<br>fewer to 0<br>more)      |          |            |
| Depress        | ion scores: co       | ontinuous me              | easures post-tro            | eatment (seif-             | report) (Bette       | er indicated by lo   | wer valu         | ies)                  |                      |   |          |            |
| 2              | randomised<br>trials |                           | no serious<br>inconsistency | no serious<br>indirectness | serious <sup>1</sup> | none                 | 39               | 44                    | -                    | SMD 0.17<br>lower (0.61<br>lower to<br>0.26 higher)     | MODERATE | CRITICAL   |
| Depress        | ion scores: co       | ontinuous me              | easures post-tro            | eatment (clini             | cian-report) (       | Better indicated     | by lower         | values)               |                      |   |          |            |
| 2              | randomised<br>trials | no serious<br>limitations | no serious<br>inconsistency | no serious<br>indirectness | serious <sup>1</sup> | none                 | 39               | 44                    | -                    | SMD 0.12<br>lower (0.55<br>lower to                     | MODERATE | CRITICAL   |

|       |                      |  |                             |                            |                           |                          |                  |                  |                              | 0.31 higher)  |      |        |
|-------|----------------------|--|-----------------------------|----------------------------|---------------------------|--------------------------|------------------|------------------|------------------------------|---|------|--------|
| res   | sion scores: d       | ichotomous                               | outcomes (BDI               | 9) post-treatr             | ment (self-rep            | ort)                     | 1                |                  |                              | '   |      | ı      |
|       | randomised<br>trials | no serious<br>limitations                | no serious<br>inconsistency | no serious<br>indirectness | no serious<br>imprecision | none                     | 30/59<br>(50.8%) | 43/52<br>(82.7%) | RR 0.60<br>(0.46 to<br>0.79) | 331 fewer<br>per 1000<br>(from 174<br>fewer to 447<br>fewer)                        | HIGH | CRITIC |
|       |                      |  |                             |                            |                           |                          |                  | 0%               |                              | 0 fewer per<br>1000 (from 0<br>fewer to 0<br>fewer)                                 |      |        |
|       |                      |  | outcomes (USD               | D>11) nost-tra             | atment (clinic            | cian-report)             |                  |                  |                              |   |      |        |
| pres  | sion scores: d       | icnotomous                               | outcomes (nsk               | D>11) post-tre             | atiment (cilin            | ciair report,            |                  |                  |                              |   |      |        |
| epres | randomised<br>trials |  | no serious<br>inconsistency | no serious<br>indirectness | very serious <sup>2</sup> |                          | 11/27            | 9/28 (32.1%)     | RR 1.27<br>(0.63 to          | 87 more per<br>1000 (from<br>119 fewer to<br>501 more)                              | LOW  | CRITIC |
| epres | randomised           | no serious                               | no serious                  | no serious                 |                           |                          | 11/27<br>(40.7%) |                  |                              | 1000 (from<br>119 fewer to  | LOW  | CRITIC |
|       | randomised<br>trials | no serious<br>limitations                | no serious<br>inconsistency | no serious<br>indirectness | very serious <sup>2</sup> |                          | (40.7%)          | 0%               | (0.63 to                     | 1000 (from<br>119 fewer to<br>501 more)<br>0 more per<br>1000 (from 0<br>fewer to 0 | LOW  | CRITIC |
|       | randomised trials    | no serious<br>limitations<br>ontinuous m | no serious<br>inconsistency | no serious<br>indirectness | very serious <sup>2</sup> | none<br>(Better indicate | (40.7%)          | 0%               | (0.63 to                     | 1000 (from<br>119 fewer to<br>501 more)<br>0 more per<br>1000 (from 0<br>fewer to 0 | LOW  | CRITIO |

# Is group CBT – mindfulness + GP care effective compared with GP care?

|                |                      |                           | Quality asses | ssment       |                           |                      | Summ                                   | ary of find       | ings                            |  |         |            |
|----------------|----------------------|---------------------------|---------------|--------------|---------------------------|----------------------|--|-------------------|---------------------------------|--|---------|------------|
|                |                      |                           |               |              |                           |                      | No. of pati                            | ents              | E                               | ffect  |         | Importance |
| No. of studies | Design               | Limitations               | Inconsistency | Indirectness | Imprecision               | Other considerations | Group CBT-<br>mindfulness +<br>GP care | GP care           | Relative<br>(95% CI)            | Absolute   | Quality |            |
| Leaving        | study early          | I                         | I             | I            | I                         | '                    |  |                   |                                 |  | '       |            |
|                | randomised<br>trials | no serious<br>limitations |               |              | no serious<br>imprecision | none                 | 19/113<br>(16.8%)                      | 0/107<br>(0%)     | RR 19.11<br>(2.58 to<br>141.35) | 0 more per<br>1000 (from 0<br>more to 0<br>more)<br>0 more per<br>1000 (from 0<br>more to 0<br>more) | HIGH    | CRITICAL   |
| Relapse        |                      |                           |               |              |                           |                      |  |                   |                                 | ·  |         |            |
|                | randomised<br>trials |                           |               |              | no serious<br>imprecision | none                 | 51/113<br>(45.1%)                      | 65/107<br>(60.7%) | RR 0.74<br>(0.57 to             | 158 fewer<br>per 1000<br>(from 24  | HIGH    | CRITICAL   |

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1</sup> Inconclusive effect size <sup>2</sup> Single study, inconclusive effect size

| O fower per                | fewer to 261<br>fewer)                    | 0.96) |  |  |  |  |
|----------------------------|---|-------|--|--|--|--|
| 0% 1000 (from 0 fewer to 0 | 0 fewer per<br>1000 (from 0<br>fewer to 0 |       |  |  |  |  |

## Is group CBT – mindfulness effective compared with waitlist control?

|                |   |              | Quality assess  | sment                      |                              | Summary of findings       |               |                         |          |   |     |          |
|----------------|---|--------------|-----------------|----------------------------|------------------------------|---------------------------|---------------|-------------------------|----------|---|-----|----------|
|                |   |              | . ,             |                            | No. of patients              |                           |               | Effect                  |          | Importance  |     |          |
| No. of studies | Design   Limitations   Inconsistency   Indirectness   Imprecision |              |                 |                            | Other considerations         | Group CBT-<br>mindfulness | Waitlist      | Relative<br>(95%<br>CI) | Absolute | Quality   | •   |          |
| Depress        | ion scores: co  | ontinuous me | asures at 1-mor | nth follow-up (            | self-report)                 | Better indicated          | by lower valu | es)                     |          |   | ı   |          |
| 1              | randomised<br>trials  |              |                 | no serious<br>indirectness | very<br>serious <sup>1</sup> | none                      | 19            | 23                      | -        | SMD 0.36<br>lower (0.98<br>lower to 0.25<br>higher) | LOW | CRITICAL |

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1</sup> No explanation was provided

## Is group CBT - mindfulness effective compared with antidepressants in relapse prevention?

|                |                      |                           |               | Sum                        | mary of fi                   | ndings               |  |                |                      |   |         |            |
|----------------|----------------------|---------------------------|---------------|----------------------------|------------------------------|----------------------|--|----------------|----------------------|---|---------|------------|
|                |                      |                           | Quality asses |                            |                              |                      | No. of patie   | ents           | E                    | ffect   |         |            |
| No. of studies | Design               | Limitations               | Inconsistency | Indirectness               | Imprecision                  | Other considerations | Relapse<br>prevention:<br>Group CBT -<br>mindfulness | AD             | Relative<br>(95% CI) | Absolute  | Quality | Importance |
| Leaving        | study early          |                           | ı             | ı                          | ı                            | !                    |  | 1              | 1                    | '   |         |            |
|                | randomised<br>trials | no serious<br>limitations |               | no serious<br>indirectness | very<br>serious <sup>1</sup> | none                 | 2/61 (3.3%)  | 6/62<br>(9.7%) | (0.07 to<br>1.61)    | 64 fewer per 1000 (from 90 fewer to 59 more)  0 fewer per 1000 (from 0 fewer to 0 more) | LOW     | CRITICAL   |
| Depress        | sion scores: co      | ontinuous m               | easures 1-mon | th post-treatn             | nent (clinicia               | n-report) (Bette     | r indicated by lo                                    | ower va        | lues)                |   |         |            |
|                | randomised<br>trials |                           |               | no serious<br>indirectness | very<br>serious <sup>1</sup> | none                 | 61   | 62             | -                    | SMD 0.31<br>lower (0.66<br>lower to<br>0.05 higher)                                     | LOW     | CRITICAL   |
| Depress        | sion scores: co      | ontinuous m               | easures 1-mon | th post-treatn             | nent (self-re                | port) (Better ind    | icated by lower                                      | values         |                      |   |         |            |
| 1              | randomised           | no serious                | no serious    | no serious                 | serious <sup>2</sup>         | none                 | 61   | 62             | -                    | SMD 0.37<br>lower (0.72   |         | CRITICAL   |

|        | trials               | limitations               | inconsistency               | indirectness               |                              |                   |                 |         | to 0.01<br>lower)                                 | MODERATE |          |
|--------|----------------------|---------------------------|-----------------------------|----------------------------|------------------------------|-------------------|-----------------|---------|---|----------|----------|
| Depres | sion scores: c       | ontinuous m               | leasures 15-mo              | nth follow-up              | (clinician-re                | port) (Better ind | icated by lower | values) |   |          |          |
| L      | randomised<br>trials | no serious<br>limitations | no serious<br>inconsistency | no serious<br>indirectness | very<br>serious <sup>1</sup> | none              | 61              | 62      | SMD 0.2<br>lower (0.5<br>lower to<br>0.12 highe   | LOW      | CRITICAL |
| epres  | sion scores: c       | ontinuous m               | easures 15-mo               | nth follow-up              | (self-report)                | (Better indicate  | d by lower valu | es)     |   |          |          |
|        | randomised<br>trials | no serious<br>limitations | no serious<br>inconsistency | no serious<br>indirectness | very<br>serious <sup>1</sup> | none              | 61              | 62      | SMD 0.3-<br>lower (0.6-<br>lower to<br>0.02 highe | LOW      | CRITICAL |

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1</sup> Single study, inconclusive effect size <sup>2</sup> Single study

## **Behavioural activation**

Is behavioural activation (BA) effective compared with supportive psychotherapy?

|                |                      |                           | Quality asses               | sment                      |                              |                      |              | Sum                      | nmary of fi                  | ndings   |          |            |
|----------------|----------------------|---------------------------|-----------------------------|----------------------------|------------------------------|----------------------|--------------|--------------------------|------------------------------|--|----------|------------|
|                |                      |                           | Quality asses               |                            |                              |                      | N            | o. of patients           | E                            | ffect  |          | Importance |
| No. of studies | Design               | Limitations               | Inconsistency               | Indirectness               | Imprecision                  | Other considerations | ва           | Supportive psychotherapy | Relative<br>(95% CI)         | I Ahsoluta   | Quality  |            |
| Leaving        | study early          |                           |                             |                            |                              |                      |              |                          |                              |  |          | '          |
| 1              | randomised<br>trials | no serious<br>limitations | no serious<br>inconsistency | no serious<br>indirectness | serious <sup>1</sup>         | none                 | 2/40<br>(5%) |                          | RR 0.17<br>(0.04 to<br>0.71) | 247 fewer<br>per 1000<br>(from 86<br>fewer to<br>285 fewer)<br>0 fewer per<br>1000 (from<br>0 fewer to 0<br>fewer) | MODERATE | CRITICAL   |
| Depress        | sion self-repo       | rted measur               | es at endpoint (            | (Better indicat            | ted by lower                 | values)              |              |                          |                              |  |          |            |
| 1              | randomised<br>trials | no serious<br>limitations |                             | no serious<br>indirectness | very<br>serious <sup>2</sup> | none                 | 10           | 15                       | -                            | SMD 0.69<br>lower (1.52<br>lower to<br>0.14 higher)  | LOW      | CRITICAL   |

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1</sup> Single study
<sup>2</sup> Single study, inconclusive effect size

## Is behavioural activation effective compared with antidepressants?

|                |                      |                           | Quality asses     | sment                      |                              |                      |                | S               | Summary o                    | of findings  |          |            |
|----------------|----------------------|---------------------------|-------------------|----------------------------|------------------------------|----------------------|----------------|-----------------|------------------------------|--|----------|------------|
|                |                      |                           | ,                 |                            |                              |                      | No. of p       | atients         | I                            | Effect   |          | Importance |
| No. of studies | Design               | Limitations               | Inconsistency     | Indirectness               | Imprecision                  | Other considerations | ВА             | AD              | Relative<br>(95% CI)         | Absolute   | Quality  |            |
| Leaving        | study early          |                           |                   |                            |                              |                      |                |                 |                              |  |          |            |
| 1              | randomised<br>trials | no serious<br>limitations |                   | no serious<br>indirectness | serious <sup>1</sup>         | none                 | 4/43<br>(9.3%) | 30/100<br>(30%) | RR 0.31<br>(0.12 to<br>0.83) | 207 fewer per<br>1000 (from 51<br>fewer to 264<br>fewer) | MODERATE | CRITICAL   |
|                |                      |                           |                   |                            |                              |                      |                | 0%              | 0.83)                        | 0 fewer per<br>1000 (from 0<br>fewer to 0<br>fewer)      |          |            |
| Depress        | ion self-repo        | rted measure              | s (moderate sev   | verity) at endp            | oint (Better                 | indicated by low     | er values      | 5)              |                              |  |          |            |
| 1              | randomised<br>trials | no serious<br>limitations |                   |                            | very<br>serious <sup>2</sup> | none                 | 15             | 28              | -                            | SMD 0.15<br>higher (0.47<br>lower to 0.78<br>higher)     | LOW      | CRITICAL   |
| Depress        | ion self-repo        | rted measure              | s (high severity) | at endpoint (              | Better indica                | ted by lower val     | ues)           |                 |                              |  |          |            |
| 1              | randomised<br>trials | no serious<br>limitations |                   |                            | very<br>serious <sup>2</sup> | none                 | 22             | 38              | -                            | SMD 0.24<br>higher (0.29<br>lower to 0.76<br>higher)     | LOW      | CRITICAL   |

| Depress | sion clinician-      | reported me               | asures (modera              | te severity) at            | endpoint (Bo                 | etter indicated by | y lower v       | alues)          |                              |  |     |          |
|---------|----------------------|---------------------------|-----------------------------|----------------------------|------------------------------|--------------------|-----------------|-----------------|------------------------------|--|-----|----------|
| 1       | randomised<br>trials | no serious<br>limitations | no serious<br>inconsistency | no serious<br>indirectness | very<br>serious <sup>2</sup> | none               | 15              | 28              | -                            | SMD 0.14<br>higher (0.49<br>lower to 0.77<br>higher)     | LOW | CRITICAL |
| Depress | sion clinician-      | reported me               | asures (high sev            | erity) at endpo            | oint (Better i               | ndicated by lowe   | er values)      |                 |                              |  |     |          |
| 1       | randomised<br>trials | no serious<br>limitations | no serious<br>inconsistency | no serious<br>indirectness | very<br>serious <sup>2</sup> | none               | 22              | 38              | -                            | SMD 0.04<br>lower (0.56<br>lower to 0.49<br>higher)      | LOW | CRITICAL |
| Relapse | at 1-year foll       | ow-up                     | '                           |                            | 1                            |                    | ı               | 1               |                              |  |     |          |
| 1       | randomised<br>trials | no serious<br>limitations | no serious<br>inconsistency | no serious<br>indirectness | very<br>serious <sup>2</sup> | none               | 9/27<br>(33.3%) | 9/28<br>(32.1%) | RR 1.04<br>(0.49 to<br>2.21) | 13 more per<br>1000 (from<br>164 fewer to<br>389 more)   | LOW | CRITICAL |
|         |                      |                           |                             |                            |                              |                    |                 | 0%              | 2.211                        | 0 more per<br>1000 (from 0<br>fewer to 0<br>more)        |     |          |
| Recurre | nce at 2 years       | 5                         |                             |                            |                              |                    |                 |                 |                              |  |     |          |
| 1       | randomised<br>trials | no serious<br>limitations | no serious<br>inconsistency | no serious<br>indirectness | very<br>serious <sup>2</sup> | none               | 3/12<br>(25%)   | 9/17<br>(52.9%) | RR 0.47<br>(0.16 to<br>1.39) | 281 fewer per<br>1000 (from<br>445 fewer to<br>206 more) | LOW | CRITICAL |
|         |                      |                           |                             |                            |                              |                    |                 | 0%              |                              | 0 fewer per<br>1000 (from 0<br>fewer to 0                |     |          |

|         | 1                    | <del> </del>              | 1                           | †                          |                              | †    |                  |                       |                              | more)   |     |          |
|---------|----------------------|---------------------------|-----------------------------|----------------------------|------------------------------|------|------------------|-----------------------|------------------------------|---|-----|----------|
| Not ach | eving remissi        | ion (BDI <=10             | ))                          |                            |                              |      |                  |                       |                              |   |     |          |
| 1       | randomised<br>trials | no serious<br>limitations | no serious<br>inconsistency | no serious<br>indirectness | very<br>serious <sup>2</sup> | none | 24/43<br>(55.8%) | 72/100<br>(72%)<br>0% | RR 0.78<br>(0.58 to<br>1.04) | 158 fewer per<br>1000 (from<br>302 fewer to<br>29 more)<br>0 fewer per<br>1000 (from 0<br>fewer to 0<br>more) | LOW | CRITICAL |
| Not ach | eving remissi        | ion (HRSD <=              | 7)                          |                            |                              |      |                  |                       |                              |   |     |          |
| 1       | randomised<br>trials | no serious<br>limitations | no serious<br>inconsistency | no serious<br>indirectness | very<br>serious <sup>2</sup> | none | 28/43<br>(65.1%) | 77/100<br>(77%)       | RR 0.85<br>(0.66 to<br>1.08) | 115 fewer per<br>1000 (from<br>262 fewer to<br>62 more)<br>0 fewer per<br>1000 (from 0<br>fewer to 0<br>more) | LOW | CRITICAL |

Single study

<sup>2</sup> Single study, inconclusive effect size

# **Problem solving**

Is problem solving effective compared with placebo?

|                |                      |                           | Quality asses               | sment                      |                              |                      |                 |                |                              |  |          |            |
|----------------|----------------------|---------------------------|-----------------------------|----------------------------|------------------------------|----------------------|-----------------|----------------|------------------------------|--|----------|------------|
|                |                      |                           |                             |                            |                              |                      |                 |                | Effect                       |  |          | Importance |
| No. of studies | Design               | Limitations               | Inconsistency               | Indirectness               | Imprecision                  | Other considerations | Problem solving | Placebo        | Relative<br>(95% CI)         | Absolute   | Quality  |            |
| Leaving        | study early          | -                         | -                           | -                          |                              | •                    |                 |                |                              |  |          |            |
| 1              |                      | no serious<br>limitations | no serious<br>inconsistency | no serious<br>indirectness | serious <sup>1</sup>         | none                 | 2/30<br>(6.7%)  | 18/30<br>(60%) | RR 0.11<br>(0.03 to<br>0.44) | 534 fewer per 1000 (from 336 fewer to 582 fewer)  0 fewer per 1000 (from 0 fewer to 0 fewer) | MODERATE | CRITICAL   |
| Leaving        | study due to         | side effects              |                             |                            |                              |                      |                 |                |                              | ·  |          |            |
| 1              | randomised<br>trials | no serious<br>limitations | no serious<br>inconsistency | no serious<br>indirectness | very<br>serious <sup>2</sup> | none                 | 0/30<br>(0%)    | 2/30<br>(6.7%) | RR 0.20<br>(0.01 to<br>4)    | 53 fewer per<br>1000 (from<br>66 fewer to<br>200 more)                                       | LOW      | CRITICAL   |
|                |                      |                           |                             |                            |                              |                      |                 | 0%             | 4)                           | 0 fewer per<br>1000 (from 0<br>fewer to 0<br>more)   |          |            |

| Depres | sion clinician-      | reported me               | asures at endpo             | oint (Better inc           | dicated by lo        | wer values) |                  |                  |                              |   |          |          |
|--------|----------------------|---------------------------|-----------------------------|----------------------------|----------------------|-------------|------------------|------------------|------------------------------|---|----------|----------|
| L      | randomised<br>trials | no serious<br>limitations | no serious<br>inconsistency | no serious<br>indirectness | serious <sup>1</sup> | none        | 29               | 26               | -                            | SMD 0.66<br>lower (1.21<br>to 0.12<br>lower)  | MODERATE | CRITICAL |
| Depres | sion clinician-      | reported me               | asures HRSD >7              | at endpoint                |                      |             |                  |                  |                              |   |          |          |
| l      | randomised<br>trials | no serious<br>limitations | no serious<br>inconsistency | no serious<br>indirectness | serious <sup>1</sup> | none        | 12/30<br>(40%)   | 22/30<br>(73.3%) | RR 0.55<br>(0.33 to<br>0.89) | 330 fewer per 1000 (from 81 fewer to 491 fewer)  0 fewer per 1000 (from 0 fewer to 0 fewer) | MODERATE | CRITICAL |
| epres  | sion self-repo       | rted measur               | es at endpoint (            | Better indicate            | ed by lower          | values)     |                  |                  |                              |   |          |          |
|        | randomised<br>trials | no serious<br>limitations | no serious<br>inconsistency | no serious<br>indirectness | serious <sup>1</sup> | none        | 29               | 26               | -                            | SMD 0.69<br>lower (1.24<br>to 0.14<br>lower)  | MODERATE | CRITICAL |
| Depres | sion self-repo       | rted measur               | es BDI >8 at end            | point                      | l                    |             |                  |                  |                              |   |          |          |
|        | randomised<br>trials | no serious<br>limitations | no serious<br>inconsistency | no serious<br>indirectness | serious <sup>1</sup> | none        | 13/30<br>(43.3%) | 21/30<br>(70%)   | RR 0.62<br>(0.39 to<br>0.99) | 266 fewer<br>per 1000<br>(from 7<br>fewer to 427<br>fewer)                                  | MODERATE | CRITICAL |

| Diagnos | is of depressi       | on 6 months               | after treatmen              | t          |                              |      |                   | 0%                |                              | 0 fewer per<br>1000 (from 0<br>fewer to 0<br>fewer)        |     |          |
|---------|----------------------|---------------------------|-----------------------------|------------|------------------------------|------|-------------------|-------------------|------------------------------|--|-----|----------|
|         | randomised<br>trials | no serious<br>limitations | no serious<br>inconsistency |            | very<br>serious <sup>2</sup> | none | 70/128<br>(54.7%) | 77/117<br>(65.8%) | RR 0.83<br>(0.68 to<br>1.02) | 112 fewer<br>per 1000<br>(from 211<br>fewer to 13<br>more) | LOW | CRITICAL |
| Diagnos | is of depressi       | on 12 month               | s after treatme             | nt         |                              |      |                   | 0%                |                              | 0 fewer per<br>1000 (from 0<br>fewer to 0<br>more)         |     |          |
| 1       | randomised           | no serious                | no serious                  | no serious | very                         | none |                   |                   |                              | 12 fewer per   |     |          |
|         |                      | limitations               | inconsistency               |            | serious <sup>2</sup>         | попе | 73/128<br>(57%)   | 68/117<br>(58.1%) | RR 0.98<br>(0.79 to          | 12 fewer per<br>1000 (from<br>122 fewer to<br>128 more)    | LOW | CRITICAL |
| 10:     |                      |                           |                             |            |                              |      |                   | 0%                | 1.22)                        | 0 fewer per<br>1000 (from 0<br>fewer to 0<br>more)         |     |          |

Single study
2 Single study, inconclusive effect size

## Is problem solving effective compared with antidepressants?

| Quality assessment |                                    |                           |                 |                            |                           |                      |                   | Summary of findings |                             |   |         |          |  |
|--------------------|------------------------------------|---------------------------|-----------------|----------------------------|---------------------------|----------------------|-------------------|---------------------|-----------------------------|---|---------|----------|--|
|                    |                                    |                           | ,               |                            | No. of patients           |                      | Effect            |                     |                             | Importance  |         |          |  |
| No. of studies     | Design                             | Limitations               | Inconsistency   | Indirectness               | Imprecision               | Other considerations | Problem solving   | AD                  | Relative<br>(95% CI)        | Absolute  | Quality |          |  |
| Leaving            | Leaving study early for any reason |                           |                 |                            |                           |                      |                   |                     |                             |   |         |          |  |
|                    | randomised<br>trials               | no serious<br>limitations |                 | no serious<br>indirectness | serious <sup>2</sup>      | none                 | 25/110<br>(22.7%) | 12/67<br>(17.9%)    | RR 0.88<br>(0.18 to<br>4.2) | 21 fewer per<br>1000 (from<br>147 fewer to<br>573 more) | LOW     | CRITICAL |  |
| Lacrina            | study due to                       | side effects              |                 |                            |                           |                      |                   | 0%                  | 4.2)                        | 0 fewer per<br>1000 (from 0<br>fewer to 0<br>more)      |         |          |  |
|                    | -                                  | 1                         |                 |                            |                           |                      |                   |                     |                             |   |         |          |  |
|                    | randomised<br>trials               | no serious<br>limitations |                 |                            | no serious<br>imprecision | none                 | 0/110<br>(0%)     | 5/67<br>(7.5%)      |                             | 66 fewer per<br>1000 (from 2<br>fewer to 74<br>fewer)   | HIGH    | CRITICAL |  |
|                    |                                    |                           |                 |                            |                           |                      |                   | 0%                  | 0.37)                       | 0 fewer per<br>1000 (from 0<br>fewer to 0<br>fewer)     |         |          |  |
| Depress            | ion clinician-                     | reported me               | asures at endpo | oint (Better inc           | licated by low            | ver values)          |                   |                     |                             |   |         |          |  |
| 2                  | randomised                         | no serious                | no serious      | no serious                 | serious <sup>2</sup>      | none                 | 63                | 61                  | -                           | SMD 0.10  |         | CRITICAL |  |

| Donrass | trials               | limitations               | inconsistency asures HRSD >7 | indirectness               |                           |                                 |                  |                  |                              | higher (0.25<br>lower to 0.45<br>higher)  | MODERATE |          |
|---------|----------------------|---------------------------|------------------------------|----------------------------|---------------------------|---------------------------------|------------------|------------------|------------------------------|---|----------|----------|
| 1       | randomised<br>trials | no serious<br>limitations | no serious                   | no serious<br>indirectness | very serious <sup>3</sup> | none                            | 38/80<br>(47.5%) | 12/36<br>(33.3%) | RR 1.43<br>(0.85 to<br>2.39) | 143 more per 1000 (from 50 fewer to 463 more)  0 more per 1000 (from 0 fewer to 0 more)                       | LOW      | CRITICAL |
| 1       | randomised<br>trials |                           | no serious<br>inconsistency  | no serious<br>indirectness | very serious <sup>3</sup> | none                            | 33/80<br>(41.3%) | 16/36<br>(44.4%) | RR 0.93<br>(0.59 to<br>1.45) | 31 fewer per<br>1000 (from<br>182 fewer to<br>200 more)<br>0 fewer per<br>1000 (from 0<br>fewer to 0<br>more) | LOW      | CRITICAL |
| Depress | randomised           | no serious                | no serious                   |                            | very serious <sup>3</sup> | d <b>by lower value</b><br>none | 25               | 30               | -                            | SMD 0.21<br>lower (0.74<br>lower to 0.32<br>higher)   | LOW      | CRITICAL |

| Depres | sion self-repo       | rted measur               | es at endpoint (            | Better indicato            | ed by lower va            | alues)        |                  |                  |                              |  |          |          |
|--------|----------------------|---------------------------|-----------------------------|----------------------------|---------------------------|---------------|------------------|------------------|------------------------------|--|----------|----------|
| 2      | randomised<br>trials | no serious<br>limitations | no serious<br>inconsistency | no serious<br>indirectness | serious <sup>3</sup>      | none          | 63               | 61               | -                            | SMD 0.11<br>lower (0.46<br>lower to 0.25<br>higher)  | MODERATE | CRITICAL |
| Depres | sion self-repo       | rted measur               | es BDI >8 at end            | point                      | '                         | '             | '                |                  |                              |  |          |          |
| 1      | randomised<br>trials | no serious<br>limitations | no serious<br>inconsistency | no serious<br>indirectness | very serious <sup>3</sup> | none          | 13/30<br>(43.3%) | 20/31<br>(64.5%) | RR 0.67<br>(0.41 to<br>1.09) | 213 fewer<br>per 1000<br>(from 381<br>fewer to 58<br>more)<br>O fewer per<br>1000 (from 0<br>fewer to 0<br>more) | LOW      | CRITICAL |
| Depres | sion self-repo       | rted measur               | es at 1-year foll           | ow-up (Better              | indicated by              | lower values) |                  |                  |                              |  |          |          |
| 1      | randomised<br>trials | no serious<br>limitations | no serious<br>inconsistency | no serious<br>indirectness | very serious <sup>3</sup> | none          | 25               | 30               | -                            | SMD 0.14<br>lower (0.67<br>lower to 0.39<br>higher)  | LOW      | CRITICAL |

Heterogeneity >50%

Inconclusive effect size

Single study, inconclusive effect size

# Is problem solving + antidepressants effective compared with antidepressants?

|                |                      |                           | Quality asses               | sment                      |                              |                      |                            | Sun             | nmary of fi          | ndings  |         |            |
|----------------|----------------------|---------------------------|-----------------------------|----------------------------|------------------------------|----------------------|----------------------------|-----------------|----------------------|---|---------|------------|
|                |                      |                           | Quality asses               | Silient                    |                              |                      | No. of pa                  | atients         |                      | Effect  | Ì       | Importance |
| No. of studies | Design               | Limitations               | Inconsistency               | Indirectness               | Imprecision                  | Other considerations | Problem<br>solving +<br>AD | AD              | Relative<br>(95% CI) | Absolute  | Quality | importance |
| Leaving s      | study early fo       | or any reason             | 1                           | ı                          | 1                            |                      | •                          | 1               |                      |   | ı       |            |
|                | randomised<br>trials | no serious<br>limitations | no serious<br>inconsistency | no serious<br>indirectness | very<br>serious <sup>1</sup> | none                 | 6/35<br>(17.1%)            | 6/36<br>(16.7%) | RR 1.03<br>(0.37 to  | 5 more per<br>1000 (from<br>105 fewer to<br>315 more) | LOW     | CRITICAL   |
|                |                      |                           |                             |                            |                              |                      |                            | 0%              | 2.89)                | 0 more per<br>1000 (from 0<br>fewer to 0<br>more)     |         |            |
| Leaving        | study due to         | side effects              |                             |                            |                              |                      |                            |                 |                      |   |         |            |
|                | randomised<br>trials | no serious<br>limitations | no serious<br>inconsistency | no serious<br>indirectness | very<br>serious <sup>1</sup> | none                 | 4/35<br>(11.4%)            | 2/36<br>(5.6%)  | RR 2.06<br>(0.4 to   | 59 more per<br>1000 (from 33<br>fewer to 529<br>more) | LOW     | CRITICAL   |
|                |                      |                           |                             |                            |                              |                      |                            | 0%              | 10.52)               | 0 more per<br>1000 (from 0<br>fewer to 0<br>more)     |         |            |

| Depres | ssion clinician-     | reported mea              | asures at endpo             | int (Better indi           | cated by lov                 | ver values)       |                  |                  |                              |  |     |          |
|--------|----------------------|---------------------------|-----------------------------|----------------------------|------------------------------|-------------------|------------------|------------------|------------------------------|--|-----|----------|
| 1      | randomised<br>trials | no serious<br>limitations | no serious<br>inconsistency | no serious<br>indirectness | very<br>serious <sup>1</sup> | none              | 31               | 34               | -                            | SMD 0.18<br>higher (0.3<br>lower to 0.67<br>higher)      | LOW | CRITICAL |
| Depres | ssion clinician-     | reported mea              | asures at 1-year            | follow-up (Bet             | ter indicate                 | d by lower values | 5)               | _                |                              | '  |     |          |
| 1      | randomised<br>trials | no serious<br>limitations | no serious<br>inconsistency | no serious<br>indirectness | very<br>serious <sup>1</sup> | none              | 30               | 30               | -                            | SMD 0.25<br>lower (0.76<br>lower to 0.26<br>higher)      | LOW | CRITICAL |
| Depres | ssion clinician-     | reported mea              | asures HRSD >7              | at endpoint                |                              |                   |                  |                  |                              |  |     |          |
| 1      | randomised<br>trials | no serious<br>limitations | no serious<br>inconsistency | no serious<br>indirectness | very<br>serious <sup>1</sup> | none              | 14/35<br>(40%)   | 12/36<br>(33.3%) | (0.65 to                     | to 407 more)   | LOW | CRITICAL |
|        |                      |                           |                             |                            |                              |                   |                  | 0%               | 2.22)                        | 0 more per<br>1000 (from 0<br>fewer to 0<br>more)        |     |          |
| Depres | ssion clinician-     | reported mea              | asures HRSD >7              | at 1-year follo            | w-up                         |                   |                  |                  |                              |  |     |          |
| 1      | randomised<br>trials | no serious<br>limitations | no serious<br>inconsistency | no serious<br>indirectness | very<br>serious <sup>1</sup> | none              | 12/35<br>(34.3%) | 16/36<br>(44.4%) | RR 0.77<br>(0.43 to<br>1.39) | 102 fewer per<br>1000 (from<br>253 fewer to<br>173 more) | LOW | CRITICAL |
|        |                      |                           |                             |                            |                              |                   |                  | 0%               |                              | 0 fewer per<br>1000 (from 0                              |     |          |

|         |                      |              |                   |                            |                              |              |    |    |   | fewer to 0<br>more)                                 |     |          |
|---------|----------------------|--------------|-------------------|----------------------------|------------------------------|--------------|----|----|---|---|-----|----------|
| Depress | ion self-repo        | rted measure | s at endpoint (B  | etter indicated            | l by lower va                | lues)        |    |    |   |   |     |          |
|         | randomised<br>trials |              |                   | no serious<br>indirectness | very<br>serious <sup>1</sup> | none         | 31 | 34 | - | SMD 0.24<br>lower (0.73<br>lower to 0.24<br>higher) | LOW | CRITICAL |
| Depress | ion self-repo        | rted measure | s at 1-year follo | w-up (Better ii            | ndicated by l                | ower values) |    |    |   |   |     |          |
|         | randomised<br>trials |              |                   | no serious<br>indirectness | very<br>serious <sup>1</sup> | none         | 30 | 30 | - | SMD 0.25<br>lower (0.76<br>lower to 0.26<br>higher) | LOW | CRITICAL |

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1</sup> Single study, inconclusive effect size

# Is problem solving (GP delivered) effective compared with problem solving (nurse delivered)?

|                |                      |                           | Quality asses               | sment           |                              |                      |                                      | Summa                                      | ry of findi                 | ngs   |         |            |
|----------------|----------------------|---------------------------|-----------------------------|-----------------|------------------------------|----------------------|--------------------------------------|--|-----------------------------|---|---------|------------|
|                |                      |                           | •                           |                 |                              |                      | No. of p                             | atients                                    | E                           | ffect   |         |            |
| No. of studies | Design               | Limitations               | Inconsistency               | Indirectness    | Imprecision                  | Other considerations | Problem<br>solving (GP<br>delivered) | Problem<br>solving<br>(nurse<br>delivered) | Relative<br>(95% CI)        | Absolute  | Quality | Importance |
| Leaving        | study early fo       | or any reaso              | n                           | ı               |                              | ı                    |                                      |  |                             |   | ı       |            |
| 1              | randomised<br>trials | no serious<br>limitations | no serious<br>inconsistency |                 | very<br>serious <sup>1</sup> | none                 | 14/39<br>(35.9%)                     | 9/41 (22%)                                 | RR 1.64<br>(0.8 to<br>3.34) | 140 more<br>per 1000<br>(from 44<br>fewer to<br>514 more) | LOW     | CRITICAL   |
|                |                      |                           |                             |                 |                              |                      |                                      | 0%   |                             | 0 more per<br>1000 (from<br>0 fewer to 0<br>more)         |         |            |
| Depress        | ion clinician-       | reported me               | asures at endp              | oint (Better in | dicated by lo                | wer values)          | l                                    |  | I                           |   | '       |            |
| 1              | randomised<br>trials | no serious<br>limitations | no serious<br>inconsistency |                 | very<br>serious <sup>1</sup> | none                 | 34                                   | 36   | -                           | SMD 0.02<br>lower (0.49<br>lower to<br>0.44 higher)       | LOW     | CRITICAL   |
| Depress        | ion clinician-       | reported me               | asures at 1-yea             | r follow-up (B  | etter indicat                | ed by lower valu     | ues)                                 |  | I                           |   |         |            |
| 1              | randomised           | no serious                | no serious                  | no serious      | very                         | none                 | 25                                   | 28   | -                           | SMD 0.01<br>lower (0.55                                   |         | CRITICAL   |

|         | trials               | limitations               | inconsistency               | indirectness               | serious <sup>1</sup>         |         |                  |                  |                              | lower to<br>0.53 higher)  | LOW |          |
|---------|----------------------|---------------------------|-----------------------------|----------------------------|------------------------------|---------|------------------|------------------|------------------------------|---|-----|----------|
| Depress | sion clinician-      | reported me               | easures HRSD >              | 7 at endpoint              |                              |         |                  |                  |                              |   |     |          |
| 1       | randomised<br>trials | no serious<br>limitations | no serious<br>inconsistency | no serious<br>indirectness | very<br>serious <sup>1</sup> | none    | 19/39<br>(48.7%) | 19/41<br>(46.3%) | RR 1.05<br>(0.66 to<br>1.67) | 23 more per<br>1000 (from<br>158 fewer<br>to 310<br>more)                               | LOW | CRITICAL |
|         |                      |                           |                             |                            |                              |         |                  | 0%               |                              | 0 more per<br>1000 (from<br>0 fewer to 0<br>more)                                       |     |          |
| Depress | sion clinician-      | reported me               | easures HRSD >              | 7 at 1-year fol            | low-up                       |         |                  |                  |                              |   |     |          |
| 1       | randomised<br>trials | no serious<br>limitations | no serious<br>inconsistency | no serious<br>indirectness | very<br>serious <sup>1</sup> | none    | 15/39<br>(38.5%) | 18/41<br>(43.9%) | RR 0.88<br>(0.52 to<br>1.48) | 53 fewer<br>per 1000<br>(from 211<br>fewer to<br>211 more)<br>0 fewer per<br>1000 (from | LOW | CRITICAL |
| D       | ·                    |                           |                             | (D. M                      | 46                           |         |                  |                  |                              | 0 fewer to 0<br>more)   |     |          |
| Depress | sion seit-repo       | rtea measur               | es at endpoint              | (Better indica             | tea by lower                 | values) |                  |                  |                              |   |     |          |
| 1       | randomised<br>trials | no serious<br>limitations | no serious<br>inconsistency | no serious<br>indirectness | very<br>serious <sup>1</sup> | none    | 34               | 36               | -                            | SMD 0.07<br>lower (0.54<br>lower to 0.4<br>higher)                                      | LOW | CRITICAL |

| Depres | Depression self-reported measures at 1-year follow-up (Better indicated by lower values) |  |  |                            |                              |      |    |    |   |   |     |          |  |  |  |
|--------|--|--|--|----------------------------|------------------------------|------|----|----|---|---|-----|----------|--|--|--|
| 1      | randomised<br>trials   |  |  | no serious<br>indirectness | very<br>serious <sup>1</sup> | none | 25 | 28 | - | SMD 0.15<br>lower (0.69<br>lower to<br>0.39 higher) | LOW | CRITICAL |  |  |  |

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1</sup> Single study, inconclusive effect size

# **Couples therapy**

Is couples therapy effective compared with waitlist control?

|                |                |                           | Quality asses    | sment           |                           |                      |                    | Sumi     | mary of f               | ndings                                       |            |          |
|----------------|----------------|---------------------------|------------------|-----------------|---------------------------|----------------------|--------------------|----------|-------------------------|--|------------|----------|
|                |                |                           |                  |                 |                           | No. of p             | atients            |          | Effect                  |  | Importance |          |
| No. of studies | Design         | Limitations               | Inconsistency    | Indirectness    | Imprecision               | Other considerations | Couples<br>therapy | Waitlist | Relative<br>(95%<br>CI) | Absolute                                     | Quality    |          |
| Depressi       | ion self-repor | ted measure a             | at endpoint (Bet | ter indicated b | y lower values            | )                    |                    |          |                         |  | ı          |          |
|                |                | no serious<br>limitations |                  |                 | no serious<br>imprecision | none                 | 27                 | 27       | -                       | SMD 1.35<br>lower (1.95<br>to 0.75<br>lower) | HIGH       | CRITICAL |

# Is couples therapy effective compared with CBT?

|                |   |                           | Quality asses     | sment                      |                              |                      |                    | S               | ummary o             | f findings  |          |            |  |
|----------------|---|---------------------------|-------------------|----------------------------|------------------------------|----------------------|--------------------|-----------------|----------------------|---|----------|------------|--|
|                |   |                           |                   |                            |                              |                      | No. of p           | atients         | E                    | ffect   |          | Importance |  |
| No. of studies | Design  | Limitations               | Inconsistency     | Indirectness               | Imprecision                  | Other considerations | Couples<br>therapy | СВТ             | Relative<br>(95% CI) | Absolute  | Quality  |            |  |
| Leaving        | randomised no serious no serious serious serious none 39 more per                         |                           |                   |                            |                              |                      |                    |                 |                      |   |          |            |  |
| 3              | randomised<br>trials  | no serious<br>limitations |                   | no serious<br>indirectness | serious <sup>1</sup>         | none                 | 12/55<br>(21.8%)   | 9/51<br>(17.6%) | RR 1.22<br>(0.55 to  | 39 more per<br>1000 (from<br>79 fewer to<br>302 more) | MODERATE | CRITICAL   |  |
|                |   |                           |                   |                            |                              |                      |                    | 0%              | 2.71)                | 0 more per<br>1000 (from 0<br>fewer to 0<br>more)     |          |            |  |
| Depress        | ion self-repo   | rted measure              | es at endpoint (E | Better indicate            | d by lower v                 | alues)               |                    |                 |                      |   |          |            |  |
| 2              | randomised<br>trials  | no serious<br>limitations |                   | no serious<br>indirectness | serious <sup>1</sup>         | none                 | 33                 | 34              | -                    | SMD 0.10<br>lower (0.58<br>lower to 0.38<br>higher)   | MODERATE | CRITICAL   |  |
| Depress        | Depression self-reported measures at 6-month follow-up (Better indicated by lower values) |                           |                   |                            |                              |                      |                    |                 |                      |   |          |            |  |
| 1              | randomised<br>trials  | no serious<br>limitations |                   |                            | very<br>serious <sup>2</sup> | none                 | 20                 | 20              | -                    | SMD 0.05<br>lower (0.67<br>lower to 0.57<br>higher)   | LOW      | CRITICAL   |  |

| Depres | sion self-repo       | rted measur               | es at 12-month              | follow-up (Bet             | ter indicated                | d by lower values | )              |                |                              |   |          |          |
|--------|----------------------|---------------------------|-----------------------------|----------------------------|------------------------------|-------------------|----------------|----------------|------------------------------|---|----------|----------|
| 2      | randomised<br>trials | no serious<br>limitations | no serious<br>inconsistency | no serious<br>indirectness | serious <sup>1</sup>         | none              | 32             | 32             | -                            | SMD 0.41<br>lower (0.9<br>lower to 0.09<br>higher)  | MODERATE | CRITICAL |
| Depres | sion self-repo       | rted measure              | es at 18-month              | follow-up (Bet             | ter indicated                | d by lower values | ;)             |                |                              | '   |          |          |
| 1      | randomised<br>trials | no serious<br>limitations | no serious<br>inconsistency | no serious<br>indirectness | very<br>serious <sup>2</sup> | none              | 20             | 20             | -                            | SMD 0.08<br>lower (0.7<br>lower to 0.54<br>higher)  | LOW      | CRITICAL |
| Depres | sion clinician-      | reported me               | asures at endpo             | int (Better ind            | icated by lo                 | wer values)       |                |                |                              |   |          |          |
| 1      | randomised<br>trials | no serious<br>limitations | no serious<br>inconsistency | no serious<br>indirectness | very<br>serious <sup>2</sup> | none              | 20             | 20             | -                            | SMD 0.07<br>lower (0.69<br>lower to 0.55<br>higher)   | LOW      | CRITICAL |
| Relaps | e at 6 months        |                           |                             |                            |                              | .1                |                |                |                              |   |          |          |
| 1      | randomised<br>trials | no serious<br>limitations | no serious<br>inconsistency | no serious<br>indirectness | very<br>serious <sup>2</sup> | none              | 11/20<br>(55%) | 14/20<br>(70%) | RR 0.79<br>(0.48 to<br>1.28) | 147 fewer per<br>1000 (from<br>364 fewer to<br>196 more)<br>0 fewer per<br>1000 (from 0<br>fewer to 0 | LOW      | CRITICAL |
|        |                      |                           |                             |                            |                              |                   |                |                |                              | more)   |          |          |

| Relapse | at 12 month          | s                         |                             |                              |      |                |                |                              |  |     |          |
|---------|----------------------|---------------------------|-----------------------------|------------------------------|------|----------------|----------------|------------------------------|--|-----|----------|
| 1       | randomised<br>trials | no serious<br>limitations | no serious<br>inconsistency | very<br>serious <sup>2</sup> | none | 10/20<br>(50%) | 13/20<br>(65%) | RR 0.77<br>(0.45 to<br>1.32) | 150 fewer per<br>1000 (from<br>357 fewer to<br>208 more)<br>0 fewer per<br>1000 (from 0<br>fewer to 0<br>more) | LOW | CRITICAL |

Inconclusive effect size

# Is couples therapy + CBT effective compared with CBT?

|                |                      |             | Quality asses               | sment                      |                              |                      |                             | Sur             | mmary of fi                  | ndings  |         |            |
|----------------|----------------------|-------------|-----------------------------|----------------------------|------------------------------|----------------------|-----------------------------|-----------------|------------------------------|---|---------|------------|
|                |                      |             | ,                           |                            |                              |                      | No. of pa                   | atients         | ı                            | Effect  |         | Importance |
| No. of studies | Design               | Limitations | Inconsistency               | Indirectness               | Imprecision                  | Other considerations | Couples<br>therapy +<br>CBT | СВТ             | Relative<br>(95% CI)         | Absolute  | Quality | =          |
| Relapse        | at 12 months         | 1           |                             | I                          | I                            |                      | •                           |                 |                              |   |         | l          |
|                | randomised<br>trials |             | no serious<br>inconsistency | no serious<br>indirectness | very<br>serious <sup>1</sup> | none                 | 1/10<br>(10%)               | 2/13<br>(15.4%) | RR 0.65<br>(0.07 to<br>6.19) | 54 fewer per<br>1000 (from<br>143 fewer to<br>798 more) | LOW     | CRITICAL   |
|                |                      |             |                             |                            |                              |                      |                             | 0%              |                              | 0 fewer per<br>1000 (from 0<br>fewer to 0               |         |            |

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>2</sup> Single study, inconclusive effect size

|   |  |  |  |  |       | 1 |
|---|--|--|--|--|-------|---|
|   |  |  |  |  | more) |   |
| 1 |  |  |  |  | more  |   |
|   |  |  |  |  | ,     |   |

Single study, inconclusive effect size

# Is couples therapy + CBT effective compared with couples therapy?

|                |              |                           | Quality assess     | sment                      |                              |                      |                             | Sum                | nmary of fi                   | ndings  |         |            |
|----------------|--------------|---------------------------|--------------------|----------------------------|------------------------------|----------------------|-----------------------------|--------------------|-------------------------------|---|---------|------------|
|                |              |                           | <b>Q</b> aa, 2000. |                            |                              |                      | No. of p                    | atients            | I                             | Effect  |         | Importance |
| No. of studies | Design       | Limitations               | Inconsistency      | Indirectness               | Imprecision                  | Other considerations | Couples<br>therapy +<br>CBT | Couples<br>therapy | Relative<br>(95% CI)          | Absolute  | Quality | ,          |
| Relapse        | at 6 months  | l                         | l                  | l                          | l                            |                      |                             |                    |                               |   |         |            |
| 1              |              | no serious<br>limitations |                    | no serious<br>indirectness | very<br>serious <sup>1</sup> | none                 | 0/11 (0%)                   | 1/11<br>(9.1%)     | RR 0.33<br>(0.02 to<br>7.39)  | 61 fewer per<br>1000 (from 89<br>fewer to 581<br>more)<br>0 fewer per<br>1000 (from 0 | LOW     | CRITICAL   |
| Relapse        | at 12 months | •                         |                    |                            |                              |                      |                             | 0,0                |                               | fewer to 0<br>more)   |         |            |
|                |              |                           |                    |                            |                              |                      |                             |                    |                               |   |         |            |
| 1              |              | no serious<br>limitations |                    |                            | very<br>serious <sup>1</sup> | none                 | 1/10<br>(10%)               | 1/10<br>(10%)      | RR 1.00<br>(0.07 to<br>13.87) | 0 fewer per<br>1000 (from 93<br>fewer to 1287<br>more)                                |         | CRITICAL   |
|                |              |                           |                    |                            |                              |                      |                             | 0%                 | 13.0/)                        | 0 fewer per<br>1000 (from 0<br>fewer to 0<br>more)                                    |         |            |

# Is couples therapy effective compared with IPT?

|                |   |              | Quality asses               | sment                      |                              |                      |                    | S               | ummary o             | f findings  |          |            |
|----------------|---|--------------|-----------------------------|----------------------------|------------------------------|----------------------|--------------------|-----------------|----------------------|---|----------|------------|
|                |   |              |                             |                            |                              |                      | No. of p           | atients         | E                    | ffect   |          | Importance |
| No. of studies | Design  | Limitations  | Inconsistency               | Indirectness               | Imprecision                  | Other considerations | Couples<br>therapy | IPT             | Relative<br>(95% CI) | Absolute  | Quality  |            |
| Leaving        | study early   | •            |                             | -                          | -                            | •                    |                    |                 | -                    |   |          | '          |
| 2              | randomised<br>trials  |              | no serious<br>inconsistency | no serious<br>indirectness | serious <sup>1</sup>         | none                 | 4/29<br>(13.8%)    | 6/29<br>(20.7%) | RR 0.67<br>(0.22 to  | 68 fewer per<br>1000 (from<br>161 fewer to<br>215 more) | MODERATE | CRITICAL   |
|                |   |              |                             |                            |                              |                      | (0.3               |                 | 2.04)                | 0 fewer per<br>1000 (from 0<br>fewer to 0<br>more)      |          |            |
| Depress        | ion self-repo   | rted measure | s at endpoint (E            | Better indicate            | d by lower v                 | alues)               |                    |                 |                      |   |          |            |
| 1              | randomised<br>trials  |              | no serious<br>inconsistency |                            | very<br>serious <sup>2</sup> | none                 | 20                 | 20              | -                    | SMD 0.06<br>lower (0.68<br>lower to 0.56<br>higher)     | LOW      | CRITICAL   |
| Depress        | ession self-reported measures at 6-month follow-up (Better indicated by lower values) |              |                             |                            |                              |                      |                    |                 |                      |   |          |            |
| 1              | randomised<br>trials  |              | no serious<br>inconsistency |                            | very<br>serious <sup>2</sup> | none                 | 20                 | 20              | -                    | SMD 0.32<br>lower (0.94<br>lower to 0.31                | LOW      | CRITICAL   |

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1</sup> Single study, inconclusive effect size

|         |   |                           |                             |                            |                              |                 |    |    |   | higher)  |          |          |  |  |
|---------|---|---------------------------|-----------------------------|----------------------------|------------------------------|-----------------|----|----|---|--|----------|----------|--|--|
| Depress | ion self-repo   | rted measure              | es at 12-month i            | follow-up (Bet             | ter indicated                | by lower values | )  |    |   |  | ,        |          |  |  |
| 1       | randomised<br>trials  | no serious<br>limitations | no serious<br>inconsistency | no serious<br>indirectness | very<br>serious <sup>2</sup> | none            | 20 | 20 | - | SMD 0.23<br>lower (0.86<br>lower to 0.39<br>higher)  | LOW      | CRITICAL |  |  |
| Depress | Depression self-reported measures at 18 months (Better indicated by lower values) |                           |                             |                            |                              |                 |    |    |   |  |          |          |  |  |
| 1       | randomised<br>trials  | no serious<br>Iimitations | no serious<br>inconsistency | no serious<br>indirectness | very<br>serious <sup>2</sup> | none            | 20 | 20 | - | SMD 0.14<br>higher (0.48<br>lower to 0.76<br>higher) | LOW      | CRITICAL |  |  |
| Depress | ion clinician-  | reported mea              | asures at endpo             | int (Better ind            | licated by lov               | wer values)     |    |    |   |  |          |          |  |  |
| 2       | randomised<br>trials  | no serious<br>limitations | no serious<br>inconsistency | no serious<br>indirectness | serious <sup>1</sup>         | none            | 29 | 29 | - | SMD 0.01<br>higher (0.51<br>lower to 0.52<br>higher) | MODERATE | CRITICAL |  |  |

Inconclusive effect size

2 Single study, inconclusive effect size

# Interpersonal therapy (IPT)

# Is IPT effective compared with placebo?

|                |  |                           | Quality asses               | sment                      |                      |                      |                  | S                | ummary o                     | f findings  |          |            |
|----------------|--|---------------------------|-----------------------------|----------------------------|----------------------|----------------------|------------------|------------------|------------------------------|---|----------|------------|
|                |  |                           | Quality asses               |                            |                      |                      | No. of p         | atients          | E                            | Effect  |          | Importance |
| No. of studies | Design   | Limitations               | Inconsistency               | Indirectness               | Imprecision          | Other considerations | IPT              | Placebo          | Relative<br>(95% CI)         | Absolute  | Quality  |            |
| Leaving        | study early  |                           |                             |                            |                      |                      |                  |                  |                              |   |          |            |
| 1              | randomised<br>trials                                   | no serious<br>limitations | no serious<br>inconsistency | no serious<br>indirectness | serious <sup>1</sup> | none                 | 14/61<br>(23%)   | 25/62<br>(40.3%) | RR 0.57<br>(0.33 to<br>0.99) | 173 fewer per<br>1000 (from 4<br>fewer to 270<br>fewer) | MODERATE | CRITICAL   |
|                |  |                           |                             |                            |                      |                      |                  | 0%               | 0.99)                        | 0 fewer per<br>1000 (from 0<br>fewer to 0<br>fewer)     |          |            |
| Depress        | ion clinician-   | reported mea              | asures at endpo             | int (Better ind            | icated by lov        | ver values)          |                  |                  |                              |   |          |            |
| 1              | randomised<br>trials                                   | no serious<br>limitations | no serious<br>inconsistency | no serious<br>indirectness | serious <sup>1</sup> | none                 | 61               | 62               | -                            | SMD 0.43<br>lower (0.79 to<br>0.07 lower)               | MODERATE | CRITICAL   |
| Depress        | ession clinician-reported measures HRSD >7 at endpoint |                           |                             |                            |                      |                      |                  |                  |                              |   |          |            |
| 1              | randomised<br>trials                                   | no serious<br>limitations | no serious<br>inconsistency | no serious<br>indirectness | serious <sup>1</sup> | none                 | 35/61<br>(57.4%) | 49/62<br>(79%)   | RR 0.73<br>(0.56 to          | 213 fewer per<br>1000 (from<br>55 fewer to              | MODERATE | CRITICAL   |

|         |                      |                           |                             |                            |                              |      |                  | 0%               | 0.93)                        | 348 fewer)  0 fewer per 1000 (from 0 fewer to 0 fewer)                                 |     |          |
|---------|----------------------|---------------------------|-----------------------------|----------------------------|------------------------------|------|------------------|------------------|------------------------------|--|-----|----------|
| Depress |                      | _                         | es at endpoint (E           | ı                          | 1                            |      | ı                |                  |                              |  |     |          |
| 1       | randomised<br>trials | no serious<br>limitations | no serious<br>inconsistency | no serious<br>indirectness | very<br>serious <sup>2</sup> | none | 61               | 62               | -                            | SMD 0.28<br>lower (0.64<br>lower to 0.07<br>higher)                                    | LOW | CRITICAL |
| Depress | ion self-repo        | rted measure              | es BDI >9 at end            | point                      |                              |      |                  |                  |                              |  |     |          |
| 1       | randomised<br>trials | no serious<br>limitations | no serious<br>inconsistency | no serious<br>indirectness | very<br>serious <sup>2</sup> | none | 27/61<br>(44.3%) | 37/62<br>(59.7%) | RR 0.74<br>(0.52 to<br>1.05) | 155 fewer per<br>1000 (from<br>286 fewer to<br>30 more)<br>0 fewer per<br>1000 (from 0 | LOW | CRITICAL |
|         |                      |                           |                             |                            |                              |      |                  | 0%               |                              | fewer to 0<br>more)  |     |          |

Single study

2 Single study, inconclusive effect size

# Is IPT effective compared with usual care (including antidepressants)?

|                |  |                           | Quality asses   | ssment                     |                      |                      |        | Sı                             | ımmary o             | findings  |          |            |  |  |
|----------------|--|---------------------------|-----------------|----------------------------|----------------------|----------------------|--------|--------------------------------|----------------------|---|----------|------------|--|--|
|                |  |                           |                 |                            |                      |                      | No. of | patients                       | E                    | ffect   |          | Importance |  |  |
| No. of studies | Design   | Limitations               | Inconsistency   | Indirectness               | Imprecision          | Other considerations | IPT    | Usual GP<br>care<br>(incl. AD) | Relative<br>(95% CI) | Absolute  | Quality  |            |  |  |
| Leaving        | study early  | ı                         | l               | ı                          | ı                    | 1                    |        |                                |                      |   |          |            |  |  |
|                | randomised trials limitations serious serious indirectness imprecision laterals limitations limitation |                           |                 |                            |                      |                      |        |                                |                      |   |          |            |  |  |
| Depress        | ion clinician-   | reported me               | asures at endpo | oint (Better inc           | licated by low       | ver values)          |        | ı                              |                      | orc,  |          |            |  |  |
| 2              | randomised<br>trials   | no serious<br>limitations | l '             | no serious<br>indirectness | serious <sup>3</sup> | none                 | 128    | 122                            | -                    | SMD 0.07<br>lower (0.33<br>lower to 0.18<br>higher) | VERY LOW | CRITICAL   |  |  |
| Depress        | epression clinician-reported measures at 3-month follow-up (Better indicated by lower values)  |                           |                 |                            |                      |                      |        |                                |                      |   |          |            |  |  |
|                | randomised<br>trials   |                           |                 | no serious<br>indirectness | serious <sup>4</sup> | none                 | 26     | 21                             | -                    | SMD 0.81<br>lower (1.41<br>to 0.21                  | MODERATE | CRITICAL   |  |  |

|         |                      |                           |                             |                            |                           |                   |      |    |   | lower)  |          |          |
|---------|----------------------|---------------------------|-----------------------------|----------------------------|---------------------------|-------------------|------|----|---|---|----------|----------|
| Depres  | sion clinician-      | reported me               | asures at 9-moi             | nth follow-up              | (Better indica            | ted by lower valu | ies) |    |   |   |          |          |
| 1       | randomised<br>trials | no serious<br>limitations | no serious<br>inconsistency | no serious<br>indirectness | serious <sup>4</sup>      | none              | 26   | 21 | - | SMD 0.98<br>lower (1.6 to<br>0.37 lower)            | MODERATE | CRITICAL |
| Depres  | sion self-repo       | rted measur               | es at endpoint (            | Better indicate            | ed by lower va            | alues)            |      |    |   |   |          |          |
| 1       | randomised<br>trials | no serious<br>limitations | no serious<br>inconsistency | no serious<br>indirectness | serious <sup>4</sup>      | none              | 52   | 20 | - | SMD 0.69<br>lower (1.22<br>to 0.16<br>lower)        | MODERATE | CRITICAL |
| Depres  | sion self-repo       | rted measur               | es at 3-month fo            | ollow-up (Bett             | er indicated b            | y lower values)   |      |    |   | '   |          |          |
| 1       | randomised<br>trials | no serious<br>limitations | no serious<br>inconsistency | no serious<br>indirectness | serious <sup>4</sup>      | none              | 26   | 21 | - | SMD 0.88<br>lower (1.48<br>to 0.28<br>lower)        | MODERATE | CRITICAL |
| Depress | sion self-repo       | rted measure              | es at 5-month fo            | ollow-up (Bett             | er indicated b            | y lower values)   |      |    |   |   |          |          |
| 1       | randomised<br>trials | no serious<br>limitations | no serious<br>inconsistency | no serious<br>indirectness | very serious <sup>5</sup> | none              | 44   | 18 | - | SMD 0.20<br>lower (0.75<br>lower to 0.35<br>higher) | LOW      | CRITICAL |
| Depress | sion self-repo       | rted measure              | es at 9-month fo            | ollow-up (Bett             | er indicated b            | y lower values)   |      |    |   | I   |          |          |
| 1       | randomised<br>trials | no serious<br>limitations | no serious<br>inconsistency | no serious<br>indirectness | serious <sup>4</sup>      | none              | 26   | 21 | - | SMD 0.98<br>lower (1.6 to                           | MODERATE | CRITICAL |

|  |  |  |  |  | 0.37 lower) |  |
|--|--|--|--|--|-------------|--|
|  |  |  |  |  |             |  |

# Is IPT (with/without placebo) effective compared with IPT + antidepressants in older adults?

|                |                      |               | Quality asses | sment                      |                      |                      |                                  | Sumn            | nary of fin                  | dings                                 |          |            |
|----------------|----------------------|---------------|---------------|----------------------------|----------------------|----------------------|----------------------------------|-----------------|------------------------------|---------------------------------------|----------|------------|
|                |                      |               | <b>X,</b>     |                            |                      |                      | No. of patie                     | ents            | E                            | ffect                                 |          | Importance |
| No. of studies | Design               | Limitations   | Inconsistency | Indirectness               | Imprecision          | Other considerations | IPT<br>(with/without<br>placebo) |                 | Relative<br>(95% CI)         | Absolute                              | Quality  |            |
| Leaving        | study early f        | or any reaso  | on            |                            | ı                    | 1                    | -                                |                 | •                            |                                       |          |            |
| 2              | randomised<br>trials |               |               | no serious<br>indirectness | serious <sup>1</sup> | none                 | 11/29 (37.9%)                    | 8/29<br>(27.6%) | RR 1.44<br>(0.72 to<br>2.86) | 513 more)<br>0 more per<br>1000 (from | MODERATE | CRITICAL   |
| Leaving        | study early o        | due to side e | ffects        |                            |                      |                      |                                  |                 |                              | 0 fewer to<br>0 more)                 |          |            |
| 2              | randomised           | no serious    | no serious    | no serious                 | serious <sup>1</sup> | none                 | 1/29 (3.4%)                      | 4/29            | RR 0.34<br>(0.06 to          | 91 fewer<br>per 1000                  |          | CRITICAL   |

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1</sup> Heterogeneity >50%
<sup>2</sup> Heterogeneity >80%
<sup>3</sup> Inconclusive effect size

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>4</sup> Single study

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>5</sup> Single study, inconclusive effect size

|         | trials          | limitations | inconsistency  | indirectness |                      |      |               | (13.8%) | 2.08)    | (from 130  | MODERATE |          |
|---------|-----------------|-------------|----------------|--------------|----------------------|------|---------------|---------|----------|--|----------|----------|
|         |                 |             |                |              |                      |      |               |         |          | fewer to   |          |          |
|         |                 |             |                |              |                      |      |               |         |          | 149 more)  |          |          |
|         |                 |             |                |              |                      |      |               | 0%      |          | 0 fewer per<br>1000 (from<br>0 fewer to<br>0 more) |          |          |
| Depress | sion clinician- | reported me | easure HRSD >7 | at endpoint  |                      |      |               |         |          |  |          |          |
| 1       | randomised      | no serious  | no serious     | no serious   | serious <sup>2</sup> | none |               |         |          | 394 more   |          |          |
|         | trials          | limitations | inconsistency  | indirectness |                      |      |               | 5/16    |          | per 1000   |          |          |
|         |                 |             |                |              |                      |      |               |         | RR 2.26  | (from 9  |          |          |
|         |                 |             |                |              |                      |      |               |         |          |  |          |          |
|         |                 |             |                |              |                      |      | 12/17 (70.6%) |         | (1.03 to | 1241 more)   | MODERATE | CRITICAL |
|         |                 |             |                |              |                      |      |               |         | 4.97)    | 0 more per   |          |          |
|         |                 |             |                |              |                      |      |               |         |          | -  |          |          |
|         |                 |             |                |              |                      |      |               | 00/     |          | TOOU (Irom   |          |          |
|         |                 |             |                |              |                      |      |               | 0%      |          | 1000 (from<br>0 more to 0                          |          |          |

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1</sup> Inconclusive effect size <sup>2</sup> Single study

# Is IPT + antidepressants effective compared with antidepressants?

|                |                      |                           | Quality assess              | sment                      |                      |                      |                   | S                 | iummary o                    | f findings   |          |            |
|----------------|----------------------|---------------------------|-----------------------------|----------------------------|----------------------|----------------------|-------------------|-------------------|------------------------------|--|----------|------------|
|                |                      |                           | <b>Q</b> aa, aacaa          |                            |                      |                      | No. of p          | atients           | E                            | ffect  |          | Importance |
| No. of studies | Design               | Limitations               | Inconsistency               | Indirectness               | Imprecision          | Other considerations | IPT + AD          | AD                | Relative<br>(95% CI)         | Absolute   | Quality  |            |
| Leaving        | study early fo       | or any reason             |                             |                            |                      |                      |                   |                   |                              |  |          |            |
| 4              | randomised<br>trials | no serious<br>limitations | no serious<br>inconsistency | no serious<br>indirectness | serious <sup>1</sup> | none                 | 32/146<br>(21.9%) | 44/156<br>(28.2%) | RR 0.77<br>(0.53 to          | 65 fewer per<br>1000 (from<br>133 fewer to<br>39 more) | MODERATE | CRITICAL   |
|                |                      |                           |                             |                            |                      |                      |                   | 0%                | 1.14)                        | 0 fewer per<br>1000 (from 0<br>fewer to 0<br>more)     |          |            |
| Leaving        | study early d        | ue to side eff            | ects                        |                            |                      |                      |                   |                   |                              |  |          |            |
| 3              | randomised<br>trials | no serious<br>limitations | no serious<br>inconsistency | no serious<br>indirectness | serious <sup>1</sup> | none                 | 3/97<br>(3.1%)    | 7/109<br>(6.4%)   | RR 0.57<br>(0.17 to<br>1.89) | 28 fewer per<br>1000 (from 53<br>fewer to 57<br>more)  | MODERATE | CRITICAL   |
|                |                      |                           |                             |                            |                      |                      |                   | 0%                | 1.09)                        | 0 fewer per<br>1000 (from 0<br>fewer to 0<br>more)     |          |            |
| Depress        | ion clinician-       | reported mea              | asures at endpo             | int (5 weeks) (            | Better indica        | ited by lower va     | lues)             |                   |                              |  |          |            |
| 2              | randomised           | no serious                | serious <sup>2</sup>        | no serious                 | serious <sup>3</sup> | none                 | 102               | 98                | -                            | SMD 0.16   |          | CRITICAL   |

|        | trials               | limitations               |                             | indirectness               |                              |                   |                 |                |                    | lower (0.44<br>lower to 0.12<br>higher)                  | LOW      |          |
|--------|----------------------|---------------------------|-----------------------------|----------------------------|------------------------------|-------------------|-----------------|----------------|--------------------|--|----------|----------|
| Depres | ssion clinician-     | reported me               | asures after 12             | weeks' treatm              | ent (Better i                | indicated by lowe | er values)      |                |                    |  |          |          |
| 2      | randomised<br>trials | no serious<br>limitations | no serious<br>inconsistency | no serious<br>indirectness | serious <sup>1</sup>         | none              | 44              | 43             | -                  | SMD 0.13<br>lower (0.55<br>lower to 0.3<br>higher)       | MODERATE | CRITICAL |
| Depres | ssion clinician-     | reported me               | asures HRSD >7              | at endpoint                |                              |                   |                 |                | '                  | '  |          |          |
| 1      | randomised<br>trials | no serious<br>limitations | no serious<br>inconsistency | no serious<br>indirectness | very<br>serious⁴             | none              | 5/16<br>(31.3%) | 11/25<br>(44%) | RR 0.71<br>(0.3 to | 128 fewer per<br>1000 (from<br>308 fewer to<br>290 more) | LOW      | CRITICAL |
|        |                      |                           |                             |                            |                              |                   | (32.376)        | 0%             | 1.66)              | 0 fewer per<br>1000 (from 0<br>fewer to 0<br>more)       |          |          |
| Depres | ssion self-repo      | rted measure              | es at endpoint (            | 5 weeks) (Bett             | er indicated                 | by lower values)  |                 |                |                    |  |          |          |
| 1      | randomised<br>trials | no serious<br>limitations | no serious<br>inconsistency | no serious<br>indirectness | very<br>serious <sup>4</sup> | none              | 65              | 65             | 65 -               | SMD 0.06<br>lower (0.41<br>lower to 0.28<br>higher)      | LOW      | CRITICAL |

Inconclusive effect size

Heterogeneity >50%

Single study

Single study, inconclusive effect size

### Is IPT (with/without placebo) effective compared with antidepressants (with/without clinical management)?

|                |                      |               | Quality asses               | ssment       |             |                      |                                  | Summary  | of finding                   | gs   |          |            |
|----------------|----------------------|---------------|-----------------------------|--------------|-------------|----------------------|----------------------------------|--|------------------------------|--|----------|------------|
|                |                      |               |                             |              |             |                      | No. of p                         | oatients                                       | Ef                           | fect   |          |            |
| No. of studies | Design               | Limitations   | Inconsistency               | Indirectness | Imprecision | Other considerations | IPT<br>(with/without<br>placebo) | AD<br>(with/without<br>clinical<br>management) | Relative<br>(95% CI)         | IAhcoluta  | Quality  | Importance |
| Leaving        | study early          | for any reas  | on                          |              | '           | ı                    |                                  |  | •                            | ı  |          |            |
|                | randomised<br>trials |               | no serious<br>inconsistency |              |             | none                 | 63/171<br>(36.8%)                | 67/173<br>(38.7%)                              | (0.72 to<br>1.22)            | 23 fewer per 1000 (from 108 fewer to 85 more)  0 fewer per 1000 (from 0 fewer to 0 more) | MODERATE | CRITICAL   |
| Leaving        | study due t          | o side effect | :s                          |              |             |                      |                                  |  |                              |  |          |            |
|                | randomised<br>trials |               | no serious<br>inconsistency |              | - /         | none                 | 0/17 (0%)                        | 2/25 (8%)                                      | RR 0.29<br>(0.01 to<br>5.67) | 57 fewer<br>per 1000<br>(from 79<br>fewer to<br>374<br>more)                             | LOW      | CRITICAL   |

| Depress | ion clinician        | -reported n | neasures at en              | dpoint (Bette | r indicated l                | oy lower values)    |               | 0%                  |                              | O fewer<br>per 1000<br>(from 0<br>fewer to<br>0 more)                                  |          |          |
|---------|----------------------|-------------|-----------------------------|---------------|------------------------------|---------------------|---------------|---------------------|------------------------------|--|----------|----------|
|         | randomised<br>trials |             | no serious<br>inconsistency |               | serious <sup>1</sup>         | none                | 154           | 148                 | -                            | SMD<br>0.08<br>higher<br>(0.15<br>lower to<br>0.3<br>higher)                           | MODERATE | CRITICAL |
| Depress | ion clinician        | -reported n | neasures HRSD               | >7 at endpoi  | int                          |                     |               |                     |                              |  |          |          |
|         |                      | limitations |                             | indirectness  |                              | none<br>wer values) | 47/78 (60.3%) | 44/82 (53.7%)<br>0% | RR 1.12<br>(0.86 to<br>1.46) | 64 more per 1000 (from 75 fewer to 247 more)  0 more per 1000 (from 0 fewer to 0 more) | LOW      | CRITICAL |
|         |                      |             |                             |               | _                            | -<br>-              |               |                     |                              |  |          |          |
|         | randomised<br>trials |             | no serious<br>inconsistency |               | very<br>serious <sup>2</sup> | none                | 61            | 57                  | -                            | SMD<br>0.04<br>higher  | LOW      | CRITICAL |

| Depres | sion self-rep        | orted measu | ures BDI >9 at 6            | endpoint |          |               |               |                              | (0.32<br>lower to<br>0.4<br>higher)                              |     |          |
|--------|----------------------|-------------|-----------------------------|----------|----------|---------------|---------------|------------------------------|--|-----|----------|
|        | randomised<br>trials |             | no serious<br>inconsistency |          | <br>none | 27/61 (44.3%) | 27/57 (47.4%) | RR 0.93<br>(0.63 to<br>1.38) | 33 fewer<br>per 1000<br>(from<br>175<br>fewer to<br>180<br>more) | LOW | CRITICAL |
|        |                      |             |                             |          |          |               | 0%            |                              | 0 fewer<br>per 1000<br>(from 0<br>fewer to<br>0 more)            |     |          |

Inconclusive effect size

<sup>2</sup> Single study, inconclusive effect size

<sup>3</sup> Heterogeneity >50%

### Is IPT (continuation treatment) effective compared with antidepressants?

|                |                      |                           | Quality asses    | sment          |                              |                      |                                    | Summa            | ary of find                  | ings   |         |            |
|----------------|----------------------|---------------------------|------------------|----------------|------------------------------|----------------------|------------------------------------|------------------|------------------------------|--|---------|------------|
|                |                      |                           | Quality asses    | Silicit        |                              |                      | No. of patie                       | ents             | E                            | ffect  |         | Importance |
| No. of studies | Design               | Limitations               | Inconsistency    | Indirectness   | Imprecision                  | Other considerations | IPT<br>(continuation<br>treatment) | AD               | Relative<br>(95% CI)         | Absolute   | Quality | Importance |
| Depress        | ion clinician-       | reported me               | asures after 4 n | nonths' contin | uation treat                 | nent (Better ind     | I<br>licated by lower              | values)          |                              |  | 1       |            |
|                | randomised<br>trials | no serious<br>limitations |                  |                | very<br>serious <sup>1</sup> | none                 | 93                                 | 91               | -                            | SMD 0.03<br>higher (0.26<br>lower to<br>0.32 higher)                                 | LOW     | CRITICAL   |
| Depress        | ion clinician-       | reported me               | asures HRSD >7   | after 4 month  | ns' continuat                | ion treatment        | '                                  |                  |                              |  | ļ       |            |
|                | randomised<br>trials | no serious<br>limitations |                  |                | very<br>serious <sup>1</sup> | none                 | 50/93 (53.8%)                      | 47/91<br>(51.6%) | RR 1.04<br>(0.79 to<br>1.37) | 21 more per<br>1000 (from<br>108 fewer to<br>191 more)<br>0 more per<br>1000 (from 0 | LOW     | CRITICAL   |
|                |                      |                           |                  |                |                              |                      |                                    | 0%               |                              | fewer to 0   |         |            |

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1</sup> Single study, inconclusive effect size

# Is IPT (continuation treatment) effective compared with treatment as usual (TAU)?

|                |                      |             | Quality asses   | sment                      |                      |                      |                                    | Sumr             | nary of fin          | idings   |          |            |
|----------------|----------------------|-------------|-----------------|----------------------------|----------------------|----------------------|------------------------------------|------------------|----------------------|--|----------|------------|
|                |                      |             | Quanty asses    | Silicit                    |                      |                      | No. of pati                        | ents             | E                    | ffect  |          | Importance |
| No. of studies | Design               | Limitations | Inconsistency   | Indirectness               | Imprecision          | Other considerations | IPT<br>(continuation<br>treatment) | TAU              | Relative<br>(95% CI) | Absolute   | Quality  | importunee |
| Depres         | i<br>sion clinician  | reported m  | easures after 4 | months' conti              | inuation trea        | atment (Better in    | ndicated by low                    | er value:        | s)                   |  |          |            |
| 1              | randomised<br>trials |             |                 | no serious<br>indirectness | serious <sup>1</sup> | none                 | 93                                 | 92               | -                    | SMD 0.44<br>lower (0.73<br>to 0.15<br>lower)                 | MODERATE | CRITICAL   |
| Depres         | sion clinician       | reported m  | easures HRSD >  | 7 after 4 mon              | ths' continu         | ation treatment      |                                    |                  | ı                    |  |          |            |
| 1              | randomised<br>trials |             |                 | no serious<br>indirectness | serious <sup>1</sup> | none                 | 50/93 (53.8%)                      | 75/92<br>(81.5%) | IXIX 0.00            | 277 fewer<br>per 1000<br>(from 147<br>fewer to<br>383 fewer) | MODERATE | CRITICAL   |
|                |                      |             |                 |                            |                      |                      |                                    | 0%               |                      | 0 fewer per<br>1000 (from<br>0 fewer to<br>0 fewer)          |          |            |

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1</sup> Single study

### Is IPT (continuation treatment) + antidepressants effective compared with antidepressants?

|                     |                      |             | Quality assess   | sment                      |                              |   | Si              | umr                     | nary of fi      | ndings  |     |            |
|---------------------|----------------------|-------------|------------------|----------------------------|------------------------------|---|-----------------|-------------------------|-----------------|---|-----|------------|
|                     |                      |             | •                |                            |                              |   | No. of patients | 5                       |                 | Effect  |     | Importance |
| No. of studies      | Design               | Limitations | Inconsistency    | Indirectness               | considerations               | IPT<br>(continuation<br>treatment) + AD | AD              | Relative<br>(95%<br>CI) | Absolute        | Quality   | •   |            |
| Depressi<br>values) | ion clinician-r      | eported mea | sures after 6 mo | nths' continua             | nt, 16 weeks' dr             | ug free and 8 wee                       | ks' I           | IPT free (              | Better indicate | d by low  | ver |            |
| 1                   | randomised<br>trials |             |                  | no serious<br>indirectness | very<br>serious <sup>1</sup> | none                                    | 11              | 12                      | -               | SMD 0.57<br>lower (1.41<br>lower to 0.27<br>higher) | LOW | CRITICAL   |

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1</sup> Single study, inconclusive effect size

### Is IPT (continuation treatment) + antidepressants effective compared with antidepressants + medication clinic?

|                |                      |              | Quality asses | sment                      |                              |                      |  | Summary                      | of finding                   | ;s  |         |            |
|----------------|----------------------|--------------|---------------|----------------------------|------------------------------|----------------------|--|------------------------------|------------------------------|---|---------|------------|
|                |                      |              | <b></b>       |                            |                              |                      | No. of pa                                  | tients                       | Ef                           | ffect   |         |            |
| No. of studies | l Design             | Limitations  | Inconsistency | Indirectness               | Imprecision                  | Other considerations | IPT<br>(continuation<br>treatment) +<br>AD | AD +<br>medication<br>clinic | Relative<br>(95% CI)         | Absolute  | Quality | Importance |
| Relapse        | (16-week co          | ntinuation p | hase)         |                            |                              |                      | -  |                              |                              |   |         |            |
| 1              | randomised<br>trials |              |               | no serious<br>indirectness | very<br>serious <sup>1</sup> | none                 | 0/11 (0%)                                  | 1/14 (7.1%)                  | RR 0.42<br>(0.02 to<br>9.34) | 41 fewer<br>per 1000<br>(from 70<br>fewer to<br>596 more) |         | CRITICAL   |
| 10             |                      |              |               |                            |                              |                      |  | 0%                           |                              | 0 fewer per<br>1000 (from<br>0 fewer to<br>0 more)        |         |            |

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1</sup> Single study, inconclusive effect size

#### Is IPT (continuation treatment) + antidepressants effective compared with IPT + placebo?

|                |                      |               | Quality asses | sment        |                              |                      |  | Summa        | ry of findi                  | ngs   |         |            |
|----------------|----------------------|---------------|---------------|--------------|------------------------------|----------------------|--|--------------|------------------------------|---|---------|------------|
|                |                      |               | Quality asses | Silicit      |                              |                      | No. of patio                               | ents         | E                            | ffect   |         |            |
| No. of studies | Design               | Limitations   | Inconsistency | Indirectness | Imprecision                  | Other considerations | IPT<br>(continuation<br>treatment) +<br>AD |              | Relative<br>(95% CI)         | Absolute  | Quality | Importance |
| Relapse        | (16-week co          | ntinuation tr | eatment)      |              | ı                            |                      |  |              |                              |   | ı       |            |
| 1              | randomised<br>trials |               |               |              | very<br>serious <sup>1</sup> | none                 | 0/11 (0%)                                  | 1/5<br>(20%) | RR 0.17<br>(0.01 to<br>3.51) | 166 fewer<br>per 1000<br>(from 198<br>fewer to 502<br>more) | LOW     | CRITICAL   |
|                |                      |               |               |              |                              |                      |  | 0%           | ,                            | 0 fewer per<br>1000 (from 0<br>fewer to 0<br>more)          |         |            |

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1</sup> Single study, inconclusive effect size

### Is IPT (continuation treatment) + placebo effective compared with placebo + medication clinic?

|                |                      |              | Quality asses | sment        |                              |                      |   | Summary                           | of finding           | S   |         |            |
|----------------|----------------------|--------------|---------------|--------------|------------------------------|----------------------|---|-----------------------------------|----------------------|---|---------|------------|
|                |                      |              | <b>4</b> ,    |              |                              |                      | No. of pa                                       | tients                            | Ef                   | fect  |         |            |
| No. of studies | Design               | Limitations  | Inconsistency | Indirectness | Imprecision                  | Other considerations | IPT<br>(continuation<br>treatment) +<br>placebo | Placebo +<br>medication<br>clinic | Relative<br>(95% CI) | Absolute  | Quality | Importance |
| Relapse        | (16-week co          | ntinuation t | reatment)     |              | ı                            |                      |   |                                   |                      | ı   |         |            |
|                | randomised<br>trials |              |               |              | very<br>serious <sup>1</sup> | none                 | 1/5 (20%)                                       | 0/10 (0%)                         | RR 5.50<br>(0.26 to  | 0 more per<br>1000 (from<br>0 fewer to<br>0 more) |         | CRITICAL   |
|                |                      |              |               |              |                              |                      |   | 0%                                | 115.22)              | 0 more per<br>1000 (from<br>0 fewer to<br>0 more) |         |            |

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1</sup> Single study, inconclusive effect size

### Is IPT (3-year maintenance treatment) effective compared with IPT + antidepressants?

|                |                      |             | Quality asses               | ssment                     |                              |                      |  | Sum            | mary of fi           | ndings  |          |            |
|----------------|----------------------|-------------|-----------------------------|----------------------------|------------------------------|----------------------|--|----------------|----------------------|---|----------|------------|
|                |                      |             | •                           |                            |                              |                      | No. of patie                             | nts            | E                    | ffect   |          | Importance |
| No. of studies | Design               | Limitations | Inconsistency               | Indirectness               | Imprecision                  | Other considerations | IPT (3-year<br>maintenance<br>treatment) | IPT +<br>AD    | Relative<br>(95% CI) | Absolute  | Quality  |            |
| Leaving        | study early          | I           | l                           | l                          | I                            | '                    |  |                |                      |   |          |            |
|                | randomised<br>trials |             | no serious<br>inconsistency | no serious<br>indirectness | very<br>serious <sup>1</sup> | none                 | 2/26 (7.7%)                              | 4/25<br>(16%)  | (0.1 to 2.4)         | 83 fewer per 1000 (from 144 fewer to 224 more)  0 fewer per 1000 (from 0 fewer to 0 | LOW      | CRITICAL   |
| Relapse        |                      |             |                             |                            |                              |                      |  | ı              |                      | more)   |          |            |
|                | randomised<br>trials |             | no serious<br>inconsistency | no serious<br>indirectness | serious <sup>2</sup>         | none                 | 18/26 (69.2%)                            | 10/25<br>(40%) |                      | 0 more per  | MODERATE | CRITICAL   |
|                |                      |             |                             |                            |                              |                      |  | 0%             |                      | 1000 (from<br>0 more to 0<br>more)  |          |            |

# Is IPT (3-year maintenance treatment) effective compared with IPT + placebo?

|                |                      |                           | Quality asses               | sment                      |                              |                      |  | Summa            | ry of findi                  | ngs  |         |            |
|----------------|----------------------|---------------------------|-----------------------------|----------------------------|------------------------------|----------------------|--|------------------|------------------------------|--|---------|------------|
|                |                      |                           | Quality asses               | Sincin                     |                              |                      | No. of pation                            | ents             | E                            | ffect  |         | Importance |
| No. of studies | Design               | Limitations               | Inconsistency               | Indirectness               | Imprecision                  | Other considerations | IPT (3-year<br>maintenance<br>treatment) | IPT +<br>placebo | Relative<br>(95% CI)         | Absolute   | Quality |            |
| Leaving        | study early          | l                         | l                           |                            | I                            |                      |  |                  |                              |  | ı       |            |
| 1              | randomised<br>trials | no serious<br>limitations | no serious<br>inconsistency | no serious<br>indirectness | very<br>serious <sup>1</sup> | none                 | 2/26 (7.7%)                              | 4/26<br>(15.4%)  | RR 0.50<br>(0.1 to<br>2.5)   | 77 fewer per<br>1000 (from<br>138 fewer to<br>231 more)<br>0 fewer per<br>1000 (from 0<br>fewer to 0 | LOW     | CRITICAL   |
| Relapse        |                      |                           |                             |                            |                              |                      |  |                  |                              | more)  |         |            |
| 1              | randomised<br>trials | no serious<br>limitations | no serious<br>inconsistency | no serious<br>indirectness | very<br>serious <sup>1</sup> | none                 | 18/26 (69.2%)                            | 21/26<br>(80.8%) | RR 0.86<br>(0.62 to<br>1.18) | 113 fewer<br>per 1000<br>(from 307<br>fewer to 145<br>more)  | LOW     | CRITICAL   |
|                |                      |                           |                             |                            |                              |                      |  | 0%               |                              | 0 fewer per<br>1000 (from 0  |         |            |

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1</sup> Single study, inconclusive effect size <sup>2</sup> Single study

|  |  |  |  |  | fewer to 0 |  |
|--|--|--|--|--|------------|--|
|  |  |  |  |  | more)      |  |

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1</sup> Single study, inconclusive effect size

### Is IPT (3-year maintenance treatment) effective compared with antidepressants?

|                |                      |                           | Quality asses               | sment                      |                              |                      |  | Summa            | ary of findi                 | ngs  |         |            |
|----------------|----------------------|---------------------------|-----------------------------|----------------------------|------------------------------|----------------------|--|------------------|------------------------------|--|---------|------------|
|                |                      |                           | Q,                          |                            |                              |                      | No. of patio                             | ents             | E                            | ffect  | ]       | Importance |
| No. of studies | Design               | Limitations               | Inconsistency               | Indirectness               | Imprecision                  | Other considerations | IPT (3-year<br>maintenance<br>treatment) | AD               | Relative<br>(95% CI)         | Absolute   | Quality |            |
| Leaving        | study early          | l                         | I                           |                            | ı                            | '                    |  |                  |                              |  | ı       |            |
| 1              | randomised<br>trials | no serious<br>limitations | no serious<br>inconsistency | no serious<br>indirectness | very<br>serious <sup>1</sup> | none                 | 2/26 (7.7%)                              | 9/28<br>(32.1%)  | RR 0.24<br>(0.06 to<br>1.01) | 244 fewer<br>per 1000<br>(from 302<br>fewer to 3<br>more)<br>0 fewer per<br>1000 (from 0 | LOW     | CRITICAL   |
| Relapse        |                      |                           |                             |                            |                              |                      |  | 0%               |                              | fewer to 0 more)   |         |            |
| 1              | randomised<br>trials | no serious<br>limitations |                             | no serious<br>indirectness | very<br>serious <sup>1</sup> | none                 | 18/26 (69.2%)                            | 15/28<br>(53.6%) | RR 1.29<br>(0.84 to<br>1.99) | 155 more<br>per 1000<br>(from 86<br>fewer to 530<br>more)                                | LOW     | CRITICAL   |

|  |  |  |  | 0% | 0 more per<br>1000 (from 0<br>fewer to 0 |  |
|--|--|--|--|----|--|--|
|  |  |  |  |    | more)                                    |  |

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1</sup> Single study, inconclusive effect size

### Is IPT (3-year maintenance treatment) effective compared with placebo?

|                |                      |                           | Quality asses | sment        |                              |                      |  | Summa            | ry of findi          | ngs   |         |            |
|----------------|----------------------|---------------------------|---------------|--------------|------------------------------|----------------------|--|------------------|----------------------|---|---------|------------|
|                |                      |                           | <b></b>       |              |                              |                      | No. of pati                              | ents             | E                    | ffect   |         | Importance |
| No. of studies | Design               | Limitations               | Inconsistency | Indirectness | Imprecision                  | Other considerations | IPT (3-year<br>maintenance<br>treatment) | Placebo          | Relative<br>(95% CI) | Absolute  | Quality |            |
| Leaving        | study early          | ı                         |               | I            |                              | '                    |  | 1                |                      |   | I       |            |
| 1              | randomised<br>trials | no serious<br>Iimitations |               |              | very<br>serious <sup>1</sup> | none                 | 2/26 (7.7%)                              | 3/23<br>(13%)    | RR 0.59<br>(0.11 to  | 53 fewer per<br>1000 (from<br>116 fewer to<br>290 more) | LOW     | CRITICAL   |
|                |                      |                           |               |              |                              |                      |  | 0%               | 3.22)                | 0 fewer per<br>1000 (from 0<br>fewer to 0<br>more)      |         |            |
| Relapse        |                      |                           |               |              |                              |                      |  |                  |                      |   |         |            |
| 1              | randomised<br>trials | no serious<br>limitations |               |              | very<br>serious <sup>1</sup> | none                 |  |                  | RR 0.76              | 219 fewer<br>per 1000                                   |         |            |
|                | u idis               | mitations                 | inconsistency | mun comess   | SCHOOS                       |                      | 18/26 (69.2%)                            | 21/23<br>(91.3%) | (0.57 to<br>1.01)    | (from 393<br>fewer to 9<br>more)                        | LOW     | CRITICAL   |

|  |  |  |  | 0% | 0 fewer per<br>1000 (from 0<br>fewer to 0 |  |
|--|--|--|--|----|---|--|
|  |  |  |  |    | more)                                     |  |

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1</sup> Single study, inconclusive effect size

# Is IPT (3-year maintenance treatment) + antidepressants effective compared with antidepressants?

|                |                      |                           | Quality asses | sment                      |                      |                      |  |  |                              |             |          |            |
|----------------|----------------------|---------------------------|---------------|----------------------------|----------------------|----------------------|--|--|------------------------------|-------------|----------|------------|
|                |                      |                           | <b>4,</b>     |                            |                      |                      | No. of patients Effect                           |  |                              |             |          |            |
| No. of studies | I Design             | Limitations               | Inconsistency | Indirectness               | Imprecision          | Other considerations | IPT (3-year<br>maintenance<br>treatment) +<br>AD | AD   | Relative<br>(95% CI)         | I Absolute  | Quality  | Importance |
| Leaving        | study early          |                           |               |                            |                      |                      |  |  |                              | •           |          |            |
| 2              | randomised<br>trials | no serious<br>limitations |               | no serious<br>indirectness | serious <sup>1</sup> | none                 | 7/50 (14%)                                       | 13/56<br>(23.2%)                                   | RR 0.60<br>(0.26 to<br>1.38) | iewei to oo | MODERATE | CRITICAL   |
| 1.             |                      |                           |               |                            |                      | 0%                   |  | 0 fewer per<br>1000 (from<br>0 fewer to<br>0 more) |                              |             |          |            |

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1</sup> Inconclusive effect size

### Is IPT (3-year maintenance treatment) + antidepressants effective compared with medication clinic + antidepressants?

|                |                      |             | Quality asses               | ssment       |                      |                      |  | Summa            | ry of findi                | ngs  |         |            |
|----------------|----------------------|-------------|-----------------------------|--------------|----------------------|----------------------|--|------------------|----------------------------|--|---------|------------|
|                |                      |             | <b>~/</b>                   |              |                      |                      | No. of patients                                  |                  |                            | fect   |         |            |
| No. of studies | I Design             | Limitations | Inconsistency               | Indirectness | Imprecision          | Other considerations | IPT (3-year<br>maintenance<br>treatment) +<br>AD |                  |                            | Ahsolute   | Quality | Importance |
| Relapse        | •                    |             |                             | '            | '                    |                      |  |                  |                            |  |         |            |
| 2              | randomised<br>trials |             | no serious<br>inconsistency |              | serious <sup>1</sup> | none                 | 15/50 (30%)                                      | 27/56<br>(48.2%) | RR 0.62 fev<br>(0.38 to 10 | 183 fewer<br>per 1000<br>(from 299<br>fewer to<br>10 more) |         | CRITICAL   |
|                |                      |             |                             |              |                      |                      |  | 0%               | 1.02)                      | 0 fewer<br>per 1000<br>(from 0<br>fewer to 0<br>more)      |         |            |

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1</sup> Inconclusive effect size

### Is IPT (3-year maintenance treatment) + placebo effective compared with medication clinic + placebo?

|                |                      |             | Quality asses               | ssment                     |                      |                      |   | Summa                             | ry of findi                  | ngs  |          |            |
|----------------|----------------------|-------------|-----------------------------|----------------------------|----------------------|----------------------|---|-----------------------------------|------------------------------|--|----------|------------|
|                |                      |             | ,                           |                            |                      |                      | No. of pa   | ntients                           | Ef                           | fect   |          |            |
| No. of studies | Design               | Limitations | Inconsistency               | Indirectness               | Imprecision          | Other considerations | IPT (3-year<br>maintenance<br>treatment) +<br>placebo | Medication<br>clinic +<br>placebo | Relative<br>(95% CI)         | Absolute   | Quality  | Importance |
| Leaving        | study early          | ı           |                             | ı                          |                      |                      |   |                                   |                              |  |          |            |
| 2              | randomised<br>trials |             | no serious<br>inconsistency |                            | serious <sup>1</sup> | none                 | 8/51 (15.7%)  | 3/52 (5.8%)                       | RR 2.35                      | 78 more<br>per 1000<br>(from 15<br>fewer to<br>372 more) | MODERATE | CRITICAL   |
|                |                      |             |                             |                            |                      |                      |   | 0%                                | ·                            | 0 more<br>per 1000<br>(from 0<br>fewer to 0<br>more)     |          |            |
| Relapse        |                      |             |                             |                            |                      |                      |   |                                   |                              |  |          |            |
| 2              | randomised<br>trials |             | no serious<br>inconsistency | no serious<br>indirectness |                      | none                 | 37/51 (72.5%)   | 47/52<br>(90.4%)                  | RR 0.80<br>(0.66 to<br>0.97) | •  | HIGH     | CRITICAL   |
|                |                      |             |                             |                            |                      |                      |   | 0%                                |                              | 0 fewer  |          |            |

|  |  |  |  | per 1000   |  |
|--|--|--|--|------------|--|
|  |  |  |  | (from 0    |  |
|  |  |  |  | fewer to 0 |  |
|  |  |  |  | fewer)     |  |

Inconclusive effect size

## Is IPT (3-year maintenance treatment) effective compared with IPT + placebo?

|                |                      |                           | Quality asses               | sment                      |                              |                      |  | Summa            | ry of findi                  | ngs   |         |            |
|----------------|----------------------|---------------------------|-----------------------------|----------------------------|------------------------------|----------------------|--|------------------|------------------------------|---|---------|------------|
|                |                      |                           | <b></b>                     |                            |                              |                      | No. of pation                            | ents             | E                            | ffect   |         | Importance |
| No. of studies | Design               | Limitations               | Inconsistency               | Indirectness               | Imprecision                  | Other considerations | IPT (3-year<br>maintenance<br>treatment) | IPT +<br>placebo | Relative<br>(95% CI)         | Absolute  | Quality | •          |
| Leaving        | study early          | ı                         | I                           | ı                          | I                            | '                    |  |                  |                              |   | ı       |            |
| 1              | randomised<br>trials | no serious<br>limitations | no serious<br>inconsistency | no serious<br>indirectness | very<br>serious <sup>1</sup> | none                 | 2/26 (7.7%)                              | 4/26<br>(15.4%)  | RR 0.50<br>(0.1 to           | 77 fewer per<br>1000 (from<br>138 fewer to<br>231 more) |         | CRITICAL   |
|                |                      |                           |                             |                            |                              |                      |  | 0%               | 2.5)                         | 0 fewer per<br>1000 (from 0<br>fewer to 0<br>more)      |         |            |
| Relapse        |                      |                           |                             |                            |                              |                      |  |                  |                              |   |         |            |
| 1              | randomised<br>trials | no serious<br>limitations | no serious<br>inconsistency | no serious<br>indirectness | very<br>serious <sup>1</sup> | none                 | 18/26 (69.2%)                            | 21/26<br>(80.8%) | RR 0.86<br>(0.62 to<br>1.18) | 113 fewer<br>per 1000<br>(from 307<br>fewer to 145      | LOW     | CRITICAL   |

|  |  |  |  |    | more)  |
|--|--|--|--|----|--|
|  |  |  |  | 0% | 0 fewer per<br>1000 (from 0<br>fewer to 0<br>more) |

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1</sup> Single study, inconclusive effect size

#### Is IPT (3-year maintenance treatment) + antidepressants effective compared with medication clinic + antidepressants?

|                |                      |                           | Quality asses               | ssment                     |                      |                      |  | Summa            | ry of findi         | ngs   |         |            |
|----------------|----------------------|---------------------------|-----------------------------|----------------------------|----------------------|----------------------|--|------------------|---------------------|---|---------|------------|
|                |                      |                           | <b></b>                     |                            |                      |                      | No. of pa  | atients          | Ef                  | fect  |         |            |
| No. of studies | i Design             | Limitations               | Inconsistency               | Indirectness               | Imprecision          | Other considerations | IPT (3-year<br>maintenance<br>treatment) +<br>AD |                  |                     | l Absolute  | Quality | Importance |
| Relapse        |                      | •                         | '                           | '                          |                      | '                    |  |                  | _                   |   |         |            |
|                | randomised<br>trials | no serious<br>limitations | no serious<br>inconsistency | no serious<br>indirectness | serious <sup>1</sup> | none                 | 15/50 (30%)                                      | 27/56<br>(48.2%) | RR 0.62<br>(0.38 to | 10 more)  |         | CRITICAL   |
|                |                      |                           |                             |                            |                      |                      |  | 0%               | 1.02)               | 0 fewer<br>per 1000<br>(from 0<br>fewer to 0<br>more) |         |            |

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1</sup> Inconclusive effect size

## Is IPT (with/without placebo) effective in IPT + antidepressants?

|                |                      |               | Quality asses               | sment                      |                      |                      |                                  | Sumn             | nary of fin                  | dings  |          |            |
|----------------|----------------------|---------------|-----------------------------|----------------------------|----------------------|----------------------|----------------------------------|------------------|------------------------------|--|----------|------------|
|                |                      |               | •                           |                            |                      |                      | No. of patie                     | ents             | E                            | ffect  |          | Importance |
| No. of studies | Design               | Limitations   | Inconsistency               | Indirectness               | Imprecision          | Other considerations | IPT<br>(with/without<br>placebo) |                  | Relative<br>(95% CI)         | Absolute   | Quality  |            |
| Leaving        | study early f        | or any reaso  | 'n                          |                            |                      | •                    |                                  | _                | -                            |  |          |            |
|                | randomised<br>trials |               | no serious<br>inconsistency | no serious<br>indirectness | serious <sup>1</sup> | none                 | 18/64 (28.1%)                    | 19/57<br>(33.3%) | (0.52 to<br>1.45)            |  | MODERATE | CRITICAL   |
|                |                      |               |                             |                            |                      |                      |                                  | 0%               |                              | 0 fewer per<br>1000 (from<br>0 fewer to<br>0 more)         |          |            |
| Leaving        | study early o        | lue to side e | ffects                      |                            |                      |                      |                                  |                  |                              |  |          |            |
|                | randomised<br>trials |               | no serious<br>inconsistency | no serious<br>indirectness | serious <sup>1</sup> | none                 | 1/29 (3.4%)                      | 4/29<br>(13.8%)  | RR 0.34<br>(0.06 to<br>2.08) | 91 fewer<br>per 1000<br>(from 130<br>fewer to<br>149 more) | MODERATE | CRITICAL   |
|                |                      |               |                             |                            |                      |                      |                                  | 0%               |                              | 0 fewer per<br>1000 (from<br>0 fewer to<br>0 more)         |          |            |

| Depres | sion clinician       | -reported m | easures HRSD > | 7 at endpoint              | t                    |      |               |                 |       |  |          |
|--------|----------------------|-------------|----------------|----------------------------|----------------------|------|---------------|-----------------|-------|--|----------|
| 1      | randomised<br>trials |             |                | no serious<br>indirectness | serious <sup>2</sup> | none | 12/17 (70.6%) | 5/16<br>(31.3%) | 4.97) | 394 more<br>per 1000<br>(from 9<br>more to<br>1241 more)<br>0 more per<br>1000 (from<br>0 more to 0<br>more) | CRITICAL |

Inconclusive effect size

### Is IPT + antidepressants effective compared with antidepressants in older adults?

|                |  |             | Quality assess              | sment                      |                              |                      |              | S             | Summary o                    | f findings   |         |            |  |
|----------------|--|-------------|-----------------------------|----------------------------|------------------------------|----------------------|--------------|---------------|------------------------------|--|---------|------------|--|
|                |  |             | <b>X</b> ,                  |                            |                              |                      | No. of p     | atients       |                              | Effect   |         | Importance |  |
| No. of studies | Design                                 | Limitations | Inconsistency               | Indirectness               | Imprecision                  | Other considerations | IPT +<br>AD  | AD            | Relative<br>(95% CI)         | Absolute   | Quality |            |  |
| Leaving        | eaving study early due to side effects |             |                             |                            |                              |                      |              |               |                              |  |         |            |  |
|                | randomised<br>trials                   |             | no serious<br>inconsistency | no serious<br>indirectness | very<br>serious <sup>1</sup> | none                 | 0/16<br>(0%) | 7/25<br>(28%) | RR 0.10<br>(0.01 to<br>1.67) | 252 fewer per<br>1000 (from 277<br>fewer to 188<br>more) | LOW     | CRITICAL   |  |
|                |  |             |                             |                            |                              |                      |              | 0%            | ,                            | 0 fewer per<br>1000 (from 0<br>fewer to 0                |         |            |  |

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>2</sup> Single study

|         |                      |                           |                             |                            |                              |      |                 |                |                     | more)  |     | 1        |
|---------|----------------------|---------------------------|-----------------------------|----------------------------|------------------------------|------|-----------------|----------------|---------------------|--|-----|----------|
| Leaving | study due to         | side effects              |                             |                            |                              |      |                 |                |                     |  |     |          |
| 1       | randomised<br>trials | no serious<br>limitations | no serious<br>inconsistency | no serious<br>indirectness | very<br>serious <sup>1</sup> | none | 0/16<br>(0%)    | 2/25<br>(8%)   | RR 0.31<br>(0.02 to | 55 fewer per<br>1000 (from 78<br>fewer to 399<br>more)   | LOW | CRITICAL |
|         | ession clinician     |                           |                             |                            |                              |      | (676)           | 0%             | 5.99)               | 0 fewer per<br>1000 (from 0<br>fewer to 0<br>more)       |     |          |
| Depres  | sion clinician-r     | eported mea               | sures HRSD >7 a             | t endpoint                 |                              |      |                 |                |                     |  |     |          |
| 1       | randomised<br>trials | no serious<br>limitations | no serious<br>inconsistency | no serious<br>indirectness | very<br>serious <sup>1</sup> | none | 5/16<br>(31.3%) | 11/25<br>(44%) | RR 0.71<br>(0.3 to  | 128 fewer per<br>1000 (from 308<br>fewer to 290<br>more) | LOW | CRITICAL |
|         |                      |                           |                             |                            |                              |      |                 | 0%             | 1.66)               | 0 fewer per<br>1000 (from 0<br>fewer to 0<br>more)       |     |          |

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1</sup> Single study, inconclusive effect size

# Is IPT (with/without placebo) effective compared with antidepressants (with/without clinical management) in older adults?

|                |                      |               | Quality asses               | ssment                     |                              |                         |                                  | Summary of                                     | findings                    |   |         |            |
|----------------|----------------------|---------------|-----------------------------|----------------------------|------------------------------|-------------------------|----------------------------------|--|-----------------------------|---|---------|------------|
|                |                      |               | Quality asset               | ,sinem                     |                              |                         | No. of p                         | patients                                       | Ef                          | fect  |         |            |
| No. of studies | Design               | Limitations   | Inconsistency               | Indirectness               | Imprecision                  | Other<br>considerations | IPT<br>(with/without<br>placebo) | AD<br>(with/without<br>clinical<br>management) | (95% CI)                    | Absolute  | Quality | Importance |
| Leaving        | study early          | for any reaso | on                          |                            |                              | •                       |                                  |  |                             |   |         |            |
|                | randomised<br>trials |               | no serious<br>inconsistency | no serious<br>indirectness | very<br>serious <sup>1</sup> | none                    | 3/17 (17.6%)                     | 7/25 (28%)                                     | RR 0.63<br>(0.19 to<br>2.1) | 104 fewer<br>per 1000<br>(from 227<br>fewer to<br>308 more) | ,       | CRITICAL   |
|                |                      |               |                             |                            |                              |                         |                                  | 0%   | 2.1)                        | 0 fewer<br>per 1000<br>(from 0<br>fewer to 0<br>more)       |         |            |
| Leaving        | study due to         | side effects  | 5                           |                            |                              |                         |                                  |  |                             |   |         |            |
| 1              | randomised<br>trials |               | no serious<br>inconsistency | no serious<br>indirectness | very<br>serious <sup>1</sup> | none                    | 0/17 (0%)                        | 2/25 (8%)                                      | 5 67)                       | 374 more)   | LOW     | CRITICAL   |
|                |                      |               |                             |                            |                              |                         |                                  | 0%   |                             | 0 fewer   |         |            |

| Depression clinician   | -reported m | easures HRSD                | >7 at endpoir | nt                           |      |               |                   |                              | per 1000<br>(from 0<br>fewer to 0<br>more) |          |
|------------------------|-------------|-----------------------------|---------------|------------------------------|------|---------------|-------------------|------------------------------|--|----------|
| 1 randomised<br>trials |             | no serious<br>inconsistency |               | very<br>serious <sup>1</sup> | none | 12/17 (70.6%) | 11/25 (44%)<br>0% | RR 1.60<br>(0.94 to<br>2.75) |  | CRITICAL |

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1</sup> Single study, inconclusive effect size

### Is IPT effective compared with standard care (Netherlands) in older adults?

|                |                |                           | Quality assess   | sment                      |                              |                      |     | Sum                            | mary of f            | ndings  |         |            |
|----------------|----------------|---------------------------|------------------|----------------------------|------------------------------|----------------------|-----|--------------------------------|----------------------|---|---------|------------|
|                |                |                           | <b>,</b>         |                            |                              |                      | ١   | No. of patients                |                      | Effect  |         | Importance |
| No. of studies | Design         | Limitations               | Inconsistency    | Indirectness               | Imprecision                  | Other considerations | IPT | Standard care<br>(Netherlands) | Relative<br>(95% CI) |   | Quality | -          |
| Depressi       | on clinician-r | eported mea               | sures at 2-month | n follow-up (Be            | tter indicate                | d by lower value     | s)  |                                | •                    |   | •       |            |
| 1              |                | no serious<br>limitations |                  |                            | very<br>serious <sup>1</sup> | none                 | 69  | 74                             | -                    | SMD 0.28<br>lower (0.61<br>lower to 0.05<br>higher) | LOW     | CRITICAL   |
| Depressi       | on clinician-r | eported mea               | sures at 6-month | n follow-up (Be            | tter indicate                | d by lower value     | s)  |                                |                      |   |         |            |
| 1              |                | no serious<br>limitations |                  | no serious<br>indirectness | very<br>serious <sup>1</sup> | none                 | 69  | 74                             | -                    | SMD 0.11<br>lower (0.44<br>lower to 0.22<br>higher) | LOW     | CRITICAL   |

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1</sup> Single study, inconclusive effect size

Is IPT (2 to 3-year maintenance treatment) + antidepressants effective compared with IPT + placebo in older adults?

|                |                      |               | Quality asses | ssment                     |                           |                      |   | Summ             | nary of fin          | dings  |          |            |
|----------------|----------------------|---------------|---------------|----------------------------|---------------------------|----------------------|---|------------------|----------------------|--|----------|------------|
|                |                      |               | <b></b>       |                            |                           |                      | No. of pati   | ents             | Ef                   | ffect  |          |            |
| No. of studies | Design               | Limitations   | Inconsistency | Indirectness               | Imprecision               | Other considerations | IPT (2 to 3-<br>year<br>maintenance<br>treatment) +<br>AD |                  | Relative<br>(95% CI) | Absolute   | Quality  | Importance |
| Leaving        | study early f        | for any reaso | on            |                            |                           | '                    |   | l                |                      |  |          |            |
|                | randomised<br>trials |               |               | no serious<br>indirectness | serious <sup>1</sup>      | none                 | 5/53 (9.4%)   | 10/60<br>(16.7%) | RR 0.56<br>(0.2 to   | 73 fewer<br>per 1000<br>(from 133<br>fewer to<br>92 more)    | MODERATE | CRITICAL   |
|                |                      |               |               |                            |                           |                      |   | 0%               | 1.55)                | 0 fewer<br>per 1000<br>(from 0<br>fewer to 0<br>more)        |          |            |
| Relapse        |                      |               |               |                            |                           |                      |   |                  |                      |  |          |            |
|                | randomised<br>trials |               |               |                            | no serious<br>imprecision | none                 | 13/53 (24.5%)   | 37/60<br>(61.7%) |                      | 370 fewer<br>per 1000<br>(from 204<br>fewer to<br>469 fewer) | HIGH     | CRITICAL   |
|                |                      |               |               |                            |                           |                      |   | 0%               |                      | 0 fewer  |          |            |

|  |  |  |  |  | per 1000   |   |
|--|--|--|--|--|------------|---|
|  |  |  |  |  | (from 0    |   |
|  |  |  |  |  | fewer to 0 | • |
|  |  |  |  |  | fewer)     | İ |

Inconclusive effect size

Is IPT (2 to 3-year maintenance treatment) + antidepressants effective compared with medication clinic + placebo in older adults?

|                |                      |              | Quality asses               | ssment       |             |                      |   | Summa                             | ry of findi          | ngs  |         |            |
|----------------|----------------------|--------------|-----------------------------|--------------|-------------|----------------------|---|-----------------------------------|----------------------|--|---------|------------|
|                |                      |              | Quanty asset                | , o          |             |                      | No. of pa   | ntients                           | Ef                   | fect   |         |            |
| No. of studies | Design               | Limitations  | Inconsistency               | Indirectness | Imprecision | Other considerations | IPT (2 to 3-<br>year<br>maintenance<br>treatment) +<br>AD | Medication<br>clinic +<br>placebo | Relative<br>(95% CI) | Absolute   | Quality | Importance |
| Leaving        | study early f        | for any reas | on                          |              |             |                      |   |                                   |                      |  |         |            |
|                | randomised<br>trials |              | no serious<br>inconsistency |              |             | none                 | 3/25 (12%)  | 0/29 (0%)                         | (0.44 to             | 0 more<br>per 1000<br>(from 0<br>fewer to 0<br>more) | LOW     | CRITICAL   |
|                |                      |              |                             |              |             |                      |   | 0%                                | 149.2)               | 0 more<br>per 1000<br>(from 0<br>fewer to 0<br>more) |         |            |

| randomised no serious no serious no serious serious² none trials limitations inconsistency indirectness | 5/25 (20%) | 26/29<br>(89.7%) | RR 0.22<br>(0.1 to<br>0.49) | 699 fewer per 1000 (from 457 fewer to 807 fewer)  0 fewer per 1000 (from 0 fewer to 0 | MODERATE | CRITICAL |
|---|------------|------------------|-----------------------------|---|----------|----------|

Single study, inconclusive effect size

<sup>2</sup> Single study

Is IPT (2 to 3-year maintenance treatment) + placebo effective compared with medication clinic + placebo in older adults?

|                |                      |               | Quality asses               | ssment                     |                              |                      |  | Summai                            | y of findi                   | ngs  |          |            |
|----------------|----------------------|---------------|-----------------------------|----------------------------|------------------------------|----------------------|--|-----------------------------------|------------------------------|--|----------|------------|
|                |                      |               | <b>4,</b>                   |                            |                              |                      | No. of pa  | tients                            | Ef                           | fect   | ,        |            |
| No. of studies | Design               | Limitations   | Inconsistency               | Indirectness               | Imprecision                  | Other considerations | IPT (2 to 3-<br>year<br>maintenance<br>treatment) +<br>placebo | Medication<br>clinic +<br>placebo | Relative<br>(95% CI)         | Absolute   | Quality  | Importance |
| Leaving        | study early          | for any reaso | on                          | I                          | ı                            |                      |  |                                   |                              |  |          |            |
|                | randomised<br>trials |               | no serious<br>inconsistency | no serious<br>indirectness | very<br>serious <sup>1</sup> | none                 | 4/25 (16%)   | 0/29 (0%)                         | (0.59 to                     | 0 more<br>per 1000<br>(from 0<br>fewer to 0<br>more) | LOW      | CRITICAL   |
|                |                      |               |                             |                            |                              |                      |  | 0%                                | 183.92)                      | 0 more<br>per 1000<br>(from 0<br>fewer to 0<br>more) |          |            |
| Relapse        |                      |               |                             |                            |                              |                      |  |                                   |                              |  |          |            |
| 1              | randomised<br>trials |               | no serious<br>inconsistency | no serious<br>indirectness | serious <sup>2</sup>         | none                 | 16/25 (64%)  | 26/29<br>(89.7%)                  | RR 0.71<br>(0.52 to<br>0.98) | 260 fewer<br>per 1000<br>(from 18<br>fewer to<br>430 | MODERATE | CRITICAL   |

|  |  |  |  |    | fewer)   |  |
|--|--|--|--|----|--|--|
|  |  |  |  | 0% | 0 fewer<br>per 1000<br>(from 0<br>fewer to 0<br>fewer) |  |

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1</sup> Single study, inconclusive effect size <sup>2</sup> Single study

#### Is IPT (2 to 3-year maintenance treatment) + antidepressants effective compared with antidepressants in older adults?

|                |                      |               | Quality asses | sment                      |                              |                      |   | Summa           | ry of findi          | ngs   |         |            |
|----------------|----------------------|---------------|---------------|----------------------------|------------------------------|----------------------|---|-----------------|----------------------|---|---------|------------|
|                |                      |               | <b>4</b> ,    |                            |                              |                      | No. of patie  | ents            | E                    | ffect   |         |            |
| No. of studies | Design               | Limitations   | Inconsistency | Indirectness               | Imprecision                  | Other considerations | IPT (2 to 3-year<br>maintenance<br>treatment) +<br>AD | AD              | Relative<br>(95% CI) | Absolute  | Quality | Importance |
| Leaving        | study early f        | or any reasoi | n             | ı                          | I                            |                      |   | l               |                      |   | ı       |            |
| 1              | randomised<br>trials |               |               | no serious<br>indirectness | very<br>serious <sup>1</sup> | none                 | 3/25 (12%)  | 4/28<br>(14.3%) |                      | 23 fewer per<br>1000 (from<br>113 fewer to<br>341 more) |         | CRITICAL   |
|                |                      |               |               |                            |                              |                      |   | 0%              | 3.35)                | 0 fewer per<br>1000 (from<br>0 fewer to 0<br>more)      |         |            |

Single study, inconclusive effect size

Is IPT (2 to 3-year maintenance treatment) + antidepressant effective compared with medication clinic + antidepressants in older adults?

|                |                      |             | Quality asses | ssment                     |             |                      |   | Summary                   | of finding                   | S  |         |            |
|----------------|----------------------|-------------|---------------|----------------------------|-------------|----------------------|---|---------------------------|------------------------------|--|---------|------------|
|                |                      |             | <b></b>       |                            |             |                      | No. of pa   | tients                    | Et                           | ffect  |         |            |
| No. of studies | Design               | Limitations | Inconsistency | Indirectness               | Imprecision | Other considerations | IPT (2 to 3-<br>year<br>maintenance<br>treatment) +<br>AD | Medication<br>clinic + AD |                              | Absolute   | Quality | Importance |
| Relapse        | !<br>!               | ı           | ı             | ı                          | ı           | '                    |   | •                         |                              | ı  | 1       |            |
| 1              | randomised<br>trials |             |               | no serious<br>indirectness | ,           | none                 | 5/25 (20%)  | 12/28<br>(42.9%)          | RR 0.47<br>(0.19 to<br>1.14) | 227 fewer<br>per 1000<br>(from 347<br>fewer to 60<br>more) | LOW     | CRITICAL   |
|                |                      |             |               |                            |             |                      |   | 0%                        |                              | 0 fewer per<br>1000 (from<br>0 fewer to<br>0 more)         |         |            |

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1</sup> Single study, inconclusive effect size

## Counselling

Is counselling effective compared with GP care?

|                |                      |               | Quality asses               | sment                      |                              |                      |                 | Sur              | mmary of                     | findings   |         |            |
|----------------|----------------------|---------------|-----------------------------|----------------------------|------------------------------|----------------------|-----------------|------------------|------------------------------|--|---------|------------|
|                |                      |               | <b>47</b>                   |                            |                              |                      | No. of pa       | tients           | E                            | ffect  |         | Importance |
| No. of studies | Design               | Limitations   | Inconsistency               | Indirectness               | Imprecision                  | Other considerations | Counselling     | GP care          | Relative<br>(95% CI)         | Absolute   | Quality |            |
| Leaving        | study early (        | dropouts by 4 | I<br>4 months)              |                            |                              |                      |                 |                  |                              |  |         |            |
| 1              | randomised<br>trials |               | no serious<br>inconsistency | no serious<br>indirectness | very<br>serious <sup>1</sup> | none                 | 5/67 (7.5%)     | 5/67<br>(7.5%)   | RR 1.00<br>(0.3 to<br>3.3)   | 0 fewer per<br>1000 (from<br>52 fewer to<br>172 more)<br>0 fewer per   | LOW     | CRITICAL   |
| Leaving        | study early (        | dropouts by : | 12 months)                  |                            |                              |                      |                 | 0%               |                              | 1000 (from<br>0 fewer to 0<br>more)  |         |            |
| 1              | randomised<br>trials |               | no serious<br>inconsistency | no serious<br>indirectness | very<br>serious <sup>1</sup> | none                 | 9/67<br>(13.4%) | 10/67<br>(14.9%) | RR 0.90<br>(0.39 to<br>2.07) | 15 fewer per<br>1000 (from<br>91 fewer to<br>160 more)<br>0 fewer per<br>1000 (from<br>0 fewer to 0<br>more) | LOW     | CRITICAL   |

|        | randomised<br>trials | no serious<br>limitations | no serious<br>inconsistency | no serious<br>indirectness | serious <sup>2</sup> | none              | 67 | 67 | - | SMD 0.49<br>lower (0.83<br>to 0.15<br>lower) | MODERATE | CRITICAL |
|--------|----------------------|---------------------------|-----------------------------|----------------------------|----------------------|-------------------|----|----|---|--|----------|----------|
| epress | sion self-repo       | rted measur               | es at 12-month              | follow-up (Be              | tter indicate        | ed by lower value | s) |    | ' |  | '        |          |
|        |                      |                           |                             |                            |                      |                   |    |    |   |  |          |          |

Single study, inconclusive effect size Single study

## Is counselling effective compared with antidepressants?

|                |                      |              | Quality asses               | sment          |                              |                      |             | Sur    | nmary of f           | indings  |         |            |
|----------------|----------------------|--------------|-----------------------------|----------------|------------------------------|----------------------|-------------|--------|----------------------|--|---------|------------|
|                |                      |              |                             |                |                              |                      | No. of pat  | tients | E                    | ffect  |         | Importance |
| No. of studies | Design               | Limitations  | Inconsistency               | Indirectness   | Imprecision                  | Other considerations | Counselling | AD     | Relative<br>(95% CI) | Absolute   | Quality |            |
| Depress        | ion self-repo        | rted measure | es at endpoint (            | Better indicat | ed by lower                  | values)              |             |        |                      |  |         |            |
|                | randomised<br>trials |              | no serious<br>inconsistency |                | very<br>serious <sup>1</sup> | none                 | 39          | 44     | -                    | SMD 0.04<br>higher (0.39<br>lower to<br>0.47 higher) | LOW     | CRITICAL   |

| Relapse |                      |                           |                             |                            |                              |         |                  |                  |                              |   |          |          |
|---------|----------------------|---------------------------|-----------------------------|----------------------------|------------------------------|---------|------------------|------------------|------------------------------|---|----------|----------|
| 1       |                      | no serious<br>limitations | no serious<br>inconsistency | no serious<br>indirectness | very<br>serious <sup>1</sup> | none    | 27/52<br>(51.9%) | 22/51<br>(43.1%) | RR 1.20<br>(0.8 to           | 86 more per<br>1000 (from<br>86 fewer to<br>349 more) | LOW      | CRITICAL |
|         |                      |                           |                             |                            |                              |         |                  | 0%               | 1.81)                        | 0 more per<br>1000 (from<br>0 fewer to 0<br>more)     |          |          |
| Relapse | at 12 month          | s                         |                             |                            |                              |         |                  |                  |                              |   |          |          |
| 1       | randomised<br>trials | no serious<br>limitations | no serious<br>inconsistency | no serious<br>indirectness | serious <sup>2</sup>         | none    | 43/52<br>(82.7%) | 30/51<br>(58.8%) | RR 1.41<br>(1.08 to<br>1.83) | 0 more per<br>1000 (from<br>0 more to 0               | MODERATE | CRITICAL |
| Depress | <br>sion self-repo   | rt at 12-mon              | th follow-up (B             | etter indicate             | d by lower v                 | values) |                  |                  |                              | more)   |          |          |
| 1       | randomised<br>trials | no serious<br>limitations | no serious<br>inconsistency | no serious<br>indirectness | very<br>serious <sup>1</sup> | none    | 31               | 34               | -                            | SMD 0.17<br>higher (0.32<br>lower to<br>0.66 higher)  | LOW      | CRITICAL |

Single study, inconclusive effect size

Single study

## Is counselling effective compared with CBT?

|                |                      |                           | Quality asses               | sment           |                              |                      |                 | Sum              | mary of fin                 | idings   |         |            |
|----------------|----------------------|---------------------------|-----------------------------|-----------------|------------------------------|----------------------|-----------------|------------------|-----------------------------|--|---------|------------|
|                |                      |                           | ,                           |                 |                              |                      | No. of pa       | tients           | E                           | Effect   |         | Importance |
| No. of studies | Design               | Limitations               | Inconsistency               | Indirectness    | Imprecision                  | Other considerations | Counselling     | СВТ              | Relative<br>(95% CI)        | Absolute   | Quality |            |
| Leaving        | study early (c       | dropouts by 4             | months)                     |                 |                              |                      |                 |                  |                             |  |         |            |
|                |                      |                           |                             |                 | very<br>serious <sup>1</sup> | none                 | 5/67 (7.5%)     | 7/63<br>(11.1%)  | RR 0.67<br>(0.22 to         | 37 fewer per<br>1000 (from 87<br>fewer to 112<br>more) | ,       | CRITICAL   |
| Leaving        | study early (c       | Iropouts by 1             | 2 months)                   |                 |                              |                      |                 | 0%               | 2.01)                       | 0 fewer per<br>1000 (from 0<br>fewer to 0<br>more)     |         |            |
|                |                      |                           | -                           |                 | T                            |                      | I               |                  |                             |  |         |            |
|                | randomised<br>trials | no serious<br>limitations | no serious<br>inconsistency |                 | very<br>serious <sup>1</sup> | none                 | 9/67<br>(13.4%) | 13/63<br>(20.6%) | RR 0.65<br>(0.3 to<br>1.42) | 72 fewer per<br>1000 (from<br>144 fewer to<br>87 more) |         | CRITICAL   |
|                |                      |                           |                             |                 |                              |                      |                 | 0%               | 1.42)                       | 0 fewer per<br>1000 (from 0<br>fewer to 0<br>more)     |         |            |
| Depressi       | on self-repoi        | rted measure              | s at endpoint (B            | etter indicated | d by lower va                | alues)               |                 |                  |                             |  |         |            |
| 1              | randomised           | no serious                | no serious                  | no serious      | very                         | none                 | 67              | 63               | -                           | SMD 0.14   |         | CRITICAL   |

|         | trials               | limitations  | inconsistency   | indirectness               | serious <sup>1</sup>         |                  |    |    |   | lower (0.48<br>lower to 0.21<br>higher)              | LOW |          |
|---------|----------------------|--------------|-----------------|----------------------------|------------------------------|------------------|----|----|---|--|-----|----------|
| Depress | ion self-repo        | rted measure | s at 12-month f | ollow-up (Bett             | er indicated                 | by lower values) |    |    |   |  |     |          |
| 1       | randomised<br>trials |              |                 | no serious<br>indirectness | very<br>serious <sup>1</sup> | none             | 67 | 63 | - | SMD 0.04<br>higher (0.31<br>lower to 0.38<br>higher) | LOW | CRITICAL |

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1</sup> Single study, inconclusive effect sizes

## Is counselling + GP care effective compared with GP care?

|                |                      |             | Quality asses               | sment        |                              |                      |                          | Sumn           | nary of fine                 | dings   |         |            |
|----------------|----------------------|-------------|-----------------------------|--------------|------------------------------|----------------------|--------------------------|----------------|------------------------------|---|---------|------------|
|                |                      |             | . ,                         |              |                              |                      | No. of pat               |                |                              | ffect   |         | Importance |
| No. of studies | Design               | Limitations | Inconsistency               | Indirectness | Imprecision                  | Other considerations | Counselling<br>+ GP care | GP care        | Relative<br>(95% CI)         | Absolute  | Quality |            |
| Leaving        | study early          |             |                             |              |                              |                      |                          |                |                              |   |         |            |
| 1              | randomised<br>trials |             | no serious<br>inconsistency |              | very<br>serious <sup>1</sup> | none                 | 8/73 (11%)               | 7/72<br>(9.7%) | RR 1.13<br>(0.43 to<br>2.95) | 13 more per<br>1000 (from<br>55 fewer to<br>190 more) | LOW     | CRITICAL   |
|                |                      |             |                             |              |                              |                      |                          | 0%             | 2.53)                        | 0 more per<br>1000 (from 0<br>fewer to 0<br>more)     |         |            |

|      | randomised           | no serious                | no serious                  | no serious                 | very                         | none               |                  |                  |                              | 38 fewer per  |     |         |
|------|----------------------|---------------------------|-----------------------------|----------------------------|------------------------------|--------------------|------------------|------------------|------------------------------|---|-----|---------|
|      | trials               | limitations               | inconsistency               | indirectness               | serious <sup>1</sup>         | lione              | 44/73<br>(60.3%) | 46/72<br>(63.9%) | RR 0.94<br>(0.73 to          | 1000 (from<br>172 fewer to<br>141 more)             | LOW | CRITICA |
|      |                      |                           |                             |                            |                              |                    |                  | 0%               | 1.22)                        | 0 fewer per<br>1000 (from 0<br>fewer to 0<br>more)  |     |         |
| ores | ssion self-repo      | rted measur               | es (BDI >=14 at :           | L2 months)                 |                              |                    |                  |                  |                              |   |     |         |
|      | randomised<br>trials | no serious<br>limitations | no serious<br>inconsistency | no serious<br>indirectness | very<br>serious <sup>1</sup> | none               | 42/73<br>(57.5%) | 0%               | RR 0.80<br>(0.62 to<br>1.02) | 0 fewer per<br>1000 (from 0<br>fewer to 0<br>more)  | LOW | CRITICA |
| pres | ssion self-repo      | rted measure              | es at 6-month fo            | ollow-up (Bett             | er indicated                 | by lower values)   | '                |                  |                              |   |     |         |
|      | randomised<br>trials | no serious<br>limitations | no serious<br>inconsistency | no serious<br>indirectness | very<br>serious <sup>1</sup> | none               | 65               | 65               | -                            | MD 0.50<br>higher (2.47<br>lower to 3.47<br>higher) | LOW | CRITICA |
|      | ssion self-repo      | rted measur               | es at 12-month              | follow-up (Bet             | ter indicate                 | ed by lower values | )                |                  |                              |   |     |         |
| ores |                      | no serious                | no serious                  | no serious                 | very                         | none               |                  | T                |                              | 0.30 higher   |     |         |

Single study, inconclusive effect size

## Short-term psychodynamic psychotherapy

Is short-term psychodynamic psychotherapy effective compared with antidepressants?

|                |                      |             | Quality asses  | sment                      |                      |                      |  | Summa                  | ary of find                 | lings   |          |            |
|----------------|----------------------|-------------|----------------|----------------------------|----------------------|----------------------|--|------------------------|-----------------------------|---|----------|------------|
|                |                      |             | Quality asses  |                            |                      |                      | No. of patie                                 | nts                    | Ef                          | fect  |          | Importance |
| No. of studies | Design               | Limitations | Inconsistency  | Indirectness               | Imprecision          | Other considerations | Short-term<br>psychodynamic<br>psychotherapy | AD                     | Relative<br>(95% CI)        | Absolute  | Quality  |            |
| Leaving        | study early          | ı           | ı              |                            | ı                    |                      |  | 1                      | ı                           |   | ı        |            |
|                |                      | limitations | inconsistency  | indirectness               | serious <sup>1</sup> | none                 | 19/110 (17.3%)                               | 16/83<br>(19.3%)<br>0% | RR 0.90<br>(0.51 to<br>1.6) | 116 more)   | MODERATE | CRITICAL   |
| Depress        | sion clinician       | -reported m | easures at end | point (Better              | indicated by         | lower values)        |  |                        |                             |   |          |            |
| 1              | randomised<br>trials |             |                | no serious<br>indirectness | serious <sup>2</sup> | none                 | 59   | 44                     | -                           | SMD 0.43<br>higher<br>(0.03 to<br>0.82<br>higher) | MODERATE | CRITICAL   |

| Depres | sion clinician       | -reported m | easures mean                | change from l | paseline to e | ndpoint (Better | indicated by highe | er values | s) |  |     |          |
|--------|----------------------|-------------|-----------------------------|---------------|---------------|-----------------|--------------------|-----------|----|--|-----|----------|
| 1      | randomised<br>trials |             | no serious<br>inconsistency |               | ' '           | none            | 26                 | 25        | -  | SMD 0.03<br>higher<br>(0.52<br>lower to<br>0.58<br>higher) | LOW | CRITICAL |

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1</sup> Inconclusive effect size

### Is short-term psychodynamic psychotherapy effective compared with behaviour therapy?

|                |                      |             | Quality asse                | ssment                     |                      |                      |  | Summar               | y of findii                 | ngs  |          |            |
|----------------|----------------------|-------------|-----------------------------|----------------------------|----------------------|----------------------|--|----------------------|-----------------------------|--|----------|------------|
|                |                      |             | <b></b>                     |                            |                      |                      | No. of pati                                  | ents                 | Ef                          | fect   |          | Importance |
| No. of studies | l Design             | Limitations | Inconsistency               | Indirectness               | Imprecision          | Other considerations | Short-term<br>psychodynamic<br>psychotherapy | Behaviour<br>therapy | Relative<br>(95% CI)        | Absolute   | Quality  |            |
| Leaving        | study early          |             | ı                           |                            |                      |                      |  |                      |                             |  |          |            |
| 1              | randomised<br>trials |             | no serious<br>inconsistency | no serious<br>indirectness | serious <sup>1</sup> | none                 | 14/51 (27.5%)                                | 4/44<br>(9.1%)       | RR 3.02<br>(1.07 to<br>8.5) | 184 more<br>per 1000<br>(from 6<br>more to<br>682<br>more)<br>0 more<br>per 1000 | MODERATE | CRITICAL   |

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>2</sup> Single study
<sup>3</sup> Single study, inconclusive effect size

|  |  |  |  |  | (from 0   |  |
|--|--|--|--|--|-----------|--|
|  |  |  |  |  | more to 0 |  |
|  |  |  |  |  | more)     |  |

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1</sup> Single study

## Is short-term psychodynamic psychotherapy effective compared with CBT?

|                |   |                           | Quality asses   | sment                      |                              |                      |  | Summar | y of findin                  | gs  |         |            |
|----------------|---|---------------------------|-----------------|----------------------------|------------------------------|----------------------|--|--------|------------------------------|---|---------|------------|
|                |   |                           |                 |                            |                              |                      | No. of patier                                | nts    | E <sup>.</sup>               | ffect   |         | Importance |
| No. of studies | Design  | Limitations               | Inconsistency   | Indirectness               | Imprecision                  | Other considerations | Short-term<br>psychodynamic<br>psychotherapy | СВТ    | Relative<br>(95% CI)         | Absolute  | Quality |            |
| Leaving        | study early   |                           | l               | ı                          | ı                            | '                    |  |        |                              |   | 1       |            |
|                | randomised<br>trials  | no serious<br>limitations |                 |                            | very<br>serious <sup>1</sup> | none                 | 9/30 (30%)                                   | 0%     | RR 2.16<br>(0.81 to<br>5.76) | 0 more per<br>1000 (from<br>0 fewer to 0<br>more)   |         | CRITICAL   |
| Depress        | sion self-repo  | rted measur               | res at endpoint | (Better indica             | ted by lower                 | values)              |  |        | '                            |   | ļ       |            |
| 1              | randomised<br>trials  | no serious<br>limitations |                 | no serious<br>indirectness | ,                            | none                 | 28   | 29     | _                            | SMD 0.35<br>higher (0.61<br>lower to 1.3<br>higher) | I VERY  | CRITICAL   |
| Depress        | Depression self-reported measures at 6-month follow-up (Better indicated by lower values) |                           |                 |                            |                              |                      |  |        |                              |   |         |            |
|                | randomised<br>trials  | no serious<br>limitations |                 |                            | very<br>serious <sup>1</sup> | none                 | 26   | 30     | -                            | SMD 0.13<br>higher (0.4<br>lower to                 | LOW     | CRITICAL   |

|      |                      |                           |                             |                            |                              |                  |               |                  |                              | 0.67 higher)  |             |         |
|------|----------------------|---------------------------|-----------------------------|----------------------------|------------------------------|------------------|---------------|------------------|------------------------------|---|-------------|---------|
| pre  | ssion self-repo      | orted measur              | es at 1-year fol            | low-up (Bette              | r indicated b                | by lower values) |               |                  |                              |   |             |         |
|      | randomised<br>trials | no serious<br>limitations | serious                     | no serious<br>indirectness | very<br>serious <sup>1</sup> | none             | 25            | 25               | -                            | SMD 0.22<br>lower (1.22<br>lower to<br>0.79 higher) | VERY<br>LOW | CRITICA |
| ll m | eeting RDC cri       | teria for dep             | ression at endp             | oint                       |                              |                  |               |                  |                              |   |             |         |
|      | randomised<br>trials | no serious<br>limitations | no serious<br>inconsistency | no serious<br>indirectness | very<br>serious <sup>1</sup> | none             | 17/30 (56.7%) | 12/36<br>(33.3%) | RR 1.70<br>(0.97 to<br>2.97) |   | LOW         | CRITIC/ |
| ll m | eeting RDC cri       | teria for dep             | ression at 3-mo             | nth follow-up              | •                            |                  |               |                  |                              |   |             |         |
|      | randomised<br>trials |                           | no serious<br>inconsistency | no serious<br>indirectness | very<br>serious <sup>1</sup> | none             | 19/30 (63.3%) | 17/36<br>(47.2%) | RR 1.34<br>(0.86 to<br>2.08) |   | LOW         | CRITICA |
|      |                      |                           |                             |                            |                              |                  |               | 0%               |                              | 0 more per<br>1000 (from<br>0 fewer to 0<br>more)   |             |         |

Single study, inconclusive effect size <sup>2</sup> Heterogeneity >50%

# Is short-term psychodynamic psychotherapy + antidepressants effective compared with supportive therapy + antidepressants?

|                |                      |             | Quality asses               | ssment                     |                              |                         |  | Summary o                     | of findings                  |  |         |            |
|----------------|----------------------|-------------|-----------------------------|----------------------------|------------------------------|-------------------------|--|-------------------------------|------------------------------|--|---------|------------|
|                |                      |             | Z,                          |                            |                              |                         | No. of pati  | ents                          | Ef                           | fect   |         |            |
| No. of studies | Design               | Limitations | Inconsistency               | Indirectness               | Imprecision                  | Other<br>considerations | Short-term<br>psychodynamic<br>psychotherapy +<br>AD | Supportive<br>therapy +<br>AD | Relative<br>(95% CI)         | Absolute   | Quality | Importance |
| Leaving        | study early          |             |                             |                            |                              |                         |  |                               | •                            |  | •       |            |
|                | randomised<br>trials |             |                             | no serious<br>indirectness | very<br>serious <sup>1</sup> | none                    | 14/47 (29.8%)  | 10/48<br>(20.8%)              | RR 1.43<br>(0.71 to<br>2.89) | 90 more per 1000 (from 60 fewer to 394 more)  0 more per 1000 (from 0 fewer to 0 more) | LOW     | CRITICAL   |
| Non-rer        | mitters              |             |                             |                            |                              |                         |  |                               |                              | , more,  |         |            |
|                | randomised<br>trials |             | no serious<br>inconsistency | no serious<br>indirectness | very<br>serious <sup>1</sup> | none                    | 31/47 (66%)  | 29/48<br>(60.4%)              | RR 1.09<br>(0.8 to<br>1.48)  | 54 more<br>per 1000<br>(from 121<br>fewer to<br>290 more)<br>0 more per                | LOW     | CRITICAL   |

|         |                      |            |                             |               |              |               |    |    |   | 1000<br>(from 0<br>fewer to 0<br>more)             |     |          |
|---------|----------------------|------------|-----------------------------|---------------|--------------|---------------|----|----|---|--|-----|----------|
| Depress | sion clinician-      | reported m | easures at end              | point (Better | indicated by | lower values) |    |    |   |  |     |          |
|         | randomised<br>trials |            | no serious<br>inconsistency |               | · .          | none          | 35 | 39 | - | 0.80 lower<br>(4.06<br>lower to<br>2.46<br>higher) | LOW | CRITICAL |

Single study, inconclusive effect size

# Is short-term psychodynamic psychotherapy effective compared with short-term psychodynamic psychotherapy + antidepressants?

|                |                      |             | Quality assess              | sment         |             |                      | Summary of findings   |     |                      |                             |         |            |  |
|----------------|----------------------|-------------|-----------------------------|---------------|-------------|----------------------|-----------------------|-----|----------------------|-----------------------------|---------|------------|--|
|                |                      |             | <b>,</b>                    |               |             |                      | No. of                |     |                      |                             |         |            |  |
| No. of studies | I Design             | Limitations | Inconsistency               | Indirectness  | Imprecision | Other considerations | nsychodynamic I ' ' ' |     | Relative<br>(95% CI) | Absolute                    | Quality | Importance |  |
| Depres         | sion clinician       | -reported r | neasures at en              | dpoint (Bette | r indicated | by lower value       | es)                   |     | 1                    | '                           |         |            |  |
|                | randomised<br>trials |             | no serious<br>inconsistency |               |             | none                 |                       |     |                      | SMD 0.04<br>higher<br>(0.23 |         |            |  |
|                |                      |             |                             |               |             |                      | 107                   | 101 | -                    | lower to<br>0.32<br>higher) | LOW     | CRITICAL   |  |

| Leavin | g study early        |                             |  |      |              |    |                              |  |          |          |
|--------|----------------------|-----------------------------|--|------|--------------|----|------------------------------|--|----------|----------|
| 1      | randomised<br>trials | no serious<br>inconsistency |  | none | 1/107 (0.9%) |    | RR 0.06<br>(0.01 to<br>0.44) | 149 fewer<br>per 1000<br>(from 89<br>fewer to<br>157<br>fewer) | MODERATE | CRITICAL |
|        |                      |                             |  |      |              | 0% | ·                            | 0 fewer<br>per 1000<br>(from 0<br>fewer to 0<br>fewer)         |          |          |

Single study, inconclusive effect size Single study

### Is short-term psychodynamic psychotherapy effective compared with waitlist control?

|                |                      |             | Quality asses   | ssment                     |                      |                      |  |                          |                         |                                       |          |          |
|----------------|----------------------|-------------|-----------------|----------------------------|----------------------|----------------------|--|--------------------------|-------------------------|---------------------------------------|----------|----------|
|                |                      |             |                 |                            |                      | No. of patie         |  | Importance               |                         |                                       |          |          |
| No. of studies | Design               | Limitations | Inconsistency   | Indirectness               | Imprecision          | Other considerations | Short-term<br>psychodynamic<br>psychotherapy | Wait-<br>list<br>control | Relative<br>(95%<br>CI) | Absolute                              | Quality  | ·        |
| Depress        | sion clinician       | reported me | easures at endp | point (Better i            | ndicated by          | lower values)        |  |                          |                         | •                                     | ·        |          |
|                | randomised<br>trials |             |                 | no serious<br>indirectness | serious <sup>1</sup> | none                 | 10   | 10                       | -                       | SMD 1.09<br>lower<br>(2.04 to<br>0.13 | MODERATE | CRITICAL |

|  |  |  |  |  | lower) |  |
|--|--|--|--|--|--------|--|
|  |  |  |  |  |        |  |

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1</sup> Single study

#### Is short-term psychodynamic psychotherapy effective compared with supportive therapy?

|                |                      |                           | Quality asses   | ssment                     |                      |                      |               | Summary               | of findir               | ngs   |          |          |
|----------------|----------------------|---------------------------|-----------------|----------------------------|----------------------|----------------------|---------------|-----------------------|-------------------------|---|----------|----------|
|                |                      |                           | <b>X</b> ,      |                            |                      |                      | No. of pat    | ·                     | Importance              |   |          |          |
| No. of studies | Design               | Limitations               | Inconsistency   | Indirectness               | Imprecision          | Other considerations | psychodynamic | Supportive<br>therapy | Relative<br>(95%<br>CI) | Absolute  | Quality  |          |
| Depres         | i<br>sion clinician  | -reported m               | neasures at end | lpoint (Better             | indicated by         | y lower values)      | •             |                       |                         |   |          |          |
| 1              | randomised<br>trials | no serious<br>limitations |                 | no serious<br>indirectness | serious <sup>1</sup> | none                 | 10            | 10                    | -                       | SMD 0.97<br>lower<br>(1.91 to<br>0.03<br>lower) | MODERATE | CRITICAL |

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1</sup> Single study

## $Are \ antidepressants \ effective \ compared \ with \ short-term \ psychodynamic \ psychotherapy + antidepressants?$

|                |                      |                           | Quality asses               | sment                      |                              |                         | Sumi | mary of f  | ndings                  |  |          |            |
|----------------|----------------------|---------------------------|-----------------------------|----------------------------|------------------------------|-------------------------|------|--|-------------------------|--|----------|------------|
|                |                      |                           | <b>4,</b>                   |                            |                              |                         |      | No. of patients                                      | E                       | ffect  |          |            |
| No. of studies | Design               | Limitations               | Inconsistency               | Indirectness               | Imprecision                  | Other<br>considerations | AD   | Short-term<br>psychodynamic<br>psychotherapy +<br>AD | Relative<br>(95%<br>CI) | Absolute   | Quality  | Importance |
| Depress        | ion clinician-       | reported me               | asures at 24 we             | eeks (Better in            | dicated by lo                | wer values)             |      |  |                         |  | l        |            |
|                | randomised<br>trials | no serious<br>limitations | very serious <sup>1</sup>   |                            | very<br>serious <sup>2</sup> | none                    | 56   | 72   | -                       | SMD 0.16<br>higher (2.44<br>lower to<br>2.76 higher) | VERY LOW | CRITICAL   |
| Depress        | ion clinician-       | reported me               | asures at 24-m              | onth follow-u              | p (Better ind                | icated by lower         | valu | es)  |                         |  |          |            |
|                | randomised<br>trials |                           | no serious<br>inconsistency | no serious<br>indirectness | serious <sup>3</sup>         | none                    | 49   | 40   | -                       | SMD 0.52<br>higher (0.1<br>to 0.95<br>higher)        | MODERATE | CRITICAL   |
| Depress        | ion clinician-       | reported me               | asures at 48 mo             | onths (Better i            | ndicated by                  | lower values)           |      |  |                         |  |          |            |
|                | randomised<br>trials |                           | no serious<br>inconsistency | no serious<br>indirectness | serious <sup>3</sup>         | none                    | 49   | 40   | -                       | SMD 0.59<br>higher (0.16<br>to 1.01<br>higher)       | MODERATE | CRITICAL   |

## Rational emotive behaviour therapy

Is rational emotive behaviour therapy (REBT) effective compared with antidepressants?

|                |                      |                           |                    |                            |                              |                      |                 |    | Summary                      | of findings                                       |         |            |
|----------------|----------------------|---------------------------|--------------------|----------------------------|------------------------------|----------------------|-----------------|----|------------------------------|---|---------|------------|
|                |                      |                           | Quality assess     | ment                       |                              |                      | No. of patients |    |                              | Effect  | Quality | Importance |
| No. of studies | Design               | Limitations               | Inconsistency      | Indirectness               | Imprecision                  | Other considerations | REBT            | AD | Relative<br>(95% CI)         | Absolute  |         |            |
| Depressi       | on scores: cor       | tinuous meas              | ures (self-report) | (Better indicat            | ed by lower                  | values)              | •               |    |                              |   |         |            |
| 1              | randomised<br>trials | no serious<br>limitations |                    | no serious<br>indirectness | very<br>serious <sup>1</sup> | none                 | 57              | 57 | -                            | SMD 0.07 lower<br>(0.44 lower to<br>0.29 higher)  | LOW     | CRITICAL   |
| Depressi       | on scores: cor       | ntinuous meas             | ures (clinician-ra | ted) (Better ind           | icated by lov                | ver values)          |                 |    |                              |   |         |            |
| 1              | randomised<br>trials | no serious<br>limitations |                    | no serious<br>indirectness | very<br>serious <sup>1</sup> | none                 | 57              | 57 | -                            | SMD 0.00 higher<br>(0.37 lower to<br>0.37 higher) | LOW     | CRITICAL   |
| Relapse a      | at 6-month fo        | llow-up (follow           | w-up mean 6 mor    | nths)                      |                              |                      |                 |    |                              |   |         |            |
| 1              | randomised<br>trials | no serious<br>limitations |                    | no serious<br>indirectness | very<br>serious <sup>1</sup> | none                 | 1/48<br>(2.1%)  | 0% | RR 0.20<br>(0.02 to<br>1.61) | 0 fewer per 1000<br>(from 0 fewer to<br>0 more)   | LOW     | CRITICAL   |

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>1</sup> Heterogeneity >80%

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>2</sup> Single study, inconclusive effect size

<sup>&</sup>lt;sup>3</sup> Single study

| Leaving | study early          |  |                              |      |                |    |   |          |
|---------|----------------------|--|------------------------------|------|----------------|----|---|----------|
| 1       | randomised<br>trials |  | very<br>serious <sup>1</sup> | none | 5/57<br>(8.8%) | 0% | 0 fewer per 1000<br>(from 0 fewer to<br>0 more) | CRITICAL |

Single study; inconclusive effect size