

British Cardiovascular Industry Association

c/o BCOS Ltd., P O Box 20710, London E3 5UE Email: <u>BCIA@Boos.demon.co.uk</u> www: bcis.uk.com

Mr Andrew Dillon CBE, Chief Executive, The National Institute for Health and Clinical Excellence, MidCity Place,

71 H**igh Holborn,** London WC1V 6NA.

07 April 2006.

Dear Mr Dillon,

NICETAR 04/42 - Addendum to version 03 - Industry Concerns

We have received the above document and write to express our surprise and disappointment at both the tone and content of this addendum.

The revision by the Liverpool Review Group fails to address all of the areas that it was requested to do so by NICE after the committee meeting on 1 February. The methodological flaws in the LRG approach were comprehensively identified at the time of their first report and they have based their argumentation in this latest report principally on the same data source used in the original. Where published evidence contradicts their hypothesis they have either ignored it or discounted it, using calculations to justify this that are far from transparent.

The original NICE guidance of September 2003 relating to DES was a balanced assessment that allowed for the sustainable uptake of this beneficial technology and made a contribution to the achievement of the revascularisation targets of the National Service Framework on Coronary Heart Disease. The broad recommendations of this guidance have been influential in healthcare systems across the world, and have been substantiated by subsequent clinical trials and registries that have shown the sustained benefit of the use of DES in identified high-risk groups, from both a patient and economic perspective.

We urge you to take a direct interest in this process and seek reassurance that this review is being conducted in an objective and equitable way. It would be a profound shame if the benefits of this clinically-proven technology were to be diluted or even lost due to a flawed and potentially biased analysis.

We would welcome your views relating to these concerns and would be delighted to meet up with you to discuss these further.

Yours sincerely, Pp Beverley Charters, on behalf of British Cardiovascular Industry Association

List of BCIA Members

| Abbest Vascular Devices UK Sales Manager. ACIST Europe BV Country Manager, UK Apex Medical Devices Ltd Managing Director Biotromik UK Ltd Manager Vascular Intervention Biotromik UK Ltd Manager Vascular Intervention Bristol-Myers Squibb UK Marketing Manager - Interventional Cardiology Bristol-Myers Squibb Senior Product Manager, Europe - Medical Imaging Manager Cardiologic Ltd Manager Ditacocope Medical Co Ltd Manager, Vascular Intervention Manager Eli Lilly Healthcare Development Manager, UK Cuidant Ltd Marketing Manager Intervention UK Sales Manager Idato Marketing Manager Cardiologic Ltd Marketing Manager Cardiologic Ltd Marketing Manager Cardiologic Ltd UK Sales Manager | | | |
|---|---------------------------|---|----------------------------------|
| ACIST Europe BV Managing Director Biotronik UK Ldd Managing Director Biotronik UK Ldd Manager Vascular Intervention Biotronik UK Ldd Marketing Manager - Interventional Cardiology Pharmacetticals Ldd Managing Bristol-Myers Squibb Senior Product Manager Cardiologic Ldd Businesa Development Manager Cordis (A Johnson & Johnson & Johnson & Cardiologic Ldd Businesa Development Manager Cordis (A Johnson & Data Marketing Manager Sales Manager Datascope Medical Co Ldd UK Sales Manager Cardional Itid UK Country Manager, Vascular Intervention Interventional Itid UK Country Manager, Vascular Intervention Interventional Itid Managing Director Kivinsed Ltd. Manager Kivinsed Ltd. Marketing Manager Medoon UK General Manager Medoon UK Gales & Marketing, Aggnetat Sales & Marketing, UK Marketing Nyoomaed UK Lid Manager | Abbott Vaccular Devices | | UK Sales Maringer |
| Apex Medical Devices Idd Managing Director Biotronik UK Idd Manager Vascular Intervention Biotronik UK Idd Manager Vascular Intervention Bristol-Myers Squibb Interventional Cardiology Pharmaceuticals Idd Manager Bristol-Myers Squibb Senior Product Manager, Europe . Medical Imaging Business Development Manager Cardiologic Idd Business Development Manager Cardiologic Idd Business Development Manager Cordis (A Johnson & Group Marketing Manager Johnson Oceanpany), UK Sales Manager Datascope Medical Co Idd National Therapeutic Advisor Eli Illy UK Country Manager, Vascular Intervention Cardis (A Johnson & UK Country Manager, Vascular Intervention InterMedical Manager Eli Illy Healthcare Development Manager, UK Guidant Idd Manager InterMedical Manager Kimal Scientific Products Marketing Manager Idd Manager Medronic Sales & Marketing, Aggrastat Medical Inc Sales & Marketing, UK & Nyooused UK Idd Marketing, Director </td <td>ACIST Europe BV</td> <td></td> <td>Country Manager, Ch</td> | ACIST Europe BV | | Country Manager, Ch |
| Apex Madical Devices Lid Manager Vacuular Intervention Biotronik UK Lid Manager Vacuular Intervention Boston Scientific Interventional Cardiovascular Medical Education Bristol-Myers Squilbb Manager Parmaceuticale Lid Manager Bristol-Myers Squilbb Senior Product Manager Medical Imaging Business Development Manager Cardiologic Lid Business Development Manager Cordis (A Johnson & Johnson & Johnson & Sales Director Sales Director Cardiologic Lid Sales Director Cardiologic Lid Manager Cordis (A Johnson & Johnson & Johnson & Johnson Company), UK Sales Manager Datascope Medical Co Lid Weisenal Therapeutic Advisor Eli Lilly Healthcare Development Manager, UK Gaiant Lid Weisenal Intervention Manager Intervention Manager Kivinaed Lid Manager Kivinaed Lid General Manager Kivinaed Lid General Manager Kivinaed Lid General Manager Medical Inc Marketing Manager, UK & Ireland Myoomed UK Lid Marketing, Aggrastat <td></td> <td></td> <td>Meneging Director</td> | | | Meneging Director |
| Biotronik UK Ltd With Marketing Manager - Interventional Cardiology Boston Scientific Cardiovascular Medical Education Pharmaceutical Ltd Manager Bristol-Myers Squibb Manager Cardiologic Ltd Business Development Manager Cordis (A Johnson & UK Sales Manager Johnson Company), UK Sales Manager Detsacope Medical Co Ltd National Therapeutic Advisor Eli Lilly UK Country Manager, Vascular Intervention UK Country Manager Intervention Managing Director Kimal Scientific Products Marketing Manager Ltd. Ceneral Manager Medical Inc General Manager Medical Inc Sales & Marketing, Aggrastat NMT Medical Inc Sales & Marketing, UK | Apex Medical Devices Ltd | | Manager Vecular Intervention |
| Boston Scientific UK Partasting Cardiology Bristol-Myers Squibb Cardiovascular Medical Education Bristol-Myers Squibb Senior Product Manager, Europe , Medical Inaging Business Development Manager Cardiologic Ltd Business Development Manager Cordis (A Johnson & Group Marketing Manager Johnson Company), UK Sales Manager Datascope Medical Co Ltd National Therapeutic Advisor Eli Lilly UK Country Manager, Vascular Intervention Manager Intervention Manager Intervention Manager Intervention Manager Kimal Scientific Products Marketing Manager Kiwimed Ltd. General Manager Medical Inc Marketing Manager Kiwimed Ltd. General Manager Meditonic Inc Marketing, Aggrustat Mediton UK Managing Director Merck Sharp & Dohme Sales & Marketing, Aggrustat Merck Sharp & Dohme Sales & Marketing, UK Nycomed UK Ltd Manager Presade Marketing Idd Manager Presade Machical Systems Senior Prod | Biotronik UK Ltd | | Windows Wing Manager - |
| Corporation Interventional Education Bristol-Myers Squibb Cardiovascular Medical Education Manager Senior Product Manager, Europe . Medical Imaging Senior Product Manager. Cardiovascular Medical Education Senior Product Manager. Cardiovascular Medical Education Senior Product Manager. Cardiologic Ltd Sales Director Cordis (A Johnson & Group Marketing Manager Johnson Company). UK Sales Manager Datascope Medical Co Ltd Mational Therapeutic Advisor El Lilly National Therapeutic Advisor El Lilly Healthcare Development Manager, UK Guidant Ltd Managing Director InterMedical Managing Director Kivrimed Ltd. General Manager Medicon UK Marketing, Director Mericking Lidd Manager | Boston Scientific | | UK Neurastional Cardiology |
| Bristol-Myers Squibb Carcinovascutical Idd Pristol-Myers Squibb Senior Product Manager. Bristol-Myers Squibb Senior Product Manager. Cardinal Intealth Ltd. Business Development Manager Cardinal Intealth Ltd. Business Development Manager Cardinal Intealth Ltd. Business Development Manager Cordis (A Johnson & Group Marketing Manager Johnson Company), UK Sales Manager Datascope Medical Co Ltd Matager Illly UK Country Manager, Vascular Intervention Guidant Ltd Marketing Manager InterMedical Marketing Manager Kiwimed Ltd. Marketing Manager Kiwimed Ltd. General Manager Medion UK General Manager Medion UK Sales & Marketing, Aggrastat NMT Medical Inc Marketing NMT Medical Inc Marketing NYoomed UK Ltd Marketing Nyoomed UK Ltd Marketing Johrector Nyoomed UK Ltd Marketing Johrector NMT Medical Inc Marketing Johrector Nyoomed UK Ltd Marketing Johrector Sales & Marketing, Director | Corporation | | Interventional Medical Education |
| Pharmaceuticals Ltd Watasger Bristol-Myers Squibb Senior Product Manager, Europe Medical Imaging Business Development Manager Cardisal InHealth Ltd. Sales Director Cardis (A Johnson & Group Marketing Manager Johnson Company), UK Sales Manager Detascope Medical Co Ltd Watsonal Therapeutic Advisor Eli Lilly UK Sales Manager, Vascular Guidant Ltd Managing Director InterMedical Manager Kimal Scientific Products Marketing Manager Ltd. General Manager Kiwimed Ltd. General Manager Medical Inc Marketing Manager Medical Inc Marketing Manager Medical Inc Marketing Manager Medical Inc General Manager Medical Inc Sales & Marketing, Aggrastat Sales & Marketing, UK Managing Director NMT Medical Inc Managing Director RADI Medical Systems Sales & Marketing, Manager - Atherothrombouis Sanofi-Aventis Managing Director KAUM Medical Systems Sales & Marketing, Negrestat Sanofi-Aventis | Bristol-Myers Squibb | | Menager |
| Briskol-Myere Squibb Series Production Products Cardinal Integrity Business Development Manager Cardinal Integrity Sales Director Cordis (A Johnson & Johnson & Johnson & Group Marketing Manager Sales Manager Johnson Company), UK Sales Manager Datascope Medical Co Ltd National Therapeutic Advisor Eli Lilly UK Sales Manager Guidant Ltd Werketing Manager, Vascular Intervention InterMedical Marketing Manager, Vascular Intervention InterMedical Marketing Manager Kimal Scientific Products Marketing Manager Ltd. General Manager Kiwimed Ltd. General Manager Medoon UK General Manager Medical Inc Sales & Marketing, Aggrastat NMT Medical Inc Managing Director NMT Medical Inc Managing Director NMT Medical Inc Managing Director RADI Medical Inc Managing Director Sales & Marketing, Manager - Atherothrombonis Managing Director NMT Medical Inc Managing Director NMT Medical Inc Managing Director Sales & Marketing, Manager - Atherothrombonis | Pharmaceuticals Ltd | | Semior Product Manager, Europe |
| Medical Imaging Business Development Manager Cardisal InHealth Ltd. Sales Director Cardis (A Johnson & Sales Director Group Marketing Manager Johnson Company), UK Sales Manager Datascope Medical Co Ltd National Therapeutic Advisor Eli Lilly National Therapeutic Advisor Glaxo Smith Kline National Therapeutic Advisor Guidant Ltd Marketing Manager, Vascular Intervention InterMedical Marketing Manager Kimal Scientific Products Marketing Manager Ltd. General Manager Kiwinned Ltd. General Manager Medicon UK General Manager Medironic Marketing Manager Madoon UK General Manager Medironic Marketing, Aggrastat Sales & Marketing, UK Sales & Marketing, Manager Medironic Marketing, Manager Medironic Marketing Manager Medironic Marketing, Aggrastat Sales & Marketing, Director Sales & Marketing, Director Nycoursed UK Ltd Marketing Nycoursed UK Ltd Managing Director RADI Medical Systems | Bristol-Myers Squibb | | |
| Cardisologic Lid Sales Director Cordis (A Johnson & Johnson Company), Group Marketing Manager Jokason Company), UK Sales Manager Datascope Medical Co Ltd Western Coverspective Advisor Eli Lilly National Therapeutic Advisor Glaxo Smith Kline Western Coverspective Advisor Guidant Ltd Western Coverspective Advisor InterMedical Western Coverspective Advisor Kimal Scientific Products Marketing Manager Kiwimed Ltd. General Manager Medoon UK General Manager Medoon UK Vascular Business Manager, UK & Ireland Merck Sharp & Dohme Sales & Marketing, Aggrastat NMT Medical Inc Sales & Marketing, UK Nycomed UK Ltd Marketing Pyrasaed Marketing Ltd Marketing RADI Medical Systems Sales & Manager St. Jude Medical VK Sales Manager UK Medical Netional Sales Manager Wt Gore & Associates Netional Sales Manager Wt Gore K Associates Netional Sales Manager Metronic Western Sales Manager NMT Medical Marketing | Medical Imaging | | Business Development Manager |
| Cardiologic Lid Sales Different Cordis (A Johnson & Johnson Company), UK Sales Manager Johnson Company), UK Sales Manager Eli Lilly National Therapeutic Advisor Eli Lilly Healthcare Development Manager, Glaxo Smith Kline UK Country Manager, Vascular InterMedical Marketing Manager InterMedical Managing Director Kimal Scientific Products Marketing Manager Lid. General Manager Kiwined Lid. General Manager Medoon UK General Manager Medoon UK Sales & Marketing, Aggrastat NNT Medical Inc Sales & Marketing, Director NMT Medical Inc Manager NNT Medical Systems Sales & Marketing, Intervention Sales & Marketing Sales & Marketing, Intervention NNT Medical Inc Manager Notional Sales Manager Manager Sales & Marketing Sales & Marketing Nycomed UK Lid Manager Nycomed UK Lid Manager Nycomed UK Lid Manager Sales Marketing National Sales Manager <td< td=""><td>Cardinal InHealth Ltd.</td><td></td><td>Sales Director</td></td<> | Cardinal InHealth Ltd. | | Sales Director |
| Cordis (A Johnson & Johnson Company), UK Sales Manager Datascope Medical Co Lid UK Sales Manager Eli Lilly National Therapeutic Advisor Glaxo Smith Kline UK Guidant Ltd UK Country Manager, Vascular InterMedical Managing Director Kimal Scientific Products Marketing Manager Ltd. Central Manager Kiwimed Ltd. Central Manager Medoon UK Central Manager Medion UK Sales & Marketing, Aggrastat NMT Medical Inc Sales & Marketing, UK Nycomed UK Ltd Marketing Ltd Pyramed Marketing Ltd Marketing Sprector UK Manager Sales & Marketing, UK Nycomed UK Ltd Marketing Sprector Viscular Substant Sales & Marketing, UK Nycomed UK Ltd Marketing Sprector Viscular Seles Manager UK Manager Nycomed UK Ltd Marketing Sprector Viscular Seles Manager UK Manager Viscular Seles Manager Marketing UK Nycomed UK Ltd Marketing Sprector Viscular Seles Manager Marketing Sprector <tr< td=""><td>Cardiologic Ltd</td><td></td><td>Shot Datent</td></tr<> | Cardiologic Ltd | | Shot Datent |
| Cordis (A Johnson & UK Sales Manager Johnson Company), UK Sales Manager Datascope Medical Co Ltd National Therapeutic Advisor Eli Lilly National Therapeutic Advisor Glaxo Smith Kline UK Country Manager, Vascular InterMedical UK Country Manager, Vascular InterMedical Managing Director Kimal Scientific Products Marketing Manager Ltd. Ceneral Manager Kiwimed Ltd. Ceneral Manager Medtronic Vascular Business Manager, UK & Medtronic Sales & Marketing, Aggrastat NMT Medical Inc Managing Director Nycomed UK Ltd Manager Pyramed Marketing Ltd Manager UK Manager UK Manager UK Manager UK Manager NMT Medical Inc Managing Director Nycomed UK Ltd Managing Director Pyramed Marketing Ltd Manager UK Manager UK Manager St. Jude Medical Manager UK Medical Manager UK Manager Manager UK Manager Manager <t< td=""><td></td><td></td><td>Common Marketing Manager</td></t<> | | | Common Marketing Manager |
| Johnson Company), UK Sales Manager Defascope Medical Co Ltd National Therapeutic Advisor Eli Lilly Healthcare Development Manager, Guidant Ltd UK Country Manager, Vascular InterMedical UK Country Manager, Vascular InterMedical Marketing Manager Kimal Scientific Products Marketing Manager Ltd. General Manager Kimmed Ltd. General Manager Medicon UK Vascular Business Manager, UK & Ireland Merck Sharp & Dohme Sales & Marketing, Aggrastat NMT Medical Inc Masketing, Director NMT Medical Inc Managing, Director Pyramed Marketing Idd Managing, Director Pyramed Marketing Idd Managing, Director Senior Product Manager Managing, Director VIK Medical Systems Senior Product Manager – Atherothrombosis St. Jude Medical Managing, Director VIK Sales Manager Managing, Director VIK Sales Manager Manager – Atherothrombosis WUK Gree & Associates New Ventures s Manager | Cordis (A Johnson & | | Croup Mariana Barran B |
| Datascope Medical Co Lid UK stional Therapeutic Advisor Eli Lilly National Therapeutic Advisor Glaxo Smith Kline UK Guidant Ltd UK InterMedical UK InterMedical Managing Director Kimal Scientific Products Marketing Manager Ltd. General Manager Kiwimed Ltd. General Manager Medoon UK General Manager Meditronic Sales & Marketing, Aggrastat NMT Medical Inc Marketing Manager NMT Medical Inc Marketing Nycounsed UK Ltd Managing Director Pyramed Marketing Ltd Managing Director Sales & Marketing Manager Sales Manager Kiddical Inc Marketing Nycounsed UK Ltd Managing Director Pyramed Marketing Ltd Managing Director Sanofi-Aventis Sales Manager St. Jude Medical National Sales Manager UK Sales Manager Managing Director Wit Gore & Associates New Ventures a Manager Wit Gore & Associates New Ventures a Manager Wit Gore & Associates < | Johnson Company), | | TIK Galas Manager |
| Eli Lilly National Manager Glaxo Smith Kline UK Guidant Ltd UK Country Manager, Vascular InterMedical Managing Director Kimal Scientific Products Marketing Manager Kiwimed Ltd. General Manager Kiwimed Ltd. General Manager Medoon UK General Manager Meditronic General Manager Meditronic Sales & Marketing, Aggrastat NMT Medical Inc Sales & Marketing, UK NMT Medical Systems Managing Director Sales & Marketing, UK Manager NMT Medical Systems Sales & Marketing, UK Nycomed UK Ltd Managing Director St. Jude Medical Systems Senior Product Manager St. Jude Medical UK Manager VK Sales Manager UK Sales Manager UK Sales Manager UK Sales Manager VK Sales Manager Managing Director VK Sales Manager | Detascope Medical Co Ltd | | National Therapeutic Advisor |
| Glaxo Smith Kline Hearmeare Development Namegory Guidant Ltd UK InterMedical Wanaging Director InterVention Managing Director Kimal Scientific Products Marketing Manager Ltd. General Manager Kiwimed Ltd. General Manager Medoon UK General Manager Medtronic General Manager Medtronic Vascular Business Manager, UK & NMT Medical Inc Sales & Marketing, Aggrastat NMT Medical Inc Marketing Director Nycossed UK Ltd Managing Director Pyrassed Marketing Ltd Managing Director Sanofi-Aventis Senior Product Manager St. Jude Medical UK Managing Director Manager UK Manager Manager Vik Sales Manager Manager UK Medical Netional Sales Manager UK Medical Manager Netional Sales Manager Netional Sales Manager UK Medical Manager Manager Manager Manager New Ventures s Manager UK Ltd Manag | Eli Lilly | | The Whene Development Manager. |
| Guidant Ltd UK Guidant Ltd UK Country Manager, Vascular Intervention InterMedical Managing Director Kimal Scientific Products Marketing Manager Ltd. General Manager Kiwimed Ltd. General Manager Medoon UK General Manager Mediton UK Vascular Business Manager, UK & Ireland Merck Sharp & Dohme Sales & Marketing, Aggrastat NMT Medical Inc Sales & Marketing, UK Nyosmed UK Ltd Managing Director Pynamed Marketing Ltd Managing Director St. Jude Medical UK St. Jude Medical UK Visional Sales Manager UK Sales Manager VIK Sales Manager UK Sales Manager Visional Sales Manager UK Manager Metical Systems Netothrombosis St. Jude Medical Managing Director VIK Sales Manager UK Sales Manager Visional Sales Manager New Ventures s Manager Visional New Ventures s Manager | Glaxo Smith Kline | | Healthcare Development Aranges, |
| Guidant Ltd UK Country Manager, Vacuum InterMedical Managing Director Kimal Scientific Products Marketing Manager Ltd. Marketing Manager Kiwimed Ltd. General Manager Medoon UK General Manager Medicon UK General Manager Medicon UK Sales & Marketing, Aggrastat Medical Inc Sales & Marketing, UK NMT Medical Inc Marketing Nycomed UK Ltd Marketing Pyramed Marketing Ltd Manager Sales & Marketing UK Marketing Ltd Manager Vit Kadical Marketing Sanofi-Aventis Senior Product Manager St. Jude Medical Netional Sales Manager UK Medical Marketing Mathematical Manager St. Jude Medical Manager Wit Gore & Associates Manager Wit Gore & Associates New Ventures s Manager | | | UK Vernier |
| Intervention Intervention Intervention Managing Director Kimal Scientific Products Ltd. Kiwimed Ltd. Medoon UK Medoon UK Meditonic Meditonic Meditonic Merck Sharp & Dohme Sales & Marketing, Aggrastat Sales & Marketing, UK NMT Medical Inc NMT Medical Inc Nycounsed UK Ltd Pyramed Marketing Ltd Pyramed Marketing Ltd Managing Director UK Manager Sanofi-Aventis St. Jude Medical W L Gore & Associates W L Gore & Associates W L Gore & Associates | Guident Ltd | | UK Country Manager, Vaccular |
| InterMedical Managing Director Kimal Scientific Products Marketing Manager Ltd. General Manager Kiwimed Ltd. General Manager Medicon UK General Manager Medicon UK Vascular Business Manager, UK & Ireland Merck Sharp & Dohme Sales & Marketing, Aggrastat NMT Medical Inc Sales & Marketing, UK NMT Medical Inc Managing Director Pyramed Marketing Ltd Manager Pyramed Marketing Ltd Manager Sanofi-Aventis Senior Product Manager St. Jude Medical Mational Sales Manager UK Medical UK Sales Manager UK Medical Managing Director Visional Sales Manager Senior Product Manager – Atherothrombosis St. Jude Medical Managing Director UK Medical Managing Director UK Medical Manager UK Medical Manager W L Gore & Associates Manager UK Didd Manager Manager Manager | | | Intervention |
| Kimal Scientific Products Marketing Manager Ltd. General Manager Kiwimed Ltd. General Manager Medoon UK Vascular Business Manager, UK & Medtronic Vascular Business Manager, UK & Merck Sharp & Dohme Sales & Marketing, Aggrastat NMT Medical Inc Sales & Marketing, UK NMT Medical Inc Managing Director Pyramed Marketing Ltd Managing Director Pyramed Marketing Ltd Manager St. Jude Medical National Sales Manager St. Jude Medical UK Sales Manager UK Medical National Sales Manager W L Gore & Associates New Ventures s Manager UK Didical Managing Director UK Medical Manager Multical Manager | InterMedical | | Managing Director |
| Kimal Scientific Products Marketing Manager Idd. General Manager Medoon UK General Manager Meditonic General Manager Meditonic Vascular Business Manager, UK & Ireland Merck Sharp & Dohme Sales & Marketing, Aggrastat NMT Medical Inc Sales & Marketing, UK NMT Medical Inc Marketing Nycomed UK Ltd Managing Director Pyramed Marketing Ltd Manager RADI Medical Systems Senior Product Manager Sanofi-Aventis National Sales Manager St. Jude Medical Managing Director UK Medical Manager Matherothrombonis National Sales Manager W L Gore & Associates Managing Director UK) Ltd Managing Director | 1110110 | | |
| Kimin Contraction General Manager Kiwimed Ltd. General Manager Medoon UK General Manager Medironic Vascular Business Manager, UK & Merck Sharp & Dohme Sales & Marketing, Aggrastat NMT Medical Inc Sales & Marketing, UK Nycomed UK Ltd Managing Director Pyramed Marketing Ltd Manager RADI Medical Systems Senior Product Manager - St. Jude Medical National Sales Manager UK Manager UK Sales Manager WL Gore & Associates New Ventures s Manager | Kimal Scientific Products | | Marketing Manager |
| Stational Ltd. General Manager Medoon UK General Manager Medtronic Vascular Business Manager, UK & Merck Sharp & Dohme Sales & Marketing, Aggrastat NMT Medical Inc Sales & Marketing, UK Nyconned UK Ltd Managing Director Pyramed Marketing Ltd Manager Sanofi-Aventis Senior Product Manager St. Jude Medical UK Vascular Business Manager Senior Product Manager St. Jude Medical Managing Director UK Medical Manager St. Jude Medical Manager VK Sales Manager Manager WL Gore & Associates New Ventures s Manager UK Jad New Ventures s Manager | Itd. | | |
| Medicon UK General Manager Medicon UK Vascular Business Manager, UK & Ireland Merck Sharp & Dohme Sales & Marketing, Aggrastat NMT Medical Inc Sales & Marketing, UK Nycouned UK Ltd Managing Director Pyramed Marketing Ltd Manager Salos Sales & Marketing, UK Managing Director Sales Sales & Marketing, UK Managing Director Nycouned UK Ltd Manager Sanofi-Aventis Senior Product Manager – St. Jude Medical UK Sales Manager UK Medical UK Sales Manager Versional Sales Manager Managing Director Versional Sales Manager New Ventures s Manager Versional Sales Manager New Ventures s Manager | Kingimed Ltd. | 9 | General Manager |
| Medtronic Vascular Business Manager, OK. Merck Sharp & Dohme Sales & Marketing, Aggrastat NMT Medical Inc Sales & Marketing, UK Nycomed UK Ltd Marketing Director Pyramed Marketing Ltd Managing Director RADI Medical Systems Senior Product Manager Sanofi-Aventis National Sales Manager St. Jude Medical UK Sales Manager UK Medical UK Sales Manager WL Gore & Associates New Ventures s Manager (IK) Ltd New Ventures s Manager | Madrom UK | | General Manager |
| Merck Sharp & Dohme Sales & Marketing, Aggrastat NMT Medical Inc Sales & Marketing, UK Nycomed UK Ltd Marketing Pyramed Marketing Ltd Managing Director Pyramed Marketing Ltd Managing Director Sanofi-Aventis Senior Product Manager St. Jude Medical National Sales Manager UK Medical UK W L Gore & Associates New Ventures s Manager (IK) 14d New Ventures s Manager | Medtronic | | Vascular Business Muninger, Ok a |
| Merck Sharp & Dohme Sales & Marketing, Aggrestat NMT Medical Inc Sales & Marketing, UK Nycosmed UK Ltd Marketing Pyramed Marketing Ltd Managing Director RADI Medical Systems Senior Product Manager Sales Marketing Senior Product Manager St. Jude Medical UK Terusno UK UK UK Medical UK Sales Manager UK Medical National Sales Manager UK Medical Managing Director UK Medical Managing Director UK Medical Managing Director UK Medical Managing Director UK J L Gore & Associates New Ventures s Manager (UK) Ltd Managing Director | No. | | Ireland |
| NMCT Medical Inc Sales & Marketing, UK Nycomed UK Ltd Managing Director Pyramed Marketing Ltd Managing Director RADI Medical Systems UK Manager Sanofi-Aventis Senior Product Manager - Atherothrombonis National Sales Manager St. Jude Medical UK UK Medical Managing Director UK Medical National Sales Manager UK Medical Managing Director W L Gore & Associates New Ventures s Manager (IK) 14d New Ventures s Manager | Merck Sherry & Dohme | | Sales & Marketing, Aggraduit |
| Normal Marketing Marketing Nycosmed UK Ltd Managing Director Pyramed Marketing Ltd Manager RADI Medical Systems UK Manager Sanofi-Aventis Senior Product Manager - Atherothrombosis St. Jude Medical National Sales Manager UK Medical UK Sales Manager UK Medical Managing Director UK Medical National Sales Manager UK Medical Managing Director UK L Gore & Associates New Ventures s Manager (IK) Ltd Manager | NACT Medical Inc | | Sales & Marketing, UK |
| Nycounted Marketing Ltd Managing Director Pyramed Marketing Ltd UK Manager RADI Medical Systems Senior Product Manager - Sanofi-Aventis National Sales Manager St. Jude Medical UK Sales Manager UK Medical UK Sales Manager UK Medical Managing Director W L Gore & Associates New Ventures s Manager (UK) Ltd New Ventures s Manager | Naronmed LIK Ltd | | Marketing |
| Pyrusieu water water UK Manager RADI Medical Systems Senior Product Manager – Atherothrombonis St. Jude Medical National Sales Manager Terumo UK UK Sales Manager UK Medical Managing Director W L Gore & Associates New Ventures s Manager (UK) 14d Managing Director | Demand Marketing Ind | | Managing Director |
| NADA Medical Senior Product Manager – Sanofi-Aventis Atherothrombonis St. Jude Medical National Sales Manager Terumo UK UK Sales Manager UK Medical Managing Director W L Gore & Associates New Ventures s Manager (UK) 14d Idd | PATH Medical Seriems | | UK Manager |
| Sumon-Avenus Atherothrombosis St. Jude Medical National Sales Manager Terumo UK UK Sales Manager UK Medical Managing Director W L Gore & Associates New Ventures s Manager (UK) Ltd Idd | KALA IVERIAL OVERALIS | | Senior Product Manager - |
| St. Jude Madical Mational Sales Manager Terumo UK UK Sales Manager UK Medical Managing Director W L Gore & Associates New Ventures s Manager (IK) 14d Managing Director | 2011011-UACUTS | | Atherothrombosis |
| Terumo UK UK Sales Manager UK Medical Managing Director W L Gore & Associates New Ventures s Manager (IK) 14d | as hude Madical | | National Sales Manager |
| UK Medical Managing Director W L Gore & Associates (UK) 14d | Tomuno LIK | | UK Sales Manager |
| W L Gore & Associates (UK) 14d | TK Medical | | Managing Director |
| (IIK) Itd | WI Com & Associates | | New Ventures s Manager |
| | (IIK) Itd | | |



BCIA Response to LRiG Addendum Report for Review of Guidance No. 71.

Executive Summary

• LRiG have understated the difference in effectiveness between BMS and DES by:

- Failing to report several important studies that identify longer lesions, small vessels and diabetes as independent risk factors for repeat revascularisation.
- Failing to accurately represent absolute repeat revascularisation rates in BMS. In answer to the Committee's specific question, the rate was <u>13%</u> for the general population in the Scottish registry for the year 2000/2001.
- Continuing to use Total Revascularisation rates, which can only be estimated using a number of poorly defined correction factors that introduce unnecessary complications and uncertainty into cost effectiveness estimates.
- Continued dependence upon the CTC dataset that the Committee have already judged as not representative of repeat revascularisation.
- Understating the reduction in repeat revascularisation conferred by DES.
- As a result of this approach, LRiG's additional analyses are still unrepresentative of the cost effectiveness of DES.
- Long lesions and small vessels have been reconfirmed (and now accepted by LRiG on page 35 of the Addendum) as placing patients at increased risk of repeat revascularisation. With no evidence to suggest that the treatment effect of DES has diminished since the original Guidance was issued, it follows that there is no reason to change the existing Guidance in this respect.
- In fact, as diabetes has been established as an independent predictor of repeat revascularisation, this Review should also recommend the use of DES for all diabetic patients undergoing PCI.

Introduction

- The deliberations from the first Committee meeting identified a number of potential issues for the addendum to consider. We suggest that the key issues driving cost effectiveness and thus requiring consideration are:
 - The independent risk factors for repeat revascularisation consistently shown in the literature to be small vessels, longer lesions and diabetes.
 - 0 The absolute risk of revascularisation with bare metal stents (BMS) -13% for an unselected population from the Scottish registry.
 - The risk reduction gained from DES.

Our response below considers these issues in turn.

Risk Factors for Repeat Revascularisation

- The reason for continuing to present separate analyses for elective and non-elective patients is not explained. In the absence of any stated scientific rationale, the reason appears to be to maintain consistency with the Bagust paper (Bagust *et al*, 2005). This paper in itself does not provide any argument for the separation of elective and non-elective patients.
- LRiG undertake further work in Figure A3 (page 30) to show that diabetes is not a risk factor for repeat revascularisation. They do this using a risk model developed from the CTC database. As the Committee have already concluded that the CTC database is not representative of repeat revascularisation rates, this additional analysis is flawed because the CTC database is underpowered to answer the Committee's question.
- Estimates from the Bagust paper and the AR Addendum show that the CTC dataset has only about 25% power to detect a difference in revascularisation rates between diabetics (~11%) and non-diabetics (~9%) in the total CTC population. The CTC database is simply underpowered and a wider perspective from the literature is required.
- LRiG have presented in Table A6.2, a more wide-ranging (but not complete) review of the literature pertaining to risk factors for repeat revascularisation than in either the AR or the Bagust paper. As a result, they now acknowledge that <u>long lesions and small vessels are commonly occurring risk factors</u> in the literature. Thus, the original guidance recommending DES for use in lesions >15mm length and vessels <3mm diameter is supported.
- The Committee should note that Table A6.2 *"Summary of risk model factors in reviewed papers"* does not present the results of a further 7 risk models. Curiously, 5 out of these 7 identify diabetes as an independent risk factor for repeat revascularisation. Table 1 below reproduces LRiG's Table A6.2 to include data highlighted in earlier industry submissions.
- Overall, LRiG's interpretation and representation of the extensive published literature pertaining to previous risk factor studies is extremely concerning and at worst, selective. The literature has been dismissed as being based on 'beliefs' and 'perceptions', implying that only LRiG have seriously studied this question (page 31):

"The success of the LRiG formulations to outperform other possibilities is not surprising since they were developed to provide 'best fit' to these data. However, it is notable that none of the additional variables **widely believed** to be most influential by the clinical community (and therefore factored into trial designs) showed any indication of independent effect, or acted to modify the LRiG factors to any serious extent. This suggests that **common perceptions** about the genesis of restenosis may be misconceived".

- We would draw the Committee's attention to the recent paper by Gotschall *et al* (2006) in which the authors state: *"Indeed, prediction of restenosis after PCI is one of the most studied topics in interventional cardiology"*.
- The manner in which such a body of evidence can be easily dismissed when it does not appear to fit with LRiG's own findings is disconcerting. They are happy to defer to the 'weight of prior evidence' when it does fit their message. For example, in reviewing the evidence for AMI and mortality (*for which we make no claim*), the report concludes on page 23: *"The <u>weight of</u> prior evidence is sufficiently strong that a very compelling body of new information would be necessary to alter the current consensus that PCIs provide symptomatic relief but do not alter life expectancy..."*.

| | Sources cited by LRiG | | | | Sources not cited by LRiG | | | | | | | | | |
|--------------------------|-------------------------------------|-----------------------------------|---|---|---|------------------------------------|--------------------------|------------------------------------|--------------------------|--|--------------------------|------------------------|-------------------------------------|------------------------------------|
| Risk Factor | SCRR (Pell <i>et al</i> 2001) | Toulouse (Elbaz et al 2002) | Netherlands (Agema <i>et al</i> 2004) | Cleveland (Ellis <i>et al</i> 2004) | Washington (Wu <i>et al</i> 2004) | LRiG elective | LRiG non- elective | Kastrati et al 1997 ^ | Singh et al 2005\$ | Iakovou <i>et al</i> 2003 ^ | Kornowski et al 1999^ | Nikolsky et al 2005 | Jilaihawi et al 2005 ^ | Gotschall <i>et al</i> 2006^ |
| 3 vessel disease | | | | | | | | | | | | | | |
| Previous MI | | | \checkmark | | | | | | | | | | | |
| Ostial location | | | | | | | | | | | | | | |
| Unstable angina | | | | | | | (1) | | | | | | | |
| Restenotic | | | | | | $\downarrow \downarrow \downarrow$ | | | | | | | | |
| Saphenous graft | | | | | | | | | | | | | | |
| LAD | | | | \checkmark | | | | | | | | | | |
| Stable angina (vs. none) | | | | | | | | | | | | | | |
| Creatinine | | | | | | | | | | | | | | |
| Lesion length | | | \checkmark | \checkmark | | | | | | | | | | \checkmark |
| Small vessel | | | $\sqrt{1}$ | \checkmark | | | $\sqrt{1}$ | $\sqrt{1}$ | | | | | | \checkmark |
| Diabetes | | | √~ | | √# | | | | | | | | √* | |
| Previous CABG | | | | | | | $\sqrt{1}$ | | | | | | | |
| Calcification | | | | | | | | | | | | | | |
| Angulation | | | | | | | | | | | | | | |
| Multiple stents | | | | | | | | $\sqrt{1}$ | | | | | | |
| Age | | | | | | | | | | | | | | |
| Smoker | | | | | | | | | | | | | | |
| Hypertension | | | | | | | | | | | | | | |
| Number of lesions | | | | | | | | | | | | | | |
| Use of rotablator | | | | | | | | | | | | | | |
| Previous PCI | | | | | | | | | | $\overline{\mathbf{A}}$ | | | | |
| Body mass index | | | | | | | | | | | | 11 | | |
| Acute coronary syndromes | | | | | | | | | | | | | | - 1 1 |

 Table 1:
 Clinical and procedural factors independently predictive of repeat revascularisation after coronary stenting with BMS.

 $\sqrt{10} = p < 0.05 \& RR$, hazard ratio or odds ratio < 1.6. $\sqrt{10} = RR$, hazard ratio or odds ratio > = 1.9.

 $\sqrt{-100}$ Netherlands: Diabetes predictive of TVR in the publication (RR 1.52, 0.99-2.32). Excluded by LRiG because univariate predictors with p < 0.10 were entered into the multivariate regression model. *LRiG appear to have made an error in excluding this study because p < 0.10 is the standard criterion for entry into a backwards stepwise regression model.*

V# Washington: Diabetes excluded by LRiG because it was predictive of repeat revascularisation by CABG only (HR 1.52, 1.03-2.23). Revascularisation by CABG is still revascularisation!

 $\sqrt{*}$ UK data (Dr H Jilaihawi, personal communication). RR = 1.8, p = 0.05.

- * 5 out of 7 Risk models not cited by LRiG were developed from clinical databases without mandated angiographic follow up.
- \$ PRESTO study ischaemia-driven TVR required presence of ischaemic signs & symptoms.
- Small vessels, long lesions and diabetes are the most commonly occurring factors when all risk models are considered.
- Diabetes occurs in 5 out of 7 of the risk models not presented by LRiG in the Addendum non of these 5 included mandated angiographic follow up.

- Two risk models (Toulouse and Kastrati) identified post-procedural minimum lumen diameter (MLD) <3mm as being a predictor of repeat revascularisation. LRiG state on page 33 that *"since this factor cannot be known when the choice of stent is made it is of no immediate value in assessing sub-groups with the highest risk of subsequent revascularisation"*. This assertion is not true. Trials consistently show that MLD after stenting is smaller than the reference vessel diameter. Thus, if DES are implanted in vessels <3mm diameter, the post-procedural MLD will invariably be <3mm.
- The relative risk for TLR with an MLD <3mm was 2.09 (95% CI 1.42-3.07, P = 0.0002) in the Toulouse study (Elbaz *et al* 2002). The odds ratio for TLR with an MLD <3mm was 2.05 (95% CI 1.77-2.34) in the Kastrati study (Kastrati *et al* 1997). These two studies showing <u>MLD</u> <<u>3mm as predictive of repeat revascularisation</u> are highly relevant and clearly demonstrate that this strongly predictive factor <u>should be retained in the new guidance</u>.
- Gotschall *et al* (2006) did not find that diabetes reached formal statistical significance as an independent predictor of 1-year TVR (OR 1.62, 0.85-3.06, p = 0.14), but in testing three different risk models, they concluded:
 - "The results demonstrate that the model that most appropriately fit the data included the <u>reference</u> <u>vessel diameter</u>, lesion length and diabetes mellitus (Hosmer-Lemeshow goodness-of-fit statistic = 2.339; p = 0.969)."
 - 'Indeed, the variables included in this (risk) score (reference vessel diameter, lesion length and diabetes mellitus) have also been <u>consistently associated with outcomes in several clinical and experimental studies</u>."
 - "The clinical implications of this study relate to the prediction of a new TVR after coronary stenting based on pre-procedural characteristics, which can aid to the decision to implant a drug-eluting or a bare metal stent."
- Table 2 summarises the additional independent risk for repeat revascularisation posed by diabetes based on the studies in Table 1.

| Study | Diabetes Risk Statistic (95% CI) |
|-------------------------------------|----------------------------------|
| Agema et al 2004 (TVR) | $RR = 1.52 \ (0.99-2.32)$ |
| Wu et al 2004 (first repeat revasc) | HR = 1.52 (1.03-2.23) |
| Kastrati et al 1997 (TLR) | OR = 1.45 (1.11-1.80) |
| Singh et al 2005 (TVR) | OR = 1.42 (1.08-1.87) |
| Iakovou et al 2003 (TLR) | OR = 1.00 (1.00-1.01) |
| Kornowski et al 1999 (TLR) | OR = 1.48 (1.12 - 1.82) |
| Jilaihawi et al 2005 (TLR) | RR = 1.8 |

 Table 2.
 Risk of repeat revascularisation posed by diabetes as an independent risk factor. Risk statistics are raw data as reported in each study, RR = relative risk, HR = hazard ratio, OR = odds ratio.

Summary of Risk Factors for Repeat Revascularisation

- Long lesions, small vessels and diabetes are the most commonly occurring independent predictors of repeat revascularisation in BMS across many studies.
- LRiG have failed to present several important studies detailing predictors of repeat revascularisation both in the AR and the Addendum.
- The studies omitted by LRiG commonly find diabetes to be in independent predictor of repeat revascularisation.

Absolute Risk of Repeat Revascularisation in BMS

It is useful to recap the origin of the debate around the absolute risk of repeat revascularisation in BMS.

- LRiG asserted in the Bagust paper that protocol-mandated follow up angiograms in the randomised trials inflate repeat revascularisation rates beyond those that would have been observed in routine practice without mandated angiographic follow up.
- LRiG also asserted that corrections for this effect by reporting clinically-driven rates were still over-estimates because this definition still included revascularisations based on "an in-lesion diameter stenosis >70% in the <u>absence</u> of ischaemic signs and symptoms.."
- LRiG therefore sought data that reported lower rates from other sources including the CTC BCIS and Leicester databases.
- The Committee concluded that the CTC and Leicester registries were not reliable sources of repeat revascularisation rates and felt that the Scottish registry and the BASKET trial (Switzerland) may be more representative.
- LRiG looked at these and other data, attempting to make adjustments to estimate total revascularisation rates, 100% BMS usage and 12m rates.

We have a number of concerns with the new analysis undertaken by LRiG. These are first listed, then explained below:

- Failure of LRiG to clearly address the Committee's question of the absolute risk of revascularisation of BMS taken from the Scottish registry data
- Continued use of Total Revascularisations
- Conversion rate used for baseline data converting to 100% BMS usage
- Conversation of data to 12 month outcomes

Absolute Risk of Repeat Revascularisation from the Scottish Registry

- LRiG dismiss the Scottish 2003/04 report as being "out of line with the published paper from the same source" (page 26). The basis of this comment is unclear as the Scottish publication (Pell et al 2001) gives a rate of 17.1% and the Scottish 2003/04 report gives a rate of 14.7%. These two figures are not out of line with each other.
- Scottish registry data for the <u>specific year 2000/01</u>, in which the stent usage was >80% (Pell and Slack 2004), show the repeat revascularisation rate to be <u>13%</u> (Figure 1 below). This figure, requested by the Committee, probably represents the most reliable estimation of repeat revascularisation rates in a general population from UK registry data but still may not capture events as completely as randomised trials. Higher risk groups of small vessels, longer lesions and diabetics will have higher rates.



Figure 1. Repeat revascularisation rates and stent usage from Scottish Revascularisation Register (Pell and Slack 2004). The 12m rate in 2000/2001 (prior to the introduction of DES) was 13%. Inset shows use of stents over time, $\sim 47\%$ in 1997/1998 and $\sim 82\%$ in 2000/2001. Repeat revascularisation rates are approximately the same for both years despite increased BMS usage, probably reflecting more complex case mix in the later year.

Continued use of Total Revascularisations (Total Rev)

- The dependence of LRiG on this end-point is most likely driven by the fact that the CTC data are unable to differentiate between TLR, TVR and Total Rev in some cases (Original Assessment Report, 8.2.3), hence they cannot reliably model cost effectiveness based on TVR or TLR.
- LRiG attempt to convert TLR and TVR data from 6 other sources (Table 5.1 p 28) to Total Rev to maintain consistency with the CTC data. This estimation uses conversion factors derived from the CTC data. As the CTC data has already been judged unreliable, these conversions are also unreliable and introduce further errors into LRiG's results.
- TLR or TVR capture all of the additional costs and disutility of repeat revascularisation relevant to DES. The added complication of manipulating data to Total Rev is unnecessary clinically, introduces additional statistical uncertainty and relies on further unclear estimations of the risk reduction DES confer on Total Rev.
- The risk reductions DES confer on BMS TLR and TVR rates are known, transparent and subject to far less uncertainty than the multitude of corrections and estimates LRiG rely on in their continued use of Total Rev.
- In attempting to convert the BCIS and Leicester data to Total Rev, LRiG have neglected to account for repeat revascularisation by CABG. The Leicester (Glenfield) data only include TLR by PCI and the BCIS data only accounts for PCI for restenosis (Ludman 2004).

Conversion Rate Used for Baseline Data - converting to 100% BMS usage

- The BCIS data used to convert 'unstented' patients to 'stented' in Table 5.1 of the Addendum is recognised by the Committee as unreliable. Adjustments based on these data will also be unreliable and introduce yet more errors into LRiGs results.
- Even accepting the BCIS data, the calculation methods for this conversion are unclear. Converting the Scottish data (Table 5.1, Row 1, Pell-SCRR), an adjustment of 0.49 has been applied to adjust the data to account for 49% of patients receiving POBA (no stent). This reduces the TOTAL revascularisation rate in that population by half. What that means is that the relative risk of revascularisation in **POBA is three times higher than with a BMS**¹. This magnitude of benefit was not observed during the original review of bare metal stents compared with POBA, TA no 4, May 2000. LRiG's estimates appear to be flawed.

Conversion of Data to 12-month Outcomes

• LRiG do not state what objective criteria they use to define the results of their data adjustments as acceptable not. LRiG appear happy to accept the results of their adjustments when the answers are low, yet dismiss the adjustment when the results are above an arbitrary threshold – P 26, pt 6:

"For converting from 9 to 12 months follow-up we have applied a multiplier derived from the CTC revascularisation time profile. However, we found that adopting a similar approach to move from 6 to 12 months suggested unrealistically large adjusted rates."

- Realistic estimates of increases in revascularisation rates from 6 to 12 months can be obtained from a number of sources; the Scottish 2000/2001 registry (Pell and Slack 2004), the SIRIUS trial BMS arm (patients without angiographic follow up, Holmes *et al* 2004) and the BENESTENT II trial BMS arm (patients without angiographic follow up, van Hout *et al* 2005) These data are shown in Figure 2 below.
- Figure 2 shows that LRiG's 6m to 12m conversion factor of 1.3 (Table 5.1) is unrealistically small and not consistent with the available evidence. This is not surprising as they describe their factor to be *"without specific evidence to support it"* (page 26).
- The true 6m to 12m conversion factor is in the order of <u>1.65</u>. Applying this to the BASKET trial 6m outcomes results in an estimate of <u>13.6% for 12m TVR</u> for an unselected 'base case' population.
- The rates LRiG dismiss as *"unrealistically large adjusted rates"* are actually in line with the Scottish registry, BASKET and many other published rates previously brought to the Committee's attention in our submission and response to the original Assessment Report. LRiG's systematic exclusion of these rates is perverse and not scientifically robust.

¹ For the adjusted risk of 8.4% to be correct, the contribution to the orginal rate of 17.1% from BMS patients must be 8.4%/2=4.2% (~50% population receiving BMS). Therefore, rate in original population due to POBA = 17.1%-4.2%

^{= 12.9%.} Relative difference 3 fold!



•

• It should be noted from Figure 2 that the 12m rates from the randomised trials without the effect of the follow up angiogram are remarkably consistent with the Scottish registry data.

Summary of Absolute Risk of Repeat Revascularisation

- The repeat revascularisation rate from the Scottish registry prior to the introduction of DES (2000/2001) is <u>13%</u> for the general population.
- The estimated 12m overall TVR rate for the BASKET trial is **13.6%**.
- BCIA's previous submissions estimated a rate of <u>12%</u> from a range of sources that did not included a protocol-mandated angiogram.
- The 12m BMS repeat revascularisation rate in an unselected population is therefore <u>12% to 14%</u> when all data sources are considered and realistic adjustments from 6m to 12m are made.
- UK and non-UK sources yield very similar results.

The Risk Reduction Gained from DES

• In Table A6.3 (page 38), LRiG present further cost effectiveness results for small vessels, diabetes and long lesions. These results are misleading because the Committee, in the specification of additional work, requested that a 12m timeline should be adopted. Instead, LRiG have used the 41% <u>6m relative risk reduction.</u>

Figure 2. Estimates of factors for converting 6m repeat revascularisation rates to 12m rates. Scotland 2000/2001 = Scottish registry, SIRIUS = BMS rates from patients in the SIRIUS trial who did not have a protocol-mandated follow up angiogram, BENESTENT II = BMS rates from patients in the BENESTENT II trial who did not have a protocol-mandated follow up angiogram BASKET = actual 6m BMS result from BASKET study.

• The randomised controlled trials of DES show that the risk reduction associated with DES increases between 6 and 12 months. The use of a 6m-risk reduction in LRiG's new analyses is inconsistent with the Committee's specification of additional work, will under-estimate the DES treatment effect at 12m and substantially over-estimate the ICER.

Overall Conclusions

- Long lesions and small vessels have been reconfirmed (and now accepted by LRiG on page 35 of the Addendum) as placing patients at increased risk of repeat revascularisation.
- Diabetes is also an independent predictor of repeat revascularisation.
- The absolute risk of repeat revascularisation in BMS is 13% for a general population in the Scottish registry and will be higher for long lesions, small vessels and diabetic patients.
- LRiG have under-estimated the risk reduction (treatment effect) conferred by DES.
- In under-estimating both the absolute risk of repeat revascularisation and the DES treatment effect, LRiG's cost effectiveness estimates are not representative of the benefit of DES in UK clinical practice.
- The current guidance correctly identifies patients with lesions >15mm length or vessels <3mm diameter as being at increased risk of repeat revascularisation. With no evidence to suggest that the treatment effect of DES has diminished since the original Guidance was issued, it follows that there is no reason to change the existing Guidance in this respect.
- In fact, as diabetes has been established as an independent predictor of repeat revascularisation, this Review should also recommend the use of DES for all diabetic patients undergoing PCI.

References

Agema WR, Monraats PS, Zwinderman AH, De Winter RJ, Tio RA, Doevendans PA, Waltenberger J, De Maat MP, Frants RR, Atsma DE, Van Der Laarse A, Van Der Wall EE, Jukema JW (2004). Current PTCA practice and clinical outcomes in The Netherlands: the real world in the pre-drug-eluting stent era. *Eur Heart J* 25(13):1163-1170.

Bagust A, Grayson AD, Palmer ND, Perry RA, Walley T (2005). Cost-effectiveness of drug-eluting coronary artery stenting in a UK setting: cost-utility study. *Heart* Apr 14; [Epub ahead of print].

Elbaz M, El Mokhtar E, Fourcade J, Mourali S, Hobeika R, Carrie D, Puel J (2002). Does stent design affect the long-term outcome after coronary stenting? *Catheterization & Cardiovascular Interventions* 56(305-311).

Ellis SG, Bajzer CT, Bhatt DL, Brener SJ, Whitlow PL, Lincoff AM, Moliterno DJ, Raymond RE, Tuzcu EM, Franco I, Dushman-Ellis S, Lander KJ, Schneider JP, Topol EJ (2004). Real-world bare metal stenting: identification of patients at low or very low risk of 9-month coronary revascularization. *Catheterization & Cardiovascular Interventions* 63(2):135-40.

Gottschall CAM, Quadros AS, MD, Sarmento-Leite R (2006). Predictive score for target vessel revascularization after bare metal coronary stenting. *J Inv Cardiol 18(1):22-26*.

Holmes DR, Leon MB, Moses, MD JW, Popma JJ, Cutlip D, Fitzgerald PJ, Brown C, Fischell T, Wong SC, Midei M, Snead D, Kuntz RE (2004). Analysis of 1-year clinical outcomes in the SIRIUS trial: a randomized trial of a sirolimuseluting stent versus a standard stent in patients at high risk for coronary restenosis. *Circulation* 109:634-640.

Iakovou I, Mintz GS, Dangas G, Abizaid A, Mehran R, Lansky AJ, Kobayashi Y, Hirose M, Ashby DT, Stone GW, Moses JW, Leon MB (2003). Optimal final lumen area and predictors of target lesion revascularisation after stent implantation in small coronary arteries. *Am J Cardiol.* **92**(10):1171-1176.

Jilaihawi H, Khan S, Kovac J (2005). Low incidence of revascularisation of bare stents in the era of drug-eluting stents: a single tertiary centre experience. *Heart* **91** (Suppl 1):A5.

Kastrati A, Schömig A, Elezei S, Schulen H, Dirschinger J, Hadamitzky , Wehinger A, Hausleiter J, Walter H, Neumann F-J (1997). Predictive factors of restenosis after coronary stent placement. *JACC* **30**(6):1428-1436.

Kornowski R, Mehran R, Satler L, Pichard AD, Kent KM, Greenburg A, Mintz GS, Hong MH, Leon MB (1999). Procedural results and late outcomes following Multivessel coronary stenting. *J Am Coll Cardiology* **33**:420-426.

Ludman P (2004). BCIS audit returns adult interventional procedures 2003. www.bcis.org.uk/resources/audit/audit2003. Accessed 18th May, 2005.

Nikolsky E, Kosinski E, Mishkel GJ, Kimmelstiel C, McGarry TF Jr., Mehran R, Leon MB, Russell ME, Ellis SG, Stone GW (2005). Impact of obesity on revascularisation and restenosis rates after bare-metal and drug-eluting stent implantation (from the TAXUS-IV trial). *Am J Cardiol* **95**:709–715.

Pell J, Slack R (2004). The Scottish revascularisation Register: time trends 1997-2003. Greater Glasgow NHS Board.

Pell JP, Walsh D, Norrie J, Berg G, Colquhoun AD, Davidson K, Eteiba H, Faichney A, Flapan A, Hogg KJ, Jeffrey RR, Jennings K, McArthur J, Mankad P, Oldroyd K, Pell ACH, Starkey IR (2001). Outcomes following coronary bypass grafing and percutaneous transluminal coronary angioplasty in the sent era: a prospective study of 9890 consecutive patients operate on in Scotland over a two year period. *Heart* 85:662-666.

Singh M, Gersh BJ, McClelland RL, Ho KK, Willerson JT, Penny WF, Holmes DR Jr (2005). Predictive factors for ischemic target vessel revascularisation in the Prevention of Restenosis with Tranilast and its Outcomes (PRESTO) trial. J Am Coll Cardiol. 45(2):198-203.

van Hout BA, Serruys PW, Lemos PA, van den Brand MJBM, van Es G-A, Lindeboom WK, Morice MC (2005). One year cost effectiveness of sirolimus eluting stents compared with bare metal stents in the treatment of single native de novo coronary lesions: An analysis from the RAVEL trial. *Heart* 91:507-512.

Wu AH, Goss JR, Maynard C, Stewart DK, Zhao XQ (2004). Predictors of repeat revascularisation after nonemergent, first percutaneous coronary intervention in the community. *Am Heart J* **147**(1):146-150.