

**Public Health Interventions Advisory Committee (PHIAC)**

**PHIAC 25: Minutes of meeting 9<sup>th</sup> May, 2008**

**Preventing the uptake of smoking by children: mass media and point-of-sale interventions**

<p><b>Attendees</b></p>	<p><b>Members</b>                  Catherine Law, Andrew Hopkin, Jane Putsey, Muriel James, Tracey Sach, Dale Robinson, Matt Kearney, Mike Owen, Alasdair Hogarth, David McDaid, Ann Hoskins, Joanna Cooke, Simon Capewell, David Sloan, Dagmar Zeuner, Mike Rayner, Klim McPherson</p> <p><b>NICE</b>                  Mike Kelly (MK), Simon Ellis (SE), Emma Stewart (ES), Patricia Mountain (PM), Linda Sheppard (LS), Bhash Naidoo (BN)</p> <p><b>Observers</b>                  Mandy Harling (Implementation)                  Sue Jelley (Editing)                  Alison Lake (Editing)</p> <p><b>Contractors</b>                  Nigel Jackson (Dr Foster Intelligence Ltd)</p> <p><b>Training for meetings in public additional attendees:</b>                  Peter Hobday (trainer)                  Alana Miller (NICE, corporate office)                  Reetan Patel (NICE, corporate office)                  Sarita Tamber (NICE, communications)                  Alix Johnson (NICE, PPIP)                  Bucky Gibson (NICE, corporate office)                  Tonya Gillis (NICE, communications)                  Jane Cowl (NICE, PPIP)                  Dr Mark Chakravarty (member of the technology appraisals committee)</p>
<p><b>Author</b></p>	<p>Emma Stewart</p>
<p><b>File Ref</b></p>	<p>\\NICE\Data\CPHE\Centre\PHIAC\Meetings\2008\PHIAC 25 meeting 09.05.08\Minutes\PHIAC Draft Minutes of PHIAC 25 ES.doc</p>
<p><b>Version</b></p>	<p>1</p>
<p><b>Audience</b></p>	<p>Members of PHIAC; Public</p>

Agenda Item	Minutes	Action
<p><b>1. Welcome and introductions (Chair)</b></p> <p><b>2. Apologies (All)</b></p>	<p>The Chair welcomed members to the twenty fifth PHIAC meeting. The meeting was declared quorate.</p> <p>Apologies were received from: Mike Bury, Philip Cutler, Susan Michie, Richard Cookson, Valerie King, KK Cheng, John Barker, Sue Atkinson, Sharon McAteer, Brian Ferguson, Joyce Rothschild, Ruth Hall, Mark Sculpher, Amanda Hoey</p>	
<p><b>3. Declaration of Interest (All)</b></p>	<p>Declarations of interest in relation to smoking and children were asked for.</p> <p>The following were declared:</p> <p><i>PHIAC members:</i></p> <p>Matt Kearney –took part in a panel discussion which will appear in ‘Guidelines in Practice’ and has received an honorarium for this, funded by an education grant from Smith Klein and Beecham - <i>personal pecuniary interest.</i></p> <p>Jo Cooke – potential research interest and also works for ScHARR (research unit at Sheffield University) who have recently signed a contract with NICE as one of two collaborating centres who will be undertaking evidence reviews in the future –<i>non-personal pecuniary interest.</i></p> <p>Simon Capewell – Is Director of Research for the Heart of Mersey – <i>personal non-pecuniary</i></p> <p>Mike Rayner – Is a Trustee of the National Heart Forum <i>personal non-pecuniary</i></p> <p>Klim McPherson – Is the Chair of the National Heart Forum – <i>personal non-pecuniary</i></p> <p><i>Co-optee/ Expert:</i></p> <p>Nigel Jackson - Dr Foster are involved in a number of research and mass media campaigns relating to this topic - <i>non-personal pecuniary interest.</i></p> <p>Service Payment:</p> <p><i>PHIAC member</i></p> <p><i>None were declared</i></p> <p>Research:</p> <p><i>PHIAC members:</i></p> <p>Catherine Law - <i>Potential non-personal pecuniary</i></p> <p><i>NICE staff:</i></p> <p>Alastair Fischer - <i>Potential non-personal pecuniary</i></p> <p>It was agreed that the above declarations would not prevent participants from taking part in the meeting.</p>	
<p><b>4. Smoking and Children (All)</b></p>	<p>The Chair introduced the main business of the day – to revise the draft guidance on <i>Mass media and point-of-sale interventions to prevent the uptake of smoking by children</i></p>	

	<p><i>and young people.</i></p> <p>Simon Ellis, Associate Director at NICE, updated the committee on progress made on the actions from the January 2008 meeting on this topic. This included further economic analyses.</p> <p>The committee thought that it would be useful to request information (for example marketing data) from manufacturers and commercial companies. However, this data was not critical for this guidance. <b>The committee agreed that NICE should consider at a strategic level how best to approach commercial companies for this kind of information.</b></p> <p>Patti White, analyst at NICE, updated the committee on progress with the Scottish Action Plan.</p> <p>Mike Kelly updated the committee on an interim response from the NICE Liaison Team at Department of Health in relation to the legislative suggestions arising from the January meeting of PHIAC on smoking and children. <b>A formal response is expected shortly and will be reported at a future meeting.</b></p> <p>The committee discussed general issues arising relating to legislation and regulation. It was agreed that a general process is needed. This will be developed within NICE and discussed at a future PHIAC meeting.</p> <p><b>The Chair summarised the discussion as follows:</b></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• A general process needs to be developed building on the current approach.</li> <li>• The guidance will be developed in the normal way based on the best evidence available.</li> </ul> <p>Lesley Owen, analyst at NICE and technical lead for this guidance, presented a summary of the stakeholder comments.</p> <p>Nigel Jackson from Dr Foster Intelligence Ltd presented an overview of the fieldwork responses.</p> <p>Mike Kelly updated the committee on the current status of topic suggestions relating to this guidance and suggested by the committee for referral to the topic selection panel.</p>	<p><b>MK</b></p> <p><b>MK</b></p> <p>MK/NICE</p> <p><b>PHIAC/ NICE</b></p> <p><b>PHIAC/ NICE</b></p>
<p><b>5. Smoking and Children (all)</b></p>	<p>Simon Ellis highlighted some of the equality and diversity issues to consider when revising the guidance.</p> <p>The committee suggested a topic referral on tobacco related products that are not smoked (to include Bangladeshi women chewing tobacco and snus which may be legalised within the EU). <b>This should be referred to the topic selection panel.</b></p> <p>The committee discussed the equality and diversity issues relating to this guidance. It was agreed that this should include consideration of the socio-economic groups (which is</p>	<p><b>MK/ NICE</b></p>

	<p>additional to the equality legislation).</p> <p>It was agreed that the guidance would be taken forward with consideration of the discussions around equality and also the issues highlighted by the committee.</p>	
<p><b>6. Smoking and Children</b></p>	<p>The committee discussed revisions to the draft guidance. :</p> <p><b>Summary by the chair:</b></p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• The committee agreed that stakeholders generally supported the draft guidance.</li> <li>• It was agreed that it should be set in the wider context of tobacco control but with focus on prevention of uptake in smoking in children as per the scope rather than expand to include more on smoking cessation.</li> <li>• The committee discussed mass media campaigns and agreed that a range of emotional responses may be useful.</li> <li>• The mass media recommendation should highlight the importance of involving young people in developing campaigns.</li> <li>• The current evidence suggests that television advertising is important, but in the future new media may present more opportunities and so needs further investigation.</li> <li>• Point of sale recommendation – the committee felt it was important to strengthen the notion of enforcement. Some suggestions of how to do this have been made by the committee, but NICE team should ensure these are evidence based.</li> <li>• PHIAC had not been advised of direct scientific evidence to support positive over negative licensing for tobacco sales or for banning vending machines. These issues should be included in the considerations section, noting the logical case that can be made despite the lack of direct evidence..</li> <li>• Recommendation 2 should add 'local Government' as key people who can help to enforce this.</li> <li>• Training for retailers should be added to recommendation 3.</li> <li>• The areas for possible legislation arising from the January meeting should be added to the considerations section</li> </ul> <p>It was agreed that the NICE team would redraft the guidance in line with the above and circulate to the committee for comment.</p>	<p><b>NICE team</b></p>
<p><b>7. Smoking and Children – research recommendations</b></p>	<p>A number of suggested research recommendations were considered by the committee. The committee agreed which should be prioritised in order to further the guidance in the future.</p>	<p><b>NICE team</b></p>
<p><b>8. Next steps in guidance (Chair)</b></p>	<p>The guidance will be revised in line with today's discussions and then re-circulated to PHIAC on Tuesday 20<sup>th</sup> May for comment by Thursday 29<sup>th</sup> May.</p>	

	The final guidance is due to be published on 23 <sup>rd</sup> July 2008.	
<b>9. Minutes of PHIAC 24</b>	The minutes were agreed with no changes.	
<b>10. Training for meetings in public</b>	<p>A number of additional people joined the meeting for training for meetings in public. Please see the list of attendees at the beginning of the minutes.</p> <p>Mike Kelly introduced the background to having meetings in public.</p> <p>Alana Miller from the Corporate Office at NICE then outlined the logistics of meeting in public and answered any questions relating to this subject. The following was agreed:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• The issue of recording the meeting needs further consideration.</li> <li>• Legal advice regarding personal liability is to be circulated to PHIAC before July.</li> <li>• The management of parts one and two at PHIAC needs further consideration and should be considered separately to processes for technology appraisals, which have different though related issues to consider.</li> <li>• Market sensitivity and policy sensitivity should also be reconsidered.</li> <li>• It may be useful for paper copies of the scope to be made available to members of the public.</li> </ul> <p><b>The above will be taken back to the NICE board meeting in May for further consideration.</b></p> <p>Peter Hobday highlighted some key considerations that committee members should take into account when presenting or attending a meeting in public.</p> <p>Sarita Tamber from Communications at NICE discussed the communications strategy for meetings in public.</p> <p>The committee were then given an opportunity to ask any questions to the presenters.</p>	
<b>11. Topic proposals (MK)</b>	<p>The following topics were suggested by the committee to be referred to the topic consideration panel:</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Portrayal of smoking in films.</li> <li>• Preventing the uptake of smokeless tobacco (as referred to in the minutes above.)</li> <li>• The overlap between smoking and cannabis in young people.</li> <li>• The link between debt and health issues.</li> </ul>	<b>MK/ NICE</b>
<b>12. AOB (Chair)</b>	<ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• Jane Putsey, one of the lay members of the committee, will be taking a break from the committee for 6 months. Given the short period no new lay member will be recruited.</li> <li>• MK updated the committee about giving evidence at the</li> </ul>	

	<p>Health Select Committee on health inequalities. The meeting took place on 30<sup>th</sup> April. This can be viewed on the Health Select Committee website.</p> <ul style="list-style-type: none"> <li>• CL asked the committee whether they had any suggestions of networks to advertise for a new statistician to the committee. <b>Committee members should email ES and MK with any suggestions.</b></li> <li>• Equalities monitoring form – a request was made for these forms to be completed by committee members.</li> <li>• Older People and Mental Wellbeing – MK updated the committee about the provisional revised timeline for the guidance. This will include a discussion at the next PHIAC meeting in June.</li> <li>• The chair referred the committee to the list of upcoming PHIAC actions. <b>ES to change the colour scheme so it is easier to read.</b></li> <li>• <b>The committee were informed that ES will send them an updated list for PHIAC topics</b> so that committee members can sign up to be PHIAC reps over the next year.</li> </ul>	<p><b>PHIAC</b></p> <p><b>ES</b></p> <p><b>ES</b></p>
<p><b>13. Close</b></p>	<p>The meeting closed at 4.15pm</p>	